Revisiting Urban Planning in Latin America and the Caribbean

Clara Irazábal

Regional study prepared for
Revisiting Urban Planning:
Global Report on Human Settlements 2009

Available from http://www.unhabitat.org/grhs/2009

Prof. Clara Irazabal is Assistant Professor at the Graduate School of Architecture, Planning, and Preservation at Columbia University, New York City. Comments may be sent to the author by e-mail: irazabal.zurita@columbia.edu.

About this report

General Assembly Resolution 34/114 mandated UN-HABITAT to prepare periodically the Global Report on Human Settlements as a vehicle for monitoring and reporting on human settlements conditions and trends. So far, six issues of the Global Report have been published.

The seventh issue of the Global Report on Human Settlements will be devoted to 'Revisiting Urban Planning'. The report will be published in October 2009. It will review urban planning practices and approaches, with a view to identifying the constraints and conflict points therein, as well as to identify innovative, flexible and dynamic approaches that are more responsive to the rapid pace of urbanization and its accompanying challenges. New approaches to planning can only be meaningful, and have a greater chance of succeeding if they are in consonance with the prevailing socioeconomic and cultural milieu, are participatory and inclusive, as well as linked to contextual political processes. The objective of the 2009 Global Report is to improve knowledge, among Governments and Habitat Agenda Partners, on global conditions and trends with respect to urban planning. This regional study is one of eight regional studies that will serve as inputs into the various chapters of the 2009 GRHS.

Contents

List of tbles

List of acronyms

ALBA	Bolivarian Alternative for the Americas (Alternativa Bolivariana para las Américas),
CAFTA	Dominican Republic-Central America Free Trade Agreement
CDM	Clean Development Mechanism (CDM)
CER	Certified Emissions Reductions
CFIA	Federal Collegiate of Engineers and Architects in Costa Rica (Colegio Federado de Ingenieros y Arquitectos)
COMEC	Curitiba Metropolitan Region Coordenation (*Coordenação da Região Metropolitana de Curitiba)*
ECLAC/CEPAL	Comisión Económica para América LaTINA Y EL CARIBE
FTAA/ALCA	Free Trade Area of the Americas/Area de Libre Comercio de las Américas
GPN	Global Planners' Network
GRHS	Global Report on Human Settlements
HDI	Human Development Index
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INCA	National Institute of Agricultural Sciences (INCA)
INCAE	Central American Institute for Business Administration (Instituto Centroamericano de Administración Empresarial)
INEGI	Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Geografía
INEGI	Instituto Nacional De Estadística Y Geografía
IPPUC	The Institute of Urban Research and Planning of Curitiba (*Instituto de Pesquisa e Planejamento Urbano de Curitiba*)
LAC	Latin America and Caribbean
Mideplan	Ministry for Planning and Cooperation (Chile)
MIDEPLAN	Costa Rican Ministry of National Planning and Economic Policy (*Ministerio de Planificación Nacional y Política Económica)*
MPI	Migration Policy Institute
MPPD	Ministry of Public Power for Planning and Development (*Ministerio del Poder Popular para la Planificación y el Desarrollo)*
MST	Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra
MSTC	Movimento Sem Teto do Centro
NACLA	North American Congress on Latin America
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organizations
NUDP	National Urban Development Policy

OAS	Organization of American States
Odeplan	Office of National Planning
PDDUA	Master Plan of Urban Development and Environment of Porto Alegre (*Plano Diretor de Desenvolvimento Urbano e Ambiental de Porto Alegre*)
PET	Territorial Strategic Plan
PND	National Development Plan (*Plan Nacional de Desarrollo)*
PNDOT	Nacional Policy for Development and Territorial Ordering (*Política Nacional de Desarrollo y Ordenamiento Territorial)*
POT	Plan of Territorial Ordering (Plan de Ordenamiento Territorial)
RTPI	Royal Town Planning Institute
RTPI	Royal Town Planning Institute
SCAG	Southern California Association of Governments
SCAG	Southern California Association of Governments
SEAM/ASSOMEC	Special Secretary of Metropolitan Affairs (*Secretaria Extraordinária de Assuntos Metropolitanos)*
SEAM/ASSOMEC	Special Secretary of Metropolitan Affairs (*Secretaria Extraordinária de Assuntos Metropolitanos)*
SiNDOT	National System of Development and Territorial Ordering (*Sistema Nacional de Desarrollo y Ordenamiento Territorial)*
SiNDOT	National System of Development and Territorial Ordering (*Sistema Nacional de Desarrollo y Ordenamiento Territorial)*
SIVAT	Information, Networking, and Technical Assistance for Development and Territorial Ordering systems
SIVAT	Information, Networking, and Technical Assistance for Development and Territorial Ordering systems
SJDC	St John's Development Company
SJDC	St John's Development Company
UK	United Kingdom
US	United States of America
UDC	Urban Development Corporation
UDC	Urban Development Corporation
UDeCOTT	Urban Development Corporation of Trinidad and Tobago
UDeCOTT	Urban Development Corporation of Trinidad and Tobago
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UN-HABITAT	United Nations Human Settlements Programme
WGBC	World Green Building Council

Introduction

This regional study reviews urban planning conditions and trends in Latin America and the Caribbean. It is one of eight regional studies that will serve as inputs into the various chapters of the 2009 Global Report on Human Settlements. The report is organized into nine chapters. Chapter 1 identifies recent fundamental challenges faced by urban areas in the region. Chapter 2 describes the varying nature of the urban context within which planning takes place, with emphasis on the socio-spatial issues which are of concern to urban planning. Chapter 3 reviews the emergence of contemporary or modern urban planning. A discussion of the nature of the institutional and regulatory framework for urban planning is then provided in Chapter 4. Chapter 5 examines the extent to which the planning process is inclusive of relevant stakeholders and communities (participatory/collaborative planning). Chapter 6 considers the role of urban planning in promoting sustainable urban development. An assessment of planning responses to informality in cities including the emergence of related processes (peri-urbanization, urban sprawl, metropolitanization and rural densification) is undertaken in Chapter 7. In Chapter 8, the effects of infrastructure provision on the spatial structure of cities and the implications for planning are reviewed. Chapter 9 discusses the extent to which monitoring and evaluation of urban plans is an integral part of planning processes. Lastly, the final Chapter focuses on the trends in planning education within the region.

1. Urban Challenges and the Need to Revisit Urban Planning

This chapter starts by providing a narrative of the more recent fundamental challenges that urban areas face in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC). These challenges relate to globalization and its uneven impacts, increasing vulnerability of cities to climate change and other environmental concerns, as well as increasing levels of poverty and inequality, among others. Despite their similarities, these urban challenges are always context-specific.

Thereafter, the chapter develops an overall argument about why urban planning, which until recently has been sidelined and neglected around the world and particularly in LAC, remains vitally important for addressing the critical urban issues of the 21st century in the region. It elaborates how assumptions that 'the market' would eventually deal with socio-spatial inequalities and environmental problems have not held and what urban planning systems are expected to deliver. The chapter also considers a different philosophy of planning (or different conceptualization of planning) which is required to confront contemporary urban issues and also develops a set of normative principles, or a way of thinking about the future of urban planning. These normative principles are expected to be applicable within diverse contexts.[1]

1.1. Recent Challenges of Urbanization

The more recent fundamental challenges faced by urban areas in LAC relate to globalization and its uneven impacts, the persistent existence of informal activities and settlements due to heightened poverty and inequality, as well as the increasing vulnerability of cities to climate change, natural disasters and other environmental concerns. Developing countries in Africa, Asia, LAC on account of their rapid pace of urbanization face urban challenges that are remarkably different, in nature or scale, from those of developed countries. Some of these include the proliferation of slums and squatter settlements and the inadequate provision of basic infrastructure and services, air and water pollution, escalating rates of crime and violence, high levels of unemployment, and increasing levels of urban

---

[1] Jackson, 2006.

poverty and ascendancy of the informal sector. This state of affairs is further compounded by the inability of city authorities to effectively manage the consequences of urban growth.

1.2. Urban Population Growth and the Rise of Urban Primacy

While the rate of urbanization in Latin America has slowed somewhat since the late 1980s—due largely to the financial crises that crippled many nations' economies during that "lost decade"—many major cities have continued to expand as a result of organic growth and migration.[2] In 2005, the number of urban dwellers in LAC had reached 434 million, constituting approximately 75% of the total population.[3] Predictions of the future suggest a bleak scenario if the population explosion is not managed. By 2050, the urban population in Latin America is expected to reach a staggering 800 million, posing many potential challenges for governments in the region.[4]

Urban planning literature has long considered rural-urban migration as a major cause of the proliferation of urban settlements in LAC.[5] During the first half of the 20th century, the rise of manufacturing industries decreased economic reliance on the agricultural sector in many regions of the world. This phenomenon had profound effects on LAC's rural-urban migration patterns on different tiers. The industrialization era led to the deployment of highly productive agricultural machineries and this combined with the infiltration of global, commercial agrarian operations—who brought with them the aforementioned mechanized tools—put many smaller farms and manual laborers out of work.[6] Unable to seek viable sources of income, rural migrants flocked to cities in droves, prompting economic powerhouses such as Mexico City and São Paulo to attain population growth rates as high as 6,7% annually during the 1960s. Medium sized cities with industrial bases or strategic locations along trade corridors, such as Curitiba in Brazil or Valencia in Venezuela, also experienced unprecedented and elevated growth rates. By 2005, what were originally metropolitan areas with hundreds of thousands in 1950 had populations of more than 5 million.

Table 1. Populations of the largest cities in LAC

City	Population (in millions)	
	1950	**2005**
Mexico City	2.883	18.735
Sao Paulo	2.334	18.333
Buenos Aires	5.098	12.533
Rio de Janeiro	2.950	11.469
Lima	1.066	7.747
Bogota	6.30	8.320
Santiago	1.322	5.599

Source: World Urbanization Prospects, 2008

---

[2] Gilbert, 1998.

[3] Salyer and Bloom, 2007.

[4] Brea, 2003.

[5] Zoomers, 2002.

[6] Gilbert, 1998.

With more than 80 percent of region's population living in cities, the metropolitanization has become a key characteristic of LAC's urban context.[7] Urban concentrations are becoming transformed into corridors, or clusters of city-regions,[8] city constellations, or megalopolis. Examples include the coastal corridor in Venezuela (encompassing, from west to east, the cities of Maracaibo, Barquisimeto, Valencia, Caracas, Barcelona-Puerto La Cruz, and Cumana) or the one in Brazil (anchored by São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro), despite explicit attempts of these countries to deconcentrate their urban axes and populate the interior.[9] In some cases, metropolitan areas are transnational, such as the case of Buenos Aires-Montevideo.

Urban Primacy and its Consequences

Urban primacy is prevalent in many LAC countries. A primate city, usually a nation's capital, houses a large percentage of the population and has by far the most developed urban infrastructure. It also provides the most prominent financial, industrial, and commercial opportunities for the country's residents.[10] There is the exception of Brazil, where the most influential municipalities (São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro) are not the nation's capitals (although Rio was Brazil's capital in the past). Although substantial growth has been observed in smaller cities in recent years, urbanization in LAC countries is still concentrated in each nation's one or two most populous metropolises. These primate cities can often carry more than twice the population of their countries' second largest cities, as witnessed in Santiago of Chile, Bogota of Colombia, Kingston of Jamaica, Mexico City of Mexico and others.

Table 2. Populations of the largest cities compared with that of the second largest cities in LAC

Country	2005 Population (in millions)	
	Largest City	**Second Largest City**
Argentina	12.533 (Buenos Aires)	1.423 (Cordoba)
Brazil	18.333 (Sao Paulo)	11.469 (Rio de Janeiro)
Colombia	8.320 (Bogota)	2.378 (Cali)
Mexico	18.735 (Mexico City)	4.051 (Guadalajara)
Venezuela	2.930 (Caracas)	1.976 (Maracaibo)

Source: World Urbanization Prospects, 2008

While the advent of transportation networks and the associated drops in travelling costs have facilitated much of the rural-urban migration in the past 50 years, they have consequently contributed to the rise of urban primacy. Gilbert best described migration in the region in the pre-1940s period as "almost an adventure". Migrants had little idea of what to expect when they relocated, and they tended to move in shorter distances.[11] However, this changed rapidly when ever-improving roads and bus connections made long-distance travel cheaper and less arduous. Naturally, rural-migrants became more willing to relocate to faraway cities that presented better economic and employment opportunities. This increase in urban primacy has resulted in a concentration of poverty in cities, and the emergence of many undesirable urban and rural outcomes.

---

[7] North American Congress on Latin America, 1995.

[8] Scott, 2002.

[9] see Irazábal, 2004.

[10] Greenfield, 1994, xv.

[11] Gilbert, 1998.

Table 3. Average Annual rate of change of the largest cities in LAC, 1950 to 2015

City	Average Annual rate of Change (per cent)												
	1950-1955	1955-1960	1960-1965	1965-1970	1970-1975	1975-1980	1980-1985	1985-1990	1990-1995	1995-2000	2000-2005	2005-2010	2010-2015
Bogota	6.99	7.00	6.77	5.84	4.87	2.96	2.96	2.97	2.95	2.92	2.91	2.47	1.38
Buenos Aires	2.58	2.58	2.07	2.04	1.52	1.49	1.11	1.08	1.18	1.21	1.16	0.84	0.52
Caracas	6.40	6.40	4.62	4.35	2.56	1.90	0.90	0.54	0.35	0.34	0.46	1.11	1.30
Lima	4.99	4.99	5.26	5.32	4.30	3.66	2.84	2.63	2.27	1.70	1.70	1.56	1.12
Mexico City	5.53	5.53	5.67	5.52	3.96	3.93	1.62	1.64	1.87	1.39	0.78	0.79	0.71
Rio de Janeiro	3.94	3.94	4.16	4.17	2.60	2.54	1.14	1.09	1.17	1.20	1.20	1.19	0.97
Santiago	4.04	4.04	2.94	2.86	3.41	3.41	2.43	1.88	1.46	1.21	1.19	0.98	0.68
Sao Paulo	5.31	5.31	6.50	6.54	4.65	4.58	2.05	1.96	1.53	1.39	1.39	1.32	0.96

Source: World Urbanization Prospects, 2008

In less developed and economically disadvantaged regions of the world, urbanization is occurring within the context of economic stagnation or low economic growth, rising unemployment, financially weak municipal authorities incapable of providing basic services, and poor governance, with city growth now taking on forms that are largely informal. This has led to the proliferation of slums, extensive peri-urban development, increasing urbanization, high levels of unemployment as well as the *feminization* of poverty. Many cities in LAC, but also in sub-Saharan Africa and parts of Asia, fall within this category. For example, in Argentinean cities with populations of more than 100,000, 57.5 % of the population lives under the poverty line.[12] This trend is becoming more apparent across LAC.

1.3. Globalization and the Multifaceted Nature of Urban Forms

Globalization and Migration

As the trend of urban in-migration accentuates in LAC, social ills that have already been festering along the lines of race and class have become more pronounced.[13] There are some critics who argue that these differences, emerging in the forms of spatial and social inequalities, crime, pollution, and sprawling development, have been the direct result of globalization and the emerging trends that are associated with it. As countries in LAC further open themselves to the world, they disproportionately expose some of their population to wealth while denying others access to basic needs. While inequality prevails, the rise in polarization represents a graver concern.[14]

Manuel Castells[15] and Saskia Sassen[16] have long argued that the rise to prominence of "networked" global financial players have caused new business complexes to congregate in specific pockets of metropolitan areas, either city centers or edge cities. While these global players cluster to create distinct boundaries between themselves and the rest of the metropolitan areas (such as in Santa

---

[12] Bianchi, 1999; Fukuda-Parr, 1999; Thibos, Lavin-Loucks and Martin, 2007.

[13] Portes, Itzigsohn, and Dore-Cabral, 1994.

[14] Castells, 1998.

[15] Castells, 1991.

[16] Sassen, 1991.

Fe, Mexico City or the Bernini Corridor in São Paulo), they also target a handful of technologically-savvy "transnational capitalist class" members as leaders and recruits.[17] As these highly skilled, highly coveted, and highly paid workers establish themselves as the clear urban elites on both the local and global scales, mid and lower-level employees find their job functions eliminated or downgraded with the advent of technology. As a result, many lower-middle class households have fallen into poverty—essentially creating polarized societies that favor the rich and highly-educated, and deny the poor greater income opportunities or livelihoods altogether.

As a counterpart to the urban primacy phenomenon in LAC—now accentuated by globalization trends—some rural and underdeveloped areas in the region have been attaining lower- than-desired rates of urbanization. This phenomenon is characterized by shrinking regions, cities, or towns plagued by marked declines in their economic and social bases, as well as loss of employment opportunities and the ensuing out-migration of population. It usually happens within nation-states, but also takes place across nation-states throughout the region, continuing the periphery-to-centre migration that prompted rapid urbanization for the most part of the 20th century, and caused the swelling of the nations' primary and more prosperous cities. When migration happens across nation-states within LAC, it is driven by an exodus of people from poorer to richer countries or from dangerous to more stable countries, Examples of these migration axes are Bolivia to Argentina, Peru and Colombia to Venezuela, Nicaragua to Costa Rica, Jamaica and Haiti to the Dominican Republic, or the Dominican Republic to Puerto Rico. Some of the migration happens from LAC to North America and Europe, but most particularly to the US of America.[18] This trend illustrates the need for planners and policy makers to address planning at a regional scale.

The Rise of Gated Communities and the Persistence of Informal Settlements

One of the most important aspects of globalization has been the provoked response of simultaneous proliferation of exclusive growth and haphazardly constructed slums. In highly urbanized metropolitan areas—of which there are usually highly developed enclaves marked by global business headquarters and gated communities—the rich and the poor have been separated by more than just economic lines. Latin American cities have become increasingly dichotomous in terms of wealth and class, and such divides have manifested themselves physically in contrasting urban forms.[19]

Those who have access to global capital have found more ways to physically distance themselves from urban poverty, and the dysfunctional circumstances of cities in LAC. The rise of expensive, private fenced properties is well-documented in the urban planning literature of the recent decade. By 2007, gated communities were established for more than 50,000 inhabitants in major metropolitan areas such as Buenos Aires, São Paulo, and Santiago.[20] In Buenos Aires alone, the number of gated communities along its northern highway more than tripled in the 1990s, reaching 500 by the year 2001.[21] Lima's wealthy districts of La Molina and Santiago de Surco hold many gated communities. Wealthy residents of LAC's cities that seclude themselves in this manner benefit from exclusive access to urban services, such as sanitation and infrastructure.

Constructed for a small portion of the cities' populace, gated developments usually occupy significant areas of land and are disconnected from the regular urban street grids. They often have their own schools, universities, shopping malls, golf courses and sport clubs, forming "gated cities" that cater to the middle and upper class inhabitants. They can also be grouped by ethnicity, religion, and other characteristics. They are usually "islands" oriented to those with good incomes, surrounded

---

[17] Sklair, 2000.

[18] Fussell, 2004.

[19] Sassen, 1991; Mollenkopf and Castells 1991; Davis, 2006.

[20] Caldeira, 2000; Bosdorf, Hidalgo, and Sanchez, 2007.

[21] Libertun de Duren, 2006, p. 308.

by areas of great poverty,[22] although gated communities are now sprouting up for people at all income brackets, recently including a *favela* in Rio de Janeiro. In the cases of Argentina[23] and Chile,[24] some private developers have gone as far as to build private highways to link gated communities, and to provide exclusive transit passages for dwellers to access the cities' business districts. Significant fragmentation and social polarization can arise as a result of these growth patterns.

Fear of crime and kidnappings in cities such as Bogota, Medellin, Guatemala City, Managua, Guayaquil, Rio de Janeiro, and Caracas leads to the proliferation of gated communities.[25] In countries such as Mexico, Brazil, and Colombia, some of the extremely wealthier residents commute by bullet-proof vehicles and helicopters, avoiding both traffic and the threat of violence. Such behavior leads to wider social polarization. Gated communities are also a symbol of status and do not necessarily offer greater security to their residents.[26]

On the opposite end of the spectrum are squatter settlements that continue to spring up sometimes in proximity to wealthier neighborhoods and gated communities. Informal settlements in LAC first arose in the 19th century and grew in the earlier 20th century as a result of increased rural-urban migration and urban primacy. As the cities' populations rose with enormous influxes of rural-migrants, city authorities have been unable to provide sufficient housing, services, and infrastructure for the new comers. Many migrant families began to build "self-help" housing, which eventually aggregated to form settlements constructed in a haphazard manner.

Informal settlements remain a primary problem for many metropolises in LAC. In 2005, 31% of Latin America's urban population lived in slums, while many shanty towns are built around Caribbean cities like Haiti's Port Au Prince, which houses 2.5 million residents on infrastructure originally intended for 200 thousand.[27] These slum areas, densely populated and distinctively named *barriadas, barrios marginales, colonias, favelas, inquilinatos,* and *rancherías* depending on the country of location, are constructed out of makeshift materials such as tin and wood, and are usually not serviced by basic necessities such as water and electricity. Often neglected by the local governments, they are also plagued by poverty, crime, poor hygiene, and lack of access to economic opportunities. While population growth has slowed in large part due to the economic crises of the 1980s, informal housing remains omnipresent in LAC. Although government and community collaboration to increase infrastructure provision has raised living conditions in some self-help communities, neglect remains prevalent in many others. The fact that many local governments have devoted their attention solely to more lucrative, higher-end development has only perpetuated the plight of poor city dwellers.

Although globalization remains a prime area of concern for urban planners, recent studies also cite other factors as catalysts for segregation and social polarization. Spatial division is often exacerbated by piecemeal, fragmented decisions dictated by political systems that often favor scenographic and cosmetic planning.[28] This is supported by Libertun de Libertun de Duren's notion of "planning a la carte," referring to the tendency by less affluent municipalities to modify zoning codes ad hoc in order to lure real estate developers. The quotation of an Argentine planner's statement highlighted the severity of the issue: "We are the 'anti-planners'. If someone has a parcel and wants to invest there, he just comes here and asks us to change the zoning code. So we change the code and

---

[22] Crot, 2006.

[23] Libertun de Duren, 2006.

[24] Borsdorf, Hildalgo, and Sanchez, 2007.

[25] Silva, 2006.

[26] Low, 2003; Caldeira, 2000; Blakely and Snyder, 1999.

[27] United Nations Human Settlements Programme, 2006.

[28] Crot, 2006.

everybody is happy, there are more construction jobs, ten more blocks are paved and he has done his business."[29]

Transnational Migration

Urban communities can no longer be fully understood within their regional or even national boundaries. Issues such as immigration flows and controls, transnational cultural exchanges, global manufacturing, distribution, and consumption patterns are inherently tied to the current dynamics of globalization in LAC and beyond.[30] With uneven development only benefiting the upper socio-economic echelons of LAC, many less-privileged residents of the region have resorted to external migration in search for a better living. Many factors fuel immigration outside LAC, particularly towards the US, but also to Spain, Portugal, the UK, Japan, etc. They include the effects of foreign debt, insecurity, corruption, economic restructuring, and the retreat of the state since the 1970s.[31] Many LAC countries received international loans on the condition that they implemented "structural adjustment programs" (SAP), which involved repealing labor protections and agricultural subsidies for local farmers, cutting social spending, limiting regulation, privatizing public utilities, and throwing borders open to foreign imports. Meanwhile, farmers in the US were subsidized by the government and could sell their produce cheaper than local farmers in LAC. Such policies decimated rural economies in LAC and affected urban infrastructure as millions of people from rural areas flooded cities. They usually occupied land subject to landslides and other disasters. The conjunction of natural and social factors further weakened these economies and propelled many people to migrate as economic refugees.[32]

Most commonly, emigrants move from economically disadvantaged countries to nations that offer better economic opportunities and job prospects. Although much of the western media attention in recent decades has focused on the influx of Latin American and Caribbean migrants to developed countries such as Spain, the UK and the US, movement within Central and South America, and the Caribbean has also been prevalent. A recent study conducted by the World Bank showed that as many 74 million "south-to-south" migrants exist globally. Together, they send home between $18 billion to $55 billion a year.[33] The migration axes from Nicaragua to wealthier Costa Rica, Jamaica to the Dominican Republic and the Dominican Republic to Puerto Rico are just some of the prime examples that illustrate the economic relativity and intricate social relationships between the Latin American and Caribbean nations. In some cases, the disparities between national incomes of neighboring countries can be more than five fold, as illustrated by the Dominican Republic and Haiti. Per capita income in the Dominican Republic is $2,850, while in Haiti it is $480.[34]

Likewise, political stability and changes in the governing ideology of a nation can also serve as crucial catalysts for the external migration of citizens. These factors frequently go hand-in-hand with economic well-being within a nation. Very often, citizens of the Americas migrate as a result of a combination of political instability and the associated economic downfalls. A prominent case would be the migration of Cubans to the US in the post-communist revolution period, in which the US. saw its Cuban population expand from 124.000 in 1959 to 1.240.000 in 2000, mostly as a result of Cubans seeking political and economic refuge from Fidel Castro's communist rule.[35] In Cuba's example, the US. immigrants consist of both the wealthy and the poor. Many of the more-privileged classes, already property and business owners in cities such as Miami, US. fled their homeland shortly after 1959 in

---

[29] cited in Libertun de Duren, 2006, p. 308.

[30] Irazábal and Farhat, 2008, p. 223.

[31] Roberts and Portes, 2006.

[32] Irazábal and Farhat, 2008, p. 224.

[33] Deparle, 2007.

[34] Deparle, 2007.

[35] US Census Bureau, 2000.

order to protect their assets, and to escape property and political condemnation. At the same time, since the 1960s, poorer Cubans have crossed illegally to the US borders by boat in search of economic opportunities.

In another instance, Colombia's violent internal conflict between the left-wing guerillas—composed primarily of the Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia and the smaller National Liberation Army —and the extremely-right paramilitary groups has caused a tremendous amount of out-migration from the country. According to the Administrative Department of Security of Colombia, as many as 1.6 million Colombians had left the nation without returning during a seven-year period spanning from 1996 to 2003. In comparison, immigration into the country has been miniscule due to the common perception of widespread insecurity, with small numbers of immigrants coming from neighboring countries such as Venezuela and Ecuador.[36] Colombia's imbalance in migration patterns is an expression of the social and physical consequences of the existing guerrilla warfare. These conditions have greatly impeded effective planning and development in significant portions of the country's less-developed areas, and have deterred longer-term investments from abroad and domestically. This is reflected in the Colombia's macroeconomic conditions, as the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) growth plummeted from 5,8% in 1995 to 4,1% in 1999. In addition, unemployment is as high as 18% in urban centers where three-quarters of Colombia's population resides.[37] Unfortunately, Colombia's migration trends have had severe consequences on the region's urban development on multiple-levels. Emigration by residents frequently increases the burden of destination countries, while Colombian cities less-affected by guerilla violence have become major destinations for poor migrants from the war-torn countryside. As groups like the FARC and the ELN continue to exert their influences in the country's rural areas, a dichotomous pattern of development persists in Colombia, in which the countryside remains desolate and vastly underserved, while the already developed metropolises, such as Bogota and Medellin, become more urbanized and polarized. Fortunately, there are recent hopes for the long-term civil war in Colombia to finally come to an end, which could open up a new era of national, regional, and local planning in the country.

Large-scale internal conflicts have not been foreign to other nations in LAC. Guatemala, El Salvador and Nicaragua have only recently ended their own struggles against civil wars, while civil unrest in poverty stricken countries such as Haiti continue to displace many less-privileged families. How to effectively plan for the influx of emigrants and internal migrants is a question that policy makers and urban planners have to collectively address.

Free Trade Agreements

A key feature of the globalized era has been the implementation of "free-trade" agreements. In the Americas, there have not been instances of free trade, but of government-managed trade. The president of Ecuador, Rafael Correa and many others have denounced the "sophistry of free trade"[38] due to domestic political pressures from powerful corporate, environmental or labor interest groups. The so-called free trade agreements generally reduce the economic freedom of poorer countries and individuals, thereby increasing levels of impoverishment. For example, it is argued that admitting subsidized corn from the US. into Mexico under the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) (even when subsidies violate the notion of free trade) at prices well below production cost (a practice called dumping) has proven detrimental for Mexican farmers.

Championed by many governments worldwide as catalysts of economic prosperity, such agreements have often failed to engender "trickle-down" benefits to lower-income classes touted by economists and political scientists. In 1994, the NAFTA was implemented in the Americas to abolish tariffs for agricultural trade between Canada, Mexico and the US, beginning a series of heated debates about the arrangements' benefits and harms. Although the NAFTA permits agricultural goods to be

---

[36] Migration Policy Institute, 2008.

[37] Migration Policy Institute, 2008.

[38] Acosta and Falconí, 2005.

traded at lower prices, it nonetheless favors large scale Canadian and US. farming interests that are able to mass-produce at lower costs. Alternatively, it has spelt disaster for smaller Mexican farms, putting many of them out of business as they lacked the sufficient scale to compete with transnational commercial farming operations.[39] Unable to subsist in the Mexican agricultural sector, workers of these domestic farms migrate to the US illegally in search for economic opportunities, or move to larger domestic cities that are already combating the social and physical aftermaths of urban primacy. Exacerbating the problem at hand, their agricultural knowledge often fails to translate into valued skills for steady income in an urban setting, making informal housing in peri-urban areas the only affordable option for accommodation. NAFTA is also attributed to have impacted the reduction of *ejido* (communal) land in Mexico, further disenfranchising small producers.

Despite the potential physical and social ills it may cause, the free trade appears to be gaining steam through recent developments. In January 2008, the NAFTA Plus was introduced to allow basic staples of the Mexican diet—sugar, milk, grain, and wheat—to be imported into Mexico from the US duty free, heightening the devastation brought to Mexican farmers and their employees.[40] Although some Latin American interest groups have expressed strong opposition to more US. initiated free trade agreements, the US are actively broadening the scope of its free trade partners by trying to establish bilateral treaties with Colombia and Costa Rica, while successfully ratifying the Dominican Republic-Central America Free Trade Agreement (CAFTA) in 2006, and another with the Peruvian government at the end of 2007.[41]

In implementing such international trade agreements, the dynamics of urbanization are transformed. For Herzog (2000, 2004), the effects of globalization on Latino and Latin American communities on both sides of the US-Mexico border amount to a rather pessimistic "marginality on both sides." Dear and Burridge (2005) extend this to an analysis of structural factors that fuel the urbanization of the "borderland." Of these, the forces of globalization, such as tourism, the commoditization of place (Irazábal and Gómez-Barris, 2007), and the rise of border trade and manufacturing communities, have had a dramatic impact on the geography of border zones. The efforts to theorize the geographies of urbanization in the post-NAFTA, post-border world need to be expanded.

As US. and right-leaning Latin American governments (Peru, Colombia) continue to forge ahead with more free-trade arrangements, grass-root policy makers and urban planners need to pursue the uphill battle of highlighting the agreements' effects on matters such as migration, rural poverty and urban forms, and devise measures that would deter, or at least mitigate these negative impacts. The federal governments, in turn, would need to incorporate these inputs into the process of designing trade policies. There has been a refusal of other Latin American countries to sign free trade agreements with the US., and the Costa Rican trade agreement was only approved in a short-called referendum in 2008. Critics of free trade advocate alternative "fair trade" agreements that introduce greater protection for displaced workers and an improved education system. Alternatives to the Free Trade Area of the Americas (FTAA) proposed by the US have been devised in Latin America including the Bolivarian Alternative for the Americas (*Alternativa Bolivariana para las Américas*), which advocates, a socially-oriented trade block rather than one strictly based on the logic of deregulated profit maximization. The Bolivarian Alternative appeals to the egalitarian principles of justice and equality that are innate in human beings, the well-being of the most dispossessed sectors of society, and a reinvigorated sense of solidarity toward the underdeveloped countries of the western hemisphere, so that with the required assistance, they can enter into trade negotiations on more favorable terms than has been the case under the dictates of developed countries.[42]

---

[39] Smith, 2008; Sigmond, 2008.

[40] de Ita, 2008; *The Economist,* 2008a.

[41] Bachelet and Oppenheimer, 2008; Bachelet, 2007.

[42] Arreaza, 2004, p. 1.

1.4. Social and Environmental Challenges

Crime

Informal, often self-created settlements established due to the lack of affordable housing and well-distributed resources within LAC cities frequently nurture deeply rooted dissatisfaction among the urban poor. Unable to obtain viable sources of income, many squatter residents have resorted to criminal, and often violent, activities in order to generate income and to find a sense of identity. This is reflected in LAC cities' high crime rate, as metropolises such as Medellin had a homicide rate as high as 248 per 10,000 people in 1995.[43] Likewise, more than 900 murders occurred in Jamaica in 2001 alone, many of which took place in Kingston.[44] In Brazil's *favelas*, narcotics-dealing has become the most lucrative form of illicit behavior, giving drug lords tremendous financial and social influence over *favela* residents. In more extreme cases, drug lords have become administrators and law enforcers of the settlements, carrying out capital punishments and dispute resolution on behalf of the communities. Outside of organized crime, less severe illicit activities like pick-pocketing and independent robberies are also common in urban areas of LAC.

The prevalence of crime in many areas of LAC has grave implications on the social and physical environment of cities. Firstly, the perception of insecurity has caused a voluntary seclusion of the wealthy, with the rich drawing themselves into exclusionary communities guarded by gates and security guards. These walls serve as a reminder of the class-based lines that cannot be crossed, which exacerbates physical and social segregation and alienation, and does little to alleviate crime. Secondly, aggressive police efforts to curb illegal activities have frequently affected innocent bystanders of the informal settlements. In Rio de Janeiro's *favelas*, police raids have often been indiscriminate and violent, resulting in the deaths of many community residents, including children.[45] As retaliation becomes commonplace among gangs and police, mistrust between *favela* dwellers and authorities deepens. This is apparent when recent trends saw several *favelas* in Rio attempt to equip their settlements with gates and cameras to survey police movements.[46] The rise in crime has negatively affected trusts and sociability in poor communities too, diminishing social capital and quality of life. As crime remains prevalent in urbanized areas, detrimental changes in urban forms that encourage social and physical segregation continue to arise.

Poverty and political disenfranchisement can breed crime. As many young Latin Americans and Latinos in the US continue to lack access to education, recreation, and job opportunities, and as they face poverty, hopelessness, and disenfranchisement, some turn to gangs. An unfortunate consequence of this is the export of gang culture to Central America from the poor Latino neighborhoods of large US industrial cities, mostly as a consequence of amendments to immigration laws, which traded repatriation of aliens with the commuting of sentences.[47] Gangs such as *Mara Salvatrucha-13*,[48] a Los Angeles export, became involved in some of the most horrific prison executions, street wars, and urban terror that cities such as San Salvador and Tegucigulpa had ever seen.[49] These violent syndicates exert their control and influences by terrorizing and intimidating the less wealthy parts of urban

---

[43] Mesquita Neto, 2002

[44] Colon, 2001.

[45] Human Rights Watch, 2008.

[46] Vargas, 2006.

[47] Wolfe, 2005.

[48] Mara Salvatrucha-13, also known as MS-13, is a dominant street gang that has presence in both the Central America and US. It first started in Los Angeles when Salvadorans escaping from the civil war banded together to engage in illegal activities (Goodale, 2006).

[49] McGirk, 2000; Goodale, 2006; Irazábal and Farhat, 2008, p. 218.

Guatemala, El Salvador and Honduras, committing rapes, executions and kidnappings at their own discretion.[50]

Migrants, Race, Ethnicity and the Peripheral City: Indigenous and African Groups

Indigenous peoples and residents of African origin continue to struggle with the remnants of colonial mentality that persists in the region. Often unable to obtain desirable employment and housing due to their ethno-racial and legal and/or socio-economic status, these disadvantaged groups are often pushed out to informal settlements located at the peripheries of the cities.[51]

The disenfranchisement of indigenous and African-descendent groups in LAC dates back to colonial times. Indigenous groups in the region were massacred during the European conquest of the continent. Those that survived the genocide of the indigenous Americans and the enslavement of Africans were subjugated as servants and despised as inferior.[52] They were also relegated from the nation-building and myth-making processes of the republics constituted after independence. Since colonial times, indigenous groups in LAC have been deprived of human rights and upward-mobility opportunities. They have been dispossessed of land or left out of the land distribution schemes in most countries.[53] Many constitute the rural and urban poor, and engross the numbers of informal economy workers or become beggars and inhabitants in substandard and informal housing. The ones that work in the cities are often pushed to live in the outskirts because they cannot afford housing within the city. Outside the metropolitan areas, many live in agriculturally poor mountains or plains, often lacking adequate access to transportation, education and health. Although there is an increasing trend towards sustainable transport planning in Latin America as a response to public pressures on governments, these less-privileged groups remain largely plagued by poor mobility.

Nowadays, the situation of indigenous and Afro-descendant groups has improved, but there is persistent neglect of their conditions by many LAC governments. Institutional racism is still rampant and is a deeply ingrained problem, though progress to overcome it has been made in Ecuador,[54] Bolivia,[55] Brazil[56] and other LAC countries.[57] Policy-makers and planners in many LAC government institutions and NGOs have been working to mitigate negative conditions and new national constitutions have been implemented (in Venezuela, Brazil, Bolivia, etc.) to expand the rights of indigenous groups to self-determination, land rights, cultural protection, etc.

There are ongoing and varied debates and developments about the inclusion of indigenous and Afro-descendent groups in LAC. For instance, in Brazil and other LAC countries, there is a persistent "myth of racial democracy", although it has been contested.[58] Another fertile notion to analyze the condition of indigenous groups in LAC is that of the "permitted Indian" (*indio permitido*),[59] which refers to the manipulation of cultural rights by government and international agencies to domesticate and divide indigenous movements. Whereas the thesis of the *indio permitido* articulates a critique of the shortcomings and ambiguities of neoliberal governance and control reforms, recent events reveal

---

[50] Schofield, 2008.

[51] Fagen, 1977.

[52] Galeano, 1997 [1970].

[53] Horton, 2006.

[54] Zomosc, 2007.

[55] Healey, 2007.

[56] Barrows, 2006.

[57] Radcliffe, 2007; Wahbel et al., 2007.

[58] Ferreira, 1998, 2001; Freeman, 2002, 2008.

[59] Rivera-Cusicanqui, 1996; Hale, 2004.

the partial failure of this project, pointing to the factors that account for innovations in the mass protests that have been taking place in Bolivia and Guatemala.[60]

In addition, Brazil and other LAC countries hold heated debates about the pros and cons of the creation of "indian nations" within the countries territories and the implications of these for national unity. Encouraging recent developments include the validation of indigenous knowledge through the *Universidad Indígena* of Venezuela founded in 2004 in the Bolivar state[61] and the democratic election of the first indigenous president in LAC—Evo Morales in Bolivia. His presidency, however, has been threatened by secessionist attempts by the elite of Santa Cruz and other regions of Bolivia.

The Informal Economy

Due to the high levels of unemployment (LAC on a whole had an unemployment rate of 7.3% in 1997, with countries like Jamaica, Dominican Republic and Panama leading the pack with a rate of higher than 15%,[62] along with the increasing levels of urban poverty, the last few decades have increased the dominance of the informal economy's position on Latin America's streetscape.[63] As of 1989, as much as 60-80% of Peru's population was engaged in "extralegal entrepreneurship."[64] Not surprisingly, the informal sector often comes hand in hand with the proliferation of self-help housing and informal settlements. In recent years, the sector has experienced a dramatic expansion, as deindustrialization prompted the demise of many mid- and low-level job functions. Salaried work has become increasingly out of reach for the less-privileged, and many poorer families have resorted to seeking income through street vending.

The formats of these street ventures vary greatly. Street entrepreneurs can sell anything from food and clothes to crafted goods that are placed on the ground, booths, or wheeled carts. While informal businesses generate some levels of income for many of the cities' inhabitants, their presence also has important implications for urban forms. There is a tug-of-war between Quito's legislators and street vendors, an example of how informal commerce plays a key role in the dynamics of expansion and exclusion in the historic centers of LAC cities.[65] While vending is generally permitted in designated market spaces, the operation of unlicensed businesses on the streets is generally outlawed. Some cities, such as Mexico City, Lima and Caracas, have gone, at different periods, as far as trying to evict all street vendors from their historic center, even though extreme measures as such are generally short-lived.[66] As the informal sector continues to grow, concerns about pollution and congestion emerge. Moreover, informal commerce is often regarded as an eyesore by many Latin American governments concerned with the image of their cities. This ongoing struggle between the elites and the less-privileged majority then begs the question that commonly haunts urban planners: "whose streets are these?" The rights of the urban poor to the city remain an ongoing challenge.[67]

Border Regions

Border regions between LAC countries and other neighboring countries encompass distinct planning challenges. While some communities live peaceful bi-national lives along these frontiers, border

---

[60] McNeish, 2008.

[61] González, Guerrero, 2007.

[62] Comisión Económica para América Latina y el Caribe, CELAC/ECLAC, 1997.

[63] Alvarez Leguizamón, 2005.

[64] De Soto, 1989.

[65] Bromley, 1998; see also Chion and Ludeña, 2008, for a discussion on Lima; Broudehoux, 2001 for a discussion on Rio de Janeiro.

[66] Associated Press, 2007.

[67] Broudehoux, 2001.

regions are often times difficult to access or to trespass, and constitute areas of security risks. The border among Colombia-Venezuela-Ecuador is one in which drug-, arm-, mineral- and human trafficking are common. Areas along these borders have constituted guerrilla havens and terrains where states engage in occasional battles against guerrillas. Some of these areas are also lands that have been *de jure* or *de facto* granted to some indigenous groups for their communities. In the border between Venezuela and Brazil, significant mineral mining (performed by *garimpeiros* often working under inhuman and unsustainable conditions),[68] deforestation and self-determination of indigenous groups take place. There is a long-dated discord between Bolivia and Chile because the lack of access to the sea for Bolivia (which can only take place through Chile's land concession) is hampering its economic opportunities (trade, tourism, recreation) and straining bi-national relations between the two nations. Recently, Bolivian President Evo Morales vowed that his nation will not give up peacefully its sea access seized by Chile during a war in the 19th century.[69]

Border regions are also pivotal points along main migratory corridors. In particular, the Dominican Republic-Haiti border, the Guatemala-Mexico border, and the US-Mexico border serve as prominent examples of this category.[70] Some cities are growing very rapidly along the Mexican side of the border as migrants station there before attempting to cross the border undocumented, or remain there if they are deported from the US. This is evident in the case of Tijuana, Mexico, which saw its population nearly tripled from 1980 to 2000.[71] Meanwhile, other cities are shrinking due to difficulties in maintaining previous economic and labor dynamics across borders, caused by the current escalation of border militarization. The decision to tighten US border control in the late 1960s, for instance, created physical barriers with Mexico and affected Mexican and Mexican American self-identification and practices at both sides of the border.[72] This augmented the formation of many poor settlements or "*colonias*" along the Mexico border.[73]

Furthermore, the borders areas are zones of intensified socio-economic and environmental disparities between countries. This is echoed in the Massacre River region along the Dominican Republic-Haiti border, as border town Ouanaminthe carries eight times the population of its Dominican counterpart, Dajabon, while being vastly underserved by running water and electricity.[74]

Along the US-Mexico border, but also in other LAC countries, there are '*maquilas*' or '*maquiladoras*', factories that import materials and equipment on a duty- and tariff-free basis for assembly or manufacturing outside the US. Once assembled, the products are then re-exported, usually back to the US. *Maquiladoras* lessen the production costs of transnational corporations by using cheap labor and responding to fewer, if any, environmental standards. They have sprouted across the US-Mexico border in the second half of the twentieth century, attracting migrants from the rest of the country to these border cities, which are growing mostly informally and without proper urban infrastructure and services for the *maquila* workers.

Growing urban inequalities and human rights violations exacerbate problems along the borders. Some border cities are subjected to perverse crimes related to human and drug trafficking across borders, but also against women, such as in the case of the feminicide and torture of hundreds of young and poor women in Ciudad Juarez. Proper planning for street infrastructure and transportation from-to work is believed to be able to significantly improve the safety of these women.[75] The unsolved

---

[68] see Salgado, 1997.

[69] Jiang, 2008.

[70] Herzog, 1991; Pick, Viswanathan, and Hettrick, 2001.

[71] Instituto Nacional De Estadística Y Geografía, 2000.

[72] Sanchez, 1993.

[73] Bressi, 1993.

[74] Deparle, 2007.

[75] Vázquez-Castillo, 2006.

murders of women in Ciudad Juarez and deaths of migrants in the US deserts are some examples.[76] Migrants from LAC who succeed in reaching the US often suffer a "triple disenfranchisement":

First, a push from hometowns to border regions: the same forces of globalization that sustain US-based rural economies have decimated the livelihoods of many Mexican and Central American villagers, forcing migrants to relocate to border communities for employment in the industrial belts of the US-Mexico border. Second, migration from border regions to US cities: as industrial activity in the border weakens as corporations chase lower wages in East Asia, many travel across the border seeking livelihoods. Finally, as job polarization and gentrification in US cities push forward, many suffer further displacement into meager jobs and the exurban fringes.[77]

One important feature of the geographic processes of de-territorialization and re-territorialization of migrants in LAC and Latinos in the US is that they are transnationalized, i.e., they draw on intense and sustained migratory flows, cultural and economic exchanges, and hybridizations across national borders. They produce transnational urbanisms.[78] On the one hand, there are processes of sustained migration, especially from the smaller towns and villages in Mexico and Central America to the US. On the other hand, immigrants help sustain (through remissions) the economies of their homelands, many of which are in decline as a result of aggressive (and often US. sponsored) neo-liberal policies.[79] The growing "Hispanic nation" in the US also benefits from a communications revolution that makes it possible to build "communities without propinquity" across the Americas.[80]

While most contemporary theories of tourism, travel, and place emphasize the erosion of national boundaries and the fluidity of territories, the cases of the US.-Mexico and the Mexico-Guatemala borders reveal the opposite phenomenon as well—the strengthening of national borders and their impact on the (im)mobility of millions of individuals.[81] While migrant populations continue be on the move, both as a result of socio-economic limitations and the increased fortification of the US.-Mexico and Mexico-Guatemala borders, deportation sweeps and a political climate that defines immigrants as 'aliens' have decidedly dimmed the prospect of mobility across the US border.[82] The ecological challenges are also pressing. Bi-national water basins, wild habitats, and animal migratory corridors are threatened by the border fences and by bi-national policies[83]

The unique political economy, ecology, geography, and planning challenges of the "troublesome border" between the US and Mexico[84] and others in LAC are an invitation to planning practice and scholarship on pressing issues. They include pollution, ecological degradation, social and spatial inequalities, violence, racial strife, migration, drug smuggling, official corruption, the effects of border policing, the economic, labor, and environmental impacts of NAFTA and the proposed Free Trade Area of the Americas (FTAA/ALCA).[85]

---

[76] Vázquez-Castillo, 2006; Huspek, Martinez, and Jimenez, 1998.

[77] Irazábal and Farhat, 2008, p. 223

[78] Smith, M.P. 2001, 2005.

[79] Remissions to LAC increased 7 percent in 2007, but in the previous seven years the increase had been more than 10 percent. The region's remissions amounted to US$66,500 millions, albeit recent decreases in remissions to Mexico (given the slowing condition of the US economy and the stricter application of immigration laws) and Brazil (given improving economic conditions in this country and the relative strength of the Brazilian currency) (Inter-American Development Bank, 2007).

[80] Arreola, 2004; Irazábal and Farhat, 2008, p. 218.

[81] Irazábal and Gómez-Barris, 2007, p. 186.

[82] Irazábal and Gómez-Barris, 2007, p. 187.

[83] Pezzoli, 2000, 2002; Herzog, 2000.

[84] Pezzoli, 2000, 2003; Martínez, 2006.

[85] Arreola and Curtis, 1993; Martínez, 2006; Irazábal and Farhat, 2008, p. 223.

Environmental Degradation, Resource Exploitation and Tourist Development

In LAC, especially in Central America and the Caribbean, the tourism and retirement industries are expanding rapidly and exacerbating existing ecological damages brought by such developments. In some cases, entire countries such as Costa Rica and islands of the Caribbean, and significant regions of countries, such as the Pacific and Caribbean coastal areas of Mexico, have been subjected to explosive and uncontrolled growth in the tourist industry and/or retirement industry. Mega-resorts, luxurious second-home developments, and retirement communities often times damage or destroy fragile ecosystems and increase socio-economic polarization. Some good examples of sustainable tourism or eco-tourism practices exist in the region, particularly in Costa Rica, but there is an urgent need to scale them up and make them widespread. Also, some eco-tourism initiatives fail to benefit those who are truly in need, though they do prove to be effective in the preservation of the habitat.[86] Some initiatives also fail to be maintained in a timely fashion. Unplanned tourist development can contribute to a loss of cultural identity, the production of a "geography of nowhere" (lack of sense of place), and partial foreign takeover as multi-international ventures exploit the travel and hotel industries. Some negative social effects include the rise in drug use and trafficking, prostitution, and the loss of public access to beachfronts and other natural areas.[87]

The search for and exploitation of oil and gas is having negative effects on Amazonian cities and villages,[88] prompting disputes concerning contamination and its adverse effects on residents' health. Disputes often pitch powerful transnational corporations against politically disenfranchised local, indigenous communities. Conflicts between preservation and development are common in the eight-nation Amazon region. In Ecuador, President Correa's oil policies may result in more disputes with foreign companies and reduced oil production.[89] Oil, Ecuador's largest export, currently outweighs tourism, Ecuador's fourth largest source of foreign exchange. Oil companies depict the area as a pool of underground wealth, while organizers of ecological tourism argue that it should be preserved as it is for the region's 100,000 Indian inhabitants, tourists, and scientists. With about one-third of the country covered by Amazon rain forest, oil drillers and tourist operators increasingly say the area is too small for both industries.[90] Deforestation of the Amazon for timber, agriculture and cattle-raising have resulted in climate changes at the global level. In addition, the poor quality of the soil makes these ventures unsustainable as long-term economic projects.

Natural Disasters, Planning for Risk Reduction and Post-Disaster Recovery

There is a recurring and expanding need for pre- and post-disaster recovery planning, particularly in light of the increasing occurrences of hurricanes, tornados, floods, landslides, and earthquakes in LAC. Hurricanes commonly occur in defined belts of the Caribbean and on the west coast of Central America and Mexico. Human-induced desertification is widespread in circumscribed arid or semiarid areas of South America and Mexico. Geologic hazards such as earthquakes, volcanic eruptions or tsunamis constitute a significant threat in virtually any area of LAC. There is also growing awareness of the challenges arising from global climate change, and the need to search for sustainable energy sources.[91]

Since 1960, earthquakes, hurricanes, floods, droughts, desertification and landslides in the LAC region have killed 180,000 people, disrupted the lives of 100 million more, and caused more than US$54 billion in property damage. The adverse effects on employment, balance of trade, and foreign

---

[86] Silva, 2003.

[87] Morán, 2008; Irazábal and Morán, 2008.

[88] Kruckewitt, 2005.

[89] *Latin Business Chronicle*, 2007.

[90] Brooke, 1993.

[91] Davis, 2005, 2006.

indebtedness continue to be felt years after the occurrence of a disaster. Activities intended to further development, such as land reclamation, high-rise construction and informal settlement establishment on unsuitable land, often exacerbate the impact of natural hazards. The poorest countries and the poorest segments of the region's populations are worst affected by disasters. International relief and rehabilitation compensates the stricken countries for only a small part of their losses.[92]

As of now, many LAC countries are not even adequately equipped against fairly regular events such as torrential rains, as evident in the floods often suffered in Jamaica's cities, which cost the government $US millions annually in clean up operations.[93] However, the impacts of global environmental risks and natural hazards can be minimized provided risks are identified and effective mitigation measures put in place. The benefits of vulnerability reduction may greatly outweigh the costs of potential damages and post-disaster interventions. For example, existing information is rarely sufficient for the evaluation of landslide potential in informal settlement areas of Rio de Janeiro, but new techniques can help create landslide and flood zone maps that illustrate the relationship of landslides and floods to causative factors such as bedrock, slope, moisture conditions, etc.[94] These maps can in turn be used in educational programs tailored for settlement dwellers. Improved warning and evacuation systems can cut the death toll of hurricanes dramatically. Combinations of structural and non-structural mitigation measures have been succeeded in alleviating the effects of earthquakes, landslides, floods and droughts. Examples of structural measures include building codes and materials specifications, retrofitting of existing structures to make them more hazard-resistant and protective devices such as dikes. Non-structural measures concentrate on identifying hazard-prone areas and limiting their use. Examples include land-use zoning, tax incentives, insurance programs and the relocation of residents away from the path of hazards. Since structural mitigation measures have a direct cost that must be added to the costs of a project, emphasizing non-structural mitigation in LAC can be more cost-effective. Non-structural measures may have some capital and/or operating costs but these are usually less than those of structural costs.[95]

The most effective approach to reducing the long-term impact of natural hazards is to incorporate natural hazard assessment and mitigation activities into the process of urban planning and to invest in project formulation and implementation. Yet the countries of the region are slow to undertake actions of vulnerability reduction or to request financing for them. Development organizations and donor agencies have been reluctant to finance disaster prevention initiatives and most development cooperatives provide little service in this subject area. Despite the cost-effectiveness of mitigation measures, more than 90 percent of international funding for natural hazard management in the region is spent on disaster preparedness, relief, rehabilitation, and reconstruction, leaving less than 10 percent for pre-disaster prevention. Planners and decision-makers in LAC countries and development assistance agencies have to incorporate natural hazard considerations early in the processes of development planning and investment project formulation, and place a higher value on risk reduction in the evaluation of investment projects. Lastly, they need to increase expenditures on preventive measures related to rehabilitation and reconstruction.[96]

1.5. Urban Planning Revisited

Urban planning in LAC has often been thwarted by changes in governing bodies, lack of constituency involvement, financial constrains, natural disasters and other challenges, resulting in failed implementation of plans. However, with the growing challenges faced by many cities in the region, there is a need to bring urban planning back into the forefront of urban management. Thus, planning in

---

[92] Organization of American States, 1990, 1991.

[93] *Jamaica Gleaner*, 2006.

[94] Organization of American States, 1990, 1991.

[95] Organization of American States, 1990, 1991.

[96] Organization of American States, 1990, 1991.

urban LAC must encompass a two-fold approach: planning proactively for a more sustainable and equitable future, and retrofitting current settlements through public capital investments, public-private partnerships, community empowerment, land use controls and other policy-based planning interventions.[97]

City authorities' relative inability to effectively plan for and manage the consequences of urban growth only serves to further compound the challenges discussed above. In planning for the future, Latin American and Caribbean countries, regions and cities must learn from past mistakes to develop new frameworks for success. Until now, many have followed approaches such as those in Costa Rica, where a national focus on market-led economic growth frequently signifies that community development and participation have been postponed in favor of large-scale industry.[98] Citizen participation, however, is key to sustainable urban development and countries must develop new ways of reaching out to their constituencies to create legitimate and sustainable planning interventions. After the wave of national democratization and municipal devolution of power that swept the region in the last decades of the 20th century, many residents of cities in LAC started demanding a voice in processes that impact the fate of their communities and places.[99] The rational or traditional model of planning has gradually transformed in some cases into a more participatory or collaborative model of planning. Some examples of successful participatory planning encompass Participatory Budgeting in Porto Alegre, Brazil[100] and agrarian reform and urban tenure land distribution in parts of Brazil and Venezuela.[101]

The challenges posed by the failure to properly plan and take action in the last several decades must be addressed in order to have prosperous cities. A favorable first step would be for governments across LAC to reach consensus about both the negative effects of top-down master planning and the values of neo-traditional urbanism.[102] By establishing a true partnership with grass-roots citizens in planning processes, "urban upgrading has the potential to solve some of the immediate physical needs of the poor, taking advantage of the valuable existing physical and social community assets, empowering communities, and helping incrementally in the improvement of city infrastructure."[103] Yet, working to overcome the challenges of informal settlements is much more challenging than planning for new development.

In LAC, there will be a continued migration of populations to and natural growth of the cities and planners need to be prepared to cope with this influx. The World Bank's urban poverty reduction policy includes two valuable recommendations that can be applied to urban planning:[104] 1) accept the right of poor people to the city, abandoning attempts to discourage migration and prevent urban growth; and 2) adopt a broad and long-term vision of the use of urban space—providing minimally serviced land for housing, planning in advance to promote sustainable land use and looking beyond the cities' borders to minimize their 'ecological footprint'.

Experiences from international "best practices" and demonstrative projects in the region illustrate that planning is an effective instrument for positive change. For instance, the "Barcelona Model," although criticized for its elitist focus on flashy projects, has also shown to many cities in Latin America what urban planning and design is able to accomplish, and consultants from Barcelona have

---

[97] Panfichi, 2002; Gilbert and Faust, 1984.

[98] Silva, 2003.

[99] Holzner, 2007; Klesner, 2007.

[100] Abers, 1996.

[101] Wiesenfeld, 1997; Varley, 2007.

[102] This term is derived both from vernacular values of urbanism in LAC, and imported notions of New Urbanism and Smart Growth.

[103] The World Bank, 2002.

[104] The World Bank, 2007.

contributed to planning in several Latin American cities. The popularity of "strategic planning" in the continent continues to grow as demonstrative projects in the region display its effectiveness. Some "good practices" were more apparent in the way they transformed the built environment (following the Barcelona Model) and others in the way they improved and democratized planning processes (such as in the Participatory Budget experiences). However, most of these models fall short of addressing socio-spatial equity concerns, a particularly urgent need in the region.

Finally, urban planning in LAC should be context-sensitive. Each city will require special policies to address its needs. Policy-based planning needs to be tailored to specific political, cultural, economic and environmental conditions. Conversely, there is also a need for collective and regional planning efforts to produce ecologically sustainable social, economic and political development.[105]

Urban planning in LAC has to face the intensification and pervasiveness of urban problems and challenges in many regions of LAC and the managerial complexities derived from the increasing political fragmentation and demographic diversification related to growing metropolitanization.[106] The notion of the "Just City" should serve as an empowering framework for contemporary urban actors to improve the quality of urban life. As Marcuse et al. argue,

much more far-reaching changes are required in the development of our cities than many professionals, and particularly planners, contemplate. ... a forthright call for justice in all aspects of city life, putting the question of what a Just or a Good or an Ideal City should be on the day-to-day agenda of urban reform, can be a practical approach to solving concrete questions of urban policy.[107]

Normative definition of urban planning for LAC

LAC is the region with the largest socio-spatial inequality in the world, with 5% of its constituents earning a quarter of all nation income in 2007.[108] Additionally, many countries in the region top the global rankings in wealth disparity, as Guatemala, Haiti, Panama, Colombia, Brazil, Bolivia and Paraguay all exhibit Gini Coefficients upward of 0.55.[109] On a micro level, inequality within the cities within LAC nations can be clearly witnessed (e.g., contrast between formal and informal parts of Bogotá, Caracas, Lima, or Rio de Janeiro). With LAC composing the largest percentage of urban population in the world, the mitigation of urban socio-spatial inequality emerges as the most pressing and challenging issue for the region.

Thus, planning for LAC should strive to be an exercise for the expansion of social and spatial equity in the region. With that goal in mind, planning should be a participatory and inclusive process of ongoing dialogue and decision-making that conceives and promotes development strategies that are tailored for specific communities and their settlements. It should consider the diversity of needs and expectations of all stakeholders; the expansion of human and social capital; the creation, maintenance, and management of a supportive urban infrastructure for economic and community development; and the adoption of sustainable development strategies (including the sustainable use of land, water, energy sources, and other resources; the ecological integration of other species and open spaces into the urban landscape; the protection of migratory corridors, water basins, fragile ecosystems, and endangered species; and the reduction of and adequate management of waste and pollution).

---

[105] Harris, 2002.

[106] Angotti, 1996; Irazábal, 2005; 2008; Roberts, 2005.

[107] Marcuse et al., forthcoming, np.

[108] Gafar, 1998, p. 599; Peters and Skop, 2007.

[109] Portes and Hoffman, 2003; United Nations Development Programme, 2007.

As planners in LAC consider these normative guidelines, they should strive to bridge the gap between theoretical conceptualizations of urban justice and sustainability and the reality of planning and building cities.

2. Diversity of the Urban Context

This chapter identifies and analyzes the diversity of the urban context of LAC in terms of rate and level of urbanization, resultant spatial forms, income or level of economic development, and coastal vs. inland locations of different cities. By studying the diversity of the urban context, economic, social and political problems can be identified so that they can be resolved through urban planning.

2.1. Current Trends of Urbanization

As a whole, LAC can be characterized as a highly urbanized region. In 2007 the total share of LAC residents living in urban areas stood at 78.3 per cent. With a greater proportion of urbanized areas than Europe, LAC's patterns of urbanization carry similarities to those observed in North America.[110] The region underwent its most significant period of urbanization between 1940 and 1980, as rural-urban migration caused certain cities originally with tens of thousands of residents to attain populations upward of 10 million.[111] But as LAC's economic growth slowed down with the 1980s economic crises, so did its pace of urbanization.

The level of urbanization in LAC varies drastically across the region. Large countries are more urbanized than small countries. The four largest nations (Brazil, Mexico, Colombia, and Argentina) contain an urban population of approximately 80 per cent, while smaller countries usually have an urban population hovering somewhere between 45 per cent and 60 per cent.[112] The rates of urbanization also differ among countries of the region. Countries that have higher levels of urbanization in general experience lower rates of urbanization than those with moderate or low levels of urbanization.[113] These nations with lower levels of urbanization, in turn, become the main drivers of LAC's population growth.

---

[110] United Nations, 2008

[111] Gilbert, 1998.

[112] Cerrutti and Bertoncello, 2003, p. 4.

[113] Cerrutti and Bertoncello, 2003, p. 5-6.

Table 4. Urbanization Rates across LAC

Country	Rate of Urbanization (per cent)				
	1970	**1980**	**1990**	**2000**	**2005**[114]
Argentina	78,4	83,0	86,9	89,6	90,6
Bahamas	71,8	75,1	83,6	88,5	90,0
Brazil	55,6	67,3	74,7	79,9	81,7
Colombia	57,7	64,4	69,4	74,5	76,6
Chile	73,0	79,0	82,8	85,7	86,9
Cuba	60,1	68,0	74,8	79,9	81,9
Haiti	19,7	24,5	30,5	38,1	41,8
Jamaica	41,5	46,8	51,5	56,1	58,5
Trinidad and Tobago	63,0	63,1	69,1	74,1	76,1
Mexico	58,9	65,5	71,4	75,4	77,2
Venezuela	71,8	78,9	83,9	87,4	88,8

Source: Cerrutti and Bertoncello, 2003, p. 7

Areas that are urbanizing at higher rates also face a set of challenges that are distinct from those faced by areas with lower levels and rates of urbanization. Countries that exhibit the highest Human Development Index (HDI) are usually the most urbanized, while nations that have the lowest HDI are mostly rural.[115] Thus, one may argue that a country's rate of urbanization is positively correlated to its HDI. However, that is not to say that urbanized areas are free from problems of their own. Indeed, many urbanized areas of LAC are currently exposed to noxious amounts of pollution due to heavy automobile usage. Meanwhile, crime remains a prime concern in most of these metropolises. In many cases, slum prevalence in metropolitan areas is cited as a root cause for high crime rates. This can be exemplified by the case of Kingston, Jamaica, where more than 900 murders were committed alone in 2001.[116] In Rio de Janeiro, 1.857 minors were murdered in 2007, with most of the atrocities occurring in the city's *favelas*.[117] Less severe crimes are also common in LAC urban areas. In 2002, Peruvian police estimated that 34,000 thefts, 28,000 break-ins, 6,000 cases of frauds and 3,500 youth gang attacks occurred in Lima, a city of 7 million.[118]

2.2. Types of Growth

Informal Settlements

In many poor cities and less wealthy areas of other cities, low-income households are settling into informal housing built on cheaper land that is usually undesirable due to geographical and political factors. In many cases, there is no jurisdiction over these lands because the government does not regard these areas as a part of the city. As a result, such areas develop into distinct urban forms that are not only socially and politically separate from the city, but also physically and spatially segregated.

---

[114] Based on estimates by Cerrutti and Bertoncello, 2003.

[115] Cerrutti and Bertoncello, 2003, p. 6.

[116] Colon, 2001.

[117] Naim, 2007.

[118] Inter Press Service, 2002.

The city of Bogotá, including its skyscrapers and office buildings, is situated on a flat plateau surrounded by mountains that are inhabited by the poor. North Bogotá is characterized by the wealth of its inhabitants and by the modernity of its infrastructure, architecture and economy. In the South, the economy is less developed with smaller shops and less merchandise, populated by inhabitants that are usually of indigenous racial background and poorer. Further south, the environment deteriorates as roads are laden with potholes and housing is constructed with poorer quality and less durable materials. Citizens purchase their own plots of land in Bogotá and each family constructs its own house with makeshift building blocks such as wood and metallic sheets, as they cannot afford up-to-date means of construction. Although there is regularity in the parcels, the houses drastically differ from each other, giving rise to an urban form that is largely informal.

Caracas is a highly dense, modernized city in Venezuela that is located in a series of narrow valleys with ranchos or shantytowns on the slopes of the mountains. From 1941 to 1961, Venezuela's urban population grew dramatically from 300,000 to 1.3 million people mostly due to migration from the countryside. This caused a concomitant rise in demand for housing. Consequently, at the start of the democratic movement from 1945-1948, the immigrants invaded the mountains but the government did not take preventive action as it was more focused on improving the image of the newly urbanized city. The ranchos in the mountains were for long informal settlements because they were not regulated by the government. Although the government has taken measures in the past to relocate rancho dwellers into subsidized housing, these programs failed due to corruption and lack of sound policy. Recently, the government has focused some efforts into regularization and upgrading.

The *favelas* of Rio de Janeiro are the most notorious settlements of the poor. Rio de Janeiro is one of the most unequal cities in Latin America where most of the *favela* population is poor and most of the homes are either poorly serviced or not serviced at all. The wealthy live directly next to the beaches where they are isolated from the rest of the city by mountains whereas most of the poor live far from the city center to the north or west where land prices are much cheaper. The local government has implemented the *Favela-Bairro* program as a way to integrate the *favelas* into the rest of the urban fabric by design, construction and by connecting infrastructure to the settlements.

Port Au Prince has always served as the Haiti's main economic and industrial driver. As residents all over the country continue to migrate towards the capital for economic opportunities, a city originally intended for 200,000 has swelled to become a metropolis of more than 2.5 millions. As a result, haphazardly erected informal settlements have emerged all around the city as the population far outstripped the capabilities of the existing infrastructure. With rings of districts that radiate from the centre, the city is fragmented into wealthy districts, and poor, crime-ridden neighbourhoods. Affluent suburbs such as Petionville are located south of the centre, while notoriously violent settlements like Cite Soleil are scattered around the city's battered downtown. Although efforts have been made by the government and the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) to rehabilitate the downtown area, polarization, widespread poverty and slum prevalence remain serious in Port Au Prince.

Kingston is by far the most populous city in Jamaica. With the country's unemployment rate standing at nearly 16 per cent in 2005, much of the capital's population is unable to afford formal accommodation. This has resulted in the establishment of many informal settlements around the city. While businesses, middle and upper class residences punctuate small sections of the cityscape, Kingston's urban fabric is largely composed of slums unserviced by basic infrastructure such as running water and electricity. The East Central Section of the St. Andres District is an area particularly affected by the lack of urban planning, prompting some to call it "a patchwork of unplanned and unchecked urbanization."

Types of informal occupations

With the existing infrastructure in LAC's cities unable to cope with the influx of immigrants from rural areas and abroad, and with natural growth in these settlements, many residents construct their own houses with makeshift materials such as wood, tin, and available bricks. Gradually, these self-made homes agglomerate to form informal settlements that are littered in available space between formal structures or in the outskirts of the cities.

Planned occupations

Some occupations of public or private land are planned by community groups or social movements, some times with the collaboration of politicians and/or planning professionals. These planned occupations usually have a more functional street layout, a cost-effective design for utility provision and communal facilities and a more equitable distribution of land. They include plans for necessary institutions and infrastructure, but may increase urban sprawl.

Despite the general illegality of informal settlements, local authorities have increasingly "*turned a blind eye*", or in some cases, supported the establishment of informal housing through the gradual instalment of services and infrastructure, as illustrated in the Britalia settlements in Colombia.[119] Self-help housing provides a means of accommodation for new immigrants and poor, while costing little to governments strapped by limited financial capabilities. "It was politically expedient" for Latin American builders "*to ignore the government's own planning regulations*."[120] The Caribbean region, meanwhile, is also plagued by haphazard development, as cities become unable to accommodate new migrants with existing infrastructure. With self-help housing prevalent in cities, many LAC authorities have gradually installed service and infrastructure, such as water taps, electricity, school and clinics in informal settlements.[121] Unfortunately, this has to some extent encouraged irregular settlements to proliferate, increase the cost of infrastructure provision, and exacerbated the issue of sprawl.

Some politicians have helped squatters devise planned occupations in order to garner political support. In fact, governmental changes in cities are often reflected in their urban forms. Gilbert highlights the unpredictable and fragmented nature of urban planning in Latin American cities: "In one city, the poor would be allowed to invade land, in another, invasions would be vigorously opposed. In one city, land could be obtained without cost, elsewhere it would be sold by private developers at a price equivalent to unserviced land in the more prosperous parts of the city."[122] Occasionally, planned invasions are selective depending on the political environment. The occupation of land reserved for some special project favored by the government in power is generally prohibited, but private land belonging to foreigners or members of political opposition could be occupied.[123]

In Brazil, the *Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra*—or the Landless Rural Workers—has gained fame through their high-profile fight for accommodation and land reform. Formed in 1984, the movement had three primary goals: 1) the immediate struggle for landless families through the non-violent occupation of unproductive land; 2) agrarian reform, defined not only by the redistribution of land but also policies that would develop and sustain rural families; and 3) a more just society.[124] Not long after, its urban counterpart, *Movimento Sem Teto do Centro*—the Roofless Workers of the Center—was established to reclaim buildings for poor urbanites working in the informal economy, and other low-income jobs. As of 2007, as many as 400,000 urban families have been allotted land through this movement.[125] Prestes Maia, a twenty-two story structure in São Paulo, serve as a prime example of the movement's occupations. The structure is currently home to 468 families and over 3000 people from all over the continent. Despite the "crammed" and "shack-like" conditions of the converted office-spaces, the residents contribute R\$20[126] monthly for the maintenance of the complex, and a rotational system that keeps the communal bathrooms hygienic is

---

[119] Gilbert, 1998, p. 83.

[120] Gilbert, 1998, p. 83.

[121] Gilbert, 1998.

[122] Gilbert, 1998, p. 84.

[123] Gilbert, 1998, p. 85.

[124] Plummer and Ranum, 2002.

[125] Duffy, 2007.

[126] 1 \$R equates to roughly 0.6 US\$.

in place.[127] With recent elected officials failing to deliver promises for increased housing rights for the poor, grassroots movements such as the MSTC have provided a viable way for poor homeless urbanites to obtain housing. However, how to resolve outstanding title disputes with land-owners and to provide sufficient services and infrastructure for occupied properties remain two thorny issues to be tackled.

Unplanned occupations

However, unplanned and fragmented self-help housing continues to add to the municipalities' burden. Unplanned occupations do not make provisions for street layouts and rights of ways for utilities and urban services, and may have an inequitable distribution of land among inhabitants. Therefore, the upgrading of such infrastructure after occupation becomes more difficult and expensive, if at all possible. Governments also lose resources and manageability when the residents of squatter settlements illegally tap into nearby utilities to serve their residential units. As many residents of unplanned settlements work in the cities' centers, accessibility to work also emerges as a major problem. In São Paulo, even *favelas paulistanas* find themselves imposed with a pricing hierarchy. Informal housing close to transit corridors can be sold by slumlords for as much as $12,000, making these out of reach for many poorer residents.[128] With LAC increasingly populated with irregular settlements, many cities in the region have shown similar trends to those observed in São Paulo. Many unplanned housing districts in LAC were able to gradually integrate themselves into the cities' urban fabric through government-backed upgrading efforts like Rio de Janeiro's *Favela-Bairro* Program. Currently in its third phase, the *Favela-Bairro* Program has benefited more than more than 140 informal settlements and 500,000 dwellers in its first two phases.[129]

2.3. Socio-Spatial Inequality and Polarization

LAC is the region with the largest inequality on the world. This inequality is blatantly visible in many of its urban areas, where the poor population squat in fragile ecosystems or dangerous terrains (e.g., steep slopes and flood prone areas) without roads or utilities, situated right next to middle- and higher-income residential enclaves of luxurious housing types and first-class infrastructure development, such as in the hills of Rio de Janeiro or Caracas. Squatter settlements often times occupy the interstices of central, formal areas where land is too steep (hills), too risky (areas at the margins of rivers and creeks, prone to flooding and landslides), and/or outlawed to development (because of its being a fragile ecosystem or strategic resource, such as a critical area for the urban water supply) to be formally developed, e.g., *favelas* in Rio de Janeiro or some *barrios* in Caracas.

In many poorer cities, spatial forms are largely driven by the efforts of low-income households to secure land that is affordable and in a reasonable location. This process is leading to entirely new urban forms as the countryside itself begins to urbanize. Low-income families, immigrants, and other economically disadvantaged groups constitute the majority of the slum settlers in Latin America. Unable to afford formal residential units close to work and the cities' centers, they resort to constructing their own housing in the gaps between better-built structures, and on the outskirts of the metropolises. Like pieces of scrap cloths sewn together, LAC cities' core districts are often dissected by pockets of self-help housing. Meanwhile, multiple rings of informal peri-urban development surround the aforementioned core.

The continuous failure by LAC governments to address informality and the associated negative effects has grave implications on future urban conditions. As urban areas become denser with the introduction of new informal settlements, slum residents face worsening hygiene, and are subject to high risks of diseases, crime and disproportioned consequences of natural disasters. In a broader

---

[127] Phillips, 2006.

[128] Rich, 2001.

[129] Brakarz and Aduan, 2004.

context, these settlements serve as clear evidence for social inequality and spatial segregation when juxtaposed next to the also-increasing number of private, gated developments. Informal settlements in Kingston, Jamaica serve as a case in point for urban decay. With much of the cityscape dominated by shantytowns, poor hygiene, crime and a dearth of services have emerged as a daily reality for significant portions of the capital's residents. In the East Central section of St. Andrew, a population of 45,000 overcrowd into poorly constructed homes without drinkable water, while sewers constantly overflow into the streets of the settlements.[130] Kingston's informal settlements have also become a hotbed of violence, as armed gangs and police execute each other in daylight.[131]

Meanwhile, LAC cities are often segregated into different enclaves based on wealth, class, ethnic characteristics and religious beliefs. In French Guiana, capital Cayenne is composed of residents and migrants of different ethnicities, and from different parts of the world. Still largely governed by white administrators from France, racism has remained a root cause for many conflicts.[132] While wealthy urban French and Guianese own condominiums in exclusive communities, poor immigrants from Brazil, Suriname and Southeastern Asia and indigenous Indians crowd into shantytowns scattered around the city.[133] Similar trends of development can be found in Buenos Aires, Argentina;[134] Valaparaiso, Chile;[135] and Lima, Peru.[136] The increasing socio-spatial polarization in LAC cities breeds a dangerous social climate of distrust and resentment among social classes that can lead to an erosion of the 'social contract.' Also, the erosion of social capital propitiates increasing levels of crime.

Peri-Urban Development and Sprawl

Significant urban growth in LAC occurs at the edges of the city where developed and undeveloped land meet. Since the urban edge is far away from the rest of the city, many peri-urban areas are unserviced by clean water, electricity and transport. They are also harder to regulate as they sit afar from the cities' administrative centers. In 1970, low-income suburbs in Guadalajara, Mexico, were laid out in the same fashion as middle-income neighborhoods. Unfortunately, these new low-income settlements began to deteriorate rapidly as the smaller plots lacked adequate services. To exacerbate the situation at hand, increasing rural-urban migration created heavier burdens on these areas that already lacked sufficient infrastructure to cope with the expanded populations. As a result, many residents have constructed informal structures to shelter themselves.[137] In the case of Rio de Janeiro, most of the poor live in western and northern suburbs such as the Baixada Fluminense, which is situated twenty miles north of the city. Like most poor districts across LAC, these suburbs are poorly serviced and located far from the city's commercial and industrial activities. In 1990, for example, more than a third of Nova Iguaçu's population lacked access to running water and half were without a sewage system.[138]

Unlike São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro, Brasilia houses a significantly smaller population numbering 3.34 million in 2005.[139] For the city inaugurated as Brazil's capital in 1960, the

---

[130] Tipling, 1999.

[131] Carroll, 2008.

[132] James, 2003.

[133] James, 2003.

[134] Crot, 2006.

[135] Bosdorf, Hidalgo and Sanchez, 2007

[136] Peters and Skop, 2007.

[137] Gilbert, 1998.

[138] Gilbert, 1998.

[139] United Nations, 2008.

government devoted attention to the city center's development by enacting *Plano Piloto,* a plan that posed extensive growth restrictions in and around the government administrative area.[140] Although the initiative played an important role in the preservation of Brasilia's modern architecture, it also led to dire spatial and social consequences in later stages. While most Brazilian cities maintain fairly high densities, building restrictions in *Plano Piloto* have encouraged growth to occur in a sprawled out manner. According to studies conducted by Dawall and Monkkonen,[141] only 15 per cent of Brasilia's population resides in the city center while comparable metropolitan areas like Curitiba and Recife have 70 per cent for the same category. In addition, less than 10 per cent of the city's urban area is established at the core. Understandably, this pattern of development has imposed immense traveling costs for workers from the lower middle and working classes who live in *favelas* and satellite cities located as far as 76 km from the city center. Congestion has emerged as one of Brasilia's prime concerns, as commuting times reach twice as long as that of Curitiba's and Recife's for equivalent lengths.[142] As Dowall and Monkkonen[143] note, Brasilia serves as an example where a master plan "ignored the social and economical realities of Brazil."

Buenos Aires grew rapidly shortly after Argentina gained its independence in the 19th century. As immigrants from Spain, Italy and other European countries settled in the city in search of economic opportunities, the surrounding territory was divided into parcels that were occupied by new types of housing, and spontaneous settlements established by working-class immigrants. However, the municipal government was unable to provide services to these new areas in a prompt manner. To compound the problem, the lack of proper infrastructure planning created accessibility problems when existing railways along the old city's perimeter were not accounted for.[144]

Throughout the early 1900s, 20 to 25 per cent of Mexico City's population lived in working class districts in the industrial sections of the north, northeast, and southeast. Unfortunately, the city could not keep up with the growth of the working class districts. Therefore, the districts were denied services and the city did not regulate the developers of the land. As a result, the working districts became unsanitary and unsafe slums while the government ineffectively sought to regulate social behavior.[145]

Ouanaminthe, in the Nord-Est Department of Haiti, sits on the Dominican Republic-Haiti border across from Dajabon, Dominican Republic. With a lack of economic and industrial activities in the vicinity, the city's population and size has exploded in recent decades as deported illegal immigrants and cross-border workers gathered there.[146] With the Haitian government unable to dedicate resources in Ouanaminthe, over 90 per cent of the 100,000 city's dwellers resides in self-help housing constructed of bricks and recycled wood. Unsurprisingly, these settlements are stricken by poverty, diseases and a lack of paved roads.[147] Although the Inter-American Development Bank has recently dedicated a US$54 million loan for Ouanaminthe to improve its water infrastructure, the city will also need vast improvements in the provision of electricity, paved roads and other services.[148]

---

[140] Dowall and Monkkonen, 2007.

[141] Dowall and Monkkonen, 2007.

[142] Dowall and Monkkonen, 2007.

[143] Dowall and Monkkonen, 2007.

[144] Gutiérrez, 2002.

[145] Reese, 2002.

[146] Deparle, 2007.

[147] The Coalition of Children in Need Association, www.haiticocina.org .

[148] Inter American Development Bank, 2007.

The resemblance to contemporary US models

With globalization in full-swing in LAC, many cities in the region have adopted urban forms that are commonly found in more developed Western counterparts. More specifically, the suburbanization of cities has emerged as a prevalent trend in recent years, as mono-functional residential developments similar to those found in the US. prop up in different urban areas. These exclusive communities often cater to burgeoning middle and upper classes that possess cars. They also occupy areas of land that are larger than what traditional apartment buildings occupy. Usually known as *urbanizaciones privadas* or *condominios fechados*, they contribute to the spatial segregation of metropolitan areas as low income households unable to afford city centers that are increasingly populated by high-end settlements are pushed to the outskirts of cities.

The Americanization of residential complexes has also become an inevitable characteristic of the globalized era. LAC cities such as Buenos Aires, Mexico City, Havana, Kingston, Lima, Naussau, Port Au Prince, São Paulo and Santiago have observed dramatic increases in the number of gated community constructed. In Buenos Aires alone, some 450 *barrios cerrados* have been constructed for less than half a million inhabitants during the 1990s.[149] These gated communities are very often dominated by detached single-family units, and are serviced with their own recreational facilities and infrastructure that ranges from schools to private highways linked to city centers. What emerges then is the proliferation of "gated cities" that dissect Latin American metropolises into isolated enclaves that are dominated by residents with homogenous backgrounds. This phenomenon is not only unique to prime-time metropolitan areas, but is also becoming more commonplace in tier-two cities of the region. [150]

A degree of "Americanization" is observed in new developments of Cartagena, Colombia where shopping malls have increasingly replaced public spaces as a staple of middle and upper living and have become places for consumerism, entertainment and social gathering. Meanwhile, urban shopping malls occupy vast areas of land and carry demanding parking requirements, greatly encouraging the spread of an automobile culture that is widely observed in the US. The exterior of these structures also carry striking resemblance to shopping centers in the US, as an interviewee in Pizarro's research cited that visitors in Barranquilla have found Floridian-looking malls to be "impacting" and "attractive."[151] According to the interviewee, many developers have gone as far as copying in entirety the interior and exterior designs from successful ventures in the US.

While the aforementioned trends continue to transform the urban forms of LAC cities, urban planners in the region are still trying to grasp the impact of globalization and its associated effects. Access to foreign capital and information has led to the deregulation of land markets and decentralization of planning governance, both instrumental to the rise in suburbia and urban dichotomies. [152] "In some cities, such as Santiago, where dictatorship could ignore popular demand for housing close to sources of work, there was a clear process of segregation."[153] Likewise, the decentralization of planning governance has devolved the national government from responsibilities.[154] This has grave implications for the layout of metropolitan areas, especially where local governments of smaller municipalities, eager to attract foreign real estate investments, devise ad-hoc land-use modifications to allow for the establishment of controlled residential and commercial developments.[155]

---

[149] Coy, 2006.

[150] Libertun de Duren, 2005.

[151] Pizzarro, 2005, p. 212.

[152] Roberts, 2005.

[153] Coy, 2005, p. 118.

[154] Roberts, 2005.

[155] Libertun de Duren, 2005.

Public Initiatives in Informal Settlements

Informal settlements are the most difficult to plan for and service because of their irregular physical forms and difficult accessibility. Moreover, even if services were provided in these areas, they would prove unaffordable for many residents. The lack of services has largely been due to the local governments' inability to keep up with the rapid growth of cities as they expand to new edges. However, in some low-income settlements, residents have been demanding services and as a result, increasing the number of neighborhoods that have undergone improvements.

The *Britalia* settlement in Bogotá had few taps, no drainage, and no paved streets between 1974 and 1980. When it rained, the streets were laden with thick mud and the drainage ditches were full of sewage. Residents demanded services such as water and drainage and after a few years, the settlement was transformed with newly paved roads and connections to the city drainage system. The Water Company was reluctant to service *Britalia* as the community did not have deeds to the land and was located below the level of the River Bogotá. This meant that the water for the settlement would have to be pumped from the river. After much toil and negotiation, the community was able to collect enough money to get the installation started.[156] In the Casablanca settlement of Bogotá, bus systems have been improved to directly reach some low-income districts. Before, workers from Casablanca had to walk out of the settlement to catch buses.[157]

More than one third of the houses in La Paz, Bolivia are not connected to the city water line because these low-income houses are located on the steep slopes of the bowl-shaped city, where landslides and floods are common. In these poor areas of La Paz, 86 per cent of the inhabitants have no water connection and more than 75 per cent of these people obtain their water from public sources. And more than 1 in 10 families in poor areas get their water from unsanitary sources such as rivers, drainage ditches, and stagnant pools. One third of the whole population of the city has no sewer connection and in poor areas, 89 per cent of the inhabitants lack sewer lines. On the other hand, electricity is better provided for, with only 14 per cent of the population without it.[158]

Urban Upgrading and its Politics

For many politicians and electable officials in Latin America, the plight of the landless presents a tremendous political opportunity to be tapped: the sheer number of residents in informal *barrios* and *favelas* has often greatly influenced election outcomes. Indeed, a review of the regions' urban history reveals that substantive urban upgrading initiatives often occur as a result of two political circumstances: consistent pressure from squatters and settlement leaders in the forms of petitions and protests; or acts to gain and retain voters done by politicians and elected officials following through with promises of settlement improvements.[159]

However, the reliance and wait for political recognition from authorities also mean that urban upgrading processes occur at the discretion of the government in power. In many cases, petitioning from the informal communities is disregarded by municipal governments. In others, settlement leaders are instructed to keep their constituents quiet and are rewarded with jobs and political advancements. At times, the settlements are castigated with neglect if they are known to be affiliated with the opposing parties, or are located within areas that are reserved for other purposes.[160] Given the difficulties associated with government initiatives, empowered slum settlers have sought to carry out their own improvement efforts, as evident in MSTC and their endeavors. Although many have achieved a degree of success, these movements are often strapped by limited financial capabilities and

---

[156] Gilbert, 1998.

[157] Gilbert, 1998.

[158] Gilbert, 1998.

[159] Gilbert, 1998.

[160] Gilbert, 1998.

worse, violent opposition from official forces. In 1996, MSTC's rural counterpart, MST, saw nineteen of its members in El Dorardo dos Carajas massacred by local police.[161]

International Organization-Backed Initiatives

Due to factors such as corruption, inefficiencies and lack of resources, many LAC governments have not been able to adequately address the issue of informal settlements. In the recent decade, the IADB has actively supported urban upgrading efforts in the LAC through partnerships with federal and local governments, establishing some of the most effective urban upgrading agendas in the region.

IADB's most notable programmes include the aforementioned *Favela-Bairro* programme in Rio de Janeiro, which facilitated the integration of many *favelas* into Rio's urban fabric in a partnership with the city's municipal government. Roads, public spaces, infrastructure for water and electricity were installed, while schools and community centers put in place greatly enhance civic life and citizen participation in targeted settlements. However, limited funding, and lack of recognition and cooperation from the federal government impede the extent of the program's effectiveness. Similar programs have been installed in other cities of Brazil, including Belo Horizonte, São Paulo, Santo André, and Recife. As of July 2008, the Inter-American Development Bank has extended an ambitious US$ 698 million to Haiti, tending to improvements in roads, agriculture, health, education, energy, the environment and portable water.[162] Specifically, US$54 million will be dedicated to waterworks in Ouanaminthe, Jacmel, Ley Cayes, Port de Paix and Saint Marc. So far, US$10 million has been spent in Saint Marc to provide clean water to twelve public kiosks and thousands of individual connections. In order to maximize the efficacy of the project spendings, the Haitian government is currently holding a tender to select a consulting firm to provide technical advice on managing Saint Marc's water system.[163]

Urban Upgrading at Large

While the urban upgrading efforts resulted from government programming, international organization-backed initiatives and popular demand have yielded mixed results, most LAC cities are still searching for an effective medium that would lead to comprehensive urban initiatives and solutions that balance governmental viewpoints with those of settlers. As of now, most planning authorities in the region have lacked systematic mechanisms that legitimize the citizenships of informal settlement residents, and in turn, incorporate their needs and concerns into the urban fabric of the cities. As a result, the well-being of these residents often depends on the oft-changing political orientation of elected officials.

2.4. Geographic Differences

Geographic resources vary across the LAC region and economic development opportunities are unequally distributed. Different locational characteristics (e.g., coastal vs. inland) have yielded a diverse range of urban forms. There are notorious spatial and socio-economic differences between urban areas in the highlands, such as La Paz, Bolivia, and urban areas near the coastline, such as Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. In addition to the effects of regional political and economic circumstances, physical isolation may also constitute a major barrier to investment and dynamic growth in LAC cities.

The proximity to water bodies continues to constitute an advantage for cities. Metropolises close to the sea can be integrated into the international economy via port infrastructure, while the provision of well-equipped beach developments and cruise lines aids the development of tourist industries. Montevideo, Buenos Aires, Rio de Janeiro, Salvador, Lima, Guayaquil, Maracaibo, Valparaiso,

---

[161] Plummer and Ranum, 2002

[162] Inter American Development Bank, 2008.

[163] Inter American Development Bank, 2008.

Georgetown, Paramaribo, Cayenne, San Juan, Santo Domingo and Havana are some examples of cities that fall into this category. The isolation of La Paz, which is located in the highlands of the country, is compounded by the city's altitude (which makes it hard for some visitors to breath), topographic mountainous boundaries (which makes it hard to accommodate growth), and lack of access to the sea. Such coastal vs. inland imbalances in economic and political terms have led to major disparities in quality of life across LAC. Inland regions are usually worse off in the realms of education, income, infrastructure, and social services.

The concentration of economic and political power within the coastal regions has major implications for LAC. This dominance of the coastal region is seen most clearly through the phenomenon of urban primacy, such that the majority of the "giant cities" in LAC are situated along the coasts. Coastal areas are the homes of major development and urbanization, while the inland areas are unattractive to foreign investors and are often neglected in the political arena. The presence of large export/import industries and transportation infrastructure also gives the coast a distinctive advantage over inland areas. These crucial advantages have allowed coastal cities to attain dominant economic statuses in the region.

Many Latin American countries and Caribbean islands possess relatively well-developed coastal urban areas, and underdeveloped rural interiors. In Bolivia, Ecuador, and Peru, the developmental contrasts between cities in the flatlands and towns in the Andean highlands are very pronounced. These developmental disparities occur along the axes of race and class, with impoverished and marginalized indigenous and Afro-descendant groups at positions of disadvantage.

Policy makers and planners must be aware of this disparity and they need to do more work to foster investment within these inland regions. The case of the city of Brasilia, while extreme, demonstrates that it is indeed possible to create change in the inland regions. While most actions will not be as large scale, decision makers in LAC would do well at promoting more balanced development within their countries.

2.5. Economic Climate and Urban Forms

This section explores the recent economic conditions of Latin America and their effects on urban forms, as economic developments in LAC continue to diversify.

Growing Economic Strength and the Re-Emergence of the Middle Class

Latin America has made progress in recent years, strengthening and deepening its economies, with a strong GDP that has been improving since 2003. For various countries in the region, especially in Brazil and Mexico, affairs are better today than they have been since the mid-1970s. Latin America is in its fourth successive year of economic growth averaging a steady 5 per cent, only the second time in 25 years that the region experienced four consecutive years of positive economic growth.[164]

This growth has been fueled by a strong boom in commodity prices, including oil, gas, coal, metals, minerals and agricultural products. Many countries have successfully used economic growth to finance their foreign debts. Countries such as Brazil, Argentina, and Venezuela paid off their loans to the International Monetary Fund ahead of time. With income levels for the poor rising faster than for the rich in countries such as Brazil and Mexico, some Latin American nations are increasingly seeing a rise in their lower-middle classes. However, many communities in the region are do not benefit from by economic growth, and informal commerce and housing remain prevalent.

---

[164] Teitel, 2007.

Inequalities, Physical Segregation and Informality

For all its recent progress, LAC remains a long way from enjoying widespread affluence. In the region as a whole, about 38.5 per cent of people remain poor according to national definitions.[165] More specifically, cities such as São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro still see 18 per cent of their populations living in informal settlements in 2005.[166] Given its current global economic ascendancy, the region has better opportunities to address some of its severe urban problems, such as the high levels of inequality, which make the reduction of poverty and informal settlements a difficult task.

The inequality of wealth in LAC manifests itself in the urbanization patterns of cities, often in the form of physical segregation. The poor continues to construct self-help housing situated in the peripheries of cities and in the interstices of formal development, as they cannot afford to construct dwellings in formally planned areas. Meanwhile, crime and violence remain a reality for many settlements, causing those who can afford more up-scale accommodations to withdraw themselves into security-laden complexes. Not surprisingly, the most fragmented metropolises are the ones that exhibit the most sever inequality and crime levels, such as Rio de Janeiro and Lima.

Although the wealthy of LAC cities oftentimes draw distinct physical and social boundaries between themselves and the less-privileged, an in-depth look into many Latin American urban economies reveal a symbiosis of formal and informal commercial activities. The streets of city centers are frequently laden with street vendors who provide daily necessities for city dwellers. Informal commerce not only provides those who are not able to obtain formal employment a means of living, but also offers ordinary residents more affordable means to a wide variety of goods. In some cases municipal governments, such as that of Quito, Lima, Caracas, Bogota and Mexico City have tried to formalize informal commerce by posing time and locational restrictions for vending activities, but the sheer size and scale of the informal sectors have proved to be difficult to regulate.[167] As such, metropolises in the region continue to exhibit diverse and complex urban contexts that simultaneously embrace and condemn informality.

Meanwhile, the dependence on tourism for economic growth by many LAC countries has created less than desired urban forms, and unequal treatment between foreign visitors and local residents. In Nassau, Bahamas, beaches are dominated by foreign-owned hotels and gated communities exclusively used by tourists. Likewise, Cubans have long been prohibited to enjoy beaches and European-backed hotels located in Havana and Trinidad, a ban just recently lifted.

Government Orientation towards Social Improvement and Urban Upgrading

In LAC countries, money has, in the past, been wasted on extravagant and poorly planned public projects. Thus, Latin American and Caribbean governments and the public have to be cautious to avoid falling into that trap again. This is an opportunity for LAC to strategically invest into education and infrastructure improvements. The "social missions" in Venezuela and other countries of the region are a good sign of the political intent to "plant the oil"—invest in social development and the diversification of the economy.

2.6. Conclusions

The LAC region is an incredibly diverse area in terms of rates, levels, forms and conditions of urbanization. Policy makers, planners and the general public must be made aware of these differences instead of labelling all of Latin America and the Caribbean as a homogenous region. The more these differences in urbanization are appreciated in the region, the more substantive and tailor-made solutions can be successfully proposed and implemented for each individual planning challenge.

---

[165] *The Economist*, 2007.

[166] BBC News, 2007.

[167] Bromley, 1998.

Current rates of reduced poverty, stronger economies, and growing democracies are hopeful signs of progress in the region. While it is true that all of the countries in LAC have not enjoyed the same level of economic growth and stability, the success of some relatively contributes to the economic and political stability of the entire region. The increased economic independence of a few countries should not overshadow the need to address the inequities that still exist throughout the region, and there are also good signs that the region is uniting for a myriad of developmental projects. LAC must continue to be resourceful and strategic in their macro growth management, so that all of their citizens may benefit from the region's success on a micro level. This includes securing resources for the future, continued decreasing dependency on foreign funds, fortifying their infrastructures, diversifying their exports, and continuously building upon international relationship both within their regional neighbors, and beyond. Of particular importance, poor settlements must be integrated even more into the rest of the urban fabric through careful and multifaceted socio-spatial planning and policy. It is important to expand the realization that those who inhabit poor areas are just as much deserving as the rest of the city residents when it comes to services and citizenship rights and identity.

3. The Emergence and Spread of Contemporary Urban Planning

Over the last century, contemporary urban planning has witnessed several major shifts in its approaches in Latin American and the Caribbean. The most significant of these has been the shift from planning as a technical, expert-driven function usually undertaken by a small group of bureaucratic elite, to one that is more concerned with communication and facilitation, and with strategic spatial planning. Nonetheless, older planning styles (master planning) still persist in many parts of LAC for various reasons. This chapter provides a review of the emergence of modern urban planning as a basis for understanding the contextual dynamics or shifts that have occurred in the approaches to planning. The importance of context in determining the nature of planning is emphasized. This chapter also reviews the more recent/contemporary and innovative approaches to planning that have emerged in LAC in response to the criticisms of the earlier planning styles, their impacts, and the extent to which they might offer ideas that correct the deficiencies of the earlier approaches to planning.

It is important to recognize that forms of 'planning' existed in LAC before the emergence of formal or conventional planning. However, it is generally accepted that what is known as modern town planning has its roots in the industrial revolution in advanced capitalist countries. The chapter provides a brief review of pre-colonial and colonial forms of urban planning in LAC, as well as the emergence of modern urban planning during the industrial revolution in Europe and North America. The second part of the chapter is a brief review of the major shifts in planning over the last century and how planning styles were informed by context. It also discusses the ways in which organic and other 'non-planning' processes contribute to the 'making' of towns and cities in LAC. The last part of the chapter reviews contemporary forms of urban planning.

3.1. Historical Roots of Urban Planning

Before the industrial revolution in Europe and North America gave way to the emergence of modern urban planning in the world, LAC experienced a rich history of planning. We can particularly distinguish the periods of indigenous (pre-colonial or pre-Columbian) and colonial planning.

Indigenous (Pre-Colonial or Pre-Columbian) and Colonial Planning

Ancient civilizations such as the Aztecs (in modern Mexico), the Mayans (in modern Mexico, Guatemala, and Belize), and the Incas (in modern Peru and the Andean regions on modern Ecuador, Bolivia, Colombia, Chile and Argentina), among others, developed sophisticated systems of urban planning in LAC.

Aztec Planning: Tlatelolco and Tenochtitlan

When the Aztecs arrived to the Valley of Mexico in 1325, they initially settled on an island within Lake Texcoco, and later developed a sophisticated plan for their capital city, Tenochtitlan. By dredging the mud from the lake, they created floating gardens for agricultural production (*chinampas*), which allowed them to sustain the population. As the population increased, they turned these gardens into urban settlements, creating a highly organized city of thousands of small islands connected by canals and aqueducts and moving agricultural production to the southern edge of the city.

The Aztecs were strongly guided by a belief in the ecological fragility of their environment and a sense of stewardship in guiding its resources.[168] Water was an important element to Aztec city planning. The city's urban design—integrating waterways for efficient waste disposal, extensive use

---

[168] Simon, 1997.

of rooftop gardens on residential homes, and lush landscaping in the city's streetscape—reflected their view of the city as physical parallel to the imagined realm of the water god.[169] Adjacent to Tenochtitlan, Tlatelolco was founded two years later on another nearby islet, and the two cities were rivals until Tlatelolco's military defeat and annexation by Tenochtitlan in 1473.[170] Tlatelolco served as the site of the capital city's markets, and was described by the conquistador Hernan Cortes as "twice as large as that of Salamanca," accommodating over 60,000 merchants and consumers.[171]

As in much of pre-colonial Latin America—particularly with their Inca counterparts in Peru and their Maya predecessors in Southern Mexico, Guatemala and Belize—communication and geographic connectivity was made possible by the Aztecs' investment in transportation infrastructure. However, while the Aztec and Inca empires held dominion over vast geographic areas, much of the governance structures in outlying regions resembled independent city-states, with Aztec and Inca rulers focused primarily on exacting tribute from these regions to finance their capital cities' infrastructure and prosperity.

Mayan Planning: Chichen Itza, Tikal, Uxmal

That road infrastructure was used for communication between city centers is particularly supported in the Mayan example, as evidenced in such facilitating advancements as the spread of a unified system of recording the lunar count.[172] Maya cities served as administrative centers for extensive polities, with intersite causeways, such as at Coba and Mirador, that connected regional settlements with specialized functions—such as salt procurement in the northern Yucatec coast and lithic production in Colha.[173] At still other sites, such as Tikal, cities were not only places of consumption, but also provided significant production and manufacturing within the city itself. In Tikal, manufacture of objects (from shell, obsidian, and wood) took place in workshops of specialized artisans of high status. A majority of the Tikal's inhabitants were, however, farmers, with evidence of raised fields suggesting many residents lived on the dense residential edges of the city.[174]

Incan Planning: Cuzco and Machu Picchu

Cuzco served as the original site of the Killke, the Incas' tribal predecessors. The original line of Inca rulers founded the Cuzco city-state in approximately 1200, and the geographic scope of the tribe's power extended through the slow absorption of other Andean tribes. Starting in 1442, Pachacutec and his three successors began an aggressive expansion of the state's territory, forming the longest northern and southern extent of the Inca Empire. Its capital city, Cuzco, sat along a steep altitude above sea level and is surrounded by two rivers. It exemplifies the earliest planning attempts by the Inca, with the city divided into lower and upper regions. These regions were further divided into four sections, with each section corresponding to a noble that oversaw each of the four geographic regions of the Inca Empire. Like the Aztec and Maya, the Inca used a combination of warfare and religion to connect the disparate reaches of the empire, and several of the religious ceremonies meant to reinforce the supernatural origins of the Incas to legitimize their political and military power over their subjects are documented at length by historians and anthropologists.[175]

Infrastructure, as evidenced in the extensive roads and public projects, such as temples and administrative palaces, played another important role in reinforcing the visibility, wealth and power of

---

[169] Simon, 1997; Gorostiza Arroyo, 1997.

[170] Kinsbruner, 2005.

[171] Kinsbruner, 2005, p. 17.

[172] Chase et al., 1990.

[173] Chase et al., 1990.

[174] Chase et al., 1990.

[175] Bauer, 1996.

the Incas. Machu Picchu, located 50 miles northwest of Cuzco, serves as a case in point. The site itself was largely abandoned by the time of Spanish discovery and conquest, and although its purpose and origins have been disputed, historians now commonly accept it to have been built by Pachacutec as a type of second-palace or retreat. The city was divided into three districts, with a sacred district for spiritual ceremonies within temples, a residential district for lower-class subjects, and district for the priestly and noble classes.[176]

The architecture and design of the site is exemplary of Inca practices of the time. Mastery of a sophisticated use of stone masonry, or ashlar, allowed masons to fit one stone atop another by sanding away the excess, thus forming an extremely tight, mortar-free and stable fit. The use of trapezoidal tilting in windows and doors, the slight inclination of corners, the offset orientation of vertical walls, as well as a number of other design innovations allowed the 140 physical structures, including temples, to withstand seismic activity over the centuries.[177]

Colonial Planning

Spaniard explorer Christopher Columbus landed in unknown territory for the Europeans in 1492. The land, later known as The Americas, spawned fierce economic competition between developing European nations for new trade routes, markets, and colonies. The majority of countries in Latin America and the Caribbean today were colonies of Spain, but Brazil was colonized by Portugal and Britain, France, and The Netherlands also held colonies in the region. Later, the US also colonized some territories in the region, and until today there are islands in the Caribbean that belong to Britain, France, the Netherlands or the US.

Several Latin American countries are about to celebrate their bicentennial anniversary of independence (Argentina, Chile, and Mexico in 2010, and seven other countries in the next 15 years). There are some more recent cases of colonial independence in LAC and some remaining vestiges of the colonial times. In Central America, Belize, a former British colony, only became fully independent in 1981, and the neighboring nation of Guatemala only recognized Belize as a sovereign state in 1994. On its part, Panama regained territorial sovereignty from the US on the Panama Canal Zone in 1979, and full operational control of the canal in 1999. In the Caribbean, the US still claims territory in Puerto Rico (Viequez Island) and Cuba (Guantanamo Bay). In South America, the UK claims the Islas Malvinas (Falkland Islands, obtained through war with Argentina in 1982) in Argentina. French Guiana is still an overseas Department of France. Suriname, formerly Dutch Guiana, gained independence in 1975; whereas Guyana, which began as a Dutch colony in 1581 and became British Guiana 250 years later, gained independence in 1966, and became a republic in 1970.[178]

Colonial policies influenced the timing, processes and nature of the exports, which differed for colonial powers such as Britain, France, Spain, Portugal, and the US. The resultant forms of urban planning differed in various contexts in the region. Differentiation resulted not only due to differences in the approaches of various colonial powers, but also due to differences between the contexts where they were introduced.

Spanish Colonization

The Spanish colony established two viceroyalties in the Americas: the viceroyalties of Nueva España (in modern Mexico) and Lima (in modern Peru). Mexico City and Lima, respectively, became the important urban organizing nodes for ordering both the internal economies of the colonies as well as global trade across the Atlantic and Pacific.[179] These were modelled on European cities of the time and

---

[176] Bauer, 1996.

[177] Protzen and Nair, 2007.

[178] Bramwell, 2000.

[179] Roberts, 2005.

served as gateways for export-based dependent communities.[180] Other cities with more subordinate roles within the urban hierarchy of colonies—such as Guanajuato in the viceroyalty of Mexico or Potosi in the viceroyalty of Peru—were important in their location as sites of mining and manufacturing.[181]

This centralization of government and focus on major trade nodes contributed to a pattern of unequal urbanization throughout the later part of the colonial period and post-independence—whereby a need for surplus labor in cities caused massive migration from rural areas. As such, federal government agendas on planning and infrastructure essentially focused on the metropolitan regions developed around colonial seats of power, leaving much of its hinterlands to "abandonment and underdevelopment."[182] The economic and social conditions that were fundamental to colonial productivity were conducive to urban expansion in the post-independence era. This became evident as much of the metropolitan regions of cities in Latin America developed around the original colonial seats of power:[183] "Centralized bodies were put in place during the colonial era to control the colonized nation. This centralized control structure was retained in the postcolonial era and only relatively recently in Latin America has this begun to change."[184]

The 1573 Law of the Indies provided an early attempt at general plans, providing design guidelines for the construction of newly colonized settlements.[185] The 148 ordinances stipulated that towns should be built with a central plaza, or commons, surrounded by civic and important buildings and arcades. The grid pattern begins in the plazas of cities throughout Latin America. Narrow streets branch out from this central space, providing shade from buildings for pedestrians, with mandated architectural consistency amongst newly erected buildings.[186]

Today in some cities of Latin American, such as Guatemala City, Mexico City, and Cuzco, there are hybrid architecture and urban spaces built upon the ruins of the destroyed ancient civilizations. The plaza was also important for pre-Columbian culture's urban life. Like in Spanish design, pre-Columbian cities had more than one plaza based on the size and density of the urban population, differentiated by use.[187] The largest plaza would usually be the administrative or religious center of the city, and it is no surprise that the Spanish chose to base their center atop the pre-Columbian centers of established cities, as in the case of the *Templo Mayor* and the Cathedral of Mexico City, in *El Zócalo*.

Portuguese Colonization in Latin America: Colonial Planning in Brazil

Brazil's economic development has affected planning practices and regional growth in important ways since its early history. Portugal colonized Brazil with an emphasis on commercial development, rather than on settlement.[188] In establishing the first pattern of development during the early 16th century, land was divided into large land lots. Essentially prime land along the coast was allocated for sugar plantations and eventually much of interior for *sesmarias*, large grants for cattle ranching. Through a heavy reliance on slave labor, sugar exportation became the primary economic source throughout the 16th and 17th centuries. This established an early pattern of urban primacy whereby few coastal cities (namely, Recife, Salvador, and Rio de Janeiro) became the main destination points for agricultural trade from Brazil's interior. In addition, the population make-up of that time, essentially small elites

---

[180] Angotti, 1996.

[181] Roberts, 2005.

[182] Angotti, 1987.

[183] Angotti, 1996.

[184] Barnes, 2003, p. 370.

[185] Saldarriaga, 2008.

[186] Trias, 1977.

[187] Kinsbrunner, 2005.

[188] Greenfield, 1994.

and large enslaved or poor laborers, meant internal markets for domestic products were "highly circumscribed," and the few urbanizing cities with increasing migrant populations were largely disconnected from each other.[189] Even while gold, coffee, rubber, and other export products eventually came to share the importance of sugar in the economy, this early pattern of economic development—disproportionately benefiting the south and southeast regions of Brazil (with some minor exceptions)—remained, by and large, a constant throughout the colonial period.

Unlike Spanish cities, Brazilian colonial cities presented a lack of planning and tendency towards an irregular layout.[190] Early forms of spatial planning included the urban square, called "*praças*", since the beginning of the colonial era in 1500. Unlike Spanish squares, Brazilian *praças* are the product of social and artistic movements. The *praça* became an integral design feature of urban settlements that served as a symbol of civic authority. It was used for official rites and rituals, both sacred and secular. Today, *praças* are a meeting place for demonstrations, celebrations such as Carnival, ordinary citizen activities and street vendors, and sometimes for the congregation of prostitutes or other covert activities.[191]

Several eras of spatial planning developed over the next few centuries. In the 1690s, a new era of spatial planning developed that emphasized the Spanish grid pattern. This new grid pattern is evident in the early designs of Salvador, São Luis, and Rio de Janeiro, but city expansion favoured spontaneous growth.[192] The grid design gained popularity again in the 18th century with the rebuilding of Mariana in 1745.[193] Beginning in the 1800s, Brazil adopted French influences and culture. Rio de Janeiro was transformed to replicate Paris, complete with grand thoroughfares, and neo-classical theatres, libraries, museums, and government buildings. This development resulted in 'slum' clearance and public beautification projects. The 1900s resulted in "a rejection of alien outside influences and a return to grassroots Brazilian traditions,"[194] while simultaneously incorporating modernism. This included the utilization of mosaics, the integration of Brazil's indigenous plants in public and private landscapes, and buildings designed with sleek, curvilinear lines built of reinforced concrete. With the evolution of urban planning in Brazil, *praças* and *largos* (open spaces similar to *plaças*) still function as nodes for civic and transit purposes, besides their role for public gatherings.

French, British, and Dutch Colonization in LAC

The French, British, and Dutch had colonies in continental Latin America (Belize, Guyana, Guyana Esquiba, Suriname) and the Caribbean (Cuba, Jamaica, Netherlands Antilles, etc.).

---

[189] Greenfield, 1994.

[190] Borah, 1972.

[191] Curtis, 2000.

[192] Borah, 1972.

[193] Bury, 1984.

[194] Curtis, 2000., p. 486.

> **Case Study: Kingston, Jamaica**
>
> An important port for British trade and colonization, Jamaica serves as a prime example of the post-colonial impacts of European settlement in the Caribbean.[195] Since early colonial times, and for much of its history, the development of Kingston, Jamaica has been predicated on its access to trade, and the relationship of primacy between this role and its status in the "colonial periphery."[196] Kingston was initially established as an agricultural settlement and grew in size in 1692 after the arrival of earthquake refugees from Port Royal. Initial drafts for a town plan followed a traditional grid, and by 1716 the town grew to be the largest trade center for Jamaica. It received its formal charter in 1802, and has served as the capital for Jamaica since 1875. The original downtown grid ended with a system of finger-piers in the Kingston Harbour. These port facilities saw significant redevelopment in the period immediately following independence in 1962.
>
> Kingston serves as a case in point in the architectural redevelopment of capital cities ensuing the sense of national, post-independence optimism that defined this period. As in contemporaneous example of Brazil, which moved its capital to newly-built Brasilia from Rio de Janeiro, Jamaican optimism was "reflected in transformations in the urban structure and architecture of Kingston."[197] The redevelopment of the Kingston waterfront ultimately resulted in a physical moving of the city's economic center to New Kingston, an exclusion of local cultural influence on the new redeveloped areas, and an abandonment of original city center and waterfront. As new local elites replaced colonial ones, the preference of an international, modernistic buildings and development over culturally local influences reflected the institutional failure to redistribute wealth and integrate the economically and socially excluded majority of citizens.[198]
>
> *Sources: Dodman, 2007; McHardy, 2002*

US Colonization and Imperialism in LAC

Beginning in the mid-nineteenth century, the presence of the US in LAC has been strongly felt economically, politically, militarily, socially and culturally. Until the 1930s, the focus of US imperialism's activities was in Mexico, the Caribbean Islands (Cuba, Puerto Rico, Virgin Islands, Haiti, etc.), and Central America. Reagan's international policies in the 1980s related to the governments in Nicaragua, Guatemala, and El Salvador continued US. interventions in Latin America. US trajectories of colonization and imperialism in nations of LAC have had, and continue to have, major impacts on the nations' development. However, the major mechanisms that keep reproducing what is called "Latin American underdevelopment" are not to be found solely as a product of the dominance of US. imperialism in the region, but as a component of the internal parts of the system of production in the region, the latter being shaped by the social structure existing there. On the other hand, US imperialism protects this social structure as a political safety-valve against the threat of socialist revolution.[199]

3.2. Major Shifts in Planning over the last Century

In addition to colonialism and imperialism, there have been other methods, mechanisms and factors underlying the shift and spread of planning approaches from Europe and North America to Latin America and the Caribbean, including the education of planners abroad.

---

[195] Dodman, 2007; McHardy, 2002.

[196] Dodman, 2007., p. 273

[197] Dodman, 2007, p. 274.

[198] Dodman, 2007

[199] Rojas, 1984, p. 295.

Case Study: Planner Lúcio Costa, architect Oscar Niemeyer, Landscape designer Roberto Burle Marx, in Brazil

Two projects, the design of the Ministry of Education and Health and the city plan of Brasilia exemplify the influence of Swiss-French architect and planner, Le Corbusier, on Brazil's foremost planners and designers during the 20th century—Lúcio Costa, Oscar Niemeyer and Roberto Burle Marx.

Le Corbusier travelled to Latin America in 1929 and included lecture stops in São Paolo and Rio de Janeiro. His futuristic vision for cities at that time was developed as part of his response to the increasing congestion and lack of physical space in European cities. As such, while Corbusian designs were openly reviled in Brazil by some as Eurocentric and physically improbable, these were embraced as modernistic and forward-thinking by others. Costa's eventual espousal of such adapted Corbusian, modernist values (in his capacity as the head of the Brazilian Heritage Service) was hugely influential in setting the aesthetic tone of preservation and publicly commissioned projects after 1930. The 1938 commission of the new Ministry of Education and Health (MES) building in Rio de Janeiro is one such example of Le Corbusier's distinctive stamp on a major public project. Le Corbusier, Costa, and Niemeyer served as principal architects for the building, and many of the classic Corbusian concepts—an elevated 16-story block structure with horizontal ribbons of windows, surrounded by a minimalistic plaza—reflect a direct adaptation of European modernist principles. Costa was a mentor to Niemeyer during his early career, and the three—Costa, Niemeyer and Le Corbusier—worked on a number of architectural and development projects.

In the case of Roberto Burle Marx, however, Le Corbusier served as a point of departure and contrast for his radical, celebrated landscape designs. An influential landscape designer by the 1930s, Marx was commissioned to design the MES Gardens—located on the roof of the building. Marx's design, a meandering design of biomorphous shapes, illustrates the cultural "cannibalization" (syncretization) of Le Corbusier's ideas on modern form and indigenous materials. Both internalizing exoticized aspects of Brazil's "jungle image" and rejecting strictly rational theories of European form, Marx' MES Gardens, as well as the subsequent proliferation of his landscape design throughout Rio de Janeiro, provide physical symbols of the broader dialogue between European and Latin American ideas on architecture and urban form during this time.

The 1956 commissioning of the new capital city appointed the three professionals for the planning, architectural, and landscape design of Brasilia, respectively.

Sources: Young, 2003; Read, 2005; Segre, 2007; Fraser, 2000.

Prominent European and North American architects and planners

Prominent European and North American architects and planners worked on a project-basis or held longer professional commitments in LAC. Jose Luis Sert, Spanish architect and planner—and another collaborator of Le Corbusier—worked on numerous city plans for LAC cities during his exile to the US after 1939. His master plan revision for Havana, Cuba, commissioned by dictator Fulgencio Batista in 1953, is exemplary of this period's rational approach to urban modernization, Guided by the US.' heavy economic influence in Cuba before the revolution, Sert's plan focused on the building of new consumer amenities, such as hotels, offices, and shopping centers, essentially eliminating much of the city's historical center. As part of the National Planning Junta (*Junta Nacional de Planificación*), Sert's disregarded the existing urban grid in favour of plans for a tourist-oriented uses and design, including a proposed artificial island dotted with casinos, residential palaces and high-rise towers. While much of rational planning in LAC in early 21st century asserted its logical approach to revitalization of post-colonial cities, Sert's master plan—never able to be implemented by the Batista regime, reflects the ideological, economic and political underpinnings of US. and European city planning.

3.3. From Import Substitution to Export-Oriented Industrialization

As some cities grew rapidly in population and size, they presented many similar problems to those of the US cities during early industrialization. An emphasis on liberal capital and industrialization in cities plus the influx of rural migrants made them sites of poor sanitation, overcrowding and generally poor living conditions. Thus, the implications of economic policy on planning for cities focused increasingly on development of new infrastructure for the production of goods and investment of foreign capital, to the detriment of planning for social infrastructure, housing and rural development.

Import substitution industrialization policies were adopted by most nations in Latin America in the 1930s and 1940s, as a result of the impact of the 1930s Great Depression. Proponents believed that developing countries needed to create forward linkages domestically and could only succeed by creating the industries that used the primary products already being produced by these countries.[200] ISI was most successful in countries with large populations or high living standards, having already a more solid economic basis upon which to function such as Mexico, Brazil, Argentina, and, to a lesser extent, Chile, Uruguay and Venezuela. Smaller and poorer countries such as Dominican Republic, Honduras, and Ecuador were not very successful in implementing ISI policies. ISI was accompanied by structural democratizing changes to the government. Banks and utilities and certain foreign-owned companies were nationalized. Many economists contend that ISI failed in Latin America, being one of many factors leading to the so-called "Lost Decade of Latin American economics". Other economists contend that ISI led to the "*Mexican Miracle,*" the period that lasted from 1940 to 1975 in which the Mexican economy grew 6 percent or more.

Chile became an experiment for free market economics when dictator Augusto Pinochet called in followers of Chicago's Professor Milton Friedman to evaluate the economy. The economic reforms proved successful at a macroeconomic level, but since Pinochet's human rights record was horrendous, many question the connection of free market reform, democracy and fascism. Other models of free-market economics were adopted under democratic regimes, such as in Bolivia, Argentina and Venezuela in the 1990s, promoting severe cuts to government spending in the attempt of curtailing hyperinflation. The social effects of such policies were so devastating, that they ultimately gave rise to democratic leftist governments in the region, which carry the electorate mandate of prioritizing social, rather than economic, development. Today, many Latin American countries are adopting a hybrid model of export-oriented industrialization (EOI), a trade and economic policy focusing on exporting goods for which the country has a competitive advantage. However, "the export-oriented industries that drive capitalist growth in Latin America tend to be more highly integrated with global capitalism than with national economies."[201]

3.4. Modernization Theory and "Growth Pole" Planning Model from Import Substitution to Export-Oriented Industrialization

In the 1960s, development specialists in the US who sought to present alternatives to the Marxist account of social development used the term modernization to describe the processes of structural differentiation by which 'traditional' societies could be transformed into complex, 'modern' societies. Thus, modernization theory claimed that less developed countries could eventually accomplish the industrialization level of the more developed ones if they emulated the social and economic system of Western capitalism, and specifically, the values current in the US of the 1960s. The prevailing development ideology of the American planners was represented in Rostows' stages of economic growth.[202] The concept of growth poles, developed by the French economist Perroux,[203] which was born as a non-spatial idea of leading economic sectors, was rapidly combined with the growing interest in regional planning in the US, to become a spatial concept of concentrated capital and industrialization in underdeveloped places to promote regional development and national spatial equilibrium. The experience was soon to be rationalized by a planner of the team at Ciudad Guayana, John Friedmann, in his book *Regional Development Policy: A Case Study of Venezuela.*[204]

It was only later that the ideology of modernization or *desarrollismo* was attacked by Latin Americanists for its over-simplification and ethnocentrism. In the late 1960s, the newly developed

---

[200] Baer, 1972.

[201] Angotti, 1996, p. 16.

[202] Rostow, 1960.

[203] Perroux, 1955.

[204] Friedmann, 1966; Irazábal, 2004, p. 24.

'dependency theory' severely questioned and condemned projects such as 'growth poles' as propitiating the continuation of imperialism and underdevelopment.[205] Eventually, this theory was also charged with over-simplification, and accused of solely inverting the assumptions of the previous one, when proposing that the failure of Third World countries to accomplish development was caused by their forced dependence on the advanced capitalist world, i.e., the theory posited that the Third World was doomed to underdevelopment because its surplus was appropriated by the advanced capitalist countries. Much has changed since then. The emergence of the Asian NICs (newly industrializing countries) challenged the validity of the assumptions of dependency theory—as these countries achieved late industrialization; and proved the need for more sophisticated and differential approaches to Third World development.[206]

Today, economic and spatial determinisms are broadly questioned, and a holistic concept of quality of life and its equitable distribution is more central to the debate on development than the mere production of wealth. Even international agencies such as the World Bank and the Inter-American Bank have changed their developmental strategies, experimenting with the goals of accomplishing the satisfaction of basic needs, redistribution, democracy, equity, and governance and participation, rather than focusing exclusively on the pursuit of progress through economic growth. Since the late 1980s, postmodern critiques have identified not only the existence of alternative modes to development, but alternatives to development altogether.

Brasilia is the most well-known example of capital city development under the growth pole and modernization models. The government in Brazil moved the capital from Rio de Janeiro to Brasilia in 1960 in order to establish a new urban center, distinct from its colonial past.[207] Theoretically, the establishment of a new capital was supposed to be a way of avoiding spontaneous urban development and aid decentralization[208]. While Brazil is the most daring example of modern capital city development in Latin America thus far, the idealistic aspiration of spatial and social equity of their designers did not play out in the city as expected.[209]

In Venezuela also, after years of dictatorship, and under a petroleum-driven economy, the democratically elected government of Rómulo Betancourt proposed Ciudad Guayana in 1961 as an industrial growth pole, to promote economic growth and decentralized development distant from the northern capital, Caracas, and its extended metropolitan region. Within a climate of political instability and a fragile democracy, the new political elite thought that a focus on technocratic planning to promote growth, rather than on the restructuring of institutions and redistribution of wealth and power, seemed both safer and faster. The leaders of the newly-born democracy needed to distinguish it from the past. In order to accomplish that aim, they supported the creation of the Guayana regional development project—and its focus, Ciudad Guayana—as a project that could spur nationalism, unite the country, diversify the economy, balance growth, and serve as an international flag for the accomplishments of democracy. The oil economy had brought rapid modernization to Caracas. It was therefore expected that capital investment and industrialization should produce the same results in Ciudad Guayana.

---

[205] Frank, 1969; Cardoso, 1969.

[206] Irazábal, 2004, p. 24.

[207] Greenfield, 1994.

[208] Angotti, 1996.

[209] Holston, 1989.

Case Study: A Return to Developmentalism in Ciudad Guayana?

The relevance of reviewing the current state as well as the potential of Ciudad Guayana more than four decades after its foundation and in light of the new national territorial policy cannot be overemphasized, since the current Venezuelan government has been revisiting the idea of making Ciudad Guayana part of a major regional axis of development. In 1999, a new government came into power in Venezuela whose purpose, in its own words, was to 're-found the Republic.' In doing so, the government is proposing Ciudad Guayana as a key urban center in a regional development project along the Orinoco-Apure river basin axis, which encompasses some 300 thousand square kilometers east to west of the country, far south of the urbanized coastal zone. Distinct from the idea of the industrial growth pole that animated the planning of the city in the 1960s, this time the urban and regional 'growth axis' project is intended not only to overcome territorial and economic imbalances by means of 'concentrated decentralization', but also to respond to political and social demands, while paying attention to environmental concerns unattended in the previous planning processes in the region.

Yet, current events in Ciudad Guayana raise the question of whether planning in Ciudad Guayana is being inspired by neo-developmentalism and growth-pole approaches. As noted above, modernization planning assumed that the concentration of industries and technology in growth poles would diffuse economic growth and modern life-styles to surrounding regions. The plan for Ciudad Guayana seems to be premised on this theory. The ideological roots of the project are laid out in the First National Plan of Territorial Development, developed in February 1999. In this document, the project Orinoco-Apure is outlined as the central strategy of national development, to the point that it is defined as a 'flag project' and as 'a revolution in-and-of itself', together with the others two 'axes of deconcentration' proposed. President Chavez has traveled around the world showcasing the project in search of investors, claiming that it has sparked much interest. Pedro Olivieri, Vice-President of Planning at the Venezuelan Corporation of Guayana (*Corporación Venezolana de Guayana*) called 'impressive' the investment interest in Guayana, noting that Australians, Japanese, Koreans, Mexican, and American groups have recently explored investment opportunities in the steel industry of the region.. However, it is already known from the experience of previous decades in Ciudad Guayana, that main local and regional—and even national—benefits do not rest in the development of primary economic sectors, much less so if the investment is foreign. The key to economic diversification and a more equitable distribution of benefits is the promotion of linkages between the major investments, i.e., the generation and networking of secondary (other industries for the production of surplus value), tertiary (services), and quaternary (informational services and production) economic sectors.

In the First National Plan of Territorial Development and all the official statements on the matter, the absence of analysis on the role of existing urban centers and urban networks is notorious. Instead, in terms of resource allocation, this growth axes projects is presented as an opposing alternative to the consolidation of the large urban agglomerations of the northern part of the country. The government manifests the intent to sponsor territorial deconcentration time and again, ignoring the empirical evidence that shows that generally, the investments that produce greater growth and diversification—and eventually more deconcentration—are those which are made in the more urbanized regions. On the other hand, investments made in territories whose population and infrastructural development are still weak tend to produce enclave effects and their contingent networking occurs, if at all, toward the aforementioned more urbanized regions. This effect paradoxically reinforces the concentration that it was meant to combat. Precisely, these are the reasons for some of the problems that the development of Ciudad Guayana has demonstrated, and that the government should take into account for current planning.

Marco Negrón has mounted the strongest and most insistent opposition to the Orinoco-Apure plan. For him, the new territorial policy attempts to formulate the need of a radical transformation of the historical trends of territorial occupation in the country; i.e., it intends to move to the south what is to the north, carrying it out mainly through the development of the Orinoco-Apure river axis project. Even when this position is presented as a territorial revolution, what is really at its basis are old anti-urban biases rhetorically justified as the quest for national spatial equilibrium. Official statements brush the dust off the old theses of internal colonialism and spatial determinism, to propose the deferment of the development of urban Venezuela in an attempt to benefit the rural. Both the experiences in Venezuela and abroad, however, have revealed time and again that these attempts favor neither the urban nor the rural worlds. Playing out a contradiction that Negrón calls a 'revolutionary rhetoric vs. contra- revolutionary practice,' the arguments of the government to resuscitate that growth axis project are surprisingly the same of decades ago: the cost of providing services and bringing water to Caracas, and the wealth of natural resources of the southern territories. The first argument is suspect, because if the cost of pumping water to Caracas from low level water basins, then the elimination or at least attenuation of the subsidies of the current consumer bills for urban services tariffs ought to be considered. The second argument is inconsistent because the existence of natural resources in a region—especially if they are non-renewable, mineral resources—does not imply the desirability of promoting intensive processes of population growth. Indeed it may be sensible to not offer incentives to populate such regions.

The acute political struggle in Venezuela from 1999 to the present between the people that support Chavez's regime and those who oppose it and the electoral defeat of the constitutional reforms in 2007 forced the government to focus on maintaining and expanding political legitimacy and to abandon, for the moment, the largest and most controversial national planning projects.

Sources: Buenaño, 1999, 2000; Irazábal, 2004; Olivieri, 2000, Negrón, 1999, 2000., Irazábal and Foley 2008a, 2008b; Irazábal, 2007

3.5. The Impact of International Financing

The supply of US dollars in the international financial markets, broadly available after WWII was channelled into the Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries when the oil prices went up in the 1970s. Many Latin American countries borrowed substantial amounts of money from international lending institutions such as the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank, and other banks for developmental projects. However, the two oil crises of 1973 and 1979 reduced supply of dollars in the international debt markets and pushed interest rates up on debt agreements. This chain of events contributed to a major increase of international debt in Latin American countries in the 1970s and 1980s. The international institutions dramatically raised interests on those debts. Many countries could not afford to pay their debts or could only afford to pay interest on their debts and were thus forced to keep borrowing to sustain development. The money lent had strings attached that mandated the rolling out of neoliberal policies, including the shrinking of government, the expansion of free trade, the privatization of public companies and services, and the slashing of social services. The formula proved devastating for the social fabric of the continent. Poverty and inequality rose to unprecedented levels. In Latin America, the 1980s is commonly referred to as the Lost Decade.

3.6. Organic and other 'Non-Planning' Processes

There are organic and 'non-planning' ways in which urbanization and squatter settlements take place and evolve in LAC.[210] Local self-help is a planning strategy that has been promoted as a complement or substitute for government sponsored planning. It is an acknowledgment that the government will take only partial or no responsibility for developing working-class neighborhoods. The goal of these programs is to assist local groups in dealing with dismal urban conditions. Assistance is offered in forms such as financial aid, construction aid, and/or construction materials. An example of a self-help assistance project is the World Bank's Sites and Services program. One of the program's most successful project is the upgrading of Lima's in squatter settlements or *barriadas*. Self-help has proven most successful in the poorest communities because those are the areas that the government generally ignores. The main problem with self-help programs is that they are "credit" based, meaning that those who use the funds must first qualify. Qualification usually requires a stable income in order to repay the funds.[211]

Established informal settlements (e.g., *barrios* in Caracas or *favelas* in Rio de Janeiro) continue to grow as people add new rooms, balconies, terraces, and often times full new floors to their original building structures. This has often strained the urban infrastructure of cities, overwhelmed road capacity and made the provision of urban services (such as garbage collection, street cleaning and policing) all the more difficult. Extreme conditions of density and overcrowding have also exacerbated the incidence of domestic and urban violence.[212]

Some ex-urban towns or villages have also grown organically and informally in a linear manner along major roads that link urban centers. These towns live out of supplying services and goods such as food, souvenirs and services (mainly eateries) to passers by. Some households complement their sustenance with small-scale food cultivation and livestock (cattle, sheep, pigs, chicken). These towns

---

[210] see AlSayyad, 1993; Ward, 2005; Gilbert, 1998.

[211] Angotti 1996.

[212] Schrader, 2007; Davis, 2006.

are usually not served or badly served with utilities and usually lack proper schools and other facilities. Many also have high rate of pedestrian injuries and deaths given their proximity to high-speed roads that lack pedestrian infrastructure and safe crossings.

Planned cities such as Brasilia, Brazil[213] and Ciudad Guayana, Venezuela[214] have seen organic urban transformations as residents subvert the formal order envisioned by their designers to familiarize their surroundings, making them more akin to traditional cities they were used to. However, as Janice Perlman points out,[215] in these transformations, the residents of so-called "slum" communities also constantly subvert and reconstruct planning and development agencies' definition of "planned" communities, and of the "slum" itself. In the case of Rio de Janeiro, increased density created informal settlements along the periphery of cities, and these settlements were increasingly left to their own devices by municipal government. As such, the first migrants to arrive from the rural interior and form these settlements were materially deprived of basic sanitation, utilities, and infrastructure that defined planned communities. Since the 1970s, programs to improve sewage, bring running water and electricity into homes, and provide materials for housing have coincided with increased access to consumer goods for a lower socioeconomic spectrum of citizens. This has brought a marked material difference in the physical indicators of slum areas: more permanent materials, higher-quality furnishings, and—in some cases, even paving of streets and roads. However, the loss of manufacturing in Rio and other LAC cities, increased drug-related violence, and lack of educational parity have created more drastic, social divides between residents of the cities' peripheral slum communities and its middle-and upper-class urban residents. Thus, the very physical definition of "planned" communities versus "slums" is subverted by deeper social, racial and economic inequality reflective of broader national patterns.[216]

Lastly, some planned communities have also seen organic transformations, as residents add on to their housing units to accommodate new children, elderly parents or other relatives. Sometimes added-on units are rented out or used for a commercial enterprise, usually in violation of local regulations, to improve the economic conditions of the household. The most successful planned communities have incorporated the element of flexibility into their design. Sites-and-services interventions organize and subdivide the land and service it with urban infrastructure. They also provide each household with a minimum residential core that usually includes a kitchen and bathroom facility. Households complete their residential units according to their needs and the opportunities allotted by their own resources. Some architects and planners in the region have accompanied this move from self-help to participatory planning models.[217]

3.7. Contemporary Forms of Urban Planning

There are organic and 'non-planning' ways in which urbanization and squatter settlements take place and evolve in LAC.[218] Local self-help is a planning strategy that has been promoted as a complement or substitute for government sponsored planning. It is an acknowledgment that the government will take only partial or no responsibility for developing working-class neighborhoods. The goal of these programs is to assist local groups in dealing with dismal urban conditions. Assistance is offered in forms such as financial aid, construction aid, and/or construction materials. An example of a self-help assistance project is the World Bank's Sites and Services program. One of the program's most successful project is the upgrading of Lima's in squatter settlements or *barriadas*. Self-help has proven most successful in the poorest communities because those are the areas that the government

---

[213] Holston, 1989; Vanderbeek and Irazábal, 2007.

[214] Peattie, 1987; Irazábal, 2004.

[215] Perlman, 2006.

[216] Perlman, 2006.

[217] Perotti, 1996.

[218] see AlSayyad, 1993; Ward, 2005; Gilbert, 1998.

generally ignores. The main problem with self-help programs is that they are "credit" based, meaning that those who use the funds must first qualify. Qualification usually requires a stable income in order to repay the funds.[219]

Established informal settlements (e.g., *barrios* in Caracas or *favelas* in Rio de Janeiro) continue to grow as people add new rooms, balconies, terraces, and often times full new floors to their original building structures. This has often strained the urban infrastructure of cities, overwhelmed road capacity and made the provision of urban services (such as garbage collection, street cleaning and policing) all the more difficult. Extreme conditions of density and overcrowding have also exacerbated the incidence of domestic and urban violence.[220]

Some ex-urban towns or villages have also grown organically and informally in a linear manner along major roads that link urban centers. These towns live out of supplying services and goods such as food, souvenirs and services (mainly eateries) to passers by. Some households complement their sustenance with small-scale food cultivation and livestock (cattle, sheep, pigs, chicken). These towns are usually not served or badly served with utilities and usually lack proper schools and other facilities. Many also have high rate of pedestrian injuries and deaths given their proximity to high-speed roads that lack pedestrian infrastructure and safe crossings.

Planned cities such as Brasilia, Brazil[221] and Ciudad Guayana, Venezuela[222] have seen organic urban transformations as residents subvert the formal order envisioned by their designers to familiarize their surroundings, making them more akin to traditional cities they were used to. However, as Janice Perlman points out,[223] in these transformations, the residents of so-called "slum" communities also constantly subvert and reconstruct planning and development agencies' definition of "planned" communities, and of the "slum" itself. In the case of Rio de Janeiro, increased density created informal settlements along the periphery of cities, and these settlements were increasingly left to their own devices by municipal government. As such, the first migrants to arrive from the rural interior and form these settlements were materially deprived of basic sanitation, utilities, and infrastructure that defined planned communities. Since the 1970s, programs to improve sewage, bring running water and electricity into homes, and provide materials for housing have coincided with increased access to consumer goods for a lower socioeconomic spectrum of citizens. This has brought a marked material difference in the physical indicators of slum areas: more permanent materials, higher-quality furnishings, and—in some cases, even paving of streets and roads. However, the loss of manufacturing in Rio and other LAC cities, increased drug-related violence, and lack of educational parity have created more drastic, social divides between residents of the cities' peripheral slum communities and its middle-and upper-class urban residents. Thus, the very physical definition of "planned" communities versus "slums" is subverted by deeper social, racial and economic inequality reflective of broader national patterns.[224]

Lastly, some planned communities have also seen organic transformations, as residents add on to their housing units to accommodate new children, elderly parents or other relatives. Sometimes added-on units are rented out or used for a commercial enterprise, usually in violation of local regulations, to improve the economic conditions of the household. The most successful planned communities have incorporated the element of flexibility into their design. Sites-and-services interventions organize and subdivide the land and service it with urban infrastructure. They also provide each household with a minimum residential core that usually includes a kitchen and bathroom facility. Households complete their residential units according to their needs and the opportunities allotted by their own resources.

---

[219] Angotti 1996.

[220] Schrader, 2007; Davis, 2006.

[221] Holston, 1989; Vanderbeek and Irazábal, 2007.

[222] Peattie, 1987; Irazábal, 2004.

[223] Perlman, 2006.

[224] Perlman, 2006.

Some architects and planners in the region have accompanied this move from self-help to participatory planning models.[225]

Planning Styles Persisting

Bureaucracies and their professional staff have played a significant role in perpetuating outmoded planning ideas and ineffective systems in LAC. The rational, technocratic planning model, master or comprehensive planning, and zoning have been common approaches to planning in LAC that have not been adjusted much in decades, except for exceptional cases. The trust on professional expertise and 'scientific' knowledge and reasoning and the distrust of local, indigenous knowledge and reasoning have a strong bearing on the persistence of such practices.[226] Those values are reinforced by educational and job training institutions. Even in countries in transition, old planning approaches are resistant to change, as Irazábal and Foley discuss for the case in Venezuela where many planning professionals do not support the political transition to an inclusive socialist democracy as conceived by President Chávez.[227] Also in Bolivia, Ecuador, Paraguay, and Nicaragua, many planners from the socio-economic elite, and those who identify with its values, oppose the current regime's calls for a new approach to planning policy that disrupts models of professional expertise and demands that planners learn from the people. Most professional planners in LAC were formed within the rationalist paradigm, even if they identify with communicative planning approaches. Although some planners have indeed embraced the spirit of this new participatory approach, often they fail to bridge the gap between theory and practice. Many practitioners still cling—consciously or unconsciously—to the notion of the exclusive value of expertise, and hence do not validate the knowledge of residents, their right to self-determination, or even the larger national political projects.

The trust on expertise and scientific knowledge and reasoning allows for decision making to be kept and controlled within government institutions. The hegemony on planning processes and outcomes furthers the grip to power for elected and appointed representatives. It gives them instruments for paternalist, clientelist, and corporative relations with their constituencies. It usually weakens citizen participation and direct democracy.

---

[225] Perotti, 1996.

[226] see Forester 1999.

[227] Irazábal and Foley, 2008a, p. 33.

Current Approaches to Urban Planning

Strategic Planning

Borrowing from business techniques, strategic planning aims to define a strategy or direction for development and a plan for action and resource allocation effective to pursue the strategy. Various analysis techniques can be used in strategic planning, including SWOT analysis (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats) and PEST analysis (Political, Economic, Social, and Technological analysis). Strategic planning aims to be proactive and not re-active. It usually defines vision, mission, values, methodologies, situational analysis, goals, objectives, and targets. Its focus is narrower than comprehensive planning, and therefore it is considered a more effective planning model when time and resources are scarce, such as the case in LAC countries. The book *Planning under Pressure*,[228] recently translated into Spanish, has become a popular tool for promoting strategic planning in the region (e.g., it has been officially adopted by Venezuelan planning institutions).

Participatory Planning

The political orientation of national, state and local governments in the region accounts for their differential openness to more collaborative and participatory planning models. Some collaborative and participatory planning experiences in the region have helped expand citizens' agency, civic education and identity rights. Decentralized, participatory planning has proven successful for many local governments.[229] Some renown participatory planning experiences in the region include: Porto Alegre participatory budgeting,[230] Venezuelan and Ecuatorian communal councils,[231] Bolivian indigenous planning, and Costa Rican scenario and ecotourism planning.[232] For LAC, it would be beneficial to deepen the examination of the focuses, levels of success, replicability and lessons from these experiences.

Since the late 1980s, Mexico is advancing the creation and networking of local planning offices. These agencies serve as the basis for the professionalization of staff personnel to address planning issues and to expand local citizen participation and the notion of citizenship education (*Ciudadanización*). The agencies form the Mexican Network of Cities towards Sustainability (*Red Mexicana de Ciudades Hacia la Sustentabilidad*), which hold national planning congresses every year to exchange information and expertise among members and from invited international specialists. Out of those encounters an annual planning book is published.

Master and Special Planning

Master or comprehensive planning that encompasses strategies for mobility, housing, urban design, regional and environmental development, job and income generation, etc. continue to be pursued in cities in the region, albeit unevenly. It is mandated by the national constitution and the Cities Statute in Brazil for cities over 20,000 inhabitants or part of metropolitan, urban, or tourist regions. The campaign Participatory Master Plan: City of All (*Plano Diretor Participativo: Cidade de Todos*) in 2005 aimed to have 1,700 cities with their plans by October 2006.[233]

---

[228] Friend and Hickling, 2002.

[229] Cardenas and Moreno, 2004; Cernea, 1992.

[230] Rios and Rios Insua, 2008.

[231] Irazábal and Foley, 2007.

[232] Bliss, Corsonb and Gran, 2001.

[233] Ministério das Cidades, 2005.

Coupled Land Use and Transportation Planning

Since the 1960s, coupled land use and transportation planning has been ever more commonly pursued in LAC. Curitiba, Brazil pioneered the experience in the region.[234] Curitiba's Master Plan of 1965 conceived of an integrated land use and transit system in a cost-effective way. Its integrated transportation system (*rede integrada de transporte*) contemplates a system of bi-articulated buses, single fare and efficient bus stops. This internationally acclaimed and emulated rapid-transit bus system allows for users to pay one flat rate to travel throughout the city. Working throughout a hierarchical system, whereby collector buses from outlying areas bring passengers to main city arteries, Curitiba's bus system is credited with saving approximately 27 million automobile trips and currently serves 1.3 million passengers a year—approximately 85 per cent of Curitiba residents depend on the bus system as their main source of transportation.[235] Also, multiuse "Citizenship Streets" in the outskirts of the system provides outlying communities with a community center with retail, sport facilities, transit connection, and government offices.

The city of Curitiba has also been a leader in sustainability planning. The "garbage that is not garbage" program made it an effective recycling city with official estimates of 70 per cent of its trash being recycled. This program has helped keep the streets clean, cut diseases, and reduced flooding caused by trash thrown into rivers.[236] Led by former three-time mayor of Curitiba, Jaime Lerner, the city planned energy efficient buildings that include an emphasis on site selection that respects green space.[237] In order for the city to assure new projects will provide green/open space, developers are offered tax breaks. In 1970, there was less than 1 square meter of green space per person. Today, officials estimate there are 52 square meters for each person comprised of 28 parks and wooded areas. Flood waters are diverted into created lakes in parks solving the problem of dangerous flooding, while also protecting valley floors and riverbanks, acting as a deterrent to illegal occupation and providing aesthetic and recreational value to the people who use city parks.

The bus system or components thereof have been emulated and adapted in other Brazilian cities and also in Bogota, São Paulo, Mexico City, Guayaquil City, Santiago, and Los Angeles, among others. Bogota's Transmilenio, inaugurated in 2000, is often deemed as an improvement over Curitiba's model, particularly because of its management (incorporating Intelligent Transportation Systems—ITS) and maintenance record. São Paulo and Mexico City have also created express lines and bus stations that adapt some of Curitiba's transit trademarks to their own urban conditions. Chile's TranSantiago built on Curitiba's and Bogota's transit models, replacing single, long bus routes with more efficient, shorter routes of an interconnected network of buses and the existent subway line in 2007. Deficient coordination and timing of buses caused chaos in the city and angered commuters who then challenged President Michelle Bachelet early in her term. Later adjustments in the system dramatically improved efficiency but the negative public perception has proven more resistant to change. This particular case proves the difficulties inherent to inducing changes in urban residents' habits, whereby many transit users in Santiago allegedly prefer long and windy commutes in a single bus, than faster commutes in a system that requires transboarding.[238]

In the Caribbean, Puerto Rico installed the first metro system in San Juan in 2004. Some residents and transit specialists question the route it follows and what they deem as an unnecessary investment in monumental stations.[239] On its part, the Dominican Republic is currently working on Santo Domingo's subway system, trying to redress the long and difficult commutes from the peripheral areas of the city to the center. It is also an attempt to deal with growing levels of pollution

---

[234] Irazábal, 2005, forthcoming 2008.

[235] Goodman, *et al.*, 2005/2006.

[236] Wright, 1996.

[237] Huecker, 2007.

[238] Estrada, 2007.

[239] Green, 2005

produced by a stock of cars and buses growing increasingly old. Responsible local agents are envisioning a plan that integrates land use and transportation, promoting transit-oriented development wherever possible. The University of Texas at Austin is offering professional expertise in such effort.

Historic Preservation of City Cores

The revitalization of some historic centers in the region's urban areas has incorporated strategies of urban design, historic preservation, economic development, and cultural planning in tandem with equity concerns.[240]

In Cuba, since establishing the Office of the City Historian (*Oficina del Historiador de la Ciudad*), planning around historic preservation of its central core has become an integral part Cuba's economic revitalization strategy.241 As such, planners have developed a comprehensive strategy to document historic resources, encourage preservation of landmarks through regulation, and promote investment into historic neighborhoods for tourism development. Starting in 1981, the government invested in its preservation strategy through a series of five year plans to restore monuments and entire city squares, and provided legal authority to the Office of the City Historian to promote sustainable development in targeted zones. Through tax and partnership programs with foreign entities, the Office of the City Historian has been able to fund its activities, as well as provide support for social, cultural and recreational services and improve the housing stock of residents in its core areas. In addition to revitalizing its core, preservation planning of the city has also addressed other related impacts of urban displacement that has been common to LAC cities. Through its training programs for young adults, the Office of the City Historian provides residents the opportunity to work as masons, carpenters and skilled tradesmen, thus providing employment and revenue generating opportunities within targeted zones, with nearly half of the five thousand workers engaged in preservation projects of the Office of the City Historian in 1998 having resided in Old Havana or Havana Center city.[242]

3.8. National Development Planning and Urban Planning

National level planning has implications for planning at the city level in LAC.

Planning for Eco-Tourism and Sustainable Real Estate Tourist Development

The swelling tourist development in both the Atlantic and Pacific coastal cities and towns of Mexico and Central America,[243] from Puerto Vallarta to Cancun (in Mexico) to Costa Rica, is prompting local and national governments in LAC to plan in reaction to concerns of unchecked tourism development's damaging ecological impacts on the environment.[244]

At one end, Mexico's Pacific and Atlantic coastal development is turning fragile ecosystems and collective land (*ejidos*) into mega-resorts and golf courses at a pace that has upset environmentalists and has prompted legal disputes over the role of local and national governments as regulatory and managerial guarantors of the public good.[245] With a hugely lucrative tourism industry, however, Costa Rica has refocused national-level planning towards ecologically sustainable planning or eco-tourism planning in the past thirty years, in tourist towns and in its preservation of natural resources.[246] Having received generous support from international agencies, such as the International Monetary Fund

---

[240] Scarpaci, 2004.

[241] Scarpaci, Segre and Coyula, 1997.

[242] University of Vermont Historic Preservation Department, 2008.

[243] Campbell, 1999

[244] Silva, 1997; Irazábal and Morán, 2008.

[245] Irazábal and Morán, 2008.

[246] Weaver, 1999.

(IMF), US Agency for International Development (USAID, and the World Bank to develop tourist infrastructure such as hotels, airport and sea transportation utilities, Costa Rica has been able to rely on tourism as its major economic development tool. A major component of Costa Rica's eco-tourism planning approach embraces stewardship of its national parks, preservation of natural habitat, participation of stakeholders, and sustaining the local economy.[247] However, Costa Rica has witnessed increased volumes of tourists to its national parks under its eco-tourism planning approach with mixed-results. Outside its system of parks and protected areas, Costa Rica's rain forests have been under increased attack of deforestation, resulting in loss of habitat. Insufficient funding at the federal-government level has also left the park system vulnerable and reliant on international aid for its maintenance. Lastly, while preservation of protected areas has been a boon to environmental successes, Costa Rica eco-tourism planning approach had not adequately assessed the impact of the loss of resources to adjacent communities, nor (until recently) had it invested heavily in the environmental education of its citizens and stakeholders.[248]

Limitations of Contemporary National-Level Planning

The late Venezuelan intellectual Arturo Uslar Pietri [1906-2001] critiqued the excessive reliance of the country's economy on oil and urged the national government to "plant the oil" (*sembrar el petróleo*), metaphorically referring to using the oil revenues for investment in other productive sectors for a more diversified economic base.[249] Chavez's government is using this advice as a planning rationale for the creation of new towns and cities in the country with specific economic missions.

In 2008, the Venezuelan government hired a Canadian firm, SNC-Lavalin (previously Surveyer, Nenniger & Chênevert), to develop sophisticated irrigation systems and three towns and that will house people devoted to agricultural activities. SNC-Lavalin was awarded a US$597 million contract by Venezuela's National Institute for Rural Development (*Instituto Nacional de Desarrollo Rural*, INDER) to design and build an integrated irrigation system, supporting infrastructure and three small towns in the Tiznados district of the State of Guarico, about 300 km south of Caracas. On the one hand, this initiative brings the benefits of investment to rural communities and contributes towards efforts to achieve national self-sufficiency in food production. However, there is the worrisome side of placing unwarranted faith in environmental determinism and the difficulties of convincing people to relocate and change their life-styles and jobs. Other recent planning initiatives in Venezuela include communal councils (see Irazábal and Foley 2008b; Josh Lerner 2007), the planning school (*Escuela de Planificación*) for community members, endogenous developments (*Desarrollos Endógenos*) and neighborhood units. They all aim to expand citizen participation in planning and community development matters and provide spatial settings appropriate for the formation and sustenance of cooperative production and communal living.

Colombia is politically and territorially divided into areas controlled by elected national, regional, and municipal governments; areas controlled by guerrilla groups; and areas controlled by paramilitary groups. These conditions pose phenomenal challenges to national and regional planning, as these institutions are at war with each other. In addition, the violence has displaced thousands of rural residents, who have migrated to major cities, and particularly to the capital, Bogota. Colombia has thus concentrated its efforts on local and metropolitan urban planning, with the meritorious examples of Bogota and Medellin, and some important efforts on historic preservation in the coastal city of Cartagena. Attempts at regional planning, such as the one for the region of Antioquia, where Medellin is located, have usually been prompted by post-natural disaster recovery efforts and been hindered by the armed conflict.

In Cuba, after the period of communist regime started in 1959 under the lead of Fidel Castro, the government put a lot of emphasis on rural development to the detriment of cities, and particularly to

---

[247] Buchsbaum, 2004.

[248] Buchsbaum, 2004.

[249] Cervantes Varela, 2001.

the abandonment of plans and efforts for proper development and maintenance of infrastructure in the capital, Havana.[250] The loss of economic support from the Soviet Union after the demise of global communism and the impact of the US-led embargo on trade have hit the economy of the island really hard.[251] In an attempt to boost the tourist economy as an economic strategy, the Cuban government invested in priming its urban infrastructure in Havana and other cities, as well as its resort infrastructure linked to attractive beaches. These efforts created clusters of new or historically-preserved and beautified development. The tourist economy run in US dollars or Euros has contributed to the polarization of society, widening a gap between those who have the privilege to work in tourist-related trades and those who do not. Raúl Castro, Fidel Castro's brother supplanting him as president of Cuba since February 2008, will likely continue a centralized planning model in the island.

3.9. The Influence of International Agendas in Planning

In the last decades, several international organizations, including UN-HABITAT, have promoted several urban planning approaches in LAC embedded in global programs such as the Urban Management Programme, Local Agenda 21, Sustainable Cities Programme, the Healthy Cities Programme, and the Safer Cities Programme. These can be seen as part of an international agenda designed to influence planning in the region. The extent to which experiences from such initiatives form part of the planning priorities in LAC as well as their level of effectiveness varies.

The World Bank and USAID

The World Bank has long been involved in influencing the planning policies and practices of LAC governments. During the 1960s, rural poverty and urban degradation gave rise to international concern about development and long-term planning, while at the same time, the United Nations declared the 1960s the "Development Decade." Meanwhile, the World Bank increased lending for infrastructure and the US. Alliance for Progress aimed to improve living standards. The US Agency for International Development (USAID) Housing Guarantee program helped to establish savings and loan systems in LAC that were largely directed towards rural problems. Despite rural development programs, the migration of people to large economic centers continued to large cities increased. Since the 1960s, master planning, slum clearance, urban renewal, development of public housing and infrastructure projects became principal approaches to urbanization while rural areas continued to suffer.[252]

The International Monetary Fund (IMF)

The IMF is credited with having a heavy influence on the internal economic policies of LAC countries facing difficulty managing their international debt, thus influencing the planning and development strategies of the these countries. In the case of Brazil, for example, increased inflation during the 1960s through 1980s, and international economic crises starting in the late 1970s (starting from oil crises in 1973 and 1979) saw the country increasing its foreign debt to the IMF and a growing trade imbalance, even while it saw some growth in the GDP and the government continued its investment in costly public sector projects.[253]

After nearly a decade of decreased levels of growth, Brazil began to renegotiate its foreign debt to the IMF in 1982, and thus began a process of economic reforms to liberalize trade and increase the privatization and deregulation of some industries. In addition, reforms placed the federal government in an increased role as a promoter of private development and reduced its direct responsibilities for production of goods and services. Thus, Brazil, as in LAC in general, witnessed a vastly decreased

---

[250] Segre, 2008; Castro Rodríguez and Rodríguez, 1984.

[251] Carter, 1998; Colantonio and Potter, 2006.

[252] Urban Development Timeline, 2008.

[253] Deloitte, 2004.

role in the planning of public services and infrastructure, such as housing, public transit, and utilities and infrastructure. Recidivist legislation further hobbled the role of regional and city planning in many cases. Specifically, in the case of Brazil, the implementation of three programs changed the country's development strategy and its implications for planning: the National Debureaucratization Program (1979), the Federal Privatization Program (1988) and the National Privatization Program (1990). Following these programs and subsequent acts, Brazil broke up several state infrastructure monopolies (oil, telecommunications, and piped gas distribution) and eliminated "discrimination" between domestic and foreign capital. In addition, the National Privatization Program further privatized 68 federal and 40 state companies, including steel, electric energy, banking and financial services, ports, and railway networks. State economic planners also reinforced the regulatory framework overseeing public services, minimizing economic power abuses, and supporting competition within newly privatized industries.[254] Thus, Brazil serves as one example of the trends towards neoliberal economic policies taken by Latin American nations following the default or negotiation of foreign debt.

UNESCO's International World Heritage Programme

This United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization's (UNESCO) program makes World Heritage Site designations around the world. These designations have impacted local socio-economic development, often times attracting tourism and conservation efforts and funds to the region. In the case of Havana's historic city core, or Mayan and Aztec ruins in Guatemala and Mexico, the designation as a world heritage site helped to further stimulate efforts by the governments to preserve its historic resources and generate economic development through investment in tourism infrastructure. The benefits of such designations, however, are often inequitably distributed, exacerbating socio-spatial polarization in the area, as government resources and investment are diverted away from other social infrastructure projects.

3.10. Concluding Thoughts

This chapter broadly discusses how current approaches to urban planning differ from earlier master planning approaches and some experiences in which they have been applied and the contextual factors that have shaped them. It portrays the uneven engagement in purposeful planning in the LAC region and therefore its subsequent uneven application of master planning or other planning models. The different levels of urbanization and the uneven access to planning education in the region also make for planning efforts to be unevenly present in the region and for planning models to be highly contextualized. The political orientation of national, state, and local governments in the region also account for their differential openness to more collaborative and participatory planning models.

As explained above, some collaborative and participatory planning experiences in the region have helped expand citizens' agency, civic education, identity rights, and sustainable planning. Also, some integrative or comprehensive planning in the region has considered land use and transportation in tandem, to various degrees of success. In particular, multi-modal, coordinated systems of transportation have improved mobility in several metropolitan areas of Latin America and the Caribbean (Mexico City, São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, Curitiba, Caracas, Santiago de Chile, San Juan, etc.), and there are other cities that are in the process of planning for the implementation of such multi-modal, mobility systems (Santo Domingo, Valencia, etc.). The revitalization of some historic centers in the region's urban areas has incorporated strategies of urban design, historic preservation, economic development, and cultural planning in tandem with equity concerns. Finally, in the last decade, there have been important social revolts against neoliberalist structures in LAC that have transformed peoples' consciousness and political regimes in the region.[255] This has led to the rise of leftists governments in Venezuela, Ecuador, Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Argentina, Panama, and Paraguay, and

---

[254] Deloitte, 2004.

[255] Irazábal, 2008.

propitiated new regional alliances with Cuba. The impacts on urban planning in LAC of this epochal transformation are unfolding and may expand the possibilities of a post-neoliberal urbanism and planning.

4. The Institutional and Regulatory Framework for Planning

This chapter examines the institutional framework for urban planning with a focus on plan formulation and implementation. Planners have long argued that the institutional framework or way in which planning is usually situated within government is a principal reason why plans are ignored or not implemented. The silo-type structure of government, in which planning is placed in a separate department, is a major problem in the absence of mechanisms for linkage to other departments or to the budgeting process.

This chapter takes cognizance of the fragmentary nature of the institutional framework for urban planning in many LAC countries. This is because what often exists is an assortment of and incoherent organization of planning agencies cutting across different levels of government, as well as geographical areas with no clearly defined, or at best, poorly defined functions and responsibilities. This often leads to problems of inter-agency or institutional coordination, duplication of responsibilities and functions, and misuse of scarce resources. Yet, it is also part of a larger problem of integrating the work of local government and dealing with inter-governmental relations. Integrated Development Planning (e.g., in South Africa) or area-based management approaches have been suggested as ways to overcome this, but there have been no clear successes in LAC.

In addition, the chapter addresses the role of urban planning legislation in the effective formulation and implementation of plans. Outdated or inappropriate legislative codes and overly-bureaucratic regulatory processes hinder effective plan implementation. More relevant, inclusive, and effective urban planning legislation can enhance the urban planning process.

4.1. Institutional framework for shaping plan formulation and implementation

The institutional framework shaping plan formulation and implementation varies across the LAC region. It also varies depending on the level of government—national, regional, metropolitan, and local.

National planning structures

National planning in many LAC countries has benefited from greater institutionalization in recent decades and is increasing its articulation with other planning institutions and other levels of government as decentralization advances in the region. In most LAC countries, there is an agency in charge of planning, usually a national ministry of development, public works, or planning. In a recent and innovative move, Brazil created the Ministry of Cities (*Ministério das Cidades*),[256] but this initiative has not been emulated elsewhere in the region. Other more conventional models contain ministries of planning and/or development, such as in Chile, Venezuela, Argentina, and Costa Rica. Lastly, some countries perform planning functions within other departments, such as those related to economic or social development, such as in Panama.

In Panama, the former Ministry of Planning and Economic Policy (*Ministerio de Planificación y Política Económica*) has been dissolved and some of its functions adopted by the Ministry of Economy and Finances (*Ministerio de Economía y Finanzas*), created in December 1998 with the mission to formulate economic and social policy, administer and provide the resources for the execution of government's plans and programs, and to promote the greatest well-being of the population.[257] It has formulated a 2009 Strategic Vision for economic development[258] that includes, but does not particularly focus, on spatial territorial planning.

---

[256] Ministério das Cidades, Brasil

[257] Ministerio de Economia y Finanzas

In Brazil, where cities contain 82% of the national population, 6.6 million families lack housing, 11% of the urban domiciles do not have access to a potable water supply, and 50% are not connected to sanitation systems. The Ministry of Cities' mission, created by President Luiz Inácio (Lula) Da Silva in January of 2003, is "to fight social inequalities, transforming the cities into more humanized spaces, through extending the population's access to housing, sanitation and transport." Through cooperation with the Federal Economic Bank (*Caixa Econômica Federal*), the Ministry works in specific and unified manners with states, cities, social movements, non-governmental organizations, and the private sector. The creation of the Cities' Council in 2004 further adds an instrument of democratic management of the National Urban Development Policy (NUDP), which has yet to be completed. This council is a collegiate body with a deliberative and advisory nature for studying and proposing guidelines in the formulation and implementation of the NUDP, as well as following the execution of programs in habitation, environmental sanitation, transport and urban mobility, and territorial planning. Currently, the Cities' Council is comprised of 86 counselors—49 representatives of segments of civil society and 37 of the three branches of government—with terms of two years, and nine state government representative observers, which also must have Cities' Councils in their respective states. The institutional structure in Brazil maybe the most productive in LAC to advance urban planning, but it has proven to swing with the emphasis of its different leaders.

In Argentina, national-level planning power is held by the Ministry of Federal Planning, Public Investment, and Public Services (*Ministerio de Planificación Federal, Inversión Pública y Servicios*).[259] The implementation of the Nacional Policy for Development and Territorial Ordering (PNDOT, *Política Nacional de Desarrollo y Ordenamiento Territorial*)[260] requires a flexible and participative strategy allowing gradual and phased actions, and coordination between a diverse set of actors. The instrument for permanent intervention is the National System of Development and Territorial Ordering (SiNDOT, *Sistema Nacional de Desarrollo y Ordenamiento Territorial*), conceived as a set of specific actors, instruments, plans and projects. Through SiNDOT a work methodology is created based on three parallel axes: The implementation and consolidation of the Information, Networking, and Technical Assistance for Development and Territorial Ordering systems (SIVAT); a Territorial Strategic Plan (PET); and a National Law of Development and Territorial Ordering.

Chile's national planning body is the Ministry of Planning and Cooperation (*Ministerio de Planificación y Cooperación*).[261] The Ministry of Planning's mission is the promotion of country development with integration and social protection of the people; the collaboration between political authorities, organs of the State and civil society at national, regional and local levels through analysis, design, coordination, execution and evaluation of social policies, plans and programs; public investment initiatives evaluation; information and analysis provision about the current social and economic status of the country; and elaboration of instruments and methodologies for public policy management and decision making. In 1967, the Office of National Planning was created (Odeplan) as a decentralized public agency structured for administrative purposes through the Department of the Interior. It was tasked with determining where Regional Offices of Planning would be created. In 1974 these offices changed name, to the Regional Secretariat for Planning and Coordination, and were further integrated into the national system. In 1990, the Office of National Planning was transformed once again; now into the Ministry for Planning and Cooperation (Mideplan), whose internal structure was defined in 1992.

According to the guidelines established by President Michelle Bachelet, the Regional Division is currently working (from 2006 to 2010) towards the technical strengthening of the Ministerial Regional Secretariats through the development of human capital measurement methodologies, an index of basic

---

[258] Ministerio de Economia y Finanzas

[259] Minplan of Argentina

[260] Minplan of Argentina

[261] Ministerio de Planificación y Cooperación, Midelan

necessities satisfaction and human development, an index of regional competitiveness, methodologies of territorial planning, zoning for waterfront development, and investment geo-referencing. Also, it is contributing to public policy design with the goals of elevating regional competitiveness and reducing interregional gaps. Capacity-building and technical assistance is offered to municipalities in participatory planning, valuing the self-directedness and cultural identity of communities. Also, the territorial dimension in the instruments of regional and local planning will be included, as well methodical support in the conception of territorial networks of social protection. This reworking aspires to position the Regional Division as the bridge between planners and the entirety of the Ministry in assisting both national and regional growth within the framework of the descentralizing goals of Michelle Bachelet's government. Thus, Chile's planning institutional trajectory is representative of a major trend in the LAC area from technocratic and centralized planning to a more decentralized and participatory structure and model of planning that aims to be more inclusive of, and responsive to, the communities in all stages of planning: plan formulation, implementation, and post-evaluation.

In Venezuela, the equivalent ministry is the Planning and Development Ministry (*Ministerio de Planificación y Desarrollo*)[262], created in 1999, later called Ministry of Public Power for Planning and Development (*Ministerio del Poder Popular para la Planificación y el Desarrollo*, MPPPD).[263] The Ministry's mission is to advise the President the Republic, the National Assembly and the other government decision-makers in socio-economic development strategy formulation and instrumentation, plan promotion, creation of policies and projects compatible with this strategy, and facilitating coordination between the relevant groups and organizations for its execution. The Bolivarian political project in Venezuela has pursued an explicit attempt to give greater power to the people to plan and implement projects in their communities. The inertia of traditional planning practices and models, the persistence and complexities of the old bureaucracy, the ambiguities of new institutional and legal arrangements, and the political opposition have been enormous challenges to surmount for this transition.

In Bolivia, a country with a shorter tradition of planning, the Ministry of Planning and Development, known before as the Ministry of Sustainable and Environmental Development, was created in 2006 and has the mission of projecting the guidelines for the governmental policies that are oriented at constructing a society and a State in which the Bolivians "live well".[264] The Ministry holds top-level responsibility in policy generation and articulation, such that the State has a fundamental role in creating a "Worthy, Productive and Sovereign Bolivia," necessary to "live well." The Ministry is responsible for planning and coordinating the country's integral development by means of elaboration, coordination, and national economic, social and cultural development strategy division, in relation to the other Ministries, public departmental entities, locales, and social organizations representative of civil society. The Viceministry of Planning and Coordination has the function of planning the integral development of the country, contributing in the elaboration of the National Development Plan (*Plan Nacional de Desarrollo*, PND) with the collective participation of all sectors including farmers, microindustralists, small producers, and the private sector. The Viceministry of Territorial and Environmental Planning also formulates policies for the sustainable use of renewable and nonrenewable natural resources, biodiversity and conservation of the environment, congruent with production processes and social and technological development.

The restructuring of Bolivian planning institutions and intents is one of the most innovative in the LAC region and deserves further commentary. The "National Plan of Worthy, Sovereign, Productive and Democratic Bolivian Development to Live Well" guides the conception of national development policies, strategies and programs in all sectoral and territorial scopes aiming to contribute to the country transformation process; to disassemble the model of development conceived in colonialism and neoliberalism and to change the pattern of exporting primary development; to formulate and

---

[262] Ministerio del Poder Popular para la Planificación y el Desarrollo

[263] Gobierno Bolivariano de Venezuela, 2005

[264] Bolivian Planning Ministry

execute development while maintaining cultural sensitivity; to contribute to the construction of a new plurinacional State promoter of social communitarian development that equitably redistributes wealth, income and opportunities; to develop a balanced coexistence of the state economy, the communitarian economy, the mixed economy and the private economy; and promote a new pattern of diversified and integrated development and the eradication of poverty, social inequality and exclusion. There is, however, a powerful opposition to the national government in Bolivia that is hindering the implementation of this planning agenda.

Costa Rica's planning body is the Ministry of National Planning and Economic Policy (*Ministerio de Planificación Nacional y Política Económica*, MIDEPLAN).[265] MIDEPLAN is the governmental body ordered to formulate, coordinate, pursue and evaluate the strategies and priorities of the government. MIDEPLAN is similar to the brain of the executive authority, since it is in charge of defining the route of national development and supporting the decision-making of the President in individual and general Executive authority, while maintaining grounding in a conscientious and permanent analysis of reality. Some of the main functions of the Ministry are: to define both a medium and long term development strategy for the country; to draft the National Plan of Development, which articulates the government strategy in priorities, policies, programs and actions; to coordinate, evaluate and pursue those actions, programs and policies; to maintain an updated and perspective evaluation of the national development's evolution, as an essential part in strengthening the processes of decision making and evaluating the impact of the government's programs and actions; to promote a permanent evaluation and renovation of state services (modernization of public administration); and to stand by the application of government priorities in budget allocation, public investment, and international cooperation.

The National system of Planning was created in 1974, with the purposes of intensifying the growth of national production and promoting the best distribution of national funds and social services.[266] The National System of Planning is integrated with the MIDEPLAN, the Ministries' planning units or offices, and other public institutions and the mechanisms of existing coordination and consultant's office. The National Plan of Development (*Plan Nacional de Desarrollo*, PND 2006-2010) was delivered to president Dr. Oscar Arias Sanchez in 2007.[267] The plan was created with participation from the Ministers of State, managers of public institutions, representatives of international organizations, the diplomatic body, an episcopal conference, directors of universities, academics, mayors, deputies, government officials, and mass media. The plan is structured along five axes: social policy, productive policy, environmental policy, institutional reform, and foreign policy. These group 16 sectors, and respond to the following national goals: fight corruption in all of the pubic sector's scopes of action; reduce poverty and inequality; increase economic and employment growth; improve the education system's quality and expand its coverage; stop the growth of crime, drug trafficking, and curb drug addiction rates; revert feelings of increasing insecurity within the citizenry; strengthen public institutions and order state priorities; repair and extend the country's transportation infrastructure; dignify foreign policy and recover Costa Rica's role in the world.

Planning institutions and practices in Costa Rica are advancing, but not at the pace of development. In particular, pressures from globalization (such as for the installment of international business parks and their related urban infrastructure) and tourist-real estate development are affecting fragile ecosystems and overloading inadequate urban infrastructure. Planning legislation, planning institutions, and compliance with them are not keeping up with the pace of changes. This is a common trend in the Caribbean. However, these planning initiatives and institutions commented here are steps in the right direction for challenging the political and institutional constraints to the promotion of planning in Costa Rica and other LAC countries.[268]

---

[265] MIDEPLAN of Costa Rica

[266] MIDEPLAN of Costa Rica

[267] MIDEPLAN of Costa Rica

[268] Graterol-Aranguren, 1992

Regional and metropolitan planning structures

Many countries in the region are administratively divided into states or departments with varying levels of planning independence, infrastructure, technical competence, and resources.[269] Larger and wealthier states or departments are more likely to have planning institutions than smaller and poorer ones, and those institutions are better equipped and more technically proficient (e.g., state planning institutions in northern Mexico are wealthier and better structured than in southern Mexico. State planning institutions in southern Brazil, on the contrary, are wealthier and more technically proficient than in northern Brazil. Planning institutions in mineral-rich states such as Zulia in Venezuela are richer than in poorer states, such as Apure. There are regions that lack planning institutions altogether, or whose planning is performed in central planning agencies, particularly those in capital cities associated with national governments.

Metropolitan areas are composed of municipalities between which exist population centers, economic ties, and joint planning and coordination of certain services. Their distinguishing characteristic is the unitary character granted to a determined territory by functional independence relations. Because of this, metropolitan problems cannot be addressed from a local perspective, since integrated visions across all cities in a metropolitan region are necessary to combat the issues at each local level. There are some efforts to create metropolitan planning structures in some LAC cities, but where they exist they lack power and do not supersede local governments. Important factors critically contributing to the decline of planning and governance in many LAC cities are institutional structure deficiencies and planning and governance coordination at the metropolis level.

The Main Mayoral Office or *Alcaldía Mayor* was a figure of Spanish colonial government in Latin America; chief judge of a district from Peru to Nueva España (current Mexico). The figure of *Alcaldía Mayor* corresponds today to the main mayoral office in metropolitan Caracas, Bogota, and other LAC cities. The Metropolitan Mayorship of Caracas, for example, coordinates and applies policies for development in the Metropolitan District of Caracas. The Metropolitan District of Caracas is the City of Caracas' political unit based on a formula of administration and municipal organization at two levels: a Metropolitan Level and a Municipal Level, with the latter being subjected to the Metropolitan Level in its capacities. The Metropolitan Mayor of Caracas, also known as Greater Mayor, depends on a Government Council as the superior advisory organization. This body is composed of the mayors of the municipalities forming the Metropolitan District of Caracas.[270] The Metropolitan *Cabildo* (Town Hall) is the legislative body of the District, composed of Metropolitan Council Members. Five municipalities form the Metropolitan District.

Case Study: Urban Planning, Bogota, Colombia

The Metropolitan Government of Bogota includes an Institute of Urban Development (Instituto de Desarrollo Urbano). It was created in 1972 and was designed to execute physical infrastructure projects, maintenance, and improvement actions such that the Bogota's inhabitants have access to transportation, enjoy public space, improve their quality of life, and reach sustainable development. Participation mechanisms are implemented to generate public buy-in. It attempts to advance the concept of a city of the people and for the people, with a human environment that promotes the exercising of collective rights, fairness and social inclusion. It envisions a modern, environmental and socially sustainable city, balanced in its infrastructures, territorially integrated, economically competitive and participative.

The development plan "Bogota without Indifference: A social commitment against poverty and exclusion" was adopted for Bogota, *Distrito Capital* for the period of 2004-2008.. The general objective of the Plan is to collectively and progressively construct a modern and humane city, committed to solidarity with the social rule of law, and with women and men who exert their citizenship and recognize their diversity. Also, to create a city with an integrated, participative, effective, and transparent public management system that generates commitment and social confidence within the citizenry and to guarantee their human rights. The plan's Regional Urban Axes' policies focus on habitat, cooperation and competition, environmental sustainability, and city-region. In order to advance in regional and international integration processes, it promotes the strengthening and legitimization of the Regional Planning

---

[269] Escobar-Lemmon, 2001

[270] Alcaldía Mayor del Distrito Metropolitano, Caracas

Commission and the Regional Council of Competitiveness, as well as other instances, instruments, or mechanisms that develop them, through the establishment of working groups.

Bogota's Plan of Territorial Ordering (Plan de Ordenamiento Territorial, POT) is considered a new step in the metropolis' urban planning process. It retakes a system of integral planning starting off of the existing city. In it, there are bases for land use policy for the next 10 years in the matters of: controlled growth, renovation or conservation of urban structures, land assemblages for infrastructure development, open space, public facilities, affordable housing programs, and environmental considerations. The territorial model dictated by the POT establishes general systems for the urban structure: road systems, general systems of transport, aqueducts, basic sanitation, public facilities, and public space. The Institute of Urban Development will execute the plans, programs, and projects related to road, transport, and public space systems.

Sources: IDU, 2004; IDU, 2007

Case Study: Urban Planning, Curitiba, Brazil

A pertinent example of efficient urban planning at the local level that has not effectively transcend to a metropolitan level is that of Curitiba, Brazil. A recent mayor of Curitiba, Cassio Taniguchi, defined basic guidelines of his government plan, two of which give priority to metropolitan issues: shared management and metropolitan integration. Despite the recent attempts by Taniguchi, the COMEC, Curitiba Metropolitan Region Coordenation (*Coordenação da Região Metropolitana de Curitiba*) and the Special Secretary of Metropolitan Affairs SEAM/ASSOMEC (*Secretaria Extraordinária de Assuntos Metropolitanos*, created in 1997) to pursue such goals, there is skepticism on the part of some observers of the process. For Oliveira, one of the harsher critics, there is a major 'structural obstacle' to those metropolitan plans. If patterns of urban development similar to those of Curitiba were implemented at the metropolitan level, he asserts, the entirety of economic functionality provided by those municipalities to Curitiba would be reverted. Oliveira further senses that the discussion of metropolitan issues has not yet transcended to the elite in Curitiba, in other words, it has not transformed into a socio-political problem, and hence, the powers-that-be are not compelled to confront their constituency with proposals to address it. This is rapidly changing, however, as was demonstrated by the electoral campaign for Mayor in 2000, in which all candidates had to explicitly address the problems of metropolitanization.

There are additional institutional constraints that make metropolitan planning difficult in Curitiba and other Brazilian (and other LAC) cities. Only municipal and state governments in Brazil hold decision-making powers. The state legislature is the governing body for legally-defined metropolitan regions. Therefore, metropolitan entities such as the aforementioned COMEC and SEAM/ASSOMEC are not decision-making bodies. There have been proposals presented for the creation of a metropolitan parliament, with political power and a forum for municipal council members to meet and negotiate upon metropolitan issues. Vested political interests have resisted the proposals, however. Compounding the problem is the absence of political will to confront the power schemata of neighboring municipalities for the creation or coordination of a metropolitan government. The possibility even exists for higher confrontational political costs among local governments than the potential achievable benefits. Instead, metropolitan region fragmentation has resulted in more municipalities and incorporation of new municipalities into the metropolitan region. This has happened frequently in recent years, making the attempts for metropolitan government and coordination even more difficult. In most cases, the fragmentations and incorporations are not functionally justified in terms of the urban dynamics taking place in the municipalities involved; rather, they usually follow political-administrative interests—the more instances of power, the more resources and installments of power to distribute among more people.

Within this current system, the only other institute capable of taking over metropolitan leadership is the Institute of Urban Research and Planning of Curitiba (*Instituto de Pesquisa e Planejamento Urbano de Curitiba*, IPPUC) created in 1965. Yet today, IPPUC's actions do not have the same all-encompassing impact they had during the early years of the Curitiba Master Plan's (*Plano Diretor)* design and implementation. This is mainly a result of the major planning actions conceived in the *Plano's* already completed implementation. In effect, there has been a clear shift in the role played by IPPUC since Jaime Lerner's last term as mayor of Curitiba; from an emphasis on structural urban planning to punctual architectural and landscaping interventions.

It has been only within the most recent mayoral period of Mayor Taniguchi that IPPUC has recovered its leadership position. In effect, the SEAM/ASSOMEC is functioning within IPPUC premises, and part of IPPUC's personnel is devoted to metropolitan projects by addressing the integration of neighboring municipalities to Curitiba. Since IPPUC is a municipal agency, however, there are some institutional constraints to actions in metropolitan planning. These institutional problems are partially solved through instances of some municipalities (lacking technical capacity) contracting IPPUC or professionals from this institution to perform consulting services in developing their municipal *Planos Diretores*. This occurs in a context where neither of the two metropolitan institutions have deliberating powers: the SEAM/ASSOMEC is a political council composed by the mayors of all the municipalities of the Curitiba

Metropolitan Region (CMR), with the mayor of Curitiba as President; and the other metropolitan organ, the Metropolitan Coordination of Curitiba (COMEC), is a technical planning organ for the metropolitan region. Decisions for each municipality remain in the hands of individual mayors, who may or may not comply with metropolitan plans. Given the financial, technical, and political weight of the municipality of Curitiba within the metropolis, however, the metropolitan planning and managing processes are led and often times co-opted by the Mayor of Curitiba and planners of IPPUC.

The aforementioned considerations working against metropolitan coordination today result in metropolitan-level planning policies in Curitiba and other LAC cities working behind reality—they are not structuring the growth of the city as they once did, but merely trying to remedy some of their resulting functional deficiencies. This is one of the major contradictions of metropolitan development in Curitiba. The situation is entirely opposed to that of the planning process of the municipality of Curitiba. Upon completion of the *Plano Diretor* in 1965, there was the attempt to envision a desirable city of the future and to provide guidelines for achieving that development. Transportation, for instance, was a major structural element of that vision. Today, however, there are still under-served neighborhoods in the metropolitan area; even to the extent of altogether lacking transit services. While it had been convenient for the central city that the poor occupied the fringes of the metropolis to a certain degree, in time the benefits attained from such social class spatial distribution have evolved into burdens, forcing the government to provide transportation and other urban services to those fringe settlements. The resulting effects of transit and housing's unequal distribution in the metropolis have also occurred in other urban services and amenities. The parks are solely located in formal areas of the central city, right in the limits of the municipality of Curitiba—providing the city some green buffering from the metropolitan area. The major cultural centers are all in the municipality of Curitiba, as well. Unfortunately, the periphery of the metropolis has not been provided with these types of spaces and amenities.

The fact that the government and planning officials have chosen, up till recently, to dismiss (or even on occasions to hide) the problems of the metropolis, and in particular the unattended needs of the lower income sectors of the population, has had the counter-effect of making it even more difficult to deal with and provide solutions to those problems today. Some current social problems, including the lack of affordable housing; deficient education and health services; and dramatic increases in crime, violence, homelessness, and unemployment, have sprouted in a neglected suburban environment and have become critical signs of a rapidly deteriorating urban environment as a whole. Furthermore, following a neoliberal economic model, the government is promoting further privatization of education, health, housing, sanitation, and other (traditionally public) services. Privatization in these areas has progressed incrementally, with the approval of the City Council. In this process, numerous workers are loosing their benefits and protection, as job market diversification becomes the norm. The union movement has not been capable of maintaining the public services functionality, with profound repercussions for the periphery population. Unions are, however, very critical of the privatization processes attempted by the government. As the welfare state model is efficiently dismantled, union representatives protest that it is not being substituted by any other efficient mechanism that can respond to the needs of the most disfranchised populations. Popular movement groups that remain organized, in particular around issues of housing, education, and health, are also opposed to these trends. These groups however, have thus far been either dispersed, not large, mature, resilient, and/or vociferous enough to effectively contend and contest these processes.

The differential level of foreign investments, which the post-communist countries have received since the beginning of the transition period, has helped widen the gap between the lowest and the highest economic performers. Thus, the per capita gross domestic product generated in the region in 2007 shows a range starting from less than US$ 3,000* (in Tajikistan, the Kyrgyz Republic, and Moldova) to over US$ 25,000. The experience of the transition period has demonstrated that countries which moved ahead in the global competition for attracting investments were the ones where governmental institutions became directly involved in development planning and coordination. Thus, in countries with proactive state, regional, and local governments, such as those in Central Europe and the Baltics, public policies and programs acted as catalysts of reform, allowing the national economies to gain and maintain momentum throughout the period of transition.

* GDP values are measured in US$ at purchasing power parities (PPP) per capita.

Sources: Oliveira, 1998; Moura and Kornin, 2001; Irazábal, 2005

Local planning structures

Most LAC countries have undergone recent decentralization and devolution programs since the 1980s.[271] This has led to a rise in local government-level planning. Yet, localities also have different institutional frameworks for plan formulation and implementation. Larger and wealthier localities have existing sophisticated planning structures, and in the case of capital cities (such as in Brasilia, Mexico

---

[271] Nickson, 1995; Carrión, 1991; Bret, 1994.

City, Caracas, etc.) there are generally no well-defined boundaries between local and national planning institutions.

One of the most efficient local planning institutional structures in LAC is that of Curitiba. To guide the discussions over the *Plano Diretor*, a commission was created in 1965 (Assessoria de Pesquisa e Planejamento Urbano de Curitiba, APPUC). As the work evolved, the planning team felt the need for transforming the advisory commission into an independent public institution. The Institute of Urban Research and Planning of Curitiba (*Instituto de Pesquisa e Planejamento Urbano de Curitiba*, IPPUC) was created 5 months later (on December 1, 1965) as a political means for injecting flexibility and dynamism to the process. This municipal entity was able to surpass the bureaucracy of city departments, with the goal of "changing the city's appearance preparing it for the future" with functional technocratic planning under the guidance of the military regime.[272] The structure of IPPUC was conceived such that its Administrative Council included representatives of all levels of government departments, thus establishing functional links with the other agencies. During the creation of the Institute, all of its members shared the same political inclination, had previously participated in the redrafting of the *Plano*, and were appointed by Jaime Lerner—an architect, urban planner, and savvy politician who had led city planning through its most important stages. IPPUC was then further vested with authority over all of the other government agencies. Since 1966, having survived political changes and being transformed in the process, IPPUC continues to be the major planning agency in Curitiba. Aiding in this, the succession of mayors and governors that followed have also been committed to the realization of the plan through a propitiatory institutional environment nurturing and protecting the political will necessary to carry out the *Plano*.[273]

There are also other municipalities in LAC that have performed extraordinarily well in terms of planning. In June of 2004, the Municipality of Rosario, Brazil, through the Secretariat of Planning, initiated an agreement process with the purpose of developing a New Urban Plan that, with citizen consensus, could consolidate the City Project.[274] Components of Rosarios's New Urban Plan include: the territorial organization of the metropolitan region; proposals for transformation; the management of the territorial organization; city completion and extension policies; land use planning, urbanization programs, urban agreements, and a public land bank; and promotion of housing and provision of services.[275] The content of the plan reveal the strong spatial focus of planning in Rosario. In the area of housing, the plan addresses housing and its relation to structural projects, irregular settlement policies, housing policies and services coordination, financing funds, the territorialization of housing policies and services, participation of the private sector and infrastructure service provision priorities. In the area of recovery of public spaces and facilities, the plan considers public spaces as a supporting element of neighborhoods and important to urbanization as a whole; as well as in public space system categories, rules of public space design, and the private intervention, management, and operation modalities of public spaces. The preservation of the environment and the constructed patrimony deals with defining criteria for assessing the value of heritage; applied strategies in patrimony preservation; mechanisms and instruments to protect urban spaces and elements, urban environment preservation; consideration of waterways or river basins, including the multiple types of contamination and residue treatment; and the control of existing productive facilities. The reconstruction of mobility deals with the urban network of mobility, transit and urban transport, and urban transportation nodes. Finally, the new dimension of centrality deals with the Central City, the New Centralities, and centrality management in the Urban Plan.

The planning office of the municipality of Porto Alegre, Brazil is the Secretary of Municipal Planning[276] under which there is the Municipal System of Management of Planning (SMGP), which is

---

[272] Del Rio, 1992.

[273] Irazábal, 2005.

[274] Municipality of Rosario.

[275] Municipality of Rosario.

[276] Municipality of Porto Alegre.

in charge of the Master Plan of Urban Development and Environment of Porto Alegre (*Plano Diretor de Desenvolvimento Urbano e Ambiental de Porto Alegre*, PDDUA) and the plan's realization and application in the city. The Managing Plan of Urban Development is the basic defining instrument in the City's development model and is composed of seven strategies, including: urban structure; urban mobility; use of private land; environmental qualification; economic promotion; and production of the city. The basic principles of the proposed spatial model are: decentralization of activities through multicentered policies, sociocultural provision of services; mixed-use occupation of property with goals in displacement reduction of people and vehicles and the qualification of the urban system; controlled densification, with regard to costs of production optimization and rationalization in the city; recognition of the informal city through policies involving the social interest; and environmental qualification and structuring through patrimony valuation and primary production stimulation.

Urban centers in the Caribbean also face a wide variety of infrastructural and planning challenges. One of the key strategies that has been adopted by national governments to address these challenges is the formation of urban development corporations, which can operate at local, regional, or national lelvels. These are governmental agencies with powers to facilitate urban regeneration in specific areas in Jamaica, Antigua and Barbuda, and Trinidad and Tobago. The Urban Development Corporation (UDC) was formed in Jamaica in 1968, the St John's Development Company (SJDC) in Antigua and Barbuda was created in 1986, and the Urban Development Corporation of Trinidad and Tobago (UDeCOTT) was established in 1994. These bodies have far-reaching planning and development powers within specific areas. For example, the SJDC is able 'to acquire, manage, or dispose of lands and to lay out, construct, and maintain roads, buildings, public parks, piers, car parks, and other public amenities' within specified designated areas, whilst Jamaica's UDC is empowered 'to carry out and/or secure the laying out and development of "designated areas". These three urban development corporations can be seen to act as developers in the public interest, as agents of modernization, and as responses to neoliberalization. However, whilst they have succeeded in effecting large-scale transformations to the urban landscape, this has often been achieved through a top-down development process with exemption from planning regulations and little accountability to the residents of the cities.[277]

Despite the proactive planning experience of some municipalities in LAC, there is much variety regarding local government, planning performance, and satisfaction with democracy in LAC countries[278] including problems in the classification and governance structure of low-income neighborhoods in LAC metropolises. These are unevenly accounted for in formal plans and by formal planning institutions.[279] As a result, they often do not get integrated into governance and planning institutions and plans, furthering their physical deprivation and socio-political alienation.

4.2. The impact of Governance on plan formulation and implementation

Variation is also found between the institutional framework for plan formulation and implementation (for more on the topics in this section, see chapter 9). It is common that the agencies in charge of plan formulation are different and disconnected from those in charge of plan implementation. This negatively affects many plans, which do not reach implementation. A key issue is the trend of decentralization in LAC and its effect on planning. Decentralization has empowered municipalities, and often times mandated them, to do planning. It has not necessarily followed up with adequate devolution of resources and technical capacity building that allows municipalities to respond to the new responsibilities. Hence, the primary focus of many municipalities in the region on economic development planning in order to keep afloat, and if possible, generate economic and financial conditions to support a more comprehensive planning approach.

---

[277] Dodman, 2008.

[278] Weitz-Shapiro, 2008.

[279] Burgess, 1985.

Governance challenges for plan formulation include unclear or unstable institutional structures for decision making, deficient technical expertise for data gathering and analysis, deficient mechanisms for citizen participation, lack of political will or political appreciation for the benefits of planning, short-term perspective of elected politicians, disruptions between the terms in office of elected representatives (electoral cycles and politics), clientelism, patronage, corruption, and prevalence of the technocrat and/or incremental decision-making models.280 All experiences of plan formulation in LAC are challenged by one or more of these factors at varying degrees.

Governance challenges for plan implementation include lack of funding, deficient fiscal management, corruption, bureaucratic inefficiencies (red tape, unclear procedures, uneven application of procedures, lack of predictability, deficient technical expertise), and political difficulties (deficient intergovernmental coordination, intergovernmental competition, political support, political instability and distrust, etc.). All experiences of plan implementation in LAC are challenged by one or more of these factors at varying degrees.

Plan formulation and implementation are heavily politicized in LAC. Party-based politicization often trumps technical expertise and community input in plan making and implementation. Ideological bias, electoral politics and term limits, clientelism, patronage, populism, and paternalism are common in many cities and countries of the region. Plan formulation and implementation also get affected by lack of coordination among different institutions and levels of government, and even purposeful sabotaging among them if they are political rivals. Weak systems for political accountability and legal impunity perpetuate these problems. To affront those challenges, public sector reform programs recently implemented in LAC have put emphasis on efficiency, effectiveness and economy, including government financial management systems reform and public sector performance reforms.281 Despite the persistent governance challenges, there are plenty of examples of countries and cities, such as the ones presented above, that are making progress in improving governance and making plan formulation and implementation more effective at all levels of government.

4.3. The impact of neoliberal regimes on planning

The neoliberal notion that an unregulated market is the best way to increase economic growth, which will ultimately benefit everyone, has not produced the results envisioned in LAC. Cutting public expenditures for social services like education and health care effectively reduces the safety-net for the poor and is even common in maintenance of roads, bridges, and water supplies merely for the sake of reducing government's role. Paradoxically, government subsidies and tax benefits for business have been maintained. Deregulation advances the reduction of any government regulation that could diminish profits, including protecting the environment and workers' job safety. In parallel, the privatization agenda proposes selling state-owned enterprises, goods and services to private investors. This trend includes banks, key industries, railroads, toll highways, electricity, schools, hospitals and even fresh water. Usually done in the name of greater efficiency, privatization has mainly further concentrated wealth in a few hands and made the public pay even more for its needs. Lastly, the replacement the concept of "the public good" or "community" with "individual responsibility" has pressured the poorest people to find solutions to their lack of health care, education and social security by themselves, and has labeled them, if they fail, as "lazy."

Around the world, neo-liberalism has been imposed by powerful financial institutions like the International Monetary Fund (IMF), the World Bank, and the Inter-American Development Bank. Neoliberal regimes have greatly impacted planning in LAC through the dismantling of the welfare state and the rolling-out of privatization and reduction of government. The first clear example of neo-liberalism at work came in Chile (influenced by University of Chicago's economist Milton Friedman), after the coup against the popularly elected Allende regime in 1973. Neoliberal reforms in LAC countries have eliminated many of the traditional channels of participation and representation

---

[280] Ranis, 1996.

[281] McCormack Asselin, 1998.

available to lower-class groups, restricting the voice of many marginal groups in spite of democratic reforms. In Mexico, for example, neoliberal reforms have reduced political participation of the poor, resulting in the impoverishment of democracy. Other countries have also followed suit; however, some of the worst effects have been found in Mexico where wages declined while the cost of living rose significantly after NAFTA's implementation. Over 20,000 small and medium businesses have failed and more than 1,000 state-owned enterprises have been privatized in Mexico.

Chile's new democratic government, a broad coalition of centrist and moderate leftist parties called the Concertación, pledged to maintain the military regime's free market policies while promising to deliver greater equity and social justice. But the government circumvented these laws in instances where they clashed with transnational corporations' interests. Thus, despite laws to protect LAC's indigenous people's lands and culture, the effects of globalization and the application of neoliberal policies have been devastating on the indigenous communities in LAC. Some of these groups do contest the neoliberal trends: The Mapuche, an often overlooked indigenous group that constitutes between 4 and 10 percent of the Chile's population, have directly challenged both private interests and the traditional concepts of state and nation, raising broad claims to collective economic and political rights.

Reactions to the negative impacts of neoliberalism on social well-being and equity have sparked a recent wave of anti-neoliberal regimes in LAC. They in turn have had an ongoing impact on planning reforms in Venezuela, Chile, Argentina, Brazil, Nicaragua, Bolivia, Ecuador, and Paraguay (commented elsewhere in this report).

4.4. Institutional arrangements between different levels of government and the role of decentralization

Since the level of urbanization in the continent is large and continues to expand, and middle and large cities are growing into metropolises and megalopolises respectively, the need for cross-sectoral and intergovernmental coordination and cooperation in the region is critical; however, there is weak cross-sectoral and intergovernmental coordination and cooperation for planning in LAC. Again, conditions vary from city to city and country to country, depending on the size and wealth of governments, their level of technical expertise, their level of politization, and their type of leadership and political will.

Cross-sectoral and intergovernmental coordination and cooperation should be an explicit mandate in the objectives of each government sector and level in charge of plan formulation and/or implementation. There should be a system of monitoring, evaluation, and accountability in place, and a system of incentives and disincentives for individuals and institutional performers (see more on this in chapter 9). Yet, there are multiple disincentives for local governments to participate in cross-sectoral, intergovernmental, and regional planning, including: requiring more effort, time, and resources; diminishing the self-determination and power of local governments; and potentially becoming less rewarding in terms of electoral politics.

Some strategies that can assist in redressing the disincentives for cross-sectoral, intergovernmental, and regional planning in LAC include: educating civil society to the benefits and responsibilities of cross-sectoral, intergovernmental, and regional planning such that it can request it from elected and appointed representatives and public servants; educating elected and appointed representatives and public servants to the benefits, responsibilities, and know-how of cross-sectoral, intergovernmental, and regional planning such that they can invest their efforts, resources, and political capital in it; adjusting mission and regulatory statutes of planning agencies (and/or create the new agencies as necessary) such that they are mandated and rewarded for engaging in cross-sectoral, intergovernmental, and regional planning; and adjusting electoral systems and terms such that they can accommodate the requirements of cross-sectoral, intergovernmental, and regional planning.

There is also a need to explicitly review attempts in various parts of the world to achieve integrated, cross-sectoral government and improved intergovernmental relations with a focus on planning, while also assessing the extent to which these have been successful and can be adopted in different cities of LAC. This should include approaches to the different ways of linking spatial plans

and land use management (regulatory planning) and different ways of linking spatial planning with other policy arenas (health, education, etc.). Lessons can be drawn from both 'weak' and 'strong' versions and from diverse methods for producing integrated municipal plans.

4.5. Approaches through which planning can be integrated into government work

There has been a long-standing prevalence of comprehensive spatial plans and land use management (master planning) in LAC; however, there has been a recent and growing trend toward other approaches: strategic planning, "planning under pressure", endogenous planning (planning cooperatives, "núcleos endógenos" or self-sufficient towns), redistributive planning (agrarian and land reforms and proposals in Cuba, Venezuela, Brazil, Bolivia, Ecuador), participatory planning (communal councils in Venezuela, Ecuador; participatory budgeting in Brazil, etc.) and social planning (health clinics and subsidized food markets in squatter settlements in Venezuela; *Favela-Barrio* or slum-to-neighborhood programs in Rio de Janeiro).[282]

Strategic planning and "planning under pressure" is strongly advocated by President Hugo Chavez in Venezuela, but has also been popular in other LAC countries where political stability is not guarantee and time and resources are scarce.[283] Strategic Planning is a powerful tool for diagnosis, analysis, reflection and collective decision-making around present tasks, and to develop guidelines such that institutions adapt with maximum efficiency and quality to the changes and demands which the circumstances impose. Strategic planning contributes the viability necessary to reach the objectives in a manner such that the plan is always in constant evolution. It presents a valid scheme to propose situational changes. A high-level strategic framework should exist that allows for the establishment of a dynamic process of evaluation.[284]

There are also a few LAC experimenting with socialist planning. The Cuban model will reach a half-century of activity in 2009, but the experiences in Venezuela,[285] Bolivia, Ecuador, Chile, Argentina, Paraguay, and Nicaragua are more recent and moderate. These latter countries are softening the neoliberal regimes which prevailed in the latter part of the twentieth century through the integration of social welfare programs. Even Cuba, to a certain extent, is trying to strike a balance between socialist and capitalist enterprises as strategies of economic survival in today's world.

Emphasis on physical or spatial planning has been an important factor in LAC planning. Even today, there are LAC cities whose recent planning activity has concentrated heavily on urban design interventions, examples include Curitiba,[286] Rio de Janeiro,[287] and Bogota.[288] Physical planning has been used to upgrade or beautify formal parts of the cities, but in some cases it has been a central aspect in upgrading informal settlements as well. Some of these spatial plans have been criticized for their cursory attention to social considerations, while the best of them have indeed considered a more balanced approach between social and spatial planning.

In general, LAC and cities have been eclectic in their adoption and syncretism of different planning models, including most particularly the rational or technocratic planning model, advocacy or equity planning, democratic planning, and participatory or collaborative planning. An explicit integration of the strategies discussed in Donald Schön's The *reflective practitioner* (1983) and in John Forester's The *deliberative practitioner* (1999) can help planners be better attuned to the possibilities of learning-by-doing and the relevance of mastering both technical and social skills.

---

[282] Friend and Hickling (2002 [1987])

[283] Friend and Hickling (2002 [1987])

[284] For more information on this topic see http://alumno.elsabio.com/tmp/7393.htm

[285] Irazábal, 2007, 2008.

[286] Irazábal, 2008; Sánchez 1996, 1997; del Rio, 1992.

[287] del Rio, 1997, 2002; del Rio and Iwata, 2004; del rio and Gallo, 2000; Broudehoux, 2001.

[288] Berney, 2008.

4.6. How should plan formulation and plan implementation processes relate to each other in government?

There should be built-in institutional structures and procedural mechanisms within plan formulating and implementing agencies that streamline the linkages between the two activities (plan formulation and implementation), facilitating interagency coordination and management. Recommended measures include a system of regular interagency meetings, mandated coordinating activities, making funding contingent upon coordination, and the institution of a meta-participation and meta-collaboration monitoring through the figure of a planner interagency broker.

Economic and financial solvency, homogeneous societies, and non-pluralistic political climates have contributed to advance planning implementation in some LAC instances. Plan implementation was centralized under some dictatorial and technocratic regimes in LAC, and hence made easier. Examples include the case of Curitiba's Plano Diretor under a national dictatorship and an appointed technocratic local government; Caracas's transportation and housing infrastructure creation under Pérez Jiménez's dictatorship; Brazil's 'Brazilian miracle' and the creation of Brasilia; and the case of Chile's so-called 'economic miracle' under Pinochet. These examples constitute a challenge in public perception for the current democratic regimes, which are challenged to deliver noticeable results under more difficult and pluralistic economic and political climates.

In all cases, the prevailing political structure in countries can affect the implementation of plans. This is particularly the case for countries in transition (from militaristic to democratic regimes, such as in Argentina, Chile, Paraguay, Nicaragua, and Haiti; and from neoliberal to moderated capitalist or socialist regimes, such as Venezuela, Bolivia, and Cuba) where the fragmented, unstable, and changing political structure plays a key role in how plans are implemented. These challenges are particularly evident in the case of countries transitioning to left-leaning regimes—Venezuela, Brazil, Ecuador, Bolivia, Nicaragua, Paraguay, Chile, Argentina—but maintaining old oligarchies and bureaucracies with different levels of resistance to change. Challenges are also observable in the case of countries recently coming out of divisive civic wars or dictatorial regimes, such as El Salvador, Guatemala, Nicaragua, Chile and Argentina. Distrust among people that belonged to opposing fractions in the past hinders planning initiatives in the present and nurtures conflicting, and altogether opposite, societal projects for the future.

Apart from the constraints that may be derived from the institutional framework underlying the planning process, other types of constraints may hinder the effective implementation of plans. These include: shortage of skilled personnel, dearth of finance and the necessary support on the part of planning authorities to carry out basic functions, and lack of political will to implement plans. These factors are particularly present in small and medium-sized cities in the region, which paradoxically are facing higher rates of growth than larger and more established cities.

4.7. Institutional arrangements and regulatory frameworks can be put in place for effective plan formulation and implementation

Metropolitan planning

Ideally, LAC governments would strive to institutionalize metropolitan planning agencies. These agencies would plan for all localities in a metropolitan area with power over municipalities and systems to check on and exert pressure for implementation at the local level. These metropolitan planning agencies should be backed legally and financially by state and national government agencies. Good models to emulate can be adopted from other world regions. For example, the planning agency Metro in metropolitan Portland, Oregon, and the tax-sharing system in Minneapolis-Saint Paul, are useful examples from the US.

Associations of governments with only planning advisory roles, such as the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) in Los Angeles, USA, or COMEC in Curitiba, Brazil, are inefficient models to attain effective metropolitan governance and planning. However, these

institutions could be reformed and vested with deliberative powers and new ones created where they do not exist and are needed. Growing small to medium-sized cities, where the need for metropolitan planning is not yet evident or urgent, should try to create metropolitan planning agencies taking advantage of their less complicated political climate.

Regional planning

Most countries in LAC are facing regional planning challenges that transcend inner-municipal and departmental political boundaries; examples include shared coastal zones, river basins, Andean regions, or maritime regions. A good model to emulate for addressing multi-territorial and multi-dimensional regional planning is the Tennessee Valley Authority, created in 1933 in the US, which proved to be a successful multi-tasking planning model. Another good model to emulate is the spatial planning of the European Union.

Adequate regional legislation and institutions are also rapid in addressing the growing challenges to sustainability brought about by the recent greenfield and tourist development in specific areas of LAC, particularly in fragile and coastal ecosystems. Even when the legislation and institutions are in place to monitor preservation and development in LAC countries, deficient systems of accountability allows for an uneven application of monitoring and evaluation and sanctions for non-compliance. In addition, unethical behavior, corruption, deficient professional expertise, and lack of sufficient human, technical, and financial resources compound the effectiveness of environmental and regional planning.

Transnational planning

Border regions have their particular transnational planning challenges (see chapter 1 for a discussion of planning for the US-Mexico, Mexico-Guatemala, Dominican Republic-Haiti, and Colombia-Ecuador and Venezuela transnational border regions).

The geography of coastal, maritime, and mountainous regions in LAC also transcends national borders and calls for transnational planning. In particular, the Pacific, Atlantic, and Caribbean coasts and the Andean region cross national borders and present similar and mutually-constituting ecological, socio-political, and spatial conditions that demand a more systemic planning approach.

There has been a recent creation of a few socio-economic institutional arrangements for transnational planning in LAC, among them Mercosur, Bolivarian Alternative for the Americas (ALBA, *Alternativa Bolivariana para los Pueblos de Nuestra América*), and Bank of the South (*Banco del Sur*). They have mostly focused on trade and financial opportunities, but could lead to a broadening of LAC planning considerations.

International Assessment of the Capacity for Planning

In order to be more effective at envisioning and creating institutional arrangements for effective plan formulation and implementation in LAC, it would be critical to act on the basis of an international assessment of the capacity for planning. The Royal Town Planning Institute (RTPI, an international organization based in the UK) and the Commonwealth Association of Planners for the Global Planners' Network (GPN) with the support of the Lincoln Institute[289] (based in the US.) have developed an initiative to help planning organizations and planners around the world to assess their capacity to respond to the challenges or urbanization, identify where they think the most strategic gaps in capacity are, and establish support networks that can help fill those gaps.

The tool could help to learn how different countries plan and manage human settlements, and find out their priorities in planning these settlements. It could also help the GPN and other planning associations develop their network of planning contacts. It is a web-based self-diagnostic tool that can

---

[289] For more information, see www.lincolninst.edu

be reached in several ways.[290] The target respondents for the project are organizations or individuals involved in planning human settlements. The diagnostic tool is available in English, French, Spanish, and Chinese and modules have been developed for 5 different sectors: organizations representing planners, central government ministries and local government, NGOs and community groups, planner training organizations and academics, and the private sector.

A complementary effort is being lead by the United Nations in connection with the Global Report 2009, through the implementation of a survey on planning education in the world. A parallel global discussion is assessing the pros and cons of international accreditation of planning programs (see chapter 10). Lessons from these studies can benefit planning assessment, and therefore the creation of strategies for the improvement of planning capacity in LAC.

4.8. What role can other actors—civil society and private sector—play in the effective formulation and implementation of plans?

The role of the private sector

The role of the private sector has been particularly important in capitalist societies, where much of urban life is determined by private decision-making, including individuals and external corporations who make decisions that affect public planning. The role of the private sector is very powerful in the capitalist systems of LAC, and also in those that are striving to create a more regulated capitalism or socialist model.[291]

Usually, the economic and political elites overlap in LAC, or the economic elite exerts an inappropriate influence upon the political elite in LAC. Even in non-participatory plan-making, the economic elite is consulted and benefited by the plans, e.g., with Curitiba's *Plano Diretor* of 1965. Often, local economic and political elites have their interests entangled with international elites and serve as their local agents. A few exceptionally rich Latin Americans, such as Carlos Slim from Mexico, exert significant influence in planning, real estate development, and other areas of development in their countries, e.g., Carlos Slim's impact on information and communication technologies in Mexico.

Some foreign individuals and corporations have also had an impact in LAC planning. Among the most influential of such interventions are the ones of US. billionaires such as Donald Trump inverting in luxurious developments in Mexico and Central America; or other world millionaires buying islands in the Caribbean (e.g., Turks and Caicos Islands) and promoting luxurious resort development and gated vacation home subdivisions. Oil corporations are also exploiting vast sea and land territories in several LAC countries. Meanwhile, other transnational corporations are buying strategic companies in LAC countries, e.g., PEMEX and telecommunications in Mexico, Spain's Barceló in tourist investments in Mexico and Costa Rica, and others. On a different scale, the exodus of refugees, economic migrants, or retirees from some countries to other countries within LAC also affects land and housing markets in local communities, with the potential negative effects of displacements and the socio-spatial polarization of local societies.

In order to make progress toward equitable and sustainable development in LAC, it is imperative that the state maintains a central role in mediating the private sector. The state's mediating role should concentrate in three main areas to support and promote sustainable and equitable developmental practices: education for fostering a socially- and environmentally-mindful business environment; institutional and regulatory support (creation and implementation of a system of incentives,

---

[290] http://www.surveymonkey.com/s.aspx?sm=BVoAHze7i6IVKGrpW/zgdA==, visit the International page of the RTPI website www.rtpi.org.uk/rtpi_international where there is a link, or use the short address http://tinyurl.com/2u2ovm.

[291] Nickson and Lambert, 2002; Portes and Roberts, 2005.

disincentives, controls, taxation, accountability, and regulatory predictability); and infrastructural support (allocating capital investments and financing and securing infrastructure provision).

The role of civil society

Civil society is weak in Latin America, yet social movements have been able to stop or slow neo-liberal projects in several countries.[292] Examples include the protests against the privatization of gas in Bolivia and of PeMex, Mexico's Oil Company in Mexico. However, these movements are mostly reactive and they often disintegrate after they get tokenistic results or a sense of urgent crisis dissipates.

Nonetheless, civil society is expanding social learning and organizing not merely on a local level, but also transnationally in LAC. Examples include the World Social Forum in Porto Alegre, Caracas, and other parts of the world as a reaction to the World Trade Organization and other international efforts perceived as advancing an unsustainable and inequitable development agenda disfavouring the developing world. Environmental groups in LAC are among the most active in the defence of fragile ecosystems (e.g., coastal areas) and communal agricultural land (e.g, *ejidos* in Mexico), and in the promotion of alternative developmental models, such as ecotourism (in Costa Rica, Peru, etc.). Social justice is also an important agenda for LAC social movements. The landless movement (Movimento *Sem Terra*) and roofless movement (*Sem Teto*) in Brazil, and political parties such as the Worker's Party (*Partido Dos Trabalhadores)* in Brazil or Fifth Republic Movement (*Movimiento V República)* in Venezuela are strong advocates of planning for social equity.

The state should play a strong role in protecting and strengthening civil society. The state's supporting role should concentrate in three main areas: the provision of civic and technical education; support for the independent organization, institutionalization, and capacity-building of community groups; and the provision of funding and technical assistance.

---

[292] Irazábal, 2008.

5. Planning, Participation and Politics

The focus of this chapter is on participation and politics as it relates to planning. One of the most important shifts in planning in the last century has been from a view of planning as an expert-driven technocratic activity to one which is inclusive of relevant stakeholders and communities. This fits with the shift from government to governance and the rather different role for local/municipal government. However, there are many debates and tensions in the notions of both governance and participatory planning. Specifically, there are tensions between the idea of community-driven planning and broader issues of social justice and environment, which may not fit with immediate community interests. There are also debates about how collaborative planning can take place in contexts of deep societal differences and power imbalances.

Latin American and Caribbean cities have suffered from lack of planning, and as the populations continue to grow in cities, participatory urban planning can become vitally important. The one characteristic that cities in LAC share is that they each contain concentrations of populations who lack basic services.[293] Participatory planning has become more popular in LAC, however, accountability and infrastructure mechanisms have not been developed to ensure that participation is included in decision making processes for medium and long-term planning.

5.1. Participatory planning: Strengths and Risks

Participatory planning has important strengths, but also critical risks.

Strengths: Participatory planning can empower and educate individuals; can build human and social capital; can make them responsible co-agents of their communities' wellbeing; can make planning processes more transparent, accountable, democratic, and often times better tailored to the needs of the community; can build legitimacy for the planning process and its outcomes; and can facilitate implementation and sustainability of the plans.

Risks: democratic processes and outcomes in participatory planning may maintain the status quo, preventing transformation; may even widen socio-spatial inequalities; participation may not be inclusive, excluding the more disenfranchised members of the community; power differentials of stakeholders may not be dealt with but left intact or expanded. Participatory planning usually consumes more time and resources that non-participatory processes.

Different Forms or Approaches in Different Contexts

Different forms of and approaches to participatory planning appear in various LAC contexts.

Enabling and Inclusive Approaches

Enabling approaches were promoted in the LAC region and other areas of the developing world by the World Bank and other international institutions from the 1970 to1990s. The new paradigm of international development, promoted as "Sustainable Human Development," focused on poverty-alleviation, environmental sustainability, and local-level initiatives. A crucial part of these initiatives has been policies intended to enable and empower the poor, especially poor women. Some enabling projects included micro-credits (the practice of giving small loans without collateral to the very poor) and self-help housing. Some of these projects have produced some positive outcomes, but the criticism to the approach is substantive.

---

[293] Carrión, 2001.

Enabling approaches have been praised as empowering, as agency is expected from people to help themselves improve their individual and communal living conditions. Once a person is on the process of building a small entrepreneurial activity or a self-help housing project, for instance, it is believed that she is on her path to self-sufficiency. However, some critics claim that the discourse of "enabling" and "empowering" the poor has been used by international aid and financial agencies as well as governments to justify the process of "hollowing out" of the welfare state and rolling out of the neoliberal economic project. At the end, if structural conditions prevent the poor to acquire self-sufficiency with the minimum support received from the state or these aiding institutions through the enabling approach, they are to blame for their misery. Enabling strategies have also been criticized for advancing the "feminization of poverty" and the exploitation of women, often times expected to work double or triple shifts to make ends meet and to support the life of families and communities.[294] For Roy, enabling strategies, and particularly microcredit, represents a battle of ideas with sharp disagreements over how poverty is conceptualized, measured, and alleviated.[295]

According to the UN's economic commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC), the tendency towards an increase in female-headed households was very marked during the 1980s in urban areas in Latin America, and "between 1980 and 1992, of total urban households the percentage headed by women increased in 10 out of 12 countries."[296] In 1992, the proportion of all urban households headed by women ranged from 17 percent in Mexico to 28 percent in Honduras. Figures suggest that the feminization of poverty is present in some countries in Latin America, but by no means all.[297] Tied to the plight of women is that of their children, with woken poverty leading to children and youth poverty. The existing evidence strongly suggests the need for gender- and age-sensitive strategies for poverty alleviation and human development, including the ordering of the territory so that currently disenfranchised groups have access to adequate housing, transportation, job training and other services.

Deliberative Democracy

Deliberative democracy rests on the core notion of citizens and their representatives deliberating about public problems and solutions under conditions that are conducive to reasoned reflection and refined public judgment; a mutual willingness to understand the values, perspectives, and interests of others; and the possibility of reframing their interests and perspectives in light of a joint search for common interests and mutually acceptable solutions.[298] It is thus often referred to as an open discovery process, rather than a ratification of fixed positions, and as potentially transforming interests, rather than simply taking them as given. Deliberative democracy does not assume that citizens have a fixed ordering of preferences when they enter the public sphere. Rather, it assumes that the public sphere can generate opportunities for forming, refining and revising preferences through discourse that takes multiple perspectives into account and orients itself towards mutual understanding and common action. Deliberative democracy means expanding the opportunities of citizens themselves to deliberate. It can exist in many forms and combinations, we can see forms used not only for shaping an independent citizen dialogue, but for complementing deliberations by a city council, state legislature, or administrative agency.

Throughout Latin America, municipal governments have been experimenting with participatory approaches to democratic governance that have significant deliberative components. Deliberative democracy is a more direct type of democracy that usually complements, but also transcends representative democracy. Citizens are allowed to deliberate on matters of planning and self-

---

[294] Srinivas, and Lund, 2000/2005; Roy and AlSayyad, 2004; Roy, forthcoming.

[295] Roy, forthcoming.

[296] Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, 1995.

[297] UNIFEM, 2002: Moghadam, 2005, Chant, 1997, Medeiros and Costa, 2007.

[298] Sirianni and Friedland, nd.

governance.[299] Some countries, such as Venezuela and Ecuador, are experimenting with what they call direct, protagonistic, and socialist democracy. The main instrument is the communal councils.[300] Once thought of as an exercise reserved for small groups with shared interests or small towns with a degree of social cohesion, deliberative democracy is being applied albeit unevenly to formal government structures in towns and cities of different sizes throughout the region in new and innovative ways. Many of the best-known cases have emerged in cities governed by political parties of the left that have included some form of participatory democracy in their electoral platform. However, a review of experiences in three countries[301]—Mexico, Guatemala, and Brazil—suggests that governments run by political parties of widely different ideological stripes are experimenting with participatory approaches to local governance that have deliberative components.

The reasons for implementing participatory and deliberative forms of governance often have to do with the need to shore up the legitimacy of governments before an increasingly mobilized and skeptical citizenry. These approaches share several characteristics in common. First, they engage citizens in ongoing participation in the political process between elections. Second, they involve citizens directly or through neighborhood councils in some sort of collective dialogue and decision-making on policy and resource allocation in coordination with elected bodies. Finally, they alter traditional top-down relationships and communication channels between the government and society. They thus enhance the range of issues that are debated within the public sphere and the relationship of the public sphere to the policymaking process. These processes are most successful when they are implemented in the context of a vibrant representative democracy and not seen as an alternative to it.[302]

Cuqu'o, Jalisco, Mexico. In Mexico, several municipalities, both rural and urban, have experimented with new participatory decision-making structures that have important deliberative components. Among these, the largely rural municipality of Cuqu'o, Jalisco is notable because of the creation of the Democratic Municipal Council of Cuqu'o (CODEMUC), an institutional innovation that allows citizens to decide and monitor public investments in local development projects. In each of the seventy communities, citizens gather each year in a public assembly to discuss their priorities for municipal investments in their community. These citizen gatherings in turn elect delegates from each zone to a Permanent Municipal Committee, which has responsibility for municipality-wide decision-making on public investments in infrastructure, healthcare, and education. The result is a complex web of interactions among citizens who have primary responsibility in plenaries for voicing their preferences for government actions and for monitoring these through their elected delegates. This has led to a year-long process through which citizens gather periodically, debate their priorities and hold their elected leaders accountable for following up on these. This process emerged after the 1992 election of the first-ever opposition government in Cuqu'o, affiliated with the left-of-center Democratic Revolutionary Party (PRD).[303]

Porto Alegre, Brazil. Perhaps the best known process of participatory governance with deliberative components is the participatory budgeting process (Orçamento Participativo) implemented in Porto Alegre, Brazil. The first municipal administration of the leftist Workers Party (PT) began its participatory budgeting in 1989 (after a frustrated attempt under a previous administration of a different leftist party) as a means of engaging citizens in municipal planning efforts. Today, the participatory budget allows citizens in their neighborhoods to set priorities for municipal investments and to participate in city-wide bodies that set broad policies and hold the government accountable for execution. The percentage of the municipal budget available for investments has risen from 2% to 20% between 1989 and 1994 and a higher proportion of investments

---

[299] Souza, 2007.

[300] Irazábal and Foley (2008b).

[301] Selee, 2003.

[302] Selee, 2003.

[303] Selee, 2003.

have been targeted to poorer areas today than in the past. Participatory budgeting has not been limited to Porto Alegre. Participatory Budgeting has been used in over a hundred municipalities throughout Brazil, including in Recife, San Andre, and the municipalities of the region around São Paulo. These processes are relatively recent, and it is perhaps too early to make conclusions about their success, but they generally include elements similar to those of the Porto Alegre process.[304]

These cases are only examples of the kind of municipal innovations taking place throughout Latin America to generate new, ongoing links between local governments and citizens. Though none were designed specifically as attempts to generate deliberative democracy, all have significant deliberative components. They allow citizens within their communities to discuss common priorities and preferences, negotiate them with municipal authorities, and, in most cases, dialogue about priorities and preferences across communities. Similar participatory processes have been implemented elsewhere, including Quetzaltenango, Guatemala; Montevideo, Uruguay; and Caracas, Venezuela. In addition, new laws in the state of Oaxaca in Mexico (1995, 1998) and in Guatemala (2002) have institutionalized the decision-making authority of deliberative decision-making processes in some indigenous municipalities usually organized around community assemblies. These processes have often functioned as a parallel authority to official governments, and their recognition as decision-making bodies is an important step both in recognizing demands of indigenous organizations for respect of their customary forms of authority and in institutionalizing a deliberative approach to governance.[305]

Three reasons have influenced the turn towards participatory governance with deliberation in Latin American municipalities. The first is the growing importance of municipalities in Latin America. Second, the nature of politics in Latin America changed significantly in the 1980s and 1990s causing political leaders to seek out new ways of bolstering their legitimacy. Serious economic crises in this period undercut clientelistic networks that had linked politicians to voters and generated distrust in the political class as a whole. It also helped generate a series of autonomous grassroots organizations and NGOs skeptical of politicians, brought new demands into the public sphere, and challenged existing political arrangements. Politicians have been desperately looking for ways to reconnect with voters and municipal leaders have increasingly found that participatory forms of governance give them a legitimacy that old clientelist structures no longer succeed in achieving. Finally, deliberative democracy has important intellectual precursors in Latin America which have nurtured many of the most successful and ambitious innovations. Among these precursors are the collective decision-making traditions of many indigenous rural communities. These were often co-opted and manipulated by governing elites and local powerbrokers, but in many rural communities they remain a vivid memory and an aspiration for reformers. Remnants of these traditions remain in community assemblies in some rural areas and recovering these deliberative decision-making processes has been a centerpiece of revitalized indigenous movements in several countries, including Guatemala and Mexico.[306]

The deliberative structures implemented play a significant role in governance in Porto Alegre and Cuqu'o, and in other municipalities throughout LAC. In many cases, the resources allocated by participatory processes are minimal compared to total municipal budgets, though they are usually the resources that are of most interest to the poor: funds for local community projects to pave roads, build schools and clinics, install sewer systems, and prevent flooding. These kinds of infrastructure projects represent a fraction of what municipalities do, but it is precisely that fraction which affects the lives of poor and working class citizens directly. In that sense, these bodies seem to have important discretionary authority over key resources, even when these represent a fraction of total municipal resources.[307]

---

[304] Selee, 2003.

[305] Selee, 2003.

[306] Selee, 2003.

[307] Selee, 2003.

In these participatory innovations there are important opportunities for citizens to come together between elections to discuss preferences and priorities for municipal investment and to monitor whether these investments are made. This brings citizens into interaction with their local governments in more horizontal processes. The evidence from Porto Alegre and Cuqu'o suggests that considerable debate, dialogue and collective analysis take place. In all of these municipalities, moreover, there is also a central coordinating mechanism that brings together the different community councils, commissions, or assemblies, allowing for sharing of ideas and innovations among communities and providing a certain degree of leverage to ensure compliance with community decisions (monitoring). This provides an opportunity to link deliberation on neighborhood priorities with deliberation on municipality-wide priorities and generates fora for discussion among different sectors of society in complex municipal environments. Whether these processes help citizens address notions of the common good remains to be explored.[308]

These processes contribute to empower sectors of society that previously had a limited voice in politics. Studies of Porto Alegre and Cuqu'o and other experiences in the region suggest considerable citizen engagement, tilted slightly toward the poorer sectors of society who have increased the resources they receive from the government over previous periods. However, this may not always be the case. In some instances more organized groups may gain at the expense of less organized groups or groups with ties to political leadership can utilize these participatory processes more effectively. In some cases, local power-holders can co-opt deliberative processes or strongly organized sectors can do so at the expense of the less organized (even when the organized group represents the poor they may marginalize other poor people).[309]

In municipalities with sharply unequal distribution of wealth and power and where there is a history of authoritarian control by political or economic elites, participatory processes can prove susceptible to manipulation by elites. Leaders or political parties with the greatest capacity to mobilize participation may be able to control these processes more effectively than they can control elections, especially if the turnout in deliberative assemblies and community meetings is less than that on election days. Ultimately, the success of deliberative processes depends on their subordination to, and calibration with, institutions of representative democracy. These deliberative processes need to be influential enough that citizens feel it is worth their while to participate and that they can monitor the implementation of the decisions they make, yet ultimately these decisions need to be reviewed and vetted by representative bodies.[310]

Deliberative processes are attractive because they engage citizens directly in decision-making on issues (and resources) that are of special concern to them, they potentially provide schools of democracy where the political community can debate ideas of the common good and they may empower segments of the society who were largely ignored in decision-making previously. But these processes rarely mobilize more than a minority of eligible citizens (much less so than voting) and thus are much more susceptible than voting to the mobilizing capacity of specific groups. It is vital to find a balance between a representative democracy that guarantees political equality and the appropriate channels that allow citizens specific direct influence on issues of greatest local concern to them in their communities. This requires both good institutional design and implementation process.[311]

---

[308] Selee, 2003.

[309] Selee, 2003.

[310] Selee, 2003.

[311] Selee, 2003.

Other Consultative Approaches

Referenda and initiatives

Recall referenda are now available in many countries of the LAC region, whereby under certain conditions, the electorate can recall representatives at all levels of government, including the president of the nation. Referenda and other consultative approaches have sometimes led to impeachments—a process for a legislative body to forcibly remove a government official. Critical examples of these impeachments have been Collor de Mello in Brazil (resigned in 1992 to avoid being impeached), and Carlos Andrés Pérez in Venezuela (impeached in 1993). More recently, Venezuelan President Hugo Chávez was reconfirmed in 2004 as president after a referendum organized by his government's opposition lost. Alternatively, Chavez's proposal for a constitutional reform was rejected in a referendum in 2007.

In 2008, authorities of the department of Santa Cruz in Bolivia claimed that they won a referendum for an *estatuto autonómico* (a sort of autonomous constitution) that would give the region independence from Bolivia in all but national defence and foreign relations. The legality of the recall and its actual results (given the rate of voters abstention) are very contested. In any case, these types of secessionist initiatives have continued in Bolivia and can have serious implications for the integrity of LAC nations.

Referenda constitute, then, an important mechanism of accountability and expanded democracy in the region. In countries of polarized politics, such as in Venezuela and Bolivia, however, it can lead to political instability and a constant power struggle that hinders processes of planning and implementation of plans. At the heart of these two countries' political struggles are two opposing models of planning: one that wants to maintain and expand a capitalist emphasis on economic growth and the other that wants to focus on a more socialist approach to redistribution.

In a conservation project in Caye Caulker, Bacalar Chico, Belize, formal citizen participation was limited to provision of information with no role in the decision-making process.[312] This "participation by consultation" approach failed to give a voice to all of the local stakeholders. Planners in Belize used avoidance techniques to limit negative reactions by community members, but failed to accommodate feedback received during consultative participation. As such, informal channels of participation, such as using personal relationships with project planners and the process of political lobbying, were used to influence the process. Thus, the project was largely influenced by people of means in the community. While the project professed to be one driven by grassroots involvement, the reality of a consultative approach often means that there is room for input, but not for participation in the decision making process.

In an environment with multiple stakeholders in Buccoo Reef Marine Park, Tobago, planners were able to actively engage the stakeholders in an open trade-off analysis for conservation and development.[313] Information was shared readily and local knowledge was used in the identification of a solution. While the citizenry was fully engaged in the process, people were not given the power to implement the decisions made. Thus, the citizenry was not able to hold the organizations and the government accountable to the original decision. Brown argues that further institutional mechanisms must be developed to empower stakeholders to implement the solutions they have developed. These types of mechanisms are rare throughout LAC.

Participatory media and information and communication technologies

Some TV and radio programs and Internet websites (including some government websites) undertake public polls to gauge opinions regarding planning matters. They usually offer a set of two or more choices for prioritizing public work choices or the resolution of a conflict. Conflicts range in scale and

---

[312] Few, 2001.

[313] Brown, 2002.

transcendence from who should be allowed to use a pool in a gated community to how to proceed in the resolution of two LAC countries' border disputes. These opportunities allow people to appreciate the complexity and interconnectedness of many planning problems (their intrinsic "wickedness"[314]), to better appreciate the pros and cons of particular positions and their trade-off implications, to problem-solve towards a satisfactory solution and to compare their views to those of fellow community members. On the risky side, the presentation of problems through polls can be biased and can skew public opinion in a manner that favors a predetermined agenda of the elite.

Alternatively, interactive Internet sites, games, programs, and blogs are helping many people find an expanded sense of community and sometimes expanding democratic participation locally, nationally, and internationally. Alphaville (a gated community) residents in São Paulo deal with community matters and create interest groups through an Intranet.[315] The indigenous group The Zapatistas in Mexico built an international coalition of support based on the Internet.[316] On the risky side, many people are retreating from "the space of places" to spend more of their lives in "the space of flows,"[317] which threatens the vitality of public spaces and democracy at large.[318]

Traditional media

Traditional media plays an important role in areas where Internet is not readily available. In the Ajusco foothills of Mexico City, newspapers have been used to inform colonos (residents) of the necessary action to take to receive land titles and services. [319] Photographs of government officials interacting with residents and articles describing the services offered are attempting to send the message that participation is of great importance. However, the government fails to mention the role the social organizations have played to get the government into the community. Regardless, the social organizations have increased participation and services are being rendered in the communities.

E-Government

Electronic Government refers to the use of Internet and other information and communication technology (ICT) as a platform for exchanging information, providing services and transacting with citizens, businesses, and other sectors of government and civic society. E-Government may be applied in order to improve internal efficiency, the delivery of public services, or processes of democratic, deliberative governance. Four kinds of activities take place: providing information over the Internet, two-way communications between agents, conducting transactions and governance (e.g. online polling, voting, and campaigning). The anticipated benefits of e-government include improved efficiency, convenience and better accessibility of public services. LAC capital and other important LAC cities are increasing their provision of e-government, including for the communication of urban plans. There is potential for ICT for development (ICT4D), particularly based on cell phones, to have a substantive impact on poverty reduction and development in LAC and other developing areas of the world.

Intranet media

Gated communities, master planned communities, and communities of special interests are developing their own internal media communications. Some of these intranets are helping people expand their

---

[314] Rittel and Webber, 1973.

[315] Irazábal, 2006.

[316] Castells, 1997.

[317] Castells, 1989, Castells, 2004.

[318] Low and Smith, 2005; Holston and Appadurai, 1999; Caldeira, 2000; Irazábal, 2008.

[319] Díaz Barriga, 1996.

social networks and build a variety of interest groups (e.g., toddlers' parents, bowling players, gardeners, book clubs, etc.) that enhance their quality of lives. On occasions, however, these intranets are the media to mobilize against newcomers or for exclusionary and parochial practices that make people retreat from the larger community's civic life. Examples include Alphaville São Paulo and others in Brazil.[320]

5.2. Successful cases of participatory planning and factors that facilitate participatory processes

There are many recent and ongoing processes of participation in LAC, and growing literature on them is analyzing their effectiveness and making proposals for their sustainability and improvement. These participatory planning experiences are taking place at all levels of government, for big and small projects, for extraordinary and ordinary processes and with a variety of stakeholders. For example, community participation in local governance has been organized in Estelí and Matagalpa, Nicaragua, and both Pérez Acuña[321] and Howard[322] have analyzed their structure, strategies, challenges faced and the results achieved, describing the process of strengthening participatory democracy in Nicaragua. Anne-Katrin Linzer[323] discusses the participation of social actors traditionally excluded in the planning of the municipal development in Eastern Bolivia, in the area of the Great Chiquitanía, offering an analysis of the current participation of the original indigenous and peasant communities in the process of planning municipal participation. Participatory strategies vary from case to case. For example, in Tlalpan, a local municipality in Mexico City, a government team and an NGO (CESEM) used a participatory planning methodology called Situational Strategic Planning.[324] Another well-known participatory planning methodology, the Participatory Budget process used in Porto Alegre, Brazil, and several other LAC cities, has to be critically understood in its limits and challenges.[325]

Nance and Ortolano[326] explored four forms of participation—mobilizing, decision making, construction, and maintenance—in condominial sewers in Recife and Natal, Brazil. They argue that community participation explains variations in the performance of urban sanitation projects in Brazilian cities. They suggest that participation form as well as community influence are important factors. In particular, mobilizing and decision making were associated with good performance.

Goldfrank's [327] work attests to attempts at deepening democracy in Latin America. He analyzes urban experiments in citizen participation in Porto Alegre, Brazil, Montevideo, Uruguay, and Caracas, Venezuela in the early 2000s. For him, three important factors affected the design of the participation program in each city: local government capacity, type of party system and strength of community organizations. The participation program in Porto Alegre was the most accessible, wide-ranging, and decisive because its City Hall had the most capacity and because the Workers Party (PT) faced a divided opposition and a strong community movement. Montevideo's municipal administration had close to the same capacity as Porto Alegre's, but the Frente Amplio party encountered fierce opposition from the dominant parties in Uruguay's two-party system and weakly articulated community organizations. In Caracas, the Causa R party confronted even greater opposition from

---

[320] Irazábal, 2006.

[321] Pérez Acuña, 2002.

[322] Howard, 2002.

[323] Linzer, 2002.

[324] Rodriguez, 2002

[325] Baierle, 2002.

[326] Nance and Ortolano, 2007.

[327] Goldfrank, 2002.

Venezuela's dominant parties, weak community organizations and a municipal administration lacking authority and financial resources.

In 2001, the Government of Jamaica committed to engage the citizenry through the "Civic Dialogue for Democratic Governance in Jamaica Project". Due to the extensive failure of top-down approaches to development and planning, the project aimed to (1) promote dialogue across all sectors and levels of society to bring about shifts in perception, and (2) reframe issues through the scenario exercise in order to break the deep-seated, complex patterns of behaviour that sustain the current reality.[328] While this directive is top-down, the initiative represents a drastic philosophy change for the Jamaican government and places emphasis on participation of all socio-economic classes and the use of local knowledge in decision-making processes.

Going a step further than Jamaica, Bolivia's Law of Popular Participation, enacted in 1995, transferred power to the municipalities. One of the key components of the law was the institutionalization of participatory planning, turning citizens who were once beneficiaries of urban planning into actors leading the planning process.[329] While there have been some criticisms of the Bolivian model, it is one of the most advanced in Latin America.

Klesner [330] analyzes evidence of social capital and political participation from Argentina, Chile, Mexico, and Peru to argue that social capital[331] is an important factor in encouraging levels of political participation generally associated with a fuller democratic experience. In LAC, social trust and organizational involvement outside the political sphere do push individuals to be more politically active. Involvement in many kinds of organizations is effective in promoting participation, although labor unions remain the most important mobilizers of political activity. Arts/music/education associations, professional associations, and voluntary work for social service and health-related organizations also promote political activity. LAC has moderate levels of non-political organizational involvement, as compared to other areas of the world, and low levels of interpersonal trust. Klesner hopes that a long period of stable democracy will build social trust and encourage the associational activism that is identified with social capital.

There are many other experiences that represent a pragmatic search for LAC normative models for participatory and community-driven planning processes; for example, the Cuban model, Venezuelan experimentation with communal councils, various indigenous groups' models, and various women-led models.

In the city of Campana, located in the province of Buenos Aires, Argentina, the *Manzaneras* program called 40,000 women to action to deliver needed goods to poor families.[332] The women's involvement included taking an active role in meetings and trainings outside of their community to understand the problems facing the poorest citizens. The *Manzaneras* have become community leaders, gained seats on local Development Boards and mobilized for specific causes within the community. In one case, they were able to pressure the city to build flood prevention dykes. Their work was well received, but the *Manzaneras* associations have lost steam in fighting for social change and community planning projects. The success of their work seems to be focused on achieving an isolated goal, and involvement dissolves after that singular goal has been met. This results in a discontinuity in participation and a discontinuation of locally driven planning.

Throughout the Caribbean, NGOs have changed the nature of development discourse by giving marginalized populations a voice and mandating popular participation as a prerequisite to development. NGOs have played a large role in increasing participation in planning and development

---

[328] "Civic Dialogue for Democratic Governance in Jamaica", www.undp.org/fojam/documents.htm

[329] Goudsmit and Blackburn, 2001.

[330] Klesner, 2007.

[331] See the substantial library of works on social capital and development at the World Bank website: http://www.worldbank.org/socialcapital.

[332] Hainard and Verschuur, 2001.

issues in urban Haiti and in Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic. In Haiti, the Ecumenical Center for Human Rights focuses on working with the marginalized urban populations and promotes involvement with local development projects. COPADEBA, Committee for the Defence of the Rights of Neighbourhoods, promotes *barrio* (neighbourhood) democracy in Santo Domingo.[333] COPADEBA has been able to successfully bring together people from low-income neighbourhoods and combine their involvement with the power to NGOs to hold local municipalities accountable for planning and infrastructure development.

Women-led self-help planning is common throughout the neighbourhoods of LAC. Located in the south of Quito, Ecuador, Solanda is a settlement for low-income families sponsored by the government and several international agencies. This development lacked many basic services, such as water, electricity and transport. The community formed a neighbourhood committee to combat some of the shared challenges. From the committee emerged a women's group, whose objectives were (1) the amelioration of barrio living conditions, especially the provision of services such as water, day care centers, a primary school, and a market, and (2) the improvement of women's status, including the learning of practical skills and discussion of women's rights and other themes related to women's daily life.[334] The Solanda women's group was successful at identifying a site for a primary school and tackling the issue of water supply.

5.3. Lessons from participatory planning efforts in LAC countries

Given the acute socio-spatial inequalities existing in LAC communities and the normative definition of planning discussed in chapter 1, participatory and community-driven planning processes have to be particularly modelled to redress inequalities and power imbalances.

Strengths and risks of participation

It is not a given that successful cases of participatory planning lead to successful implementation of plans. In general, plans that are the result of participatory processes have a level of legitimacy and acceptance on the part of community members that may facilitate their implementation and maintenance in time. However, agencies in charge of plan formulation are often times separate from those in charge of plan implementation. Hence, the transition from formulation to implementation is often challenging and leads to some plans not becoming implemented, independently of the level of participation that went into their formulation. Participatory plans, nonetheless, can have the effect of keeping the community organized, committed to implementation and exerting the necessary pressure on their representatives to do so. Participatory processes for plan formulation, however, may not be sufficient to keep the community organized and mobilized for a long struggle for plan implementation.

Intervening factors

Many factors influence the willingness and ability of people to participate: level of education on the matters discussed, capacity to articulate their view points, capacity to persuade, level of esteem enjoyed from the other participants, trust, sincerity, time availability, language proficiency, availability of childcare or other familial needs, availability and diversity of participatory venues and instruments, sense of effectiveness, etc. These factors had an impact in the participatory experiences mentioned above.

---

[333] Lewis, 1994.

[334] Rodriguez, 1994.

Quantitative and qualitative aspects

In order for participation to be effective for decision-making and hence for the progress of planning processes, there are both qualitative and quantitative aspects that need to be present in participatory planning processes.[335]

Quantitative aspects

Too much participation can entangle decision-making and therefore stall planning processes. Example, some decision making processes in communal councils in Venezuela, where the lack of clear participatory rules or enforcement thereof do not easily lead to decision making. Too little participation can delegitimize the planning process and the decisions taken during it, which then can jeopardize implementation and the sustainability of plans. Example: some projects related to the revision of the *Plano Diretor* in Curitiba, Brazil, which are presented to the community as done deals may disempoer the community creating distrust or apathy in regards to planning processes.

Qualitative aspects

The previous observations make us realize that participatory processes need to be appropriately managed within reasonable constraints of time, rules, and participatory channels; and with the availability of quality of information, substance of the participation, fair representation of all stakeholders, and skills for mediation, negotiation, and consensus building.

Issue- vs. place-based participation

People in LAC continue to derive much motivation to participate in planning processes from their commitment to and sense of place. Place-based issues are also directly linked to people's everyday experiences, help them organize among friends and acquaintances, and help them maintain commitment throughout participatory processes. Place-based mobilizations are more easily linked to the brown agenda—the need to get basic services such as water, sewage, gas, transportation, etc. However, issue-based framing of participatory experiences can help broaden coalitions among different communities and places, and hence may give strength and continuity to the processes. These mobilizations are more commonly formed around issues of the green agenda—demands for less pollution, more parks, or greater participation.

In Mexico, coalitions have been used effectively to gain credibility and require the state to take action. In order to increase services provided to marginalized urban populations in Mexico, the Union of Independent Settlers (UCI) utilized large scale participation to highlight hot button issues such as human rights, growing marginalized population, and voting rights. By doing so, UCI caught the attention of the Party of the Industrialized Revolution (PRI), forcing the party to respond to its act in accordance with those issues, including the provision of urban services.[336]

Local vs. regional, national, or international participation

Place-based participation remains associated with particular localities, whereas issue-based participation can scale up to regional, national, or international levels. For example, coalitions for indigenous and gender rights in LAC are increasingly working transnationally.

---

[335] Irazábal, 2005.

[336] Shefner, 2001.

Material vs. postmaterialistic motivations

In LAC, there are changes in the orientation to politics associated with the movement from a society focused primarily on the attainment of material well-being to a postmaterialist world in which values such as the ability of all to participate in society, the defence of the natural environment, and the pursuit of individual spiritual goals take precedence over material concerns.[337] This is somewhat equivalent to the brown and green agendas. Class divisions can be observed. The poorer the community, the most likely it will focus on material motivations for participation.

Local participation as exclusionary politics

Some times, people participate to maintain their privileges or the status quo. In the process, they may exclude others from gaining those privileges too. In local politics, this process is often used to prevent more (affordable) housing units within middle- or higher-class neighbourhoods. Some times, channels explicitly created to empower the poor, such as community councils in Venezuela, Ecuador, Bolivia, Panama, etc., are used by more powerful groups to institutionalize and legitimize their exclusionary politics and their defense of privilege. In Caracas, the Country Club golf course wanted to be converted in affordable housing complexes by the major, but was strongly opposed by the neighbors.

Participation of the current vs. the future stakeholders

Planning looks towards the future. Oftentimes planning processes take years to unfold and the resulting plans can take even more years to be implemented. The community that participates in a planning process may not be the one that is in place when the plans are realized. Sometimes communities transition to entirely different demographic characteristics, including variations in socio-economic status, race, ethnicity, age, household composition, legal status, educational attainment, job capabilities, religious affiliation, sexual orientation, etc. This poses a great challenge for participation in planning. Planners are called to be sensitive to this matter and strive to represent the community of the future, which otherwise may not have voice in the present, in planning processes.

Conversely, gentrification processes, present in many central areas of cities in LAC, particularly in historic centers such as in Lima, Mexico City, Guatemala City, etc., often times give greater weight to serving the people that are supposed to come to the area once improvements are made, rather than the current residents.

5.4. The Significance of Street Politics as a Participatory Strategy

The significance of street politics as a participatory strategy in LAC, i.e., the enactment of demonstrations in public spaces to make claims and call the attention of decision makers, media, and the public at large, is demonstrated in the following nine examples of Latin American major cities, all nation-state capitals, except for the case of São Paulo.

Chion and Ludeña Urquizo[338] analyze street politics in Lima's Historic Centre, with its central role in both local and national histories throughout the city's life. This space creates a sense of place and social belonging for Lima's population, which contrasts with the increasing homogenization of the city by shopping malls and standardized office buildings. In the re-emerging role of Lima's Historic Center as a place for the reformulations of social identity, multiple urban actors compete for the use of the space. The Centre as a place for the reworking of social identity has a particular connotation in an era of globalization, when many financial and informational transactions are placeless, i.e. occur in the space of flows. Also, many places of consumption are increasingly similar across regions and have

---

[337] Inglehart, 1997.

[338] Chion and Urquizo, 2008.

little local identity. Places of identity, therefore, can define the makeup of a city and the imagination of a nation.

Kaiser[339] shows how the creative, forceful, and disruptive public presence of activists in Buenos Aires played in shaping policies regarding memory, accountability, social justice and democratization in Buenos Aires. The Mothers of the Plaza de Mayo used communication strategies to denounce state terrorism and demand accountability. By transforming motherhood into a public activity, the Mothers pioneered the redefinition of what is public in Argentina, which is at the core of the country's human rights' struggles. By conquering physical and metaphorical territories, they shaped the style and scope for human rights activism. Kaiser then follows with an analysis of the escraches (public demonstrations denouncing individuals implications in acts of torture) organized by HIJOS—the children of disappeared people—and then focuses on recent street demonstrations and the new escraches, demonstrating how these strategies have been co-opted and adapted for a variety of causes. Kaiser conceives the streets of Buenos Aires as arenas of power struggles for the rewriting of memory and history.

Lima and Pallamin[340] discuss transformations of São Paulo's iconic Museum of Art (MASP) and Avenida Paulista. The open spam of MASP is a hiatus in the dense Avenida Paulista—one of the most prized streets in São Paulo. Due to its location, shape, and cultural significance, the space has long been the site for events shaping both everyday life and extraordinary events. In a city of high density and few open spaces, it has provided a privileged venue for staging cultural, political and social events. The authors explore how this void has been continuously reconstituted by both organized and spontaneous forms of public appropriation, and has thus responded to different conceptions of collective urban life. Paradoxically, the effervescence of all these events has not resulted in greater openness in public space. Today, the space in front of the MASP is still used for protests, while the space under it is restricted to private events. Pallamin and Lima point out that this disjuncture opens new meanings and new forms of contestation and appropriation of urban open spaces in the city, a process with no foreseeable closure, since different forms of strategic exclusion continuously face tactic events of resistance.

Saldarriaga Roa[341] focuses on a place that has held many history-making, extraordinary events— The Plaza de Bolívar of Bogotá. The plaza started out as a typical space at the centre of Spanish urban settlements in the Americas. As an open void in a quadrangular grid of streets, it was a place for many events—religious celebrations, political demonstrations, markets, bullfights, and public feasts. This plaza has played a prominent role in Colombia's political life. Saldarriaga analyzes the relationship between the physical design of the plaza and some major political events of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. For him, the new century seems to intensify the use of the plaza for extraordinary events. These events highlight current tensions in Colombia, and consequently, the socio-political and spatial renegotiations in relation to different notions of nation, democracy and citizenship that are constructed and debated among different groups in the plaza.

Tamayo and Cruz-Guzmán[342] analyze the political culture of participants in public demonstrations, their collective identities, and the cultural, political and social impacts of certain forms of protests and actions on Mexico City and the nation at large, through a comparative analysis of political demonstrations in Mexico City's main square, the Zócalo. The study is based on an ethnographic approach in connection to two socio-historical contexts of demonstrations held at this space. The first was carried out by the Zapatista Army of National Liberation, flanked by thousands of sympathizers in March 2001. This case is contrasted with a final electoral meeting of the winning

---

[339] Kaiser, 2008.

[340] Lima and Pallamin, 2008.

[341] Saldarriaga, 2008.

[342] Tamayo and Cruz-Guzmán.

political party during the national electoral campaign of 2000. Tamayo and Cruz-Guzmán's study underlines the processes by which urban spaces are transformed into contesting fields for, and by, different practices of citizenship, questioning the liberal and dialogical Habermasian conception of the public sphere.

Lastly, some urban spaces do not lose strong collective memories associated with them even when they undergo significant transformation, suggest Vidal Rojas and Fox Timmling.[343] They reflect on the historical meanings and uses of the square of Grand Central Station and the campus of the University of Santiago, in Santiago de Chile. By the early 1980s, the site had become one of the essential places of protest against Chile's military regime, and a bastion of opposition against the police. With the establishment of democracy, different struggles surfaced. Today, new commercial activities are bringing vitality to the area, even though most of the buildings manifest symptoms of decay. Vidal Rojas and Fox Timmling unveil the elements of the urban memory related to this place and the conditions that have been crucial in constructing its social meaning.

Planners in Latin America should strive to protect the tradition of intense use of urban public spaces for both ordinary and extraordinary events in LAC. This requires attention to the protection, creation, maintenance, and management of public spaces in the region.

5.5. The question of planning ethics

Planning is constantly posed with a dilemma between democracy and equity.[344] What the majority in a participatory process wants may not deliver satisfactory solutions for all and thus may further socio-spatial inequalities and polarization. NIMBY (Not-In-My-Backyard) politics, for instance, may democratically (by the will of the majority) advance exclusionary zoning in a neighbourhood, preventing affordable housing to be built and therefore excluding lower-income people from that community (as mentioned above). In LAC, class segregation overlaps and is compounded by racial/ethnic segregation, with people from African and indigenous descent at a disadvantage. In this context of social injustice, the planner is called to be a social reformer, formulating and advocating for plans and regulations that ameliorate socio-spatial inequalities. These include the provision of more affordable housing, greater and affordable access to multi-modal transportation, access to job training and decent and well-paying jobs; access to opportunities and facilities related to culture (libraries, museums, community centres, cultural programming), recreation (parks, community gardens, sport facilities, recreational programming), education (good quality public education and school facilities, after-school programming), and health (health insurance and health care service and facilities, exercise opportunities, access to healthy food, etc.). In the context of LAC, these considerations are particularly relevant when planning for/with informal communities.

Planning is also frequently posed with a dilemma between democracy and sustainability. What the majority in a participatory process wants may not deliver satisfactory solutions for the larger ecosystem and for the long run, and thus may further unsustainable development. Oftentimes sustainable goals are perceived as opposed to community and economic development, historic preservation, housing, or other planning goals. Ethical decisions under those considerations involve trade-offs and are not easy, but planners should strive to strike a plan that optimizes a balanced advancement in four fronts (or "Es") of sustainability: equity, economy, environment, and engagement.[345] Furthermore, ethical decisions within these contexts should not compromise the wellbeing of future generations. This dilemma in LAC is particularly apparent in the expansion of coastal tourist-real estate development and the exploitation of rain forested areas.

Then, whose ethics should planners pursue and who decides? The national constitutions of LAC countries and sometimes state and local statutes spell out the values and normative principles of the communities planners serve. Most of these statutes contemplate the expansion of opportunities for all,

---

[343] Vidal and Timmling, 2008.

[344] Levy, 2003.

[345] Zetter and Watson, 2005.

respect of cultural differences, respect for the rule of law, etc. These principles are usually compatible to the ones included in professional planning codes of ethics. This research did not find planning codes of ethics in LAC. There are codes of ethics for longer-established, filial professions, such as architecture and engineering, which planning is usually affiliated with in LAC countries. In the absence of code of ethics specifically for planning in LAC, an attempt can be made to draw from other planning codes of ethics (e.g., APA, AICP, AESOP) as precedents to suggest how LAC planning codes may be conceived.

Regarding the ethical mandates of profession, planning is also well positioned to contribute to the advancement of the Declaration of Human Rights, the Agenda 21, the Millennium Development Goals, and international treaties for sustainability, such as the Kyoto Protocol. Several LAC cities are paying explicit attention to these treaties and have adopted some as official benchmarks for their planning agendas.

5.6. Conclusion

As LAC planning examples above show, planning is always political and cannot be disentangled from matters of governance and participation.[346] Its most prominent result, the urban environment, is constantly produced and reproduced through politics. Power, on its part, is the capacity to make things happen ('power to' or 'network power'), make others do things ('power over') or prevent things from happening ('preemptive power'). Different modes of power may be in operation simultaneously in any given planning process.[347] Power and influence are always contested and thus can change, that is what makes the urban environment to be constantly produced and transformed through politics.

---

[346] Irazábal, 2009; Levy, 2003.

[347] Irazábal, 2005.

6. Planning and Sustainable Urban Development: Linking the Green and Brown Agendas

Planners in rapidly urbanizing regions in LAC are under immense pressure to address urban issues and thus they often propose shortsighted planning measures. The multitude of pressing problems that confront the region—such as informal settlements, environmental degradation, resource exhaustion, and underdeveloped infrastructure—necessitate immediate attention by planners. Yet, currently these responses lack the guidance of multifaceted and long-range planning frameworks that can better respond to the needs at hand. Without strong guidelines, the legacies of colonialism and export-oriented economic structures ensure that a pattern of uneven geographic settlement persists. The path towards sustainability in LAC has to integrate the green and brown agendas, with particular attention to more sustainable and equitable land-use patterns and infrastructure provision, mobility, resource protection, energy and waste management, and heritage preservation.

Meanwhile, major city regions like São Paulo or Bogotá and middle-sized cities like Cartagena and Valencia, Venezuela continue to grow while populations in rural hinterlands continue to decline.[348] Planners can address this unevenness through holistic strategies that emphasize linkages between urban and rural development. If rural/urban income and housing disparities cannot be reduced, the magnetic attraction of major urban areas will not subside. Advancing sustainable long-range development that reduces demographic pressures can ease the financial, political, and land-use burdens that overwhelm urban municipalities and metropolises.

Attempts to build more equitable and sustainable environments that can accommodate current and future needs must be understood "more [as] a process rather than an outcome."[349] Ecological and human conditions need to be discussed through community involvement that addresses future development strategies, with special attention to policies citizens think are needed to encourage sustainable development (e.g., land tenure, infrastructure investment, etc.). Within these debates, however, planners must recognize and counter-balance stakeholders or factors that have weighted leverage—such as land owners, international interests, and current land-use patterns. Negotiating these power struggles while conveying the urgent need for long-range planning can be a difficult process, confounded by the generally weak political positions of planners, who do not always have technical and legal leverage in LAC.

Nonetheless, opportunities exist for planners to critically engage with and integrate citizens into the creation, maintenance, and rehabilitation of urban ecosystems that can buttress sustainable housing, economic opportunities, and open space. Aligning citizens' interests with environmental issues can instill urban dwellers with a desire to improve built environments through sustainable practices that acknowledge and balance competing needs.[350] In turn, public demands for sustainability can become manifested and reified within political discourses and government initiatives.

6.1. Sprawl and gated communities and their impact on sustainability

In the larger and wealthier cities of LAC, such as Caracas, Bogota, Santiago, Buenos Aires, San Juan, and Mexico City, over the last two decades, permissive land-use planning and the growth of affluent populations have facilitated urban sprawl, which in turn has contributed to the number of cars, distances travelled, length of paved roads, fuel consumption, and alteration of ecological systems,

---

[348] Farret, 2001.

[349] Fehr *et al.*, 2004, p. 355.

[350] Silva, 2003.

among other processes.[351] The growing phenomena of gated communities in LAC cities have also fragmented the urban layout, destroyed the traditional urban grid, impeded transportation connectivity, and increased social polarization, as evident in São Paulo or Buenos Aires.[352] The media, and particularly the influence of popular sitcom shows and movies from the US. that glamorize suburban life, have influenced the desires of the middle class of LAC countries to emulate its suburban settlement patterns and consumptive habits, as demonstrated in Cartagena, Colombia.[353]

6.2. Mobility

One method to counteract climate change is to develop multimodal transportation systems that reduce a region's demand to develop in ecologically or geologically sensitive areas (i.e. flood plains, unstable alluvial fans, etc.). Transportation options—or the lack thereof—can aid or inhibit sustainable urban densification—housing more people on less land. As such, it is increasingly important for cities to invest early in alternative transit systems that depend less on petroleum/combustion power and private automobiles. Investing in alternative modes of transportation can reduce the amount of oil consumed and vehicle miles travelled within a city, while also improving air quality and providing transportation for low- and middle-class populations.[354] Innovative transportation planning has succeeded in Curitiba, Brazil, Bogota Colombia (TransMilenio), and Santiago, Chile (TranSantiago), where the metropolises have experienced an increase in the quality of the urban environment as well as social and physical improvement to the cities.[355] The region's megalopolises have also seen mobility improvements, with new additions to transit systems in Mexico City (the addition of a second level to a highway, *Periférico*, vs. rapid transit system), São Paulo, and Rio de Janeiro. In the Caribbean, subway systems are being implemented in San Juan and Santo Domingo. Some models of government regulation of privatized transit services in Latin American cities have also resulted in important benefits to mobility and other socio-environmental factors.[356] These urban, multimodal systems have to further integrate themselves into national and international systems of mobility, including fluvial, maritime, and air mobility.

In the face of scarce economic and financial resources, short government term-limits, and fragmented political publics, prioritization of pedestrians and bicycles over automobiles can be a cost-effective solution to transportation problems. Transit alternatives that serve more people, expand public spaces, increase street safety, beautify civic places, and promote personal well-being nurture the health and sociability of communities. Additionally, non-automobile transit modes increase the independence of children and elderly, while reducing demand for gasoline or non-renewable resources. Curitiba and Bogotá have produced good bicycle systems that display the potential of alternative transit modes[357], but the opportunity for expansion of pedestrian- and bicycle-friendly policies and plans in the LAC region remains largely untapped. Availability of bicycles and supporting infrastructure would be particularly beneficial in the cities of Cuba, where inexplicable these vehicles are not massively used.

The development of mobility infrastructure has always been a critical factor in the politics of progress for the LAC region. Some cities, such as Valparaiso, Chile, are predicated upon port

---

[351] UNEP, 2007.

[352] see Caldeira, 2000 and Libertun de Duren, 2006, respectively.

[353] Pizarro, 2005.

[354] Blevis, 1999.

[355] Jencks, 1999; Irazábal, 2005; Cervero, 1998.

[356] Lee, 1999; Echeverry, 2005.

[357] Berney, 2008.

development.[358] The largest project in the region has been the Panama Canal, one of the world's most important waterways, which links the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans through the Central American nation. The 8-hour trip saves 7,800 miles on a journey between New York and San Francisco in the US. As the reach of the global economy expands, some LAC coastal cities are converting their underutilized coasts into productive economic development opportunities, including freight ports, in the attempt of generating income and jobs, e.g., in Baja California, Mexico. The socio-environmental trade-offs of such developments, however, are usually underestimated and deserve to be further examined.

6.3. Natural Resource Protection

The dramatic growth in the urban population of LAC plays a large role in determining the focus of sustainable development. By 1990, approximately one third of Latin America's population lived in metropolitan areas. Two of the five largest metropolitan areas of the world were located in Latin America: Mexico City, Mexico and São Paolo, Brazil.[359] Brazil has experienced a transformation of its population during the last twenty years. Seventy-four percent of the population used to live in rural areas in 1950. By 2000, 82 percent of Brazil's population lived in urban areas.[360] Due to this tremendous increase in urban populations across LAC cities, sustainable development in LAC nations needs to shift development away from Greenfield sites, and focus on infilling and retrofitting the built urban environment.[361]

Linking traditional and modern knowledge is critical to frame sustainable development as an appropriate cultural investment in LAC ecologies. A good example of this can be seen in modern Costa Rica planning. Costa Rica is well known as a Central American country with a relatively strong stance on environmental protection. However, a study conducted by EARTH University and NASA in 1993 revealed that Costa Rica has suffered a significant loss of forests to development.[362] This loss is due to the clearing of forests for private subsistence farming and private development, which causes environmental degradation due to erosion and water contamination. Sustainable methods of farming such as polyculture instead of monoculture farming are thus being introduced to not only benefit forest ecology, but farmers as well. In addition, the government in Costa Rica pledged to plant seven million trees in 2008 (1.5 trees for each Costa Rican) to soak up as many greenhouse gas emissions as it produces, in a bid to become the world's first carbon neutral nation.[363] The country's administration is also pledging to halt deforestation. In 2007 the country planted five million trees, trying to forestall the impending environmental catastrophe of climate change. Thus, despite its patchy progress, Costa Rica is working on a series of initiatives to be responsible for its own emissions and lessen the impact of climate change.

The first food crisis of global proportions has produced grave concern around the world and has prompted street protests and riots in the poorest LAC countries (e.g., in Haiti, Peru, and Bolivia). It has also encouraged governments in the region to convoke urgent international meetings and cooperative food banks. While some level of crisis mitigation can be accomplished by redistributing current resources, it is imperative to aggressively pursue agrarian reform and sustainable farming methods, including urban farming. Sustainable methods must link the global and regional methods of farming, creating more productive synergies between indigenous agricultural practices and modern methods.

---

[358] Martland, 2003.

[359] Angotti, 1996.

[360] Farret, 2001.

[361] Gilbert, 1994.

[362] Wyels, 2003.

[363] *Terra Daily*, 2008.

For example, the application of agroecological techniques and the salvaging of traditional farming methods have revolutionized food production in rural areas along the southern edge of the Cuban capital. A number of farms in the outlying Havana district of Batabanó that are taking part in the Program for Local Agrarian Innovation (PIAL) have seen improvements in their harvests and livestock. Efforts capitalize on natural conditions in the area and innovative ideas, particularly with regard to crop diversification. Cooperatives are producing their own hay and/or soybeans for animal feed and are able to supply their own meat and eggs. There is a seed improvement project involving small farmers that was developed by the National Institute of Agricultural Sciences (INCA). The success of experiments with protein-rich soybean varieties has helped foment livestock-raising around 50 km south of Havana. Farmers are also experimenting with the use of "green fertilizers"—plants which are improving the chemical and biological properties of soil while helping fight weeds. Since PIAL's inception in 2000, more than 8,000 farmers in nine of Cuba's 14 provinces have benefited from the program, whose central aims are to give greater participation to farmers in food production and to decentralize the introduction of innovations in agriculture. A broad base of institutional and financial support assist INCA's efforts—universities, research institutes, Cuban and international non-governmental organizations, aid agencies, and local agricultural and environmental authorities. Farmers have earned good profits in recent harvests, a welcome change from previous conditions. Many farmers would not go back to chemical products, because even though yields are slightly lower with organic techniques, the expense is greatly reduced without the need for fertilizers and herbicides.[364]

A redistribution of land and appropiate planning for peri-urban areas can enhance and further disseminate these processes in Cuba and other LAC countries. In Cuba, some public land can be transferred to small farmers. In other capitalist countries, big areas of currently unproductive land owned by a few *latifundistas* (owners of great areas of land) can be redistributed to be used in smaller productive farms. Last year, Cuba spent some 1.6 billion dollars on food imports, a figure that is expected to grow to 1.9 billion dollars this year due to the sharp rise in global food prices. Meanwhile, around half of the country's arable land is currently lying fallow. The Cuban government is studying the possibility of distributing idle land to private farmers—a process that is already underway in the case of tobacco and coffee production.[365]

As the Earth's climate increases primarily due to industrial development in Western countries, Latin American and Caribbean countries need to begin preparing their cities for different climate patterns. The potential impacts of climate change vary from irregular to dramatic weather oscillations, flooding, and the fate of species subsistence.[366] Residents of cities and regions in Latin America and the Caribbean must take the responsibility of integrating global issues into local planning policies in an effort to protect the future quality of urban living and ecosystems at risk. The potential increase of extreme weather is particularly significant for squatter settlements such as *favelas* or *barrios*. These settlements are usually built on hazardous lands, made of temporary materials, and lack proper sewer systems and potable water. In cities and towns across the region, floods and mudslides wash away thousands of homes built on hillsides or flood-prone terrain each year. In addition to extreme weather, climate change can cause decreases in agricultural productivity, as well as make water delivery to urban areas less predictable. LAC cities must consider climate change in regional and city policy to develop institutional and physical infrastructure for the purpose of preventing and mitigating the severity of weather impacts. Planning has to explicitly address preventive disaster preparedness and proactive disaster recovery. As the occurrence of disasters and their negative impacts have grown in LAC in the recent decade and are predicted to expand, pre and post disaster planning must become a more prominent priority.

---

[364] Grogg, 2008, np.

[365] Grogg, 2008, np.

[366] http://unfccc.int/essential_background/feeling_the_heat/items/2917.php

6.4. Waste Management

Potential for informal and co-operative waste management

Solid waste management in Latin American and Caribbean countries has proven difficult, especially in *favelas* and informal settlements, as infrastructural and topographic irregularities usually impede or make it difficult for efficient refuse collection. In turn, this inefficiency begets improper and unhealthy waste disposal, but also creates opportunities for unskilled laborers.[367] Scavengers and waste-pickers are a vital component of societies in developing countries, and up to 2 per cent of the population survives on recycling refuse into viable resources.[368] Despite many municipalities in LAC spending 30 to 50 per cent of their operational budgets on waste management, only a fraction of the total waste is collected by formal sanitation methods.[369] Many municipal collection vehicles become inoperable after traversing underdeveloped infrastructure—e.g., Mexican cities often have over half of their collection fleet idling, awaiting repairs—and are frequently incapable of accessing marginal sites where informal settlements are located.[370] In turn, scavengers are able to serve these communities with collection vehicles that are more appropriate to the accessibility conditions of the slums—i.e. pickup trucks, push carts, and horse carts—and can provide affordable service without costly capital investments. Informal waste collectors are especially important in cities with significantly underdeveloped waste systems, and can serve significant segments of cities; for example, in Santa Cruz, Bolivia, informal refuse collectors serve about 37 percent of the population.[371] Some cities, such as Curitiba, have tried to formalize informal waste collectors, providing training, some infrastructural and managerial support, and uniforms. They have also reused old public transit buses for the provision of job training or after-school programs in poor settlements.

Sustainable urban growth programs are thus challenged with integrating formal and informal waste management systems to provide irregular settlements with better collection services. Integrating informal waste collection and "scavenging" into formal waste management systems has the potential to expand sanitation service without significant capital investments. Moreover, policy frameworks that encourage "self-help, private investment, and entrepreneurship" among waste-pickers can recognize marginalized workers as vital elements of civic infrastructure.[372] Understanding scavengers and their "product" to be a resource management issue, and not a disposal issue, can reshape how the urban planners view informal waste collection. Many municipalities have recognized the potential resource gains from public/private partnerships with cooperatives, and have signed contracts that not only employ the urban poor while providing underserved areas with sanitation services (solid waste collection, street sweeping, and recycling separation services), but also reduce their capital and labor investments.[373] Large co-ops are also able to provide training and proper disposal of various wastes, while negotiating higher prices for recovered resources. Low operational cost and efficient and cheap recovery of resources enables cooperatives and micro-enterprises to provide their members with higher wages, and reduces costs for raw, reusable, and organic materials for other industries. These strategies can have a significant and broad effect on a local economy.[374]

---

[367] Medina, 2000.

[368] Medina, 2000, p. 9.

[369] Moreno, Roc O Del and Maldonado, 2006.

[370] Medina, 2000, p. 7.

[371] Medina, 2000, p. 6.

[372] Medina, 2005.

[373] Medina, 2000 and 2005.

[374] Medina, 2000.

Formalization and Integration

Formalization and public/private partnerships can reduce the social stigmatization associated with informal collection. Citizens throughout LAC accord scavengers little social esteem, and brand them with pejorative names that vary by county. Applying layers of stigma to informal workers ensures their activities will perpetually be considered filth-related rather than productive social contributions. Negative connotations further encourages political and social exclusion predicated on discriminatory motives against a marginal group, and ensures individual scavengers must subsist in hostile environments where they are targets of abuse and physical violence.[375] Scavengers are exposed to extreme health risks as they scour landfills, canals, and vacant lots with their bare hands or simple instruments; health risks are further exacerbated by personal economic insecurity that precludes obtaining adequate health care. Their role in producing more sustainable living conditions is extremely undervalued. A method to better articulate their contribution to resource management is through quantitative studies to demonstrate their usefulness.

Scavengers significantly contribute to solid waste management efforts as they sort and transport recovered materials to receptacle centers. Remarkably, "[i]nformal waste-pickers in developing economies collect up to 40 per cent of the recyclable material from the waste stream."[376] In 2005, informal scavengers collected over 200,000 tons of refuse, and saved Mexico City over 2.6 million US. dollars.[377] Recycling and reuse activities significantly contribute to energy conservation and water sanitation, and reduce demand for virgin resources. Additionally, low-cost scavenger reclaimed materials provide cheaper inputs into industrial production, making local firms more competitive in international markets.

However, better management and policy mechanisms need to be developed to ensure that non-profitable material—such as organic waste and soiled refuse—collected by scavengers are disposed of properly. The limited accessibility that makes scavengers appropriate collectors within informal settlements prevents them from traveling to distant landfills, and it is at this juncture where there is an opportunity for the green and brown agendas to produce positive and tangible solutions. Many development and investment projects are supporting the development of co-ops to incentivize recycling and reuse of materials, but also to standardize waste collection where possible.[378]

Development projects, composting, and increasing local knowledge

Increasing funding for waste collection efforts in informal settlements is vital to reducing the environmental and epidemiological impact of unsanitary waste disposal. Directing planning and education efforts into programs that teach residents how-to divert refuse and recyclable materials into co-op or formal collection facilities can produce tangible visual and sanitary improvements, often at marginal costs to municipal governments. International financing institutions —such as the Inter-American Development Bank, the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund, and NGOs, etc.— have been active in projects that increase the potential of recycling waste, but also reduce the vulnerability of scavengers through safety measures, wage improvements, job training, and public/private partnerships.[379] Solid waste management projects are long-term solutions that can produce sustainable recycling and reuse programs without inflicting serious negative repercussion on the environment. Waste management programs can extend the productive lifecycle of landfills, as

---

[375] Medina, 2000, p. 9.

[376] Moreno, Roc O Del and Maldonado, 2006.

[377] Medina, 2005, p. 395.

[378] Mancini, 2007.

[379] Inter-American Development Bank – example projects: ES-T1045 (El Salvador), PR-S1001 (Paraguay) World Bank – example projects: E1693 (Bacanga Basin of Sao Luis Municipality, Brazil), P096469 (Santiago, Chile).

many municipalities dispose of significant amounts of waste that can be used for other means. In a municipality of São Paulo, Brazil, waste studies indicate only 9 per cent of current refuse volumes need to be deposed of, whereas the rest could potentially be reused or recycled. Much of the waste being dumped—50 to 60 per cent—is organic or biodegradable.[380] If given the economic incentive and conditions, informal scavengers and sanitation workers can intercept organic waste before it becomes contaminated with other refuse—such as plastics—and can channel it into composting systems.[381]

Composting has much potential in LAC because it requires little capital investment and technological resources. Large scale composting has the potential to not only be an efficient method of increasing landfill capacity, but can produce auxiliary benefits. Intercepting organic and inorganic refuse before they contaminate one another requires a cheap labor force that is willing to do the work with proper incentives, and the knowledge of informal scavengers would be of much use (human capital). Introducing a policy framework to encourage composting would provide an exceptional opportunity to integrate public/private partnerships to address green and brown challenges. One major potential is that co-ops and other entrepreneurs can reframe the job scavengers perform as a process of reinvesting resources into a productive cycle that produces food, products, and reduces urban demand for raw materials. Ultimately, however, recycling and reuse needs to become viewed as more than a subsistence economic opportunity, and as vital to ensuring a sustainable future for all economic classes. Sustained educational campaigns to raise awareness of individuals and collectives are vital. A proper system of incentives and disincentives can assist in promoting public collaboration.

Waste Management and Green House Gas Emissions

Regarding waste management, allocating municipal solid waste to landfills is the most common means to dispose of waste in LAC. The waste then turns into biogas, where about half is methane, a key player in greenhouse gases. Waste management is then an important factor to consider for municipalities in reducing greenhouse gases. A study in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, revealed that an increase in the collection of recycled materials can reduce the greenhouse gas emissions. The solid waste management sector of Rio is the second largest source of GHG emissions at 37 per cent in the region, with energy consumption in transportation the first at 60 per cent.[382] Brazil has two successful waste management projects through the Kyoto Protocol's Clean Development Mechanism (CDM), which allows industrialized countries to buy Certified Emissions Reductions (CER) from projects that mitigate carbon emissions in developing countries. These projects burn landfill gas and use the additional income from the purchased carbon credits towards more local pollution improvements.[383]

Understanding how greenhouse gas emissions differ by energy source in LAC is essential for managing pollution levels. In Brazil, for example, the majority of electrical energy is from hydropower (76 per cent) and almost 6 per cent is from nuclear thermal plants and biomass. Only the remaining 17 per cent of electrical energy is from conventional energy sources (coal, gas, fuel oil, and diesel). This 17 per cent is where most of the greenhouse gases are produced. As a result, transportation and waste management play a key role in mitigating greenhouse gas emissions.[384]

6.5. Heritage Preservation

Sustainable urban development must also consider the cultural heritage of a city. Maintaining the historic architecture and urban design of a city is important to continue the distinct individual identity and culture that cities possess. As seen in Brazil, Mexico, Peru, Guatemala, Cuba, and Puerto Rico, for

---

[380] Mancini, 2007, p. 523; Inter American Development Bank, 2004.

[381] Mancini, 2007.

[382] Pimenteira et al., 2005.

[383] Dubeux and La Rovere, 2007.

[384] Dubeux and La Rovere, 2007.

instance, there has been much renewed interest in urban historic preservation and restoration. Not only does this provide a welcome "facelift" to cities that enhances quality of life for residents, but the potential for tourism is expanded.[385] Counties in LAC can thus not only correlate sustainable development practices to increased living standards, but also potential increases in tourism, international investments, and opportunities to preserve their built environments of historical and cultural value. Recent world programs for preservation have also directed increased attention to the 'intangible' cultural values and heritage of societies, including their language and cultural traditions. Built environments that support and nurture vernacular traditions constitute important aspects of comprehensive conservation plans.

The impact of international and national policies and programs, such as the UN designation of World Heritage Sites in LAC, should be mediated by regional and local planning and implementation institutions to ensure that such policies and programs bring sustainable and equitable development to the local communities where patrimonial sites are located. Also, national and international institutions should support local and regional entities with technical expertise and training, monitoring, evaluation, financial resources, and systems of accountability so that heritage conservation leads to equitable distribution of positive (economic gains, job opportunities, cultural programs) and negative externalities (traffic, parking, pollution, resource consumption) in the local, regional, and national communities. This is important for LAC communities built around or nearby pre-Hispanic sites (such as Guatemala City, Mexico City, and Cusco) and colonial sites (such as Mexico City, Lima, Quito, and Salvador).

6.6. Institutionalizing Sustainability

LAC nations must implement long-range planning policy and politics to promote sustainable development and avoid climate change catastrophes. Unfortunately, LAC leaders often show a pattern of terminating environmental programs from previous administrations to begin again at square one. It is imperative that environmental policy and planning solutions must not be abandoned with political shifts. They must instead be institutionally maintained and perpetuated to ensure responsible development during transition periods. Regulations must be enforced by politically autonomous institutionalized planning agencies in order to assure sustainable and equitable development during these times. This can be assisted through the work of universities and NGOs.[386]

Many political developments in LAC over the last few decades have significantly transformed local planning agencies. Mayors, NGOs, and citizens are actively becoming more engaged in infrastructure decisions and long-range planning. As more countries fully recognize democratic and decentralization processes, the ideological alignments and political affiliations of local actors are becoming increasingly important as they network with national bureaucratic institutions to increase funding allocations. Data from São Paulo, for example, demonstrates that these affiliations have increasingly dictated how much funding is available for local dispersion, and that funding is constrained by political interests. Such studies have not fully investigated if funded projects reflect actual needs. However, it is clear that infrastructure provision has not responded to the evolutionary needs of the city.[387] Meanwhile, São Paulo and other large cities in LAC are undergoing extensive rounds of "creative destruction" that reconstructs and rebuilds areas already provided with adequate infrastructure, while bypassing informal settlements.[388]

This pattern of omission and neglect challenges efforts by urban planners to build community support for sustainable building practices—planners need the financial tools and institutional mechanisms to buttress their work. However, some planners, particularly in poor municipalities, have

---

[385] *The Economist*, 1998.

[386] Ames and Keck, 1997.

[387] Marques, 2003, p. 820.

[388] Marques, 2003.

also become complicit of favoring wealthy and influential developers, creating or tweaking regulations to permit prohibited development, such as gated communities and luxurious subdivisions—what Libertun de Libertun de Duren has called "planning à la carte."[389] Building legitimacy and credibility has been possible with multi-partisan commitments to pursue sustainable agendas, yet finding funding to balance the scale of housing and environmental needs will continue to be a persistent challenge.

Development of General Plans

In many LAC countries, there have been significant political changes at the national level that have resulted in new planning legislation and initiatives. These changes have also imbued local governments with new tools to control growth and challenge land-use patterns. A broader inclusion of interest groups within decision-making processes, especially within the creation of master plans, can interject sustainable urban practices into municipal policies. This is a marked deviation from historic land-use policies in LAC that privileged private over public rights, and reduced the effectiveness of planning institutions. Empowering cities to address housing and land-use in tandem thus gives local governments leverage to pursue balanced policy goals that work within current conditions while still promoting sustainable land-uses that best promote socio-environmental goals.

In Brazil, two major political events have begun to take shape with a change in political power. In 2001, the City Statute expanded constitutional provisions to imbue municipalities with tools to control growth and challenge land-use patterns. Municipalities with a population of over 20,000 are formulating master plans that recognize that private property rights are encumbered by public interests. This statute recognizes "the power and obligation of municipal governments to control the process of urban development through the formulation of territorial and land use policies, in which the individual interests of land owners necessarily co-exist with other social, cultural and environmental interests of other groups and the city as a whole."[390] The City Statute encourages integration of urban planning, legislation, and management to encourage an inclusive local decision making framework. The Statute also focuses on building sustainability within informal settlements by empowering local governments to "promote land tenure regularization programmes and thus democratize the conditions of access to land and housing."[391]

The City Statute in Brazil has been further promoted with the formation of the Ministry of Cities in 2003. This institution specifically addresses "housing, environmental sanitation, public transportation and mobility, and land and urban programmes."[392] The National Programme to Support Sustainable Urban Land Regularization is one element of the ministry. Their efforts have focused on methods to articulate and mobilize intervention strategies that combine legal, financial, planning, and political elements to promote regularization of settlements to provide residents with land tenure rights to varying degrees. However, the biggest challenge for the Ministry is to truly curtail the funding of programs that "reproduce the social hierarchy when defining the priorities for investment."[393] Ultimately, the lasting importance of the Ministry will depend on its ability to form inter-agency cooperation to address issues of urban sustainability and to produce tangible, equitable results.

6.7. The Path towards Sustainability: Integrating the Green and Brown Agendas

Urban planners in LAC are confronted with a diverse range of immediate concerns that encumber long-range efforts to interject sustainable practices into political, community, and citizen agendas. Ever-present needs for housing, sanitation systems, crime reduction measures, gainful employment, or

---

[389] Libertun de Duren, 2006.

[390] Fernandes, 2007, p. 182.

[391] Fernandes, 2007, p. 183.

[392] Fernandes, 2007, 183.

[393] Marques, 2003, p. 826.

urban environmental issues have been dubbed the "brown agenda." The "brown agenda" encompasses the health impacts of urban pollution that derive from inadequate water, sanitation, drainage and solid waste services, poor urban and industrial waste management, and air pollution, especially from particulates. This set of problems facing LAC cities are disproportionately affecting the urban poor and takes a heavy toll on urban health and productivity. These issues are primarily related to lack of adequate infrastructure and urban services that hinder an efficient management of both economic and human resources.

Latin American and Caribbean cities have a difficult time addressing "brown" issues as they lack financial resources to mitigate "the worst consequences of market-driven development"—unregulated land-uses and settlement—and as such, continued rates of peri-urbanization compound infrastructural shortages and potential disasters.[394] Without adequate funding to produce and enforce long-range planning goals, land-use decisions are often driven by profit motives rather than community needs. This asymmetrical power relationship between poor communities and other sectors of society has pushed informal settlements and unregulated developments into liminal, inequitable political positions. The urban poor, who are needed to sustain regional economics in LAC nations, are not fully considered in land-use decisions that affect them.[395] Given this unequal power distribution within urban politics, many constituents within LAC countries believe that achieving sustainable development is not possible until social and economic inequalities are minimized.[396]

Overcoming these challenges requires a broader set of planning tools to reframe sustainability as a model of growth that can provide more equitable and ecologically-responsible delivery of urban services. Incorporation of a "green agenda" that considers local and global ecological issues—such as global warming, deforestation, and the exhaustion of renewable resources—in regional and local efforts can empower LAC stakeholders to question and engage with long-term development strategies.[397] Addressing these global issues in current planning efforts can prevent future urban emergencies. For example, factoring anticipated sea-level changes, petroleum shortages, and future hurricane frequencies into Caribbean and coastal planning can weigh heavily in favor of developing alternative land-use and transportation strategies that will accommodate preventive natural or man-made environmental conditions and plan for more effective post-disaster recovery[398]. This is hardly done today in coastal planning in the Caribbean, Pacific, and Atlantic coastal settlements of the region, to occasional deadly consequences, such as demonstrated by recent hurricanes in Cancun, Mexico or landslides in La Guaira, Venezuela. To accomplish this, planners need to focus more efforts on public participation so future plans, land-use decisions, and policies that do not perpetuate existing power structures and strategies that have proven inflexible and ineffective. Current political planning regimes need to be challenged through democratization and participatory efforts. Further linking the local, regional, and national agendas can provide regulatory and institutional support to place sustainable ideals in conversation with real, tangible strengths and weaknesses facing urban areas and communities.

Development in peri-urban environments is globally induced by patterns of investment in dominant regional cities—such as São Paulo or Mexico City. This places much developmental pressure on unencumbered land. Manufacturing and commercial centers find it increasingly difficult to locate in central business districts due to lack of sufficient space, dilapidated buildings, or regulatory structures that make peri-urban land more attractive. These driving factors lead to speculative and

---

[394] Angotti, 1996, p. 19.

[395] Silva, 2003, p. 94.

[396] Ducci, 1996, p. 267.

[397] Ducci, 1996, p. 264-67.

[398] Angotti, 1996, p. 20.

rapid land price increases which, in turn, push the lowest-income people "further away to outer fringes and locations that are prone to natural hazards."[399] This land-use strategy has produced a situation where 4 out of every 10 "nonpermanent houses in the developing world are located in dangerous sites that are prone to floods, landslides, and other natural disasters."[400]

Rising populations both from rural migration and urban birthrates compound existing design, environmental issues, and urban service delivery problems in *favelas* or *villas miseria* around LAC. As populations increasingly turn to informal settlements in peri-urban areas, goods and services become more expensive to provide, such as in illegal subdivisions far from Rio de Janeiro's or Bogota's city centers.

A strategic approach to guide cities in considering how to take both brown and green agendas into account in their urban planning and management systems should be based on participation, building public commitment, and choosing effective and equitable policy interventions. Bartone *et al.*[401] suggest emphasis on five key policy areas: (i) mobilizing public support and participation; (ii) choosing policy instruments that will change behavior, relieve conflicts, and encourage cooperative arrangements; (iii) building local institutional capacity; (iv) strengthening urban service delivery; and (v) increasing local knowledge about the urban environment. Other authors have reduced this model to be more direct, such that three primary factors are required for a "pro-poor government process": (i) a more inclusive political process; (ii) a greater capacity of city governance institutions to respond to the needs of the poor; (iii) more pressure from civil society.[402] No matter the tiered methodology adopted, equity should override efforts in all policy areas.

Principles within a recommended framework need to be general, given that planning and legal cultures vary in different countries and cities in LAC. The fact that many cities and countries in LAC need to create their planning systems altogether and that many established planning systems in the region are in need of revision can be conceived as opportunities to produce creative, cost-effective, and integrative responses to green and brown environmental challenges. However, bringing both the brown and green agenda into more intimate conversation within Latin American and Caribbean planning practice will not guarantee sustainable urban environments are produced. Instead, the conversation needs to initiate a long-term process to garner political and community support for sustainable development. Gaining support for sustainable development, however, proves challenging. On the one hand, decisions makers have a myriad of political ties and competing responsibilities. On the other hand, there is limited public involvement in political processes.

Every city, region, and nation has different goals and moves towards them at different rates. As such, definitions of sustainability must be contextually derived from participatory processes that are guided, but not dominated by scientific criteria and tangible examples. Encouraging regions to move at their own pace will provide citizens with opportunities to influence the long-term process, as it will be up to the "population [to] decide whether it wishes [to be] a sustainable city and at what price."[403] In turn, planners need to approach sustainability as both a process played at the level of each individual and an exercise in collective management. To maintain civic involvement in the continual evolution of long-term planning, planners will need to produce educational programs that provide transparent and convincing arguments to change the possibilities of city development within the minds of individuals.[404] Sustainability cannot be bought or erected in the built environment. It is a concept that requires time and patience to implement, and needs to be integrated into both a city's physical and socio-cultural geography.

---

[399] Keivani and Mattingly, 2007, p. 462.

[400] Sheuya, 2008, p. 9.

[401] Bartone *et al.*,1994.

[402] Keivani, 2007 and Mattingly, p. 462.

[403] Fehr, 2004, p. 361.

[404] Fehr, 2004, p. 361-64.

6.8. Conclusion

The increases of pressure on Latin American and Caribbean cities' infrastructure and quality of life will continue to be felt. To ameliorate and start redressing the negative consequences of this condition, sustainable development has to become a priority for local, regional, national, and international government, aid, and planning agencies, community groups, non-governmental organizations, and the private sector in the region. Climate change will generate additional challenges for cities due to the lack of adequate infrastructure for the burgeoning urban populations, and the weaknesses of preventive and post-disaster planning systems. Effective planning and investment in alternative modes of mobility, energy production/consumption, and waste management are ways to mitigate climate change. Sustainable and equitable development has to be conceived with a long-term vision, and political and community commitment in LAC has to increase in order to progress towards a more livable and just city.

7. Planning, Informality and New Urban Forms

There are two main parts to this chapter. The first focuses on planning within a context of informality, given the dominant role of the informal sector in many spheres in developing countries in general and LAC in particular. The second part of the chapter relates to planning vis-à-vis new urban forms, with a focus on peri-urbanization and the urban-rural interface. Next, reactions to and perceptions of the informality and peri-urban debate are explored from the positions of key stakeholders. Throughout the chapter, examples are given of recent planning practices in the region that address informal and peri-urban development in new and often innovative ways.

While conventional planning largely takes place within the formal structures of government, a great deal of city building and provision of urban services is actually undertaken informally in LAC. In LAC, the informal sector accounts for a large percentage of the provision of housing, transportation, jobs and other social and physical infrastructure in urban areas. For example, in Lima, Peru, the informal sector accounts for 70 percent of housing production and 95 percent of public transport.[405] The increasingly dominant position of the informal sector in delivery of land, housing, and services implies that the responses and solutions to many urban problems, especially those faced by the poor and other marginalized groups, might indeed lie outside the official planning system.[406] Following from this, it then can be argued that the informal systems through which these processes take place should be better understood to explore if new relationships can be forged with formal delivery systems. Such thinking is not out of place, given that the informal sector has considerable linkages with the formal sector, the state, other institutions, and the wider economy.

7.1. Informality

Informal Housing and Settlements

Many Latin American and Caribbean scholars have characterized access to land and housing in the region as an essentially gradual or progressive process.[407] The progressive housing process, or self-help housing, is the major method through which a vast majority of families in the region build their homes. Self-help housing became the norm for low and moderate income urban housing in LAC in the last half of the 20th century. The process begins with individuals or households acquiring land through purchase or invasion, depending on the particular case. For example, in Venezuela, squatting is the primary means of land development, while in Colombia and other countries in the region, informal land developers comprise a large industry and play a significant role in much of the country's urbanization.[408] Once land is acquired or invaded, households incrementally upgrade the structure and formalize land tenure, and then lobby for basic services.

The Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) estimates that 70 percent of housing production in LAC occurs progressively.[409] At its core, the force driving the self-help method of housing is an inability by most households in developing countries to purchase land or housing. This inability is caused by inefficient and regressive policies and practices in land, financial, and housing markets, combined with a lack of effectively functioning rental markets. Regulations established by

---

[405] de Soto, 1989.

[406] Charlton et al., 2007.

[407] Turner, 1972; Turner, 1976; Ferguson and Navarette, 2003.

[408] Ferguson and Navarette, 2003.

[409] Ferguson and Navarette, 2003, p.312.

government and financial institutions for securing mortgage loans, such as the requirement that applicants have formal sector employment, prevents many LAC residents from accessing such housing loans. In addition, in many LAC countries, public sector apparatuses such as secretaries or departments of housing, urban planning and transportation have been unable or unwilling to deliver and manage land, housing services and infrastructure with a clear social equity mission. As such, many of the region's residents have been forced to invent their own processes and structures to gain access to land, housing, and livelihoods in urban areas throughout LAC. The need for accessible and affordable land and housing is so great in the region that much of the low and middle-income population resorts to constructing housing on land that is either governmentally owned or not currently zoned for building, or illegally lives in subdivided private property that has been invaded.[410]

Throughout the 20th Century, informal settlements in LAC continued to grow at a rapid pace as migrants moved from rural areas into cities in search of better jobs and livelihoods. The highest rates of urbanization occurred in LAC during the 1950s, 1960s and 1970s, such that by the early 1980s, much of the region was already greatly urbanized. Yet the provision of housing and services did not keep pace with the rate of urbanization in the region. Resources in LAC urban areas have become scarce and costly, and formal access to land, housing, services, and infrastructure have become increasingly out of the reach for much of the region's urban population. Still today, informal settlements usually have a more rapid pace of growth than the formal areas of many LAC cities and an ever greater percentage of that growth is natural growth—produced in situs rather than by inmigration.

Hence, today LAC is home to many squatter communities and informal settlements. Varying in name throughout Latin America—*colonias proletarias* in Mexico, *barriadas brujas* in Panama, *barrios* in Venezuela and Colombia, *barriadas* in Peru, *callampas* in Chile*, cantegriles* in Uruguay, *favelas* in Brazil and *shantytowns* in Jamaica—these marginalized settlements share a commonality of being created informally and out of necessity. On a regional level, the Inter-American Development Bank estimates that 60 percent of LAC inhabitants live in informal settlements.[411]

UN-HABITAT has defined slums as "a group of individuals living under the same roof that lack one or more of the following conditions: access to safe water; access to sanitation; secure tenure; durability of housing; and sufficient living area."[412] Table 1 below displays the percentage of the urban population in select LAC countries that live in slums, as measured by a proxy, represented by the urban population living in households with at least one of the four characteristics: (a) lack of access to improved water supply; (b) lack of access to improved sanitation; (c) overcrowding (3 or more persons per room); and (d) dwellings made of non-durable material.[413]

As Table 1 demonstrates, there exist significant differences among LAC countries in regards to their urban slum populations. Specifically, within the Caribbean, there are vast distinctions in urban slum populations among different countries. For example, while Martinique had an estimated slum population in 2005 of less than two percent, Jamaica had one of nearly 61 percent and Haiti over 70 percent. Within Latin America, urban areas in Chile have the lowest percentage of their populations living in slums, at just over 9 percent, while Bolivia has the highest, at over 50 percent.

---

[410] Gilbert 1998; AlSayyad, 1993.

[411] Magalhaes and Rojas, 2007.

[412] Warah, 2003.

[413] United Nations Statistics Division, 2008a.

Table 5. Percent of Urban Population Living in Slums in LAC Countries

Select LAC Countries	Percent in 1990	Percent in 2005
Anguilla	40.60	36.79
Antigua and Barbuda	6.90	4.89
Argentina	30.51	26.23
Belize	54.21	47.39
Bolivia	70.04	50.43
Brazil	45.04	29.01
Chile	4.01	9.07
Colombia	26.05	17.93
Costa Rica	11.91	10.99
Dominica	16.61	N.A.
Dominican Republic	56.45	17.69
Ecuador	28.11	21.59
El Salvador	44.71	28.99
French Guiana	12.91	10.59
Grenada	6.91	6.09
Guadeloupe	6.91	5.49
Guatemala	65.88	42.98
Guinea	79.66	45.73
Guyana	4.91	33.72
Haiti	84.97	70.13
Honduras	24.01	34.93
Jamaica	29.21	60.55
Martinique	2.01	1.7
Mexico	23.11	14.43
Nicaragua	80.79	45.53
Panama	30.81	23.09
Paraguay	36.81	17.69
Peru	60.46	36.19
Saint Lucia	11.91	11.99
Saint Pierre and Miquelon	8.71	N.A.
Suriname	6.91	3.92
Trinidad and Tobago	34.71	24.79
Venezuela	40.71	32.03
Source: UN Statistics Division[414]		

---

[414] United Nations Statistics Division, 2008b.

Additionally, major cities within LAC countries are often home to larger slum populations than are the countries, as a whole, in which they are located. For example, Table 1 demonstrates that Mexico has a national slum population of roughly 14 percent, yet over 60 percent of Mexico City inhabitants live in informal settlements.[415] While there is debate around the extent to which all informal settlements can be classified as slums, both classifications imply an informal construction of housing that lies outside of the formal planning and housing production systems.

Pressing Planning Issues in Informal Settlements

Comprising the majority of housing settlements in LAC, the informal, self-help housing process directly impacts infrastructural and natural services and resources at a metropolitan level. In cities in which centrally-located land is extremely limited in its supply and hence highly cost-prohibitive, and thus households have little area in which to expand outwards, they typically expand upwards, adding extra stories to their homes. This vertical expansion is the case in many of the *favelas* of Rio de Janeiro and the *barrios* of Caracas. Such vertical expansion stresses the structure of the buildings, making them more vulnerable to disasters, particularly in earthquake, flood, or hurricane-prone areas. In lower density areas, often located at a city's periphery, households tend to expand outwards, sprawling into the surrounding areas, consuming natural or agricultural land and other resources, adding to the ecological footprint of cities and often damaging fragile ecosystems and exposing settlements to risks. This horizontal expansion is clearly seen in many of the *colonias proletarias* of Mexico City, *barriadas* in Lima, and *callampas* in Santiago de Chile. As settlements densify, whether horizontally or vertically, infrastructure and services are further stressed on both a local and a regional scale, including roads, transit, water, sewage, gas, telephone, waste collection, security, etc. Hence, in order to ensure the provision of infrastructure and services and the protection of natural land, it is necessary for planning efforts in the region to view housing, transportation, service, and insfrastructure provision and management on a regional level.

Moreover, informal settlements are particularly vulnerable to suffering severe and often deadly damages caused by natural disasters. This vulnerability is extremely high in Caribbean nations and the Mexican and Central American Atlantic coast, which face acute challenges from hurricanes and other natural disasters. In 2004 in Haiti, nearly one quarter of a million people living in the slums of Gonaives were left homeless by Hurricane Jeanne and 2,400 were left dead; yet in neighboring Dominican Republic, only 11 people were killed by the natural disaster.[416] As shown in Table 1, over 70 percent of Haitian inhabitants live in slums, compared with only 17.7 percent of residents in the Dominican Republic. Despite their occupying the same island, Haiti and the Dominican Republic contain dramatically differently-sized slum populations, and as a result, are extremely unevenly affected by natural disasters. Haiti is more heavily at risk from natural disasters due to its high slum population, which lacks the infrastructure and resources to cope with such disasters.

In addition to infrastructural, resource and natural disaster challenges, violence is also a major problem plaguing many informal settlement communities in LAC. Jamaica's shantytowns starkly highlight the way in which issues of crime and meager living conditions and poverty, more prevalent in informal settlements, become conflated in many LAC cities. Elucidating the high prevalence of violence in informal settlements, in Montego Bay, Jamaica, 80 percent of the city's homicides occur in shantytowns, which contain over half of the city's population.[417]

Violence and drug trafficking, which have become pervasive problems in many informal communities in the region, together with a restructured job market and the devaluation of education as a tool of economic promotion have prompted Janice Perlman to speak about the emergence of "the

---

[415] Connolly, 2003.

[416] Ford, 2004.

[417] Frater, 2006.

reality of marginality" in the region, superseding what she had called "the myth of marginality" 35 years earlier.[418] Perlman writes, "young people caught up in drug dealing know that they risk early death and often say they would not be doing these things if there were other alternatives."[419] There is no opportunity for youth to prosper if decent and steady work that pays a living wage is not provided to them as a central part of crime prevention and drug trafficking abatement strategies.

Recent Practices in Informal Settlement Upgrading

Programs such as *Favela-Bairro* (Slum to Neighborhood) in Rio de Janeiro are new approaches to informal settlements in Latin America and the Caribbean. The program, started in 1995, is a cross-sectoral partnership between the Inter-American Development Bank and the Municipal Departments of Urban Planning and Housing aimed at urbanizing hundreds of informal settlement communities in Rio de Janeiro. Physical upgrading of *favelas* includes improvements to water and sewage systems, street lighting, and garbage collection, as well as the opening up of streets and creation of public spaces like parks and playgrounds, and amenities such as community or health centers. The program differs from many previous state-led efforts in that it also focuses on upgrading social infrastructure in the *favelas*. Social services are administered by civil society organizations and include the provision of day care facilities, drug and alcohol prevention, education and job training, and youth leadership activities. Janice Perlman describes *Favela-Bairro* as one of the most "ambitious and forward-thinking neighborhood upgrading programs that any city has ever launched to deal with marginal settlements, not only in Latin America, but in the world."[420] Much of what makes the program such a success is its integrated approach that considers physical and social elements of planning as necessarily related and potentially complementary efforts. As *Favela-Bairro* is now entering its third phase, more could be done to redress the persistent imbalance between its physical and social components, emphasizing social programs that can directly tackle poverty in addition to the provision of urban infrastructure.[421] In recent years, the challenges of violence prevention and intervention for Favela-Bairro and other slum upgrading program sin LAC have become more prominent, particularly as drug trafficking has increased in many cities.

Recent Practices in Housing

In regards to housing provision, there have also been examples in Latin America and the Caribbean of innovative approaches. Specifically, various scholars have concluded that, "new tools… are realizing the potential of progressive housing in new types of public and private-sector enterprises."[422] These new tools are allowing the progressive housing process to become more formalized and potent.

With regards to housing finance, a mix of micro-credit and mortgage finance is being increasingly used in the region by for-profit financial institutions and land developers, nonprofit organizations working on housing, and microlending institutions. Microfinance's ability to complement social housing programs such as slum upgrading, low/moderate-income subdivision development, and core expandable units has been recognized.[423] As evidence of the growing popularity of microfinancing of housing in the region, Peruvian microcredit organization *Mibanco*, found in its first year of offering microfinancing that 20 percent of its microcredit loans went for housing.[424] Bolivia, Guatemala and El Salvador have also begun to offer microfinancing for housing.

---

[418] Perlman, 2006, p. 175.

[419] Perlman, 2006, p. 176.

[420] Bate, 2002.

[421] Nacif Xavier and Magalhães, 2003.

[422] Ferguson and Navarrete, 2003, p. 311.

[423] Ferguson and Navarrete, 2003, p. 317.

[424] Ferguson and Navarrete, 2003.

However, recent studies have found that many informal settlement residents do not want to use formal credit systems for loans. "People simply feel it is too risky to put their homes at stakes when they cannot count on a steady income to repay debts. They prefer to rely on informal markets and credit systems, despite greater risks and higher interest rates."[425]

The consolidation and upgrading of communities through programs such as *Favela-Barrio* and *Morar Legal* (Rio de Janeiro), Habitat Rosario Program (Rosario, Argentina), and COFOPRI (Peru) motivate many residents to improve their own housing units, becoming an effective public-private partnership for housing upgrades.[426]

Informal Land Development

Land acquisition and development in LAC has become increasingly informalized. Since the 1980s, the supply of developable urban land in LAC has become steadily constricted, while demand has remained high in cities throughout the region, leading to steep increases in the costs of attaining and developing urban land. These obstacles in accessing and purchasing land faced by a majority of the region's urban residents often results in decisions to settle in more remote, peripheral urban areas, therein leading to further difficulties in terms of acquiring land tenure and serviced land. Yet land informality does not prevent dynamic land and housing markets to form, albeit informally. Many informal settlements in LAC, particularly those in central urban locations with great connectivity and accessibility, are subjected to competitive land, housing, and rental markets.

However, for the millions of LAC residents that settle in more remote urban areas, they face a host of other hardships related to accessibility, employment, transportation, services and environmental hazards. Furthermore, formal land regulation processes such as the development approval process often restricts land supply because they take a long time and are bureaucratically complicated, therein augmenting land and housing costs. Driven by unsupportive regulatory frameworks and insurmountable costs, many urban residents in the region have resorted to informal means of land development. Because of these and other acute problems residents face as a result of restricted land access, researchers studying the region have noted that access to land is one of the most visible struggles for space in Latin American cities.[427] In addition, access to land is one of the greatest determinants of livelihood and quality of life for city dwellers.

Since the 1960s, many land use programs in LAC have focused on the legalization of land tenure. Land tenure, the titling of property rights, gives people security against eviction, a source of capital, and allows them to qualify for formal loans using their house or land as collateral. Tenure security enables many people to develop a greater sense of belonging and willingness to invest resources and efforts in improving their communities. However, demolition and eviction practices, which used to be common in the past, are rarer nowadays. For more established communities that are not threatened with eviction or demolition and have thus achieved *de facto* tenure, land tenure is not necessarily very attractive. Residents of *favelas* in Rio de Janeiro, for instance, are commonly opposed to regularization of land titles. Contrary to a common shared belief among analysts[428] and international organizations (e.g., the World Bank), many informal settlement residents "do not want to pay property taxes or submit to building codes, and they have little desire to use formal credit systems for loans" because they do not have a steady income to repay debts.[429]

---

[425] Perlman, 2006, p. 176.

[426] Boyer, 2005.

[427] Wigle, 2006; Valença, 2008.

[428] de Soto, 2000; Varley, 2002.

[429] Perlman, 2006, p. 176.

Recent Practices in Land Development

Some countries in LAC have begun to reduce land development standards in an effort to streamline land development regulation and implementation. For example, the government of El Salvador reformed its legal and institutional structure of land development to encourage faster and cheaper development of land. The government reduced requirements for subdivision layout, and required only provision of water and sanitation services to be in place for development to begin, permitting infrastructure to be updated incrementally. In doing so, it reduced upfront costs to developers and land development has begun to increase in pace and decrease in costs. Now, low-income lot development accounts for one-third of all new housing development in El Salvador, and lot prices have decreased by 20 percent since 1996.[430]

A challenge remains for the benefits of community improvement programs to remain in the community and not to get transferred to wealthier residents through a process of gentrification. Some programs of land banking, social interest zoning (ZEIS), condominium ownership, and "right of use" of the land have addressed these challenges.[431]

Informal Economy

Based on 2007 figures from the World Bank, Table 2 demonstrates the approximate size of the informal economy in select LAC countries, measured in terms of productive labor or microenterprises. Among the countries, Haiti, the poorest nation in the region, has the highest percent of its productive labor occurring in the informal economy, at 88.9 percent and Chile, one of the wealthiest nations in the region, has the lowest, at 37 percent.

Table 6. Informal Economy as Measure of Productive Labor

Selected LAC Countries	Percent
Argentina	44.10
Bolivia	76.90
Brazil	55.00
Chile	37.00
Colombia	71.20
Costa Rica	41.40
Dominican Republic	51.20
Ecuador	66.40
El Salvador	57.00
Guatemala	69.50
Haiti	88.90
Honduras	63.80
Jamaica	57.50
Mexico	54.10
Nicaragua	64.70
Panama	50.20

---

[430] Ferguson and Navarrete, 2003, pp. 318-19.

[431] Acioly, 2007; Boyer, 2005.

Paraguay	72.30
Peru	69.50
Uruguay	42.40
Venezuela	54.00
LAC Region	59.36

Source: World Bank[432]

The urban informal economy in Latin American and Caribbean cities developed to serve a segment of the population that has been by and large overlooked by formal urbanization for many decades. State-led efforts at economic development have not produced adequate jobs for the number of residents now living in urban areas. As such, many residents have had to find their own means of income outside of the formal economic sector. In LAC, four out of every five new jobs are in the informal sector, which currently employs 57 percent of the region's workers.[433] In Mexico City, for example, 60 percent of residents work in the informal sector. Street vending, a prevalent form of informal employment in LAC, has been steadily on the rise: in Mexico City, the number of street vendors increased by 40 percent from 2000 to 2005.[434]

The most effective poverty alleviation tool for Latin American and Caribbean urban poor is decent and steady work that pays a living wage. When asked in an open-ended interview by Janice Perlman on "the most important factor for a successful life," poor residents of Rio de Janeiro did not refer to better governance, land ownership, or safety. Instead, 70% of respondents said they needed a good job:

For them, only well-paid work (whether formal or informal) would get them out of chronic poverty. The simple fact is that no amount of housing or infrastructure upgrading and no amount of "integrated community development" or "partnership strategic planning" can substitute for the ability to earn one's living through honest labor.[435]

Recent Practices in Economy

Nations in LAC are struggling to various degrees to integrate informal economic activity into the formal economy. In the past decade, a common response on the part of governments has been to relocate informal street vendors and service providers to specific zones from which they can operate in exchange for being officially recognized. State-led programs in the past decade in Mexico City, Lima, and Bogotá to revitalize urban centers—often historic centers that are greatly impacted by and designed with tourists in mind—have forced street vendors to relocate, often to their economic and social detriment.[436] Lima relocated street vendors from its historic center in 1997 as part of urban redevelopment efforts. In late 2007, Mexico City removed 15,000 of its 35,000 street vendors from over 87 downtown blocks in similar redevelopment plans for the city's historic center that were executed by the municipal government.[437] This relocation method is unpopular because the new market zones tend to be located far from both customers and suppliers, reducing the entrepreneurs' ability to run their businesses in a profitable manner, and in addition it makes difficult the functioning

---

[432] Perry, 2007, p.29.

[433] Castillo, 2006.

[434] Castillo, 2006.

[435] Perlman, 2006, p. 176.

[436] Chion and Ludeña, 2008.

[437] Ugarte, 2007.

of the social networks around which the vendors have built their businesses. While in these revitalization efforts central areas have been beautified and made more functional and accessible to different groups, formal urban planning efforts have inadequately understood or met the needs of the informal economic sector and have also undermined their economic and social networks. The complex results of many of these recent efforts at reviving central and historic districts in LAC cities behoove planners in the region to critically examine for whom they are planning their cities and which target community they have in mind when initiating urban policies.

Countries such as Venezuela, Bolivia, and Peru are recently experimenting with cooperative systems to formalize and empower informal workers. In the case of Venezuela, there are government plans to build towns and cities that spatially accommodate these cooperative units of economic production, but none has been yet constructed.

Informal Transportation

The informal transportation sector is closely tied to the informal settlement patterns of many LAC cities, and is also greatly impacted by formal and informal economic activities and their distribution within a metropolitan area. The use of informal transportation in LAC is widespread. For example, in Lima, Peru, the informal sector provided 95% of public transport in the late 1980s.[438] In a study of two informal settlement communities in Mexico City, it was found that 82 percent of residents living in Ampliación San Marco (located in the urban periphery) and 69 percent of residents living in Copilco El Bajo (located in the city center) do not utilize formal transportation networks to travel to work and home. Roughly 39 percent of Ampliación San Marco residents and 33 percent of Copilco El Bajo residents rely on an informal transportation mode to commute to work known as *pesero*—a shared van in which users pay for their portion of the journey to and from work—and 43 percent of Ampliación San Marco residents and 36 percent of Copilco El Bajo residents walk to work.[439] Thus, many informal settlement communities are not sufficiently connected to or reached by the formal transportation systems of LAC cities, and as such, residents are left to their own means to move around the city.

Recent Practices in Transportation

In some LAC cities, improvements to formal transportation systems have not only increased accessibility and mobility for residents, but have also given governments more control over vehicle emissions, improved driving and vehicle safety, expanded service coverage to include new routes and better frequency, and augmented customer service to better accomodate users. For example, before the implementation of Transmilenio in Bogotá, a bus-rapid-transit system that expanded services to numerous previously unserved areas in the city, providers of informal transportation aggressively competed for users in the urban streets, endangering pedestrians and vehicle drivers alike and adding to traffic congestion (this continues to be a common occurrence in many cities in the region). Yet through improving and formalizing the transportation system as part of the Transmilenio project, accessibility and mobility have greatly improved in Bogotá, as have pedestrian safety and vehicle emissions. At the same time, adequate attention was granted to the assimilation of informal transportation entrepreneurs and workers into the new systems, such that jobs have been preserved.

In addition to improving its bus network through the Transmilenio project, during the late 1990s and early 2000s, Bogotá added over 300 kilometers (185 miles) of bicycle-ways to the city. From 1998 to 2006, bicycling increased from 0.1 percent to 5 percent as a primary mode of transportation for Bogotá residents, and cars have decreased from 17 percent to 13 percent as a primary mode of transportation for residents.[440]

---

[438] de Soto, 1989.

[439] Wigle, 2006, p. 169.

[440] Smith, 2006.

The current propensity of many LAC residents to walk or bicycle represents an asset that planners in the region can greatly benefit from. Prioritizing the creation of infrastructure for pedestrian and bicyclers, rather than furthering expensive freeways for private cars, addresses mobility and health needs in the region in a cost-effective way for both individuals and governments, and reduces vehicle miles traveled, gas consumption, emissions pollution, and traffic accidents. Initiatives such as those in Bogotá and similar efforts in Curitiba, Brazil to create extensive systems of bicycle lanes should be emulated elsewhere in the region.

7.2. Peri-Urban Interface

Both push and pull factors have resulted in the region's mass migration of individuals and families to urban areas and a depopulation of the region's rural areas. Migrants have been pulled to urban areas in search of new economic opportunities, upgraded services, and more sophisticated life styles associated with urban living. They have simultaneously been pushed from rural areas as farming and agriculture have failed to offer viable economic livelihoods, and aid programs aimed at rural areas have not been effective. In the mid-twentieth century, state-led and non-governmental efforts were geared toward alleviating rural poverty through land reform, agricultural growth and regional development. Efforts to address the issues of peri-urban areas included the integrated rural development (IRD) projects of the 1970s that were introduced as solutions to rural poverty with a large reliance on donors, such as the World Bank. These projects proved costly and difficult to administer. In addition, resource allocation to rural areas often times took place at the expense of resources for urban areas. Some of these programs had the explicit goal of deconcentrating urban populations by attempting to revert the rural-to-urban migration patterns. These attempts proved futile, as the "push-pull" factors that prompted people to migrate to cities in the first place were hardly affected.

Much of the growth of many LAC cities is attributed to the growth in informal settlements, and/or the incorporation of rural areas into municipal boundaries. For example, between 1990 and 2000, roughly 50 percent of the growth of Mexico City was related to the creation of informal settlements, or *colonias proletarias*, and roughly 30 percent to the incorporation of rural areas into the city.[441] One of the most needed paradigm shifts in LAC and other developing countries is for formal planning systems to recognize and deal with the importance of such processes of informalization, densification, and sprawl. As urban areas grow and become more politically complex, the need for metropolitan and regional planning becomes more urgent.

A significant bulk of the informal settlements in LAC is located in the sprawling urban peripheries of the region's cities. In Tegucigalpa, Honduras, over half of the city's population lives in peri-urban areas.[442] It is also in these peripheral urban areas that most of the region's population growth has been occurring for well over the past 50 years in most of the region's countries and for nearly 100 years in some countries, such as Brazil and Peru. The growth of urban peripheral areas in LAC is due to both a growth in population and a growth in the total land area cities occupy. Mexico City, home to 19.5 million residents, or 18 percent of the country's total population, experienced population growth rates in its conurbated, mostly peripherally-located areas of 4.2 percent and 3.4 percent from 1980-1990 and 1990-2000 respectively, compared to -0.01 percent and 0.30 percent for the same time periods in the city's centrally located Federal District.[443] Similarly, the city has greatly expanded in land area. Between 1950 and 2000, Mexico City's metropolitan area expanded from 206 square kilometers to 1,400 square kilometers.[444] Through this expansion process, Mexico City has absorbed many of the area's surrounding rural municipalities.

---

[441] Wigle, 2006, p. 91.

[442] United Nations Environment Programme (2002) Geo: Global Environmental Outlook 3, http://www.unep.org/geo/geo3/english/294.htm

[443] Wigle, 2006, p. 81.

[444] Wigle, 2006, p. 85.

Like Mexico City, São Paolo, Brazil has also experienced rapid growth in its peri-urban areas. By the end of the 1990s, the annual growth rate for the metropolitan area of São Paolo had slowed to 1.7 percent, yet the annual growth rate in its peri-urban areas was 6.3 percent per year during the 1990s, and peri-urban areas increased their share of the metro area's population from 19 percent in 1990 to 30 percent in 2000.[445] Additionally, during this time period, São Paolo lost 53.4 square kilometers of green space and green coverage.[446]

The process of urbanization has resulted in entirely new metropolitan forms in Latin American and Caribbean cities.[447] Large and middle-sized cities in the region are spreading out at a remarkable pace, and in the process, engulfing surrounding towns, leading to continuous belts of settlements contained in urban areas of enormous size and population. Cities such as Mexico City, Buenos Aires, Bogota and Caracas are characterized by a pattern of urban expansion that incorporates small villages and outlying rural areas into a sprawling, complex metropolitan system.[448]

With social disinvestment in cities in LAC in recent decades, it has now become clear that many urban dwellers face issues similar to rural areas in terms of poverty and livelihood opportunities.[449] The previous focus on shrinking the urban-rural gap—which described disparities in population density, income, and infrastructure—is now one of dealing with the blurring of the rural-urban interface, which consists of a landscape with fragmented and chaotic land use patterns. Recently, one trend in the region is for migrants to cities to sell off their exurban land to wealthy urbanites due to increasing land prices only to be forced to become urban squatters or to re-establish themselves farther from the cities, in more marginalized areas.[450] Unable to gain the upward mobility to transition from rural to urban living, "people are inclined to live in the two worlds, using the rural-urban interface as a continuum."[451] In cities throughout the region, the urban periphery includes a mix of urban and rural spaces. The ambiguity of these rural-urban, and often, informal spaces cause concern as spaces continue to grow unregulated and unattended. Other settlement typologies that are proliferating are bedroom communities, edge cities and gated communities. These trends are apparent in both large (Caracas, Buenos Aires, São Paulo) and middle-sized cities (Salvador, San Jose, San Juan), as well as in many coastal areas in LAC (Puerto Vallarta, Fortaleza, etc.). These communities range from near self-sufficiency (in the case of edge cities and some gated communities) to complete functional dependence on linkages to the central city (in the case of bedroom communities).

There are multiple issues pertaining to urban planning that arise from the peripheral urban development that is increasingly dominating Latin American and Caribbean cities. Given the scarcity of available land in central urban areas and its steep price, the ability of many of the region's residents to develop land on the urban fringe is vital to their survival, yet it often creates difficulties for residents and government agencies alike. The chaotic and unplanned urban expansion of most of the region's cities has created dysfunctionalities for residents and great costs for governments to overcome.[452] Small, poor, and/or business-oriented municipal governments often succumb to the pressures of developers to adjust their urban land regulations to suit the developers' desires for profit, creating a regulatory landscape that Libertun de Libertun de Duren has called "planning à-la carte."[453]

---

[445] Torres, 2005.

[446] Torres, 2005, p 7.

[447] Qadeer, 1999, 2004.

[448] Aguilar and Ward, 2003.

[449] Zoomers, 2002, p. 69.

[450] Zoomers, 2002, p. 76.

[451] Zoomers, 2002, p. 77.

[452] Payne, 1999.

[453] Libertun de Duren, 2006.

The high costs to governments of peri-urban development are not only those related to provision of infrastructure, such as planning and constructing roads and water and sewer lines, but also long-term problems related to sustainable development more generally. Many of the peripheral urban areas of the region's cities are not well serviced by mass transit, including in cities with the most acclaimed transit systems in the region, such as Bogota, Curitiba, and Santiago. As a result of the lack of formal transit in these peri-urban areas, private cars and shared vans and automobiles are frequently used informally as a means to travel to work and home, emitting high levels of pollution and taking a heavy toll on the environment. Hence, "[e]valuation of the regional dynamics of peri-urban spaces or of the spatial configuration of changes in land use must take into account the state's role in defining urban environmental policies that promote sustainable development of local peri-urban communities."[454] In order to attain greater sustainable development of metropolitan areas, including urban centers and fringes, many scholars argue that policy support for enhancing ecosystem services, environmental protection and economic development is crucial.

In order for sustainable development to be achieved in Latin American and Caribbean cities, proper planning for the urban fringe and rural and urban areas is necessary. In planning peri-urban areas, governments, NGOs and private-sector entities must conceive of these developments as mixed use, mixed income communities with diverse housing types, transportation options and job opportunities that are well-connected to the larger metropolitan region and particularly to centers of employment.

Recent Practices in Peri-Urban Development

Some governments in LAC are making efforts to better plan peripheral urban areas in their cities. The governmental agency *Metrovivienda* of Bogotá, Colombia, is one such example of targeting land development problems along the urban fringes of the city. *Metrovivienda* initiates development by taking the first steps in the land development process to facilitate private build-out of subdivisions. The agency buys large tracks of land zoned as rural or semi-rural (paying much less than if the land were zoned urban), applies and attains permits from other governmental departments for development and puts in fundamental infrastructure, parks and communal spaces. Finally, the organization sells the parcels to developers, which commit to selling housing at affordable prices. This approach has proven successful because of the multiple benefits that arise from it: homebuilders benefit from lower land purchase costs and expedited development time, leading to savings for them, which in turn leads to saving for homebuyers. Additionally, the government benefits from avoiding the high costs of retrofitting peripheral, often informal settlements with infrastructure.[455]

7.3. Stakeholders in Informal Planning, Metropolitan Growth and Urban Form

Government

Throughout the 20th and into the 21st Century, state-led recognition of and reaction to informal settlements, and low-income and workforce housing more generally, have undergone significant shifts.[456] For most of the 20th century, planning and other state-led urban policies turned a blind eye to informal settlements and activities in Latin American and Caribbean cities. In the 1950s and 1960s, the governments of many LAC countries pursued policies aimed at the eradication and demolition of informal housing settlements and their replacement with public housing projects. This approach did not work, as it did not meet the needs of low-income city residents and as the public sector could not provide sufficient housing with public financing. During the 1970s and 1980s, governments altered their approach and pursued a strategy of on-site improvements to informal settlements, through

---

[454] Torres-Lima and Rodríguez-Sánchez, 2006, p. 194.

[455] Ferguson and Navarrete, 2003.

[456] Ward, 2005.

increasing land tenure, infrastructure, and housing investment. Yet this method was also criticized, mainly for its high financial expenditures in what essentially amounted to physically retrofitting settlements. On-site improvement strategies have also been critiqued for their project-oriented focus and failure to fundamentally change structural issues in land access and distribution, housing, capital and labor that led to the initial formation of informal settlements, focusing instead on physical symptoms of poverty but not on its structural roots. In the 1970s and 1980s, as city officials underwent the high public and private financial costs of retrofitting informal settlements—often two to four times higher than providing basic infrastructure in new development—government reactions to and relationships with informal settlements slowly began to change.

UN-HABITAT has outlined three state-led approaches to informal settlements: state provision of housing, facilitation of market provision of housing, and a combination of both, known as enabling housing markets. In LAC today, community-based upgrading is still the most prevalent form of state support for informal settlements.[457] However, starting in the 1990s, and remaining prevalent today, many governments in the region began pursuing enabling housing policies in which they outline a minimal regulatory framework to ensure the needs of the city's most vulnerable groups are met and the private sector and nongovernmental organizations contribute to housing delivery. Moreover, because the population in the region residing in informal settlements is increasing in significant numbers, politicians throughout the region have begun to see these residents as a powerful voting block. As such, occasionally there is blatant pandering to the informal communities promising services such as water or electricity that are often not delivered once the politicians are in office, serving to compound distrust in governmental bodies and encouraging informal housing communities to once again be self-reliant and self-contained. However, the increased political clout of informal settlement communities can and has led to the creation of positions and departments within government which have as one of their main purposes to regularize and service informal settlements, such as the Secretary of Housing in Rio de Janeiro.

In addition, there have been state-led efforts in the region to offer some form of subsidies for housing, usually in the form of below-market loans. Efforts have included mandatory contributions from workers' salaries, including the National Housing Trust in Jamaica (NHT), INFONAVIT in Mexico, the Law of Housing Policy (*Ley de Política Habitacional,* LPH) in Venezuela, and the Time of Service Fund Warrant (*Fundo de Tempo de Garantía de Serviços*) in Brazil.[458] These efforts have been widely criticized for their propensity to make difficult the private sector production and financing of housing and to better serve middle rather than low-income residents. The National Housing Trust in Jamaica is a state-led effort at increasing the supply of housing that was established in 1976. NHT aims to increase the country's supply of affordable housing through funding housing by a mix of contributions from private employers and personal employees. The NHT selects applicants to receive housing loans based on their income and the number of contributions they have made to the NHT, and recipients must have made 52 weekly contributions to the National Housing Trust and must not have previously received a loan from the NHT.[459] For many low-income and very low-income residents who might not earn a steady, weekly income, it is extremely difficult to make weekly contributions for a period of 52 weeks, and as such, the NHT has been critiqued for better serving middle rather than low income residents.

Community

A strong system of social ties is usually one of the most beneficial aspects of informal settlements, particularly in urban areas.[460] Community members recognize that if they were to be relocated, their social networks, so important to their wellbeing, may be severed and their quality of life may rapidly

---

[457] Wigle, 2008, p. 181.

[458] Ferguson and Navarrete, 2003.

[459] Rose, 2008.

[460] Perlman, 1976; 2005.

deteriorate. In many Latin American and Caribbean cities, planning efforts have begun to recognize the need to work with communities residing in informal settlements. For example, the *Favela-Bairro* slum upgrading program in Rio de Janeiro explicitly strives to work with the community from the outset of all phases of the program's plans and projects. While there is still some fear among residents of informal settlements of official recognition with land tenure because it can invite government control (and taxation) over what they consider to be one of the most important assets of their lives, their home, many community members have become aware of the potential benefits of working with governmental or non-governmental entities.

In order to make a realistic assessment of the future of informal settlements and informal economic and transportation systems that exists within them, it is necessary for government and non-governmental institutions to work collaboratively with communities to promote a broader understanding of the pull and push factors that influence their decisions to stay or migrate.[461] In Venezuela and Ecuador, communal councils composed of community members have been formalized and integrated into the city planning process, often times building upon the networks and social capital of established informal systems[462]. In Cuba, local revolutionary committees (*comités locales de la revolución)* are organized by blocks and function to achieve a similar end, and they have been particularly effective at disaster preparedness and post-disaster recovery in the face of hurricanes.

International and Non-Governmental Organizations

Organizations like the World Bank, the Inter-American Development Bank and UN-HABITAT have become active players in informal settlement development in LAC, bringing to the table goals that they maintain are vital to improving what are perceived as malfunctioning urban systems. These organizations control large amounts of aid money, and as a result, are able to dictate to a significant extent how and who should benefit from investments and government actions. The World Bank in particular has encouraged the decentralization of the urban planning process in the region, believing that local needs should be addressed at a local level. Theoretically this seems reasonable, and may be very effective in highly developed nations. However, as Drakakis-Smith and others have pointed out, this external control has been accompanied by the retreat of the state from investment in subsidies and welfare programs. Therefore, it has *de facto* thrown the responsibilities for welfare services upon the poor themselves.[463]

Decentralization has also given the non-governmental organizations (NGOs) a larger role in both local and national politics in LAC, as they are in a position to mediate and unite the people of the informal sector and their political representatives. In the past few decades, non-governmental organizations have come to play an enormous role in informal and formal city building processes, particularly in regards to housing and economic development. One example of the strong role NGOs are playing in formal city building in LAC is EMBARQ. Established in 2002, EMBARQ is headquartered at the World Resources Institute Center for Sustainable Transport, and operates with sponsorship from a wide-array of donors such as the Shell Foundation, USAID, and the Caterpillar Foundation. EMBARQ works through public-private partnerships with governments, non-governmental organizations, and for-profit entities to create sustainable transportation systems in cities in developing countries around the world, including LAC. EMBARQ has improved transportation networks in Mexico City and Queretaro, Mexico as well as in Porto Alegre, Brazil through introducing bus-rapid transit systems that have improved environmental sustainability and increased accessibility and mobility.[464]

---

[461] Zoomers, 2002.

[462] Irazábal and Foley, 2008.

[463] Drakakis-Smith 2000.

[464] EMBARQ, World Resources Institute, http://embarq.wri.org/en/About.aspx#

Another such example of the increasingly prominent role NGOs have undertaken in formal urban development in LAC is the *Favela-Bairro* program in Rio de Janeiro. EMBARQ and *Favela-Bairro* are emblematic of a trend in LAC for formal city planning and city building to be undertaken and executed through cross-sectoral arrangements, often spearheaded and funded by NGOs.

7.4. New Directions for Planning in Informal City Conditions

From eradication of informal settlements through demolition to attempts at upgrading settlements and formalizing land tenure, the approaches used to address rural underdevelopment, peri-urban spaces, and informal settlements have varied from city to city and decade to decade. LAC cities will sustain significant growth in the coming decades, and as such, formal city builders have to look to the informal sector as an example of community-building and perseverance in the face of scarcity. Many scholars have maintained that the informal sector offers an opportunity for community building, as long as physical and social infrastructure are in place and supported.[465] In light of the increasing impact on urban sustainability and quality of life of informal settlements and peri-urban environments, planners must find new and innovative ways of addressing planning issues in these areas. In order to fully and realistically assess the future of informal settlements and new urban forms in the region, there is a need for community involvement that recognizes the varying needs and assets of the residents of these communities and works to make them a more integrated part of the urban system through community partnerships and planning.[466]

However, there are some innovative and cost-effective planning practices that are beginning to reshape cities in Latin America and the Caribbean while improving living conditions for the poor. The examples given above of recent, innovative planning practices that address informal development in LAC have been successful in great part because of their integration of physical and social planning and their simultaneous treatment of physical and social infrastructure. They are all the more successful because of their consideration for, integration of, and responsiveness to the needs of the millions of residents throughout the region that live in informal settlements and/or partake in the informal economy.

---

[465] Turner, 1976; de Soto, 1989; Roy, 2005; Roy and AlSayyad, 2004.

[466] Irazábal, 2008; Roy and AlSayyad, 2004.

8. Planning, Spatial Structure of Cities and Provision of Infrastructure

The provision of infrastructure such as water, sewerage, transport networks, electricity and, more recently, information- communication technologies (ICT) plays an important and all-pervasive role in the sustainability of human settlements, and requires planning. However, these infrastructure elements shape the spatial structure of cities and can result in certain sections of the population becoming spatially marginalized and excluded from access to urban opportunities. Moreover, the spatial structure and degree of densification of the built environment has a major impact on urban efficiency and sustainability. Thus the compact, mixed-use and public transport-based city (also termed Smart Growth in the US.) is said to be more environmentally sustainable, efficient and equitable, but the implications for the poor living in peri-urban areas is less certain.

In both developed and developing countries, there has been a trend towards urban redevelopment through the use of mega-projects. In some cases, these involve the recycling of urban brown-field sites, and in other cases they are new developments. In both cases there is a need for a closer connection between city-wide spatial planning and mega-projects, as the latter tend to be major factors shaping the structure of cities, but often follow a technical logic with little concern for broader urban impacts. In this context a major challenge in many parts of the world, including parts of Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC), is how to respond to the phenomenon of metropolitanization.

Since funding for public service provision is so limited in LAC, local governments have been encouraging the privatization of public services. Unfortunately, the urban poor are often left out of the private and formal provision of services, because both publicly provided utilities and those supplied by the private sector are primarily concerned with appeasing the middle- and upper-classes. Higher income communities have financial resources to pay large up-front connection costs (such as water) and infrastructure upgrades (such as toll roads). The private sector has quickly realized it is not always cost effective to supply services to very poor neighborhoods, and in turn, bypasses these areas. Ironically, residents of *favelas*, *barrios*, and shantytowns across LAC typically pay significantly more for illegally utility hookups than formal service users. Reliance on illegal utility connections has left poor areas underserved and subject to unsafe, potentially deadly, and low-quality service.

The chapter briefly considers the historical development of infrastructure in LAC, contemporary infrastructure development, regional disparities in the structure of cities and their impact on the provision of infrastructure, public transportation systems, and informal settlement upgrading.

8.1. Historical Development of Infrastructure

Spanish Practices (Colonial Period)

Historically, Spain's Law of the Indies dictated Latin American cities to consist of a central plaza, which was the center of political, economic, religious, and cultural life.[467] This plaza was surrounded by a regular urban street grid. Mexico City's Zocalo is emblematic of this urban form. As the plaza developed, indigenous peoples were banished to the periphery, where no infrastructure was provided, while the inner-city was redeveloped for foreign residents and wealthy merchants.[468] Thus, from Latin America's colonial start, the continent has seen a form of spatial development that favors the interests of wealthier classes while overlooking the needs of the urban poor.

---

[467] Angotti, 1996.

[468] Godfrey, 1991.

European Design, 19th-20th Century

In the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, many Latin American cities followed a European design model, developing Baroque-style cities modeled after Haussmann's post-1848 Paris. These cities included monumental boulevards, such as the Paseo de la Reforma in Mexico City, as well as in other cities such as Buenos Aires, Rio de Janeiro, Havana, and Belo Horizonte.[469] Haussmann visions encouraged the production of formal and informal urban spaces—with the poor typically living at the edge of urban centers—that began a process of marginalizing disadvantaged populations. Physical separation was especially noticeable as elites separated themselves from African slaves and indigenous peoples.[470] This pervasive pattern of development is still present today, as many sections of large metropolises remain economically and socially divided by historic boundaries.[471]

Development patterns have reinforced historic lineages of racial and class segregation, despite rapid immigration and urbanization rates. In the late 19th and early 20th centuries, sprawling metropolitan regions—such as São Paolo and Rio de Janeiro—were inlayed with boulevards and thoroughfares that displaced significant numbers of residents in working-class neighborhoods and contributed to the rise of hillside *favelas*.[472] Economic and infrastructure modernization projects—such as highway development, redevelopment of central business districts, and other civic projects—have disrupted urban and social fabrics, physically altering cities and disrupting social support networks. In the second half of the 20th century, development projects coupled with rapid urban migration, debt-laden governments, and limited private investment produced an explosive growth of shanty towns and informal settlements throughout LAC, and has been most noticeable in primary urban centers—such as La Paz (Bolivia), Lima (Peru), Bogotá (Colombia), Santiago (Chile), Caracas (Venezuela), etc.

Infrastructural Impacts of Authoritarian Regimes in The Twentieth Century

In some LAC countries, authoritarian regimes in the 20th century invested heavily in urban infrastructure as part of modernization projects. After the "lost decade" of the 1980s, the return of democratic governments in LAC has been plagued by political instability and financial crisis, negatively affecting the construction, upgrading, and upkeep of urban infrastructure at a time when cities have rapidly expanded. Paradoxically, then, some dictatorial regimes with the least democratic practices and the worst human right violations in LAC have often been the ones that have provided the most physical infrastructure to LAC cities. These circumstances have led some people in the region to correlate dictatorial regimes with efficient government and democratic regimes with inefficient ones, undermining support for and confidence in democracy in the region. Some of the most notorious authoritarian regimes that provided infrastructure for the modernization of their countries' national capitals included Caracas under Perez Jimenez, Santiago under Pinochet, and Santo Domingo under Trujillo.

Contemporary Infrastructure Development

In the 1970s, many LAC countries began borrowing large amounts of money to fund infrastructure modernization projects. Many LAC countries believed infrastructure development was an essential step to increase national competitiveness in international markets and attract foreign investment into major urban centers. International lending institutions supported infrastructure development, and during the 1970s, over half of the funds leant by the World Bank to Latin America targeted infrastructure expansion. In particular, these semi-public funds focused on the expansion of sanitation,

---

[469] Angotti, 1996; Godfrey, 1991.

[470] Curtis, 2000.

[471] Freeman, 2002.

[472] Gevert, 2006a; Bell et al., 2005.

water, and electrical networks.[473] However, countries saddled with debt and faced with structural adjustment policies often turned to the private sector to develop and maintain infrastructure projects; this public/private partnership was especially encouraged by neoliberal policies that aimed to form more efficient and leaner governmental institutions. In turn, since the late 1980s private development has provided between 7 to 15 per cent of new infrastructure investment, and has most heavily invested in telecommunications, energy generation, and highway construction. Between 1990 and 2001, the LAC region attracted 48 per cent of all private infrastructure investment in developing countries.[474]

Cyclical patterns of government spending and privatization, however, would not last. As the global oil crisis and interest rates steadily climbed, it became harder and harder for national and local agencies to pay back loans. By the 1990s, most Latin American nations realized they could not pay back their loans, and were simultaneously unable to spend money to improve existing infrastructure during a period of rapid urbanization

Car-Oriented Development and Sprawl

Theories of modernization (see Chapter 6) and modern planning, the rise of car technology and oil exploitation, and ambitions to recreate some LAC cities in the image of some North American cities, such as Los Angeles, US., encouraged some governments to support transportation, land-use, and infrastructural projects that prioritized motorized transit. Suburban subdivision models, such as the Garden City model from the U.K. and the US., were also emulated in some LAC cities and propelled the growth of the suburbs linked with highway infrastructure, such as the case of Altamira in Caracas.

Currently, with rising levels of economic stability in LAC, banks and lending institutions have made personal loans more affordable. This has produced a tangible demand for automobiles and homes in central urban areas that take advantage of auto-oriented developments. Historically, unstable interest rates have calmed demand for autos, but a perception of economic stability and long-term growth has made financing more accessible. In 2007, Colombia, Argentina, and Venezuela registered an aggregate automobile sales increase of 46 percent with auto loans extending up to seven years.[475] Rising rates of congestion has consequently increased the value of real estate located near central business districts and transit lines. Accessibility, mobility, and proximity to public transit are increasingly important as residents in LAC cities clog transit networks with more automobiles. Interestingly, as cities grow and real estate becomes more expensive, transit systems are becoming significantly less efficient. Many regional bus routes utilize the same infrastructure as private automobiles, and bus headways increase concomitantly with automobile use. Additionally, poor transit riders with unsecure land tenure are pushed outwards as they can no longer afford inner-city proximity. This effectively ensures that riders best located to take advantage of public transit may not do so because they can afford private modes of transportation, as in the case of the transit axes in Curitiba.[476]

Infrastructure provision increases the value of land, which frequently prices out low-income residents and potential newcomers from utilizing the developed services, even against the intent of urban planers. This has contributed to an increased inability for low-income residents to find housing with adequate urban services. The risk of gentrification thus poses significant challenges to equitable urban infrastructure development. In Curitiba, Brazil, the transport axes were meant to house low- and middle-income people in apartments close to transit. The price of real estate prevented that from happening, and instead the poor live in the outskirts of the city, where land is cheaper or is appropriated through a process of squatting.[477]

---

[473] Calderon, 2004.

[474] Martimort, 2006.

[475] Kraul, 2008.

[476] Irazábal, 2005.

[477] Irazábal, 2005.

Additionally, the urban poor have suffered from automobile-centered planning as public transit often fails to take political priority. Partially due to sprawl and a culture of reliance on private automobiles, many Latin American cities historically provided transportation infrastructure that favored automobile circulation—such as road construction—over public transportation and non-motorized options.[478] This was particularly true of countries that are relatively wealthy and/or have significant petroleum resources, such as Brazil, Mexico, and Venezuela.

Neoliberalism and its Discontents

Without adequate and stable funding sources, LAC nations and cities have neglected to upkeep infrastructure, and are seeking methods to limit budget expenditures and infrastructural responsibilities. Neoliberal policies answered this need by purportedly shifting economic responsibilities to private firms. Privatization was heavily driven by the need to not only free-up tax dollars, but to appease international lending institutions that demanded more efficient government operations and market control of urban resources.[479] This was especially prevalent in Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, and Mexico as many highway and infrastructure products during the 1990s became private undertakings. However, significant problems have plagued this seemingly efficient provision of infrastructure. The lack of efficient regulatory agencies and institutional conflicts of interest have been frequent problems, as government regulators charged with monitoring privatization contracts are often not inclined to enforce contractual compliance.[480]

Neoliberalism also promises privatization and deregulation will beget a stronger democratic society that is more efficient and responsive to civic demands. However, changes in political party leadership at the local level have not necessarily produced better urban investment strategies. Developing nations that have emerged out of a dictatorial rule—such as the Dominican Republic after the assassination of Trujillo, and Brazil after the 1985 democratic transition—have struggled to produce coherent and lasting political bodies capable of maintaining long-term planning agendas. Lack of long-term continuity has lasting physical consequences on urban development, as it makes it difficult for politicians to pursue planning programs that efficiently and equitably distribute infrastructural funds.

8.2. Spatial Structure of Cities and Provision of Infrastructure

Regional Disparities

In many LAC countries, there is great regional disparity regarding the level and quality of urban infrastructure. In general, coastal urban areas and the lower plains of the Andean countries have better levels of urban infrastructure than interior regions and the high plains of the Andean countries. Sometimes regional differences within the same country can be abysmal. There are also huge differences between urban and rural areas, and between primary and secondary urban areas. In Brazil, the poor areas of the northeast are worlds apart from the wealthier cities of the south and southeast (Rio de Janeiro, São Paulo, Curitiba, and Porto Alegre), prompting many to speak about "the Brazils," in plural. On occasions, infrastructure investments—roads in particular—have damaged fragile ecosystems; this has been the case with agricultural projection in northwestern Peru, and with logging and development efforts in the Amazon.

Infrastructure provision and funding in LAC has been funneled into large urban area, leaving peri-urban, informal, and rural areas with limited infrastructural development. The management of urban infrastructure provision and maintenance has also been used as an instrument of controlling the

---

[478] Angotti, 1996; Blevis, 1999.

[479] Engel, 2003.

[480] Engel, 2003.

push-pull factors of rural to urban migration. For example, both capitalist and socialist regimes in Venezuela have deprived major cities from needed infrastructure development or upgrades in an attempt to discourage migrants from remaining in the cities. It was hoped this "solution" would induce migrants to move back to their place of origin. Apart from being ineffective, these purposeful disinvestments in urban infrastructure have proven perverse and have had lasting negative implications for the urban poor.

In LAC, the geography of class and race/ethnicity greatly overlap, and has placed Afro-descendents and indigenous peoples at a disadvantage regarding infrastructure provision and maintenance. In the aggregate, this power differential has produced a split in terms of urban service maintenance and delivery, wherein the rich and higher-income classes enjoy services and better living conditions, while a greater number of the poor and working-class inhabit informal urban and rural areas with little or marginal access to urban services. A historic lineage of class and racial disinvestment has prolonged the inadequate provision of transportation and public services to marginal and racialized places, and contributed to an inequitable divide. Addressing this division will, however, be instrumental in building more sustainable and lasting cities and communities.

8.3. New Focuses, Different Investments

Newer investments in urban infrastructure in LAC has largely concentrated in 4 areas: public transportation, slum upgrading, sanitation and water provision and management (covered in chapter 7), and tourism.

Social Implications of a Lack of Access to Public Services

Without adequate access to public services, the poor are marginalized in LAC societies, and this exacerbates social inequalities already present there. For example, studies conducted in Argentina have shown that by providing access to clean water and better sanitation, the infant mortality rate of an area drops by 8%.[481] While this number may not appear to be large, when accounted for across an entire region, it is very significant. The lack of access to public services has also prevented poor areas from having any opportunity to improve their economic situation. Areas with access to public services are prime locations for future economic development, because being hooked up to a regional network providing efficient sanitation, electricity, and water is very desirable for companies looking for new areas to locate to.

Aside from the obvious benefits, having access to services can increase the social mobility of a marginalized people. For example, if a previously overlooked area is finally connected to the regional infrastructure network, residents may gain access to a greater number of jobs as access to public services induces localized economic activity and investment. If these settlements had at least basic services for schools or community centers, children would be able to do better in school (as many kids study by electrical lights rather than candlelight) while participating in alternative social programs. Furthermore, efficient public services increase the morale of a community, because their improved living standards give them an overall better feeling about life.[482] LAC's relatively slow economic growth during the 1990s can be greatly attributed to the region's struggle to provide services to urbanizing areas, and future planning must ensure services do not encumber future growth.

Inequitable access to regional transportation networks has impacted the urban poor, as many transport planning decisions have encouraged sprawl and a reliance on private automobiles. Auto-dominant urban forms have had significant adverse consequences for the urban poor, who are unlikely to own cars and use heavily funded transit resources. Many slums and informal settlements are located along peripheral urban areas, and the lack of efficient, regional public transit infrastructure means poor people are increasingly isolated from central business districts and other employment centers. Without

---

[481] Calderon and Serven, 2003.

[482] Calderon and Serven, 2004a.

ready access to gainful employment, physical distance serves to entrench a cycle of poverty and disinvestment.[483] Despite this, Latin America's residents spend up to 40% of their income on transportation, and spend significant parts of their day commuting to and from work. In São Paulo, for example, the typical commuter from a poor area spends more than two hours per day traveling.[484]

Auto-dependency has adversely affected health and wellbeing in LAC cities. Pollution from transportation accounts for 70 percent of total pollution in most cities; one-third of children have unhealthy levels of lead in their blood due to automobile emissions; and there is a high rate of pedestrian accidents, including deaths.[485] To illustrate these adverse impacts, residents of Mexico City breathe the equivalent of two packs of cigarettes per day, and the death rate for pedestrian accidents in Colombia is higher than its civil war.[486] Air pollution is further exacerbated in Latin America's high-altitude cities, such as Bogotá, Quito, and La Paz due to topographic elements that limit air circulation.[487] The urban poor suffer disproportionate impacts from air pollution, as they do not have the resources to own cars, but also work in outdoor environments adjacent to choking pollution—as street vendors, construction workers, and waste collectors.[488]

Public Transportation Systems

In sprawling megacities in LAC, the majority of the poor and working class must rely on public transportation and non-motorized transport modes. In Rio de Janeiro, for example, nearly 67 per cent of all trips utilize public transportation, 20 per cent are by foot, and 11 per cent are by automobile. Many of these users live in lower income areas—especially the Baixada Fluminense, a large area located north of Rio—and are geographically separated from major employment centers. Low-income transit users may spend more than one forth of their incomes on fares, while enduring commutes ranging from 2.5 to 4 hours per day.[489] One reason many developing megacities have significant congestion issues, despite high levels of transit use, is physical topography. Limited land availability, informal housing settlements, and planning practices that prioritize real estate returns restrict the development of large transit projects, such as dedicated busways or above-grade light rail lines.[490] Successful transit initiatives in LAC often utilize the infrastructural flexibility of bus rapid transit (BRT). Originated in Curitiba, Brazil in the 1970s, BRT programs provide a network of express bus lanes, with efficient and comfortable boarding stations and buses.[491] A key aspect that makes BRT efficient as a form of mass transit is that the buses travel along a designated right of way, usually in the center of large boulevards, clear of automobile traffic and other obstructions.

The grandiose Baroque boulevards of some LAC cities that plowed through neighborhoods in a foregone era, today provide much of the physical surface space for sustainable BRT lanes and bicycle routes. Given limited physical space, TransMileno in Bogotá, Colombia, utilized medians of large and medium boulevards to implement a bus rapid transit system (BRT) that significantly improved accessibility and mobility within the metro region. The BRT system was developed in phases (still on-going) that enabled the operating agency to quickly learn how to improve system circulation. Some

---

[483] Blevis, 1999.

[484] Wright, 2001.

[485] Flora, 2001; Wright, 2001.

[486] Wright, 2001.

[487] Wright, 2001.

[488] Wright, 2001.

[489] Rebelo, 2008.

[490] Rebelo, 2008.

[491] Wright, 2001.

routes have headways (or arrival frequency) of 13 seconds during peak hours.[492] Another bus rapid transit system, Transantiago in Santiago, Chile, has attempted to model itself on the successes of Bogotá and Curitiba. However, the metro operators recently realized their unprecedented plans to develop and integrate 200km (125miles) of dedicated bus lanes with metro transit hubs will be difficult to attain.[493] Transit planners and policy makers in Santiago attempted to build their system too rapidly without considering the implications of long-range planning; routes were distributed for optimal timing, not for the daily needs of transit users.[494] Some LAC cities are also moving beyond motorized transportation by providing bicycle networks and safe pedestrian environments that the poor, due to their low car ownership rate, disproportionately benefit from. The most notable example is Bogota's extensive system of bicycle routes.[495]

Rapidly densifying cities are beginning to consider developing or rehabilitating subway and light-rail systems. As noted, rapid bus lines in Curitiba and Bogota have very short headways during peak hours. Adding more buses to already extremely crowded lines could have the effect of reducing service quality—the roadway capacity of the bus lane would actually be surpassed. Bogotá and Curitiba have even gone so far as to introduce bi-articulated buses capable of carrying 270 passengers, and Bogota's rapid system has been reported to move 25,000 people per hour (one direction). Curitiba's system, while also crowded during peak hours, has been capable of moving 11,000 people per peak hour (one direction). Despite technological innovations, such as passenger queue platforms that reduce boarding/alight times, BRT systems are challenged with meeting demand. Light-rail and subway systems can significantly increase capacity of fixed transit lines, as they provide substantially more person capacity during peak hours (for example, a 4 car train totalling approximately 360 ft. can hold over 525 passengers).[496] The capacity gains of light-rail and subway are derived from their total capacity gains during peak hours, but require substantially more capital investments than BRT to purchase trains, lay fixed tracks, and build a complex and unmovable, and hence inflexible, electrification infrastructure. LAC cities have delivered BRT systems at a cost of $1-3 million/km, as compared to $90-$100million/km for underground systems. In LAC, all BRT systems recover all of their operating costs from passenger revenues.[497] Importantly, many of these systems have flat fares, so that poor residents commuting from the outskirts pay minimal amounts.[498] Some cities, such as Curitiba, have concentrated new residential development near BRT lines, which reduces the cost of providing other infrastructure such as water, sewage and electricity.[499]

Subways can provide cities with good transit solution in central business districts where established surface infrastructure and high weekday densities can attract significant transit users. However, given the increased capital and construction costs of rail lines, it is unlikely that cities in LAC can build extensive rail networks without high rates of subsidization. It has been estimated that Curitiba's rapid bus network cost less than 1% of the construction costs of a subway, but such a low figure is probably not representative of all cities, especially given the wide range of infrastructure conditions throughout LAC.[500] With this is mind, it is unclear if an equitable distribution of rail services would be possible. Rio's rail line to Zona Sul, for example, serves relatively affluent transit users rather than low-income communities. Moreover, metro operators have an incentive to capture middle-class riders with more socially palatable train systems. Low-income transit users are captive

---

[492] Transportation Research Board, 2006a.

[493] *The Economist*, 2008a.

[494] *The Economist*, 2008a.

[495] Flora, 2001, p. 400.

[496] Harkness, 2003.

[497] Carolini, 2005.

[498] Wright, 2001; Carolini, 2005.

[499] Wright, 2001, p. 11.

[500] Moisés and Martinez-Alier, 1980.

patrons that take any form of public transit out of necessity, while middle- and high-income people must be convinced.

In an effort to reduce transportation costs and to increase the efficiency of transit networks, many LAC countries have entered into partnerships with private firms. Build-operate-and-transfer contracts have been awarded with the premises that private firms have more incentive to maintain their projects, be better managers, equitably serve all users, and only invest in economically feasible projects.[501] Private firms that adhere to these traits can produce significant savings for the public, but will only do so under the watchful eye of functioning regulatory bodies. Many infrastructure construction and maintenance projects are privatized when governing bodies are under financial pressure to reduce subsidies and limit public expenditures. Following a "privatize now, regulate later" approach has, however, proven problematic as underdeveloped and unspecific contracts ultimately force contract renegotiations.[502] Cumulatively, this can cost municipalities more than the public-provision of the service or project, especially in highway projects. Without variable term contracts for operational flexibility, firm budget and contractual constraints, and an independent regulatory body, public/private infrastructure investment will continue to be an appealing, yet difficult sell.

Informal Settlement Upgrading

Informal settlements in LAC increasingly expand to accommodate more residents, but often develop on marginal land that makes infrastructure provision difficult. Without planning incentives to maintain land-uses, secure land tenure, and provide a state presence in *favelas*, settlement upgrading has been very challenging to implement. Many municipalities in LAC are, however, earnestly addressing infrastructure shortages through innovative policy and planning frameworks. One of the most well-known slum upgrading program is *Favela-Barrio* in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. Over several phases, the program has been able to maintain community involvement in the project by retaining neighborhood residents, rather than displacing them during redevelopment. *Favela-Barrio* encourages citizen participation to select infrastructure intervention projects, social services, and employment programs. In this way, residents are given an opportunity to empower themselves, and determine what assets their neighborhoods need to develop.[503] Additionally, the program includes components of community development, sanitation, environment education, and support for the regularization of irregular settlements.

Without a continuous state or municipal presence in *favelas*, demands for public services—such as water, waste removal, and sanitation—have been fulfilled by private entrepreneurs. Poor residents often pay significant amounts of money for services; informal water vendors can charge slum residents "10 to 20 times the price paid by connected households with regular service," and this disparity can be even more pronounced depending on local conditions.[504] Quantitative studies indicate that often times the very poor have a willingness to pay as they want safer services—such as safe electricity, drinking water, and waste disposal—and understand formal service connections as a step towards community regularization. Indeed, formal connections can be the first step towards securing land tenure, and can be instrumental in obtaining access to other social services.[505] However, a significant obstacle that prevents many informal settlements from being served by providers is initial connection costs. These costs, especially if they are mandatory and lack subsidies, are significant obstacles to integrating informal customers, particularly when very high (especially for water delivery). It is also interesting to note that formalizing infrastructure for slum residents usually encompasses a transition between informal to formal privatization.

---

[501] Engel, 2003.

[502] Engel, 2003.

[503] Brakarz and Aduan, 2004.

[504] Estache, 2001, p. 1185.

[505] Estache, 2001.

Tourism

Tourism has become a means of attracting private development in burgeoning metropolises. Curitiba has undertaken an extensive marketing campaign to produce a branded identity of sustainability and "green" design. The city has also erected "postcard" projects designed to attract visitors.[506] Other cities market large-scale infrastructure and cultural events, such as in the *Sambodromo* for Carnival parades in Rio de Janeiro for tourist consumption.[507] However, attracting tourist development often prompts cities to abandon environmental or cultural standards, especially for the development of beach, port, and airport infrastructure. Some regions, such as the Caribbean and tropical Atlantic and Pacific coasts, have also become tourist destinations for "sun, sand, sea, sex, and service," which has significant social impacts on local residents.[508] Lastly, important religious sites also induce tourism in some LAC cities, such as the Virgin of Guadalupe Basilica in Mexico City, which atracts national and international pilgrimages.

8.4. Impact of Infrastructure Provision on Urbanization Patterns

Infrastructure provision plays a significant role in determining urban spatial structure and how services can be accessed in differing contextual settings. Infrastructure provision is a major element in master planning processes and weighs heavily in public and private decision making scenarios. Usually transportation and land-uses are considered in tandem, whereby major transportation routes are envisioned with the greatest densities, height, and mixed-use of building structures. This is especially true for master plan development undertaken in Curitiba and other Brazilian cities.

Infrastructure provision increases the value of land, which frequently makes it economically difficult for low-income people to live adjacent to regional transit opportunities. Infrastructure provision can thus cause processes of gentrification, as has happened in LAC projects of renovation of historic centers (e.g., Lima, San Juan), even against the intent of urban plans. The transit axes in Curitiba, for example, were designed to house low- and middle-income people in apartments close to transit lines. Real estate prices prevented this from happening, and instead the poor have only found affordable housing on the outskirts of the city, where marginal land is cheaper or more readily appropriated through squatting.

In addition to the demand for cars induced by road construction, increased economic stability in LAC in recent years has enabled banks and credit institutions to make larger car loans for longer periods of time. This has produced an increased demand for automobiles in urbanizing cities, and will further tax the region's infrastructure.

8.5. Impact of Different Built Densities and Urban Form on Infrastructure Provision and Overall Sustainability, Efficiency and Inclusiveness of Cities in Different Contexts

Historic LAC urban areas are of moderate density, mixed uses, and have pedestrian accessibility and multi-modal transportation, such as the historic centers of San Jose, Quito, San Juan, Rosario, etc. The virtues of these urbanization patterns that provide infrastructure while promoting sustainability, efficiency, and inclusiveness are being rediscovered in the North (US., Canada, and Europe) through urban design models that advocate "Smart Growth," "New Urbanism," or "New Traditionalism." Mixed use and multi-modal urbanization patterns are sustainable because they attempt to manage land-uses for current and future needs through inclusive planning practices. This model also emphasizes an efficient retrofit and redevelopment of urban land, rather than plotting peri-urban land

---

[506] Sánchez, 1996, 1997; Irazábal, 2005.

[507] Broudehoux, 2001.

[508] Campbell, S. 1999.

for new development. Combining mixed-use, multi-modal, and efficient development creates the potential to provide adequate and affordable housing for all segments of the population.

However, newer urban form models are sprouting in many LAC countries and cities, such as segregated urban uses, bedroom communities, gated communities, sprawling subdivisions, edge cities, and mega-projects, rate more poorly in terms of sustainability, efficiency, and inclusiveness. These low-density models are unsustainable and inefficient because they require municipalities to develop even more infrastructure at higher costs on a per capita basis. Usually, the models are non-inclusive because they are designed to exclude low-income people, either through armed security patrols or physical barricades that privatize urban space.[509]

8.6. Government Role in the Provision of Public Services: Institutional and Managerial Arrangements

Public services in Latin America are provided by municipalities, and include sewage and garbage collection, electricity distribution, and the provision of clean water and cooking gas. Access to public services is taken for granted in many first world countries and also in wealthier neighborhoods in LAC; however, many people in the region are forced to go without many of these basic needs due to a lack of infrastructure. For instance, 58 million Latin Americans do not have access to clean drinking water, and 137 million lack access to adequate sanitation.[510]

Governments with scarce resources often choose to invest in infrastructure that can generate further investment from the private sector and beget economic opportunities—job creation, sales, and property taxes. Fiscalization of land-uses and development projects has produced intra-city competition to attract investment. This race often produces an economic and environment "race to the bottom," whereby cities reduce environmental and labor controls, taxes, and other economic gains to win over a company vis-à-vis other cities. The "zero-sum" game prevents regional and national cooperation and planning between cities, and instead deprives all participants. More progressive governments engage in non-traditional managerial relationships, such as cross-sectional collaboration, that have produced positive results. Different managerial methods are briefly described below.

Privatization

Since funding for providing public services is so limited in LAC, local governments have been encouraging the privatization of public services, with over half of all services in Latin America being supplied by the private sector.[511] Governments faced with financial problems have seen the private sector as an answer to their monetary problems, and have efficiently turned over many aspects of municipal services—such as roadway construction and maintenance to public transit operations—to private firms.[512] Unfortunately, the urban poor do not often benefit from the privatization of services, as private firms have the primary objective of appeasing the middle- and upper-classes who have the resources and political leverage to exert influence and control.513 Private firms are often unwilling to supply services to very poor neighborhoods, as shantytowns and informal settlements are not viewed as profitable markets. Given this outlook, attempts to privatize public services have provoked social and political opposition, as well as street protests. Many low-income individuals and communities understand privatization as a medium that promotes inequality rather than equity.

---

[509] Libertun de Libertun de Duren, 2006; Salcedo and Torres., 2004.

[510] Calderon and Serven, 2003.

[511] Calderon and Serven, 2004a.

[512] Calderon and Serven, 2004a.

[513] Martimort, 2006.

Public-private-nonprofit partnerships

Public-private partnerships have been tried with varying levels of success in LAC counties and cities for infrastructural and service provision. These partnerships hold great potential for ameliorating the deficiencies of urban service provision and maintenance. As discussed in Chapter 6, solid waste management is a semi-organized field that could especially take advantage of partnerships, as informal waste collectors can significantly increase the efficiency of waste systems through formal integration. Transportation systems in LAC have also registered dramatic user increases through strategic partnerships whereby private firms manage everything from single buses that move hundreds of people to regional transit lines that transport millions.[514] For these partnerships to be effective, however, more political, technical, and economic support needs to be provided, especially for small firms or organizations working in underserved areas.

Alternative managerial models

Community organizations through LAC are undertaking projects to mobilize the delivery of vital goods and services. Cooperatives can provide cost-effective service provision, and can run at a community rather than metropolitan level. One example of this is the cooperative non-profit water and sanitation provider Cosmol in Montero, Bolivia. All of the organizations customers have voting power, can audit the organization's finances, and can be elected for management positions.[515] Similarly, cooperative networks have developed for waste collectors through LAC, and have been able to negotiate higher recycling rates for their members (see Chapter 6).

Metropolitan and regional planning

Despite urbanization and settlement patterns, there is still a tendency to concentrate planning efforts and resources in central, or core, cities of growing metropolitan areas. This concentration of technological expertise and funding has encouraged infrastructure and social polarization, as only specific areas—typically formalized spaces—are receiving investment. Curitiba, for example, has heavily invested in the city's municipal services and transportation network, and in turn, negative externalities—such as toxic production facilities and informal settlements—have been pushed into nearby cities.[516] The imperative for metropolitan and regional planning is thus growing, as congestion, the lack of affordable housing, and formalization efforts affect nearly all physical and social elements of metropolises. Long-term planning efforts are thus needed, as the growth rates of informal settlements and peri-urban development show no signs of decline.[517]

Cross-sectoral collaboration

In addition to regional integration of planning efforts, more attention needs to be paid to the integration of political, fiscal, social, legal, and participatory currents within planning frameworks. Securing a broad array of support for planning projects can ensure effective implementation strategies are deployed, and can also serve as examples of good management practices. As mentioned earlier, the *Favela-Bairro* program has become a case study, as the program addresses a multitude of issues through an innovative policy framework. Program monitoring and evaluation are also essential components of cross-sectoral programs, as long-term relations and project viability require efficient staff and policy paradigms that produce tangible and lasting results.

---

[514] Transportation Research Board, 2005b.

[515] Inter American Development Bank, 2005.

[516] Irazábal, 2005.

[517] Perlman, 2006.

8.7. Information and Communication Technologies for Development (ICT4D)

Planners also have to pay increased attention to the opportunities of providing infrastructure for information and communication technologies to aid development goals (ICT4D). History has shown that ICTs such as the telegraph, telephone and Internet have played an important role in national development. In both developing and advanced economies, studies have found evidence of a correlation between telecommunications infrastructure (especially mainline telephones) and macro-level economic development, although the direction of causality remains unclear[518]. A strong correlation has also been found between the UNDP's Human Development Index and the Networked Economy Index[519].

The desire to enjoy these advantages is evident in the national communication policies of developing countries, as well as the programs of several international development agencies, all of which seek to harness the potential of information and communication technologies (ICTs) for the transformation of their economies. Indeed, the view of ICTs as crucial to urban development is so strong that access to ICTs is becoming a component or even indicator of poverty. In South America, efforts are underway to develop a measure of digital poverty, "a lack of the basic capabilities needed to participate in the information society"[520]. There are two issues of relevance here: digital divides in terms of the availability of ICT infrastructure, and digital inequalities in terms of the ability of populations to make use of the infrastructure in ways that enhance their lives. In developed countries, the positive influences of ICTs on growth were experienced only after a certain minimum threshold of ICT density had been achieved, a level that was close to universal service[521]. Thus universal service can be considered a basic platform for the achievement of both macro and micro level economic development – both digital divides and digital inequalities are important gaps to narrow.

Compared to earlier technologies, mobile phones have become one of the most accessible two-way ICT tools in developing countries. In the Latin American region, fixed line penetration stands at about 18% in 2008, while mobile phone penetration is over 65%[522]. This growth has been facilitated by privatization and liberalization of the telecommunications industry, which has encouraged competition, innovative pricing strategies, and reduction in user costs. Poor people favor mobile telephony not just because it is easier to get connected, or because of the ability to control cost, but also because for low-volume users, the average call tariff is lower than that for a fixed line when monthly fees and connection charges are taken into account. Despite this, even mobile phone services are unaffordable for most of the Latin American population[523], leading to calls for more creative strategies to reduce cost and stimulate demand from low-volume prepaid users. Additionally, market concentration threatens to stall the progress being made in the industry[524]. Internet access in the region is about 24%[525], and broadband access, while growing at about 40% per annum, is still less than 4%[526].

---

[518] e.g., Pohjola, 2001, 2002; Roller and Waverman, 2001; Waverman, Meschi and Fuss, 2005; Saunders, Warford, and Wellenius, 1994; Schreyer, 1999.

[519] Lanvin and Qiang, 2004.

[520] Barja and Gigler, 2006, p.16.

[521] Bedi, 1999; Roller and Waverman, 2005.

[522] Budde Comm, 2008.

[523] Barrantes, Galperin, Agüero, and Molinari, 2007

[524] Mariscal and Rivera, 2006.

[525] Internet World Stats, 2008.

Telecommunications infrastructure is unevenly distributed, between and within countries, with rural areas being the most deprived. Public access ICT venues (telecenters, cybercafés, and payphones) are therefore an important means of access in rural and other poor communities[527]. To see the desired results from ICT application to development problems, a holistic approach is required that addresses issues in the infrastructure, human resource, and policy arenas[528]. Analyses conducted on a variety of ICT, economic and human development indicators showed that per capita GDP alone was a large and significant predictor of ICT development, indicating that ICT divides are in fact, a function of the larger development divide[529]. Furthermore, improvements in infrastructure and policy environments *together* led to more significant positive relationships between ICTs and development, than improvement in any one factor alone. Thus areas such as the political will to move in new directions and commit resources to the process, building appropriate institutions to support e-commerce and other ICT applications; designing appropriate content and services, availability of adequately trained human resources; instituting rigorous monitoring and evaluation systems would all need attention[530].

8.8. Conclusion

In most LAC cities, basic infrastructure is not equally distributed. Due to historical patterns of development and the massive population growth of cities in recent decades, large numbers of poor urban residents lack basic services, such as sanitation, water, and electricity. In addition, poor residents often live at metropolitan fringes that lack efficient rapid public transit, and require arduous multi-hour commutes to and from work. Despite the evidence that suggests low-income users will pay for urban services, private and public providers often cannot recover fees to cover construction and maintenance fees. In order to build or upgrade slum infrastructure, government subsides or financing programs are often required. In the transportation arena, partial privatization and public-private partnerships are having some success.[531] Some primary cities, such as Bogota, and some smaller and newer cities, most notably Curitiba and Porto Alegre, have benefited from long-range planning and have grown in a more sustainable, equitable manner. LAC planners also have to pay increased attention to the opportunities of providing infrastructure for information and communication technologies to aid development goals (ICT4D), which have proven to ameliorate poverty.

---

[526] Budde Comm, 2008.

[527] Regulatel, 2006.

[528] Gerster and Zimmermann, 2003.

[529] Rodriguez and Wilson, 2000; Wilson, 2004

[530] Gerster and Zimmerman, 2003; Guslain, Qiang, Lanvin, Minges and Swanson, 2006; Mansell, 2001; Pigato, 2001; Schware, 2005; Wilson, 1996.

[531] Rebelo, 2000.

9. The Monitoring and Evaluation of Urban Plans

Without adequate knowledge, skills, and capacity to monitor and evaluate plans, urban planning institutions and practices are placed at a disadvantage. Planners and related governmental, private and non-governmental entities find it difficult to argue that their work is having a positive impact on urban livelihood if there is uncertainty or a lack of information about the effectiveness or efficiency of their interventions.[532] Over the past decade, as urban planning has re-emerged in many Latin America and Caribbean countries as a viable and effective vehicle to improve cities, the need has grown for monitoring and evaluation methodologies that can adequately assess the impact of urban planning measures. Thus, in order for planning interventions to succeed and for planning to remain an effective and valued practice in the LAC region, comprehensive and appropriate means of monitoring and evaluating plans are required. Indeed, in the past decade, many LAC countries have implemented successful monitoring and evaluation practices. These practices help shed light on key issues and concerns in monitoring and evaluating plans and signal trends in monitoring and evaluation in the LAC region.

This Chapter examines plan monitoring and evaluation (M&E) in the Latin American and Caribbean region. It offers recent examples of plan monitoring and evaluation practices and trends in LAC cities and countries as well as those occurring on a regional scale. Throughout the Chapter, specific issues and concerns arising from plan monitoring and evaluation in the region are highlighted, and instances in which the M&E of urban plans has been successful are identified.

9.1. Plan Monitoring and Evaluation

As discussed in this report (in Chapter 2 and throughout), planning is not an activity that is explicitly engaged in all LAC cities, regions or countries. Hence, the extent to which monitoring and evaluation of urban plans is carried out in LAC varies widely. However, many LAC experts have demonstrated that there is a growing trend in the region for countries and cities to engage in M&E processes. In 2005, the World Bank partnered with the Inter-American Development Bank to host a conference on monitoring and evaluation systems in eleven LAC countries. Based on their experience from the conference and further research, the World Bank confirms that there is a rise in recent years in M&E practices in many LAC countries:

> *Many governments in the LAC region have gained an increased understanding of the value of monitoring and evaluation to help both governments and donors alike better understand what public investments and interventions work well, which do not, and the reasons why.[533]*

The World Bank describes trends in M&E practices in Latin America and the Caribbean as achieving substantial progress in strengthening and institutionalizing M&E systems: "a growing number of LAC countries are initiating efforts to strengthen and systematize their M&E functions."[534] The growing practice of monitoring and evaluation of plans in LAC countries is a trend that has been noticed also by planning professionals in the region. Manuel Fernando Castro, Head of Evaluation for the National Planning Department of Colombia notes, "Truly the stars and the planets have aligned in

---

[532] Seasons, 2003.

[533] Burdescu et al., 2005.

[534] Burdescu, et al., 2005, p.4.

terms of interest in this subject [institutionalizing M&E systems], both within countries and the international community. This is an exceptional window of opportunity."[535]

Like the planning systems and planning practices of different LAC countries and cities, the systems employed in the LAC region to monitor and evaluate plans are also quite diverse. The World Bank notes that there is no single M&E system that is the most prevalent in the LAC region: "It was evident from the country experiences presented that there is no single 'destination' for countries in terms of what a well-performing M&E system looks like."[536] The World Bank describes this variety of M&E systems in LAC countries as a mix of performance-based mechanisms and evaluation-based mechanism: "Some countries stress a system of performance indicators, while others focus on carrying out evaluations (program reviews or rigorous impact evaluations)… some countries have created a whole-of-government approach driven by finance or planning ministries, others are more focused on sector M&E systems."[537] Thus, monitoring and evaluation of plans is an increasing practice in LAC countries, yet there is no uniform M&E system that is most widely used in the region.

9.2. Monitoring and Evaluation to Inform Plan Formulation

M&E practices in LAC help better inform the formulation of plans and public policies through providing data and other pertinent information to aid the planning process. Through providing a source of up-to-date and place-based information, on-going M&E practices can greatly assist in providing governments and other decision-making entities with highly valuable information to help guide planning decisions and actions. In addition, when M&E practices are not explicitly tied to any one plan or program but instead occur as part of a continual monitoring and evaluation activities, the acquired information can be used to meet a wide array of planning and policy-making functions.

The increasing M&E practice in LAC already made inroads in aiding plan formulation in various countries in the region. For instance, the monitoring and evaluation of housing programs in Brazil conducted by Xavier and Magalhães has helped elucidate key issues pertaining to plan formation in the region.[538] Based on an assessment of national and municipal programs for social housing, obstacles are examined that currently face many LAC countries in developing plans and policy responses to spontaneous settlements. One challenge to plan formulation that is considered characteristic of many recent interventions in the housing arena in LAC countries is the government's decentralized approach in dealing with housing issues. A proposed solution to meet this challenge is for private and public sectors to work together in formulating and implementing urban intervention programs. For example, in order to attract the private investment that is needed to build housing, municipalities should simplify planning and building procedures. Another suggestion to overcome difficulties resulting from governmental decentralization in urban issues is for plans, particularly those related to housing and transportation, to be formulated as part of the agenda of the federal government in addition to that of state and local governments. The evaluation of housing programs in Brazil also highlights the need for further training of all levels of governmental officials and professionals in the housing and transportation fields. Indeed, various other LAC experts have underscored the need for efforts that are specifically focused on training governmental officials and professionals as a key step in establishing M&E processes that can ultimately better assist LAC countries and cities in formulating plans.[539]

---

[535] Burdescu, et al., 2005.

[536] Burdescu, et al., 2005, p.3

[537] Burdescu, et al., 2005.

[538] Xavier and Magalhães, 2003.

[539] Acioly, 2007.

9.3. Recent Practices in Monitoring and Evaluation to Inform Plan Formulation

A recent trend in monitoring and evaluation practices related to plan formation in LAC countries is for universities to undertake some or all of the M&E processes. In 2007, the University of the West Indies (UWI) in Jamaica began to monitor the health of coral reefs in the Bahamas, Belize and Jamaica as part of a pilot project called the Main-Streaming Adaptation to Climate Change Project. The Caribbean Coastal Data Centre at the Centre for Marine Sciences helped manage the project, and selected strengthening climate and coral reef monitoring as one of the project's key objectives from the outset of the project, demonstrating a growing understanding of and appreciation for M&E practices in the LAC region. The pilot project was determined to be successful both in its ability to monitor the coral reefs and to utilize the collected information to better create future plans and policies, particularly plans relating to tourism and sustainable development. Due to its success in the pilot phase, the University of the West Indies initiated a regional monitoring project of coral reefs for countries in the Eastern Caribbean and Tobago.[540]

As the UWI coral reef monitoring project in Jamaica demonstrates, M&E practices can serve to meet a variety of purposes and provide feedback helpful in informing a myriad of urban planning, policy and development decisions. Monitoring coral reef not only determines the health of the reef itself, it also is an indicator of the extent to which development on Caribbean islands is occurring in a sustainable way and without damage to the natural environment. Moreover, when information is obtained from M&E activities conducted by a university or a third-party agency, rather than a governmental agency, the information has the potential to be more widely used and used for a greater variety of purposes due to its reduced tendency of being associated with any one sector or purpose.

The cross-sectoral and cross-thematic M&E partnership between the University of the West Indies, the Centre for Marine Sciences and the Jamaican Government is an example of a recent trend in the LAC region to conduct M&E activities through partnering across sectors and agencies. Furthermore, the Jamaican example highlights the growing understanding of the value of monitoring and evaluation practices and the progress being made towards standardizing M&E in many LAC countries.

Regionally-Based Approaches

Another trend in monitoring and evaluation practices in Latin America and the Caribbean is for M&E activities to be undertaken and managed at a regional level. The Caribbean Community (CARICOM) Secretariat has performed monitoring and evaluation activities in many Caribbean nations. The organization was created in 1973, and is headquartered in Georgetown, Guyana. The mission of CARICOM is to provide dynamic leadership and service in partnership with community institutions and groups, toward the attainment of a viable, internationally competitive and sustainable community with improved quality of life for all. Four of the organization's ten main functions are related to M&E activities in Caribbean member states: to initiate, organize and conduct studies; to collect, store and disseminate relevant information to member states; to provide, on request, technical assistance to national authorities to facilitate implementation of community decisions; and, to conduct, as mandated, fact-finding assignments in member states.[541]

From 1997 to 2001, CARICOM oversaw the Caribbean Planning for Adaptation to Climate Change (CPACC) project, which was executed by the Organization of American States and implemented by the World Bank. Antigua and Barbuda, Barbados, Belize, Dominica, Grenada, Guyana, Jamaica, Saint Lucia, St. Kitts and Nevis, St. Vincent, and Trinidad and Tobago participated in the CPACC project. The goal of the project was to build capacity in member states to enable them to respond to the impacts of climate change through assessing vulnerability, formulating adaptation plans, and conducting capacity building activities. All of four regional projects of CPACC aimed to

---

[540] Francis, 2008.

[541] http://www.caricom.org/jsp/secretariat/secretariat_index.jsp?menu=secretariat

improve monitoring and evaluation techniques in the region: to design and establish a sea level and climate monitoring network; to establish databases and information systems; to create an inventory of coastal resources; and, to use and formulate initial adaptation policies. Furthermore, CPACC was successful in creating 18 sea level and climate monitoring systems in 12 Caribbean countries, in addition to data management and information networks. CPACC also created an integrated database for the monitoring of climate change impacts through establishing the Inventory for Coastal Resources. The project also established coral reef monitoring protocols, which have increased the capacity of member states to detect early warning signs of deterioration. Finally, through improved monitoring and evaluation systems, member states better understand their vulnerabilities and needs in relation to climate change issues, and are thus better able to plan to meet those challenges and better able to articulate their needs in the larger policy area, such as under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change.[542]

Inter-Governmental Efforts

The Caribbean Disaster Mitigation Project (CDMP) is an example of another recent trend in monitoring and evaluation practices in Caribbean nations for M&E activities to be developed and implemented by inter-governmental organizations. Funded by USAID Office of Foreign Disaster Assistance, managed by the USAID Regional Housing and Urban Development Office in the Caribbean and later by the USAID Office of Foreign Disaster satellite office in Jamaica, and implemented by the Unit of Sustainable Development and Environment of the Organization of American States, CDMP helped establish M&E systems in countries throughout the Caribbean. CDMP took place in 12 pilot nations from 1993 to 1999: Antigua and Barbuda, Bahamas, Barbados, Belize, Dominica, Dominican Republic, Grenada, Haiti, Jamaica, St. Kitts and Nevis, St. Lucia, and St. Vincent and the Grenadines. In addition to the 12 participating Caribbean nations that hosted pilot projects, CDMP conducted regional M&E activities in the Caribbean. CDMP developed monitoring and evaluation indicators to help guide what the program referred to as a "problem-focused planning process." The six desired project outcomes were: to reduce vulnerability of basic infrastructure and critical facilities, improve building standards and practices to reduce natural hazard vulnerability, increase availability and access to natural disaster risk information, increase community awareness of and involvement in disaster preparedness and mitigation measures, improve availability of insurance and reinsurance for natural hazard perils, and incorporate mitigation activities in post-disaster reconstruction. M&E was selected as one of the project's core tools and approaches to help improve Caribbean disaster mitigation and implement the project's desired outcomes through developing long-term indicators of sustainability in the region. From the outset of the project, CDMP established M&E measures to provide regular data collection and information to analyze the project and the impact of its activities. As part of the monitoring and evaluation process, CDMP developed a strategic objective framework, logical frameworks for each project activity, a program performance matrix for regular reporting and ongoing monitoring and interim evaluations. Finally, during the last year of the project, external consultants conducted a final evaluation of CDMP. This monitoring and evaluation approach focused on long-term indicators, helped evaluate if CDMP activities or similar activities should continue after the project ended, and thus helped determine long-term planning needs in the Caribbean, rather than needs that were based on the project only. Through its monitoring and evaluation process, CDMP established indicators of sustainability that could be used for years to come in the region.[543]

---

[542] http://www.caricom.org/jsp/projects/macc%20project/cpacc.jsp

[543] Organization of American States, "The Caribbean Disaster Mitigation Project." http://www.oas.org/cdmp/document/final/oasfinal.htm

National Efforts

In 1994, Colombia created SINERGIA (*synergy*), the National System for Evaluation of Management of Results. SINERGIA measures the performance of public sector actions. The results of the M&E activities are used to inform the National Development Plan, as well as to assist in resource allocation and to serve as a source of information to guide public policies. SINERGIA utilizes three main arms: results monitoring, strategic evaluations and reporting for accountability. The public can then access these M&E findings via a web-based information tool that posts information on-line. In 2002, Colombia created the Inter-Sectoral Committee for Evaluation and Results-Based Management to better link evaluation results and planning and budgeting actions. The Committee found that the M&E process would function better to inform planning and budgeting if performance indicators were reduced in number and made more specific. At present, Colombia's M&E system is based at the central level, yet plans are under way for it to be replicated at the sub-national and municipal levels of government.[544]

In Brazil, monitoring and evaluation practices are also directly tied to the formulation of the national development plan. The results from M&E activities are integrated with the country's *Plan Plurianual* (PPA), a four-year development plan that guides growth and development in Brazil. M&E efforts are focused on assessing program objectives and performance as well as public expenditures, and findings are linked to policies and programs contained in the PPA. Data and information obtained from M&E practices are made available to the public via the Ministry of Finance. However, Brazil's M&E system has been criticized as lacking sufficient performance indicators, and its effectiveness has thus been seen as limited.[545]

Monitoring and Evaluation during Plan Implementation

Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) activities during plan implementation concentrate on identifying the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats of a plan at a given point in its implementation. M&E during plan implementation is thus a vital component to ensuring that planning activities are successful and meaningful, as the process provides critical feedback that can be incorporated to augment a plan's effectiveness.

The Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) has developed an approach utilized by various programs funded by the organization in the region for the plan implementation and post-implementation phases of the monitoring and evaluation process. The IADB M&E approach is a mixed-methods and triangulation M&E approach that includes quantitative methods such as data collection and analysis, as well as qualitative methods such as interviews and surveys. IADB's method first conducts data collection and, to a lesser extent, interviews, and then assesses residents' level of satisfaction with services in their community. Next, it considers the presence and impact of infrastructure and larger institutions on the communities participating in the program, and lastly it uses census data to evaluate the project's impact.546 The Favela-Bairro program in Rio de Janeiro, a joint-venture between Rio's municipal departments and the Inter-American Development Bank aimed at upgrading slums, is one such IADB-funded program that employs this approach in monitoring and evaluating urban interventions.

National Efforts

Chile's monitoring and evaluation system is considered by experts to be one of the most effective in the LAC region. The Chilean M&E system consists of management controls and result-based budgeting that uses performance indicators, program and agency evaluations, a bidding funding

---

[544] Burdescu, et al., 2005.

[545] Burdescu, et al., 2005.

[546] Xavier and Magalhães, 2003.

system for public programs, management improvement programs linked to performance-based bonuses for central government employees, and comprehensive management reports. Part of what makes Chile's system unique is that it is managed and led by the Ministry of Finance, and the M&E tools are thus part of the budget process and are followed-through in the program design and implementation phases. Evaluations are contracted out to academic and consulting agencies, yet the Ministry of Finance manages the evaluation process and ensures that evaluations are made public on their website. In studying Chile's M&E system, the World Bank found that the evaluations hold a high level of credibility by governmental departments and employees and by academics and non-governmental entities. The high credibility of the evaluations can be attributed in part to their being conducted by third-parties that lack a stake in their results. Another important component to Chile's M&E system is that all employees that participate in the M&E process receive intensive training. Finally, the results of the evaluations are used to inform future plans and programs, as well as to make changes in management.[547]

Mexico's National Council of Evaluation of Social Policy undertakes monitoring and evaluation for the country's social programs. Mexico's M&E system is based on evaluations of its large social programs through utilizing performance indicators. The M&E findings have been used to encourage the government to retain and expand their effective programs. In addition, Mexico's Congress is active in the M&E process through mandating program evaluation and auditing reports of performance indicators. Like Colombia and other countries in the LAC region, Mexico has found that indicators must be further simplified in order for M&E processes to be more effective, and the relationship between evaluation findings and planning and policy decision-making must be strengthened and made more systematic. At present, the national government is attempting to work with evaluation efforts at the state and municipal levels of government in order for all efforts to be more effective.[548]

In 2004, Peru initiated the National System of Monitoring and Evaluation of Public Expenditures (SSEGP, in Spanish). Managed by the Ministry of Economy and Finance, Peru's nascent M&E system is results-based, and is aimed at encouraging results-based management through linking the results achieved by public expenditures. SSEGP has developed performance indicators for different levels of government, including the sub-national level, which is the level responsible for providing the majority of public services in the country.[549]

It is important to note that many of the M&E systems highlighted here, such as those of Chile, Mexico and Peru, fall under the categories of both plan implementation and post-implementation M&E practices, as monitoring and evaluation activities occur both during and after implementation. The findings obtained from these M&E systems are likely utilized to inform future plan formulation in these countries. However, a more comprehensive M&E system is one that functions effectively at all three stages of the planning process: plan formulation, plan implementation and post-implementation.

9.4. An Opportunity to Detect Plan Management and Plan Enforcement

When M&E processes occur during plan implementation, there is a valuable opportunity to determine if plans are being sufficiently enforced and properly managed, and to adjust plans if necessary to better meet their targeted goals. In 2008, the Jamaican government commissioned a mid-term review of the Master Plan for Sustainable Tourism Development by a third-party consulting firm. Created in 2002, the Master Plan serves as the key policy framework guiding Jamaica's tourism sector, which is a significant source of revenue for the nation and one of the main contributors to development and growth on the island. Through a results-based approach of assessing the success of the Plan in implementing its targeted goals, the M&E process for the Master Plan sought to determine if adjustments to the plan were needed. The Senior Director of Tourism Policy and Monitoring for Jamaica's Ministry of Tourism described the M&E process as focused on analyzing the

---

[547] Burdescu, et al., 2005.

[548] Burdescu, et al., 2005.

[549] Burdescu, et al., 2005.

implementation of the plan during its first six years, and then on adjusting implementation measures if the plan's goals were not being adequately met: "An analysis of what has taken place so far, in terms of our ability to implement, how far we have gone; did we fulfill the targeted goals? And then they are to propose the way forward. How can we change what we have done?" Jamaica's 2002 Master Plan for Sustainable Tourism Development seeks to guide infrastructural development in the tourism industry, and aims to balance tourism with environmental sustainability. However, there was concern in Jamaica that the implementation of the Master Plan has been hindered in achieving its goals due to the lack of a key agency or board to ensure that developments comply with the Master Plan. For example, the Master Plan proposes that housing and resort development be timed and built simultaneously, yet there is no agency or board that guarantees this proposal, and many squatter communities have developed around resort development. Thus, as learned from this Jamaican example, enforcement is a crucial aspect of plan implementation, and M&E can greatly aid in detecting if plan enforcement and compliance is occurring to an effective degree. In addition, based on the 2008 M&E findings, experts in Jamaica also noted that management, another critical element in plan implementation, was not adequately addressed in the 2002 Master Plan. Hence, the M&E process helped provide feedback that the Master Plan needed better management in order to be properly implemented.[550]

Thus, as the M&E process of Jamaica's 2002 Master Plan for Sustainable Tourism Development exemplifies, M&E activities can help determine the presence and appropriateness of plan enforcement and management systems, and can help adjust plans accordingly such that plans become more effective. If fundamental elements such as management and enforcement are determined to be lacking from a plan during M&E, plans can be reworked to incorporate these key plan implementation components. Monitoring and evaluation are vital aspects of the planning process that can greatly assist in achieving successful and impactful plans, and function best when considered as key components of planning practices.

Post-implementation monitoring and evaluation

Post-implementation monitoring and evaluation usually takes place promptly after the project is completed, and aims to expand upon the benefits derived from the plan or project, and highlight its shortcomings so that they are well understood to be overcome in the present if possible, and be avoided in the future. The deficiency or lack of post-implementation M&E practices negatively affects project maintenance and project improvement, and can result in projects in the region being abandoned or mismanaged after experiencing positive launching results. Poor post-implementation M&E also prevents learning from previous planning experiences and can cause past mistakes to be repeated in new planning processes.

In post-implementation monitoring and evaluation, how programs are defined and the aims, goals and benefits of specific programs as detailed during the plan formation process, deeply impact the assessment of a program's successes and failures. In the example of Rio de Janeiro's *Favela-Bairro*, the program does not list improvement of dwelling units as a goal or benefit of the intervention, and thus, improved housing conditions are not evaluated in the post-implementation process as a success of the program, despite housing conditions being of great concern to *favela* residents.[551] In particular, the *Favela-Bairro* used the monitoring approach developed and approved by the Inter-American Development Bank, mentioned above, which first focuses on data collection and interviews, assesses residents' level of satisfaction with borough services, then measures the impact of infrastructure and larger institutions, and lastly uses census data to evaluate the impact of the project. Yet, lack of organization of data and centralization have created challenges in post-implementation M&E activities relating to the program, "this system has been demonstrated not to be clear and efficient enough, it is

---

[550] Manning, 2008.

[551] Xavier and Magalhães, 2003.

difficult to assess through this system whether the program has fulfilled its aims or to evaluate its positive and negative effects and its main constraints and potentials."[552]

9.5. Key Issues in Plan Monitoring and Evaluation

Capacity-building, contextualization and public participation are three key issues in plan monitoring and evaluation. In some instances in the LAC region, these issues have been well addressed in the planning process and are receiving increased attention. However, these issues remain critical concerns, especially in areas where they have not been an integral aspect of the planning process, including in M&E activities.

Capacity-Building

A crucial step in successful plan monitoring and evaluation in Latin America and the Caribbean is securing the presence of well-informed, well-trained individuals. Such individuals are needed at the governmental, non-governmental, and professional levels to effectively participate in the plan formulation, plan implementation, and post-implementation phases of the planning process and to successfully conduct M&E activities throughout all phases of the planning process. The need for policy makers and other professionals to undergo capacity-building, training and education is an important aspect of the framework for the monitoring and evaluation of planning, policy, and development interventions in Latin America and the Caribbean. However, in order to create a successful and comprehensive planning process, the communities living in cities throughout LAC must also be educated, trained and capacity-strengthened. Community capacity-building efforts, "are based upon an understanding of… the community's assets, capacities, and abilities… community members should not just be clients or aid recipients, but full contributors to the community-building process."[553] In addition, policy makers and professionals must understand planning needs and efforts from the perspective of the communities they serve.

Capacity-building and education and training in the planning arena must also work at building bridges among the community, governmental agencies, non-governmental institutions and the private sector. Efforts must be directed not only at augmenting the capacities of each of these groups of actors, but also at ensuring their collaboration in the plan formulation, implementation and post-implementation phases of the planning process and all stages of the M&E process. Building these bridges entails an overt focus on the relationships among the multiple stakeholders present in all stages of the planning process, understanding that "one of the central challenges for asset-based community developers is to constantly build and rebuild the relationships between and among local residents, local associations and local institutions."[554]

In Latin America and the Caribbean, capacity-building must be performed across sectors and must view urban issues and planning practices from a multi-faceted perspective. For example, a poor understanding of informal land development and urban economics is a key obstacle to the success of efforts to alleviate informal settlements in many LAC countries: "Many policy makers have not fully understood the complexity of informal land development, and the nexus of land markets, housing, and slums development in their cities, and therefore ill-conceived plans continue to stimulate rather than slow informal development. Any attempt to tackle the problem of existing settlements must take into account the deep-rooted causes of this phenomenon."[555] In an effort to make advancements in informal settlement issues in LAC, the Lincoln Institute for Land Policy, a research and training agency, has focused on properly educating, training, and building capacity in professionals and governmental agencies in many LAC countries.

---

[552] Xavier and Magalhães, p.25.

[553] Kretzmann and McKnight, 1996.

[554] Kretzmann and McKnight. pp. 28-29.

[555] Acioly, 2007, p.3.

Despite their being fundamental to plan monitoring and evaluation practices, many LAC experts maintain that capacity-building, education and training efforts have not reached sufficient levels in the region. However, in recent years, some research, policy, and educational institutes have begun to address this void. For example, the Lincoln Institute for Land Policy and the Institute for Housing and Urban Development initiated a four-year project to create human resources, skills development, and specialized training on land management and regulation for senior executives and practitioners from governments, NGOs, academic institutions and professionals in the private sector working on land and housing interventions in Latin America.[556] In particular, the organization's training focuses on improving the efforts of local governments in reaching policy decisions: "Competencies, skills and knowledge must be strengthened at the local government level and at the levels where legislation is drafted and policy decisions are made."[557] Planning education is also expanding in different forms and levels in LAC (as discussed in Chapter 10), and has the potential to greatly augment the capacity and skills necessary to conduct successful M&E practices in the region.

Contextual Considerations

During all stages of the planning process, planning interventions and monitoring and evaluation activities must be considered within their larger socio-cultural, political, economic, and environmental contexts. For example, if the issue of informal settlements is treated wholly as one of land management and urban economics, and not in its larger socio-cultural and political context, policy, planning, and development interventions will be formed, implemented, and evaluated from a land and economics perspective, which would not be a holistic and effective view of informal settlement issues. Many LAC experts caution against treating informal settlements as solely or moslty economic issues: "Purely political/economic circumstances of squatter populations cannot be considered without regard for the cultural contexts in which these are embedded."[558] Lasting and impactful urban development policy must be "designed and implemented in accordance with a country's cultural frameworks if it is to be effective in the long term."[559] LAC experts maintain that an approach grounded in the cultural context of specific communities may be the better and more sustainable approach in solving some urban policy and planning issues, in particular for the urban poor and settlement issues. Hence, the monitoring and evaluation of such interventions must take cultural contexts into account in order to have a sustainable and veritable impact.

9.6. Public Participation

In order for planning interventions in Latin America and the Caribbean to be more legitimate, sustainable, and effective, public participation must be present at every stage of the planning process, including during monitoring and evaluation activities. For example, programs aimed at upgrading informal settlements throughout the region, in countries such as Chile, Argentina, Uruguay and Brazil, have made progress in part through incorporating public participation as part of the slum upgrading process, in addition to emphasizing individual and collective bargaining, physical regularization and upgrading, tenure regularization, and citizen integration.[560] Success in many planning endeavors in the region is directly correlated to levels of public participation, "The chances that a particular land occupation in Colombia, Venezuela or Peru will be successful tends to increase with an increase in the scale of popular participation in it."[561] Thus, public participation is a vital element to planning in Latin

---

[556] Acioly, 2007, p.5.

[557] Acioly, 2007, p.5.

[558] AlSayyad, 1993.

[559] AlSayyad, 1993.

[560] Ward, 2005, p.290.

[561] AlSayyad, 1993, p.44.

America and the Caribbean, and plan monitoring and evaluation must thoroughly encourage and facilitate public participation in the planning process.

During education and training of municipal and other governmental officials and professionals, public participation must be part of the process and be valued: As LAC experts Xavier and Magalhães confirm, "local municipalities must be trained to be more efficient in perceiving community needs… and in the choice of implementation measures that are easy and fast to implement."[562] A key focus at all stages of the planning process must be on finding "democratic and respectful ways for the state to have a presence in the communities, offering support to people."[563]

Public participation as part of the planning process has greatly increased in many LAC countries in recent years. In addition, public participation has also been critical in successful monitoring and evaluation efforts in various instances in LAC. For example, in Rio de Janeiro, when residents were asked to vote on their favorite urban program in the city, they overwhelmingly voted in favor of the *Favela-Bairro* program. Such overt public approval for urban programs creates a level of buy-in and legitimacy and facilitates successful implementation and sustainability of impacts achieved through planning activities.

9.7. Concluding Thoughts

Plan monitoring and evaluation practices are growing in number and importance in many countries in Latin America and the Caribbean. M&E efforts are being undertaken in the LAC region by a myriad of stakeholders: governmental agencies, non-governmental agencies such as nonprofits and universities, and professional third-party consultants. Monitoring and evaluation is a fundamental component of a comprehensive and effective planning system, and the increase in M&E practices in the LAC region is a promising sign for systematic planning improvements.

---

[562] Xavier and Magalhães, 2003.

[563] Xavier and Magalhães, 2003.

10. Planning Education

Planning education in LAC can be characterized by its long-standing constraints, enormous new challenges, and its promising range of innovative perspectives. Despite some socio-economic improvement in the 2000s, the region's economic instability and social deficits persist after decades of structural adjustment, governmental reforms, and privatization trends. As discussed in previous chapters, among the pressing issues of concern in LAC are the exploding size of the region's megacities, deficient metropolitan governance arrangements, massive deforestation and depletion of natural resources as a consequence of uncontrolled and extended urbanization and deficient environmental controls, the marginalization of indigenous people and other minorities, and recurring civil unrest in both core cities and rural areas. These issues add to the challenges of planning effective and innovative urban and regional interventions. They also highlight the relevance and need for reliable and contextualized planning education programs in the region.

This chapter discusses how planners are being trained in LAC. It also looks at the educational systems in place as well as the extent of available resources for training and professional development. The goal is to provide a broad overview to planning education in this complex and challenging, yet also hopeful and creative region. The discussion begins with a review of traditional approaches used in planning education, and their evaluation and accreditation methods. Their strengths and limitations are considered from regional, historical and geographic perspectives, to then shift to the issues and challenges that educators currently face in different countries.

The analysis of the contemporary situation begins with theoretical debates in the field and the question of how these shape the curricular contents that planning students learn. Students emerging from planning education require certain skill sets and competencies. However, as planning continues to evolve in LAC, a new range of knowledge is necessary for planners to address emerging conditions and problems. Interdisciplinary integration and linked collaborations with universities, associations, and governments are creating new and innovative curricula in planning programs. These also provide students with more opportunities to pursue individual interests. Global issues influence particular planning requirements at the national and regional scales and the expansion of international and worldwide planning associations and exchanges have contributed to the revitalization of planning in the region.

The discussion of planning education in LAC cannot be limited to its traditional academic settings. Therefore, this chapter also explores organizational networks, new teachings methods such as distance learning, and the extent to which it is possible to build institutional and community capacity in the educational field. These are supplementary frameworks that illustrate the multiple approaches that may be taken for training planning students and professionals attuned to contemporary needs and opportunities.

10.1. Planning Education

Planning education systems are highly varied across LAC, but many of them have not kept pace with the changing nature of cities and government. The new urban planning problems and challenges that have emerged across the world and in the LAC region demand a new range of competencies and skills, particularly from those trained as professional planners, but also from those in other affiliated professional areas of government, such as public policy and public administration. A range of facilitative and communicative abilities are now required from planners in addition to the more technical skills constituting the core of planning education in many parts of the world in the past.

Yet the education and training of a sufficient number of capable planners is an essential prerequisite for revitalizing planning systems. In this sense, planning education has to be imparted not only through institutions of higher education but also through government capacity-building programs

and through the efforts of professional bodies of 'continuing professional development'. One reason behind the perpetuation of outdated planning modes, however, is that planners continue to be trained in curricula that have not been revised for decades.

There are no international accreditation systems for planning programs. Planning schools in LAC countries do not search for accreditation or look to the accrediting institutes in the developed countries, but the latter have developed evaluation systems for their own contexts. The development and implementation of a context-sensitive and home-grown and managed accreditation system is one important task for LAC planning educational institutions. Mexico and Brazil are at the forefront of such efforts in LAC.

In some parts of the world (e.g. in the US.), there have been recent debates about the detrimental effects of a very low content of 'international' planning in curricula, particularly at a time when many trained planners eventually work in different parts of the world. As countries in LAC become better integrated into a global system, the integration of more international planning in the region's planning curricula also makes sense, expanding both opportunities to learn from best practices from other parts of the world and international professional practice in the region.

10.2. Traditions and Approaches to Planning Education and Their Evaluation and Accreditation Systems

Multiple traditions and approaches to planning education have existed historically in LAC, many of which have been aligned with the dominant paradigms of each historical period in North America and/or Western Europe. The region is still characterized by the diversity and fragmentation of its institutional arrangements and evaluation and accreditation systems.

While an overarching concern with building national capitals could be noticed in the post-independence period of many countries,[564] planning in the mid-twentieth century responded to the imperatives of accommodating industrial growth, establishing efficient metropolitan and regional transportation systems, and maintaining the territorial coherence of expanding settlements through zoned land uses and orderly territorial development. The bias towards the largest cities in the region can still be noticed today, as planning curricula are usually taught in only such urban centers.

Planning education in LAC is not available in all of the region's countries. Where available, it is usually limited to major cities and offered at the graduate level. Very few undergraduate planning programs exist in the region (e.g., there is only one undergraduate program in "Urbanism" in Venezuela, at the Universidad Simón Bolívar, in Caracas). Planning education is traditionally linked to architecture schools and planners usually have an architectural background. Much planning in LAC has been done and continues to be done by architects without formal training as planners or urban designers. However, many architectural programs include courses on planning and urban design. Also, a substantial portion of graduate planning students in LAC has an architectural background. This linkage to architecture is gradually changing, as planning becomes more recognized as an interdisciplinary field with connections to economics, political science, engineering, law, geography, etc.

While still requiring a previous degree, short-term online programs and certificates in planning topics, such as citizen participation, are increasingly making the field accessible to diverse actors from civil society who could then be enabled to engage in more democratic planning processes. A noteworthy example of this approach is FLACSO—the Latin American Faculty of Social Sciences, which has chapters in numerous countries. Yet most programs still emphasize technical skills related to the drafting of master plans and urban design, as well as statistical analysis, and econometric and transportation modeling. This orientation is in line with the rational model of planning and prioritizes technical rather than managerial and procedural knowledge attuned to more participatory approaches and visions of planning.

---

[564] Almondoz, 2002.

Some schools offer postgraduate degrees, specializations and/or certifications. A few offer certification on planning for students still unsure about fully committing to a longer program or to a career in planning, or for professionals already working in the field that require some sort of certification. Planning education trains professionals in certain skills, such as econometric modelling, transportation modelling, urban design, statistical analysis, etc. but is usually weak in training in community planning, participation, negotiation, mediation, etc. Hence, it reproduces the rational model of planning, prioritizing technical rather than managerial and procedural knowledge. This is slowly changing, as some programs incorporate real projects and real clients into their urban studios or laboratories, and hence come to appreciate the need for managerial and procedural knowledge that includes community planning, participation, negotiation, and mediation skills. The 'communicative turn' in urban planning that Innes[565] refers to in the US., is also reaching the LAC region.[566]

Countries such as Brazil, Mexico, and Argentina promote some interaction between planning programs in different cities through committees, symposia and online and paper publications. There are also several international conferences and associations active in the region. This allows for cross-comparisons, competition, and collaboration among programs, which contributes to improve overall educational quality. Some of the most established planning programs in large cities in the region (e.g., Bogota, Caracas, São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, Santiago de Chile, Buenos Aires, Mexico City) have pursued international collaborations within LAC with similar programs in other countries. These collaborations usually lack institutionalization and occur in informal manner, although some have been ongoing for years. Some collaborative programs are heavily reliant on individual leadership, and hence their sustainability in case of leadership change remain to be seen.

Recent years have witnessed some deepening of communication and exchange flows between different countries as well as the promising emergence of more integrative approaches that bridge over the realm of physical planning and zoning—traditionally taught at architecture schools—transportation and regional planning—the previous exclusive purview of economists and engineers—and social planning and community development—which were included in sociology, social work, political science, and anthropology curricula. An innovative program that integrates multiple areas is the six-semester doctoral program that the *Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile* offers through its Institute of Urban Territorial Studies (IEU).

10.3. The Case for International Accreditation for Planning Programs

The state of affairs

While some planning programs in LAC are sponsored by national ministries and planning education is part of the component of public administration institutes such as Argentina's National Institute of Public Administration (*Instituto Nacional de la Administración Pública*, INAP),[567] most countries lack accreditation systems. Most planning programs monitor and adjust themselves in ad-hoc manners, with none or few wider frameworks of reference and evaluative criteria. Frequently, faculty members with training overseas use their personal experiences as models for the programs they direct in the region.

Lacking accreditation systems, planning programs in some countries monitor and adjust themselves without any or few frameworks of reference outside their own experience. Professors trained abroad (usually in the US., Canada, U.K., France, or Spain; but occasionally in Venezuela, Mexico, Argentina, and Brazil) use their personal experiences as benchmarks against which to model their programs in LAC. Brazil, Mexico, and Argentina have systems that promote some interaction between planning programs in different cities within these countries through professor participation in

---

[565] Innes, 1995.

[566] Allmendinger and Tewdwr-Jones, 2002; Campbell, 1997*;* Cardenas and Moreno, 2004; Cernea, 1992*.*

[567] http://www.sgp.gov.ar/inap/documentacion/cediap.htm

graduate student committees, national conferences, etc. This allows for cross-comparison, competition, and collaboration among programs, and contributes to increase their overall quality.[568] The wider integration to planning education beyond the LAC region is uneven. On the one hand, some US.-based organizations such as the Lincoln Institute of Land Use Policy promote planning education in the region, and have helped propagate curricular agendas focused on topics such as the public recovery of socially created land values (*plusvalías*), but their presence is unevenly felt. But on the other hand, some countries are unwelcoming to accreditation proposals originating from the American Planning Association (APA), the American Institute of Certified Planners (AICP), U.K.'s Royal Town Planning Institute (RTPI) or any foreign institution or consultant (e.g., the National Association of Graduate Studies and Research in Urban and Regional Planning's official position in Brazil is against foreign accreditation).

Premise and purpose of international accreditation

"Accreditation" per se is value-free, value depends on why, for whom, for what purposes accreditation is done. The purpose of international accreditation should be the promotion of standards of excellence in planning education and training.

The context of international accreditation

There are two contemporary conditions that prompt the consideration of international accreditation for LAC planning programs. First, globalization has compressed time and space in a world scale. This condition makes for global planning challenges such as global warming, urbanization, aging, migration, environmental protection and justice, etc., and their solutions to be potentially sharable by all regions of the world. Also, new information and communication technologies (ICT) facilitate planning information exchange, making planning ideas and practices disseminate more broadly and rapidly. Lastly, transportation technologies facilitate traveling and international consulting for a planning elite, also contributing to knowledge creation and dissemination at a global scale. Second, international accreditation is already happening in an uneven manner across the world. In general terms, Asian countries, particularly the most rapidly developing, such as China and India, are embracing international accreditation at a rapid pace. LAC countries have been resisting the trend, however in an uneven manner (e.g., Jamaica invites accreditation by the RTPI, while Brazil formally rejects international accreditation). These differences among LAC may create divergent challenges and opportunities to their planning programs vis-à-vis those of the rest of the world.

Advantages of international accreditation

- Opportunity for international exchange of ideas, negotiation of standards of excellence, building of consensus about basic values and criteria

- Raising of standards and accountability across the board

- Incentives for program improvements

- Opportunity for assistance to weaker and poorer institutions and programs

- Tools (criteria and indicators) for individual institutions to assess themselves and determine the resources needed to achieve excellence

- Tools for designing quality enhancement programs

---

[568] Knack, 1994.

Potential risks of international accreditation

- Unequal dialogue: Prevalence of perspectives, values, and judgment of more powerful countries, institutions, and programs
- Loss of program diversity
- Increase difficulty of contextualizing the programs to better address local needs

Potential challenges of international accreditation

- Lack of tradition for monitoring and evaluating planning programs, hence resistance to incorporate those practices on an ongoing basis
- Lack of resources and/or commitment through time (sustainability) for quality enhancement programs
- Other competing priorities and opportunity costs

Ethical conditions under which international accreditation should take place

- Equitable participation of international and national accreditation agents. One suggestion may be to have accreditation boards of 50 per cent of international advisory members and 50 per cent of national judging members.
- Accreditation criteria and indicators should be assessed in relation to the mission and resources of the institution evaluated and to the planning context it should serve.
- Assessment should aim at the design of a tailored, realistic quality enhancement program.
- Resources and incentives for promoting enhancement should be facilitated.
- Rewards for accomplished enhancements should be offered.

Precedent and Model

The UN Human Settlement Programme's 2009 Global Report "Revisiting Urban Planning" analyzes the state of planning education in the world. It can be the context in which planning associations (ACSP, AESOP, ALUP, ANPUR, etc.) partner with the UN to develop standards of excellence and ethical procedures for international planning accreditation.

There is a valuable precedent for such an effort. The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs already partnered with the International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration to produce the *Standards of Excellence for Public Administration Education and Training*.[569] These standards and the process that led to their creation can offer valuable insights to planning.

10.4. The Extent to Which Planning Education Takes Into Account Current Issues and Problems

Planning education in LAC is not keeping pace in general with the current issues and problems that planners face in the region (identified in chapter 1). Some pressing challenges in planning education in LAC include: (1) the need to keep pace with the development of new technical expertise (e.g.,

---

[569] United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs/ International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration Task Force on Standards of Excellence for Public Administration Education and Training, 2008.

geographic information systems, computer aided design, transportation or real estate modelling, etc.) and with the equipments (hardware, software) required to perform relevant planning analyses; (2) the need to expand negotiation, mediation, conflict resolution, and consensus building skills; (3) the need to complement the rational planning model with participatory, advocate, democratic, and collaborative planning models as needed; (4) the need to effectively coordinate multidisciplinary teams with various forms of knowledge and knowledge production; (5) the need to address metropolitan and regional planning and governance; (5) the need for more effective responses to the growing environmental challenges in the LAC region and the world; (6) the need for more effective responses to the growing socio-spatial justice challenges in LAC; (7) the need to forge more collaborative relations with community and governmental organizations involved in planning, so that knowledge produced in higher education can improve practice and vice versa; and (8) the need for greater emphasis on ethics education so that planning professionals can become more effective agents in combating corruption and other professional and governmental vices.

Academic planning programs in LAC are constantly struggling to keep up with rapid changes in the field. On the one hand, there is an array of technical innovations and tools that different programs are progressively incorporating to their curricula—these include geographic information systems, computer-aided design, transportation and real-estate modeling, etc. But on the other hand, the complex and shifting economic, social, political, and environmental realities of cities in the region call for constant revisions to educational approaches.

While all of the different dimensions of urban change mentioned in Chapter 2 are of significance for planning education, it is noteworthy that programs are increasingly focusing on issues of informal urbanization and the regularization of land-tenure—a major concern throughout the region, and particularly in the largest cities of Mexico and Brazil, and other Latin American and Caribbean capitals. Much focus has been placed in reducing the number of slums or favelas forming or growing in their most populated cities, including Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo. Although the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN Habitat) reported in 2006 that population growth rates in the largest metropolitan areas of Latin America were falling, in the Municipality of Rio of de Janeiro the population growth rate in the favelas and in illegal land subdivisions were five and three times higher than the overall city growth population rate.[570] For many large metropolitan cities around the world, the problems are often similar when it comes to slum formation and informal land development. The poor cannot afford to pay the high land prices in urban areas; they cannot abide by the formal land delivery system; and there is usually poor sanitation, overcrowding, high levels of crime, and poor housing conditions in their communities.

Capacity building, training, and international education are key elements to finding solutions to the most urgent urban planning dilemmas in the LAC region, such as slum formation and informal land development.[571] For the last four years, the Lincoln Institute of Land Policy has partnered with the Institute for Housing and Urban Development Studies (IHS) to offer a specialized international training program on land management and regularization. To date, representatives from over 30 different countries have participated in this training. The training provides an opportunity for practitioners and urban planners to share best practices on measures and policies that have been effective in reducing slum formation and building the capacity for formal land ownership. Through IHS-Lincoln training program, practitioners are able to develop basic skills in land economics in order to better understand land markets and land price formation. The use of case studies allows practitioners the opportunity to examine real cases of modernizing ineffective urban planning and land use policies. For example, the program recognizes Brazil's use of the ZEIS (zones of special social interest) instrument and the "Statute of the City" national legislation to formalize and protect the occupied land of the urban poor. The program also emphasizes an understanding of the transfer of development rights, land value capture, and other alternatives in identifying consistent funding streams for infrastructure projects. Lastly, the training program focuses on the development and

---

[570] Acioly, 2007.

[571] Acioly, 2007.

implementation of large-scale, citywide projects inclusive of design, management, and urban planning. This program serves as evidence that global expertise in urban planning and land management can be applied locally. The professional development model is successful in improving current planning and land management policies in Brazil and other Latin American countries.

Globalization adds to the challenges that planning faces in the region. New opportunities for urban growth have appeared as some cities seek to attract foreign investment and pursue specialized functions in the global economy. Yet, there are also problems with the entrepreneurial focus that planning has adopted in these cities—e.g. through state-of-the-art office complexes, business parks, and tourist-oriented luxury hotels and commercial centers.[572] The social and spatial consequences of these partial and strategic interventions are rarely taken into account, and planners receive little formal training on how to evaluate the wider local impacts of globalization-led urban redevelopment.

In LAC, there is also a noticeable emphasis on local development, territorial economies, and social entrepreneurship, but these courses are still largely disassociated from physical planning and often not taught in conjunction with housing topics. Issues of corruption and lack of public accountability also affect planning in the region. Planning education thus, can certainly play a role in the task to improve governance, but there is currently little curricular attention paid to issues of ethics, public and private professional norms, and on how planners may attempt to pursue forms of growth with equity.

10.5. Main Theoretical Debates in the Field of Planning Education and How Planners Learn

Theory has a solid place in planning education in LAC. Yet theoretical debates in the region tend to be limited to country- and even city-specific discussions on how well US-based and European models and hypotheses fit each local case. Regional cross-country debates are rare and comparative research does not abound, although is growing. The lack of exchange between Brazil and Spanish-speaking countries is noticeable in this regard, although it is common for planning journals in the region to allow publication in several languages. Among the few noticeable theory and research outlets with international audiences are the journals *Urbana* in Venezuela, *EURE* published out of Santiago, Chile; *Revista Ciudades* from Mexico; and the e-newsletters and websites *Vitruvius* and *Café de las Ciudades* from Brazil and Argentina, respectively.

Theory courses are also frontloaded in the earlier stages of planning curricula, but then planners tend to be exposed more to studio classes, case studies, and reviews of local zoning codes. Standardized textbooks are rare and courses tend to use ad-hoc compilations of diverse materials. Instrumental English or French proficiency is required from students in some programs, where literature may be used in either language.

Planning Skills and competencies required to respond to emerging urban problems

The multiple complexities that cities face in the region require that planners command various technical, communicational and social skills and sensibilities. Yet the fragmented state of planning education leads to professionals graduating with mixed and uneven sets of skills. This situation is aggravated by the fact that many graduates complete their education informally through on-the-job training, as they tend to work part- or full-time while they pursue an advanced planning degree.

Are there cases of new and innovative planning curricula?

Innovative curricula in LAC emphasize interdisciplinary studies that include perspectives of professionals in the field of urban planning, architecture, public administration, public policy, real estate, environmental sciences, transportation, economics, and business. The impact of international

---

[572] Jones and Moreno-Carranco, 2007; Moreno-Carranco, 2008; Talesnik and Gutierrez, 2002.

development policies on the region has also contributed to an increase in the linkages between socio-economic development, planning, and design training. Planning programs are becoming more flexible and adding new curricula to assist students to further develop their own fields of specialization. Planning students are encouraged to incorporate existing methods and models, but also to pioneer new approaches in their theses. The introduction of cross-sectoral arrangements is increasing the exploration of new topics in urban planning. Complex and interconnected problems are increasingly attracting the attention of scholars, authorities, and the public opinion, since they are intimately tied to the quality of life of the population and to the development of the country.

Some universities require students to take at least one course in Historiography. In Venezuela and Brazil, "The History of Cities and Urbanization" is intended to expose students to the development of paradigms in urban history and the urbanization of Latin America. The idea is to teach students successes and failures of planning in order to reflectively move forward. Other universities have incorporated regional scopes into their planning programs. The Mexican Association of Sciences for Regional Development (AMECIDER) focuses on the advancement of regional analysis and development. The purpose of AMECIDER is to stimulate the discussion of theoretical frameworks and the diffusion of methods, skills, and political instruments applicable to regional problems. Programmatic propositions are intended to address urban and regional problems (AMECIDER website).[573]

In Guatemala and other countries that are trying to address the needs for environmental planning education, course work in planning focuses on environmental development in tandem with social and community development. The course work develops a series of topics focusing on methodological approaches and analysis of local characteristics such as the economy, population and environment, and community organization. The goal is to incorporate programs of environmental sensitization inside formal education; and acknowledges the fact that conservation efforts cannot be separate from human needs. Projects teach students the importance of collaborative and active engagement with civil society.

In some large universities in the region, there are some joint degrees of Urban Planning with Architecture, Landscape Design, Geography, Public Administration, International Development, and other disciplines. In Mexico, a five-year Bachelor program in Planning and Landscape Design offers students the opportunity to complete a joint program with the school of Architecture, Design and Urban Planning and the School of Agronomy. The goal of the program is to train students at a professional level to plan and design spaces in open areas integrating the natural and human-made environments. The program links scientific and social disciplines as a way to integrate planning and design of open spaces. It promotes, develops, and spreads the formation of a comprehensive understanding of the problems arising from human impacts on the environment. Intensive courses require gaining knowledge in Botany, Chemistry, Morphology, Vegetation, Ecology, Climatology, History, Urban and Regional Planning, in addition to elective courses.

10.6. Current Global Organization and Networking of Planning Schools

The revitalization of planning education in LAC is partially attributed to administrative changes at the local level, and to particular planning challenges at the regional, national, and international scales. Previous planning education strategies followed models authored by modernist and rational planners and architects on how cities and institutions should be designed and built. Dissatisfied with outdated and impertinent paradigms and in search for distinctive ideas, Latin American planners came to promote the creation of planning associations in the region. Although there is no central coordination of the majority of Latin American planning networks and organizations, a handful of systems emerged to bring together institutions and individuals.

---

[573] AMECIDER, http://www.amecider.org.mx/

At a global level beyond the LAC region, there is the Global Planning Education Association Network (GPEAN), a "network of national or multi-national associations of university level planning programs and schools in urban and regional planning, intended to facilitate international communication on equal terms amongst the university planning communities in order to improve the quality and visibility of planning pedagogy, research and practice, and to promote ethical, sustainable, multi-cultural, gender-sensitive, participatory planning" (GPEAN website).[574]

There are also LAC regional associations, including the Latin American Association of Schools of Planning and Urbanism (*Asociación Latinoamericana de Escuelas de Urbanismo y Planeación*, ALEUP)[575] and the National Association of Graduate Studies and Research in Urban and Regional Planning (*Associação Nacional de Pos-Graduação e Perquisa em Planejamento Urbano e Regional*, ANPUR, from Brazil, founded in 1983).[576] ANPUR has a strong institutional presence in Brazil, but unfortunately, ALEUP has not counted on institutional commitment and resources on the part of Latin American planning institutions and schools to grow. Only a few schools from Mexico, Argentina, and Venezuela are currently associated to ALEUP, and even then their participation in the network is not significant.

These and other world associations promoted the First and Second World Planning Schools Congresses, held in Shanghai in 2001, and Mexico City in 2006, respectively. At the First World Planning School Congress, representatives of national and international planning education associations gathered at Tongji University (Shanghai, China) and signed the Shanghai Statement. This is a collective agreement to improve the quality and visibility of planning and planning education around the world. Representatives of national and international planning education associations agreed on the goal of increasing mutual communication in order to improve the quality and visibility of planning and planning education. It was agreed that the organizations would establish a global planning education association network and would develop an inclusive communication network. A preliminary website infrastructure has been created, but the project has not been fully launched.

In LAC, there is still a lack of widespread knowledge among the public about planning as a discipline. Universities and the private and public sectors can be more proactive at promoting planning as a worthy career, valued by employers and the public. Universities and public and private planning institutions can give prestigious awards to students who have remarkably contributed to the field, and offer career services to improve employment in the public or private sector as a way to increase planning interest as a career path. This method is presently being used in Brazil were every year students who submit the best master's thesis and Ph.D. dissertation are presented with the "Award in Urban and Regional Policy and Planning."
Online forums such as blogs are proving to be additional educational venues. Planning students and professionals are disseminating and exchanging information with each other through some blogs. While some blogs require membership via professional schools or associations, their goal is to advance planning expertise and interest in LAC though increased and shared knowledge. Their potential as democratic and flexible learning tools remains to be fully developed.

Some national research institutes in LAC, such as the National Councils for Science and Technology (Mexican *Consejo Nacional de Ciencia y Tecnología,* Conacyt; or Costa Rican and Venezuelan *Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Tecnológicas,* Conicit), and professional associations promote capacity-building through a system of incentives for training, publication, conference participation, etc. Some also offer financial support for graduate education or post-doctoral visitorships in national or international programs. International exchange programs also promote visiting professors, student exchanges, internships, and consulting engagements.

---

[574] Global Planning Education Association Network (GPEAN),

[575] ALEUP, http://www.uaemex.mx/pwww/Aleup/Integrantes.html

[576] National Association of Post-Graduate Urban and Regional Planning (ANPUR), http://www.anpur.org.br/home.htm

'Brain drain,' the loss of educated professionals to other countries, is a major challenge for LAC. LAC countries do not fare well in recruiting back the nationals that they send for training abroad. These professionals are either actively recruited in the countries where they study, or face difficulty professionally inserting themselves (and their families) back in their countries of origin once they graduate from their programs. Sometimes both conditions are present. As economic conditions improve in LAC, some countries could benefit from focusing on creating incentive-based, recruiting programs for their planning professionals and academics abroad. Flexible visiting and adjunct arrangements can be very attractive to these transnational class.

10.7. Systems to improve the response of planning schools and associations to new and changing planning challenges

Database models

The establishment of a LAC Planning Database can make it possible for planning students and professionals to exchange information and to perform research on subject matters of interest. The database can include Planning Programs and Specializations offered at LAC universities; basic informative facts, career paths, and job and resume posting; local and international associations, upcoming conferences and seminars, blogging venues and publications. Such database could become a space where students, educators, professionals, and institutions can refer to as they try to respond to planning challenges. Efforts to monitor and maintain the reliability of the database should be given to academics and professionals. A few countries in the region have created such databases at the national level, e.g., ANPUR in Brazil.

There is a series of databases useful for planning developed in collaboration between the US. and Mexico, referring to the US-Mexico Border. These are dynamic databases and some are not yet complete. These efforts can be emulated in other national and transnational regions of LAC. Some links include:[577]

Border EcoWeb[578] developed by the Institute for Regional Studies, SDSU (in collaboration with the EPA and other partners). It facilitates public access to environmental information for the US.-Mexican border region. The site's INVENTORY consist of environmental information, metadata (data about data), databases (data, data sets), projects, program activities, grants information, and other useful border-related information. The site's DIRECTORY contains contact information and project descriptions for government agencies and other groups involved in activities dealing with the border environment. The site can be searched for information by geographical location, media, or other key words.

- BorderBase [579] BorderBase is a bilingual directory of organizations, agencies and institutions that conduct work along the California-Baja California border. The BorderBase project seeks to promote cross border collaboration and understanding by providing a simple networking and information tool for local border communities. The BorderBase directory provides contact information, project descriptions and links to government agencies, non-profit organizations, academic institutions, and other groups that are involved in activities related to the California-Baja California border region.

- Southwest Center for Environmental Research and Policy (SCERP)[580] SCERP is a consortium of five US. and five Mexican universities which serves US.-Mexican border residents by applying research information, insights, and innovations to environmental challenges in the

---

[577] Pezzoli, 2008.

[578] Border EcoWeb, http://www.borderecoweb.sdsu.edu

[579] BorderBase, http://www.borderbase.org/

[580] Southwest Center for Environmental Research and Policy, http://www.scerp.org/

region. SCERP was created in 1989 to initiate a comprehensive analysis of possible solutions to acute air, water, and hazardous waste problems that plague the US-Mexican border region.

- US-Mexico Border XXI Program/ US-Mexico Border Environmental Indicators[581] Report covers nine areas: air, water, environmental health, hazardous and solid waste, enforcement and compliance, pollution prevention, natural resources, contingency planning and emergency response, and environmental information resources.

- Commission for Environmental Cooperation/ The North American Integrated Information System[582] Constructing an ecosystem information base (with macro to micro perspectives) to enhance the analytical capabilities of researchers and decision-makers. Combines data on physical features, such as land and water, with other elements including forest cover, wildlife, and info on economic and social issues.

Other tools to help planning schools and their associations in LAC respond to new and changing planning issues:

- Blogs

- A mix of educational programs varied in length and scope: executive education, service-learning, others

- Student and academic exchanges: internships, visitorships, postdocs, others

- IT programs: Distance learning, e-learning

- Dissemination of planning education literature across LAC languages

- Support for international and comparative research on planning education and fora for exchanges (e.g., collaborative grants, real or virtual conferences, seminars)

10.8. Role of the Other Organizations (e.g. Professional Associations) in Improving Planning Skills and Tools

After obtaining planning degrees, professional development is mainly gained through conferences, seminars, associations, peer-to-peer communication and even blog pages. Seminars provide fertile ground for productive exchange of ideas and experiences and enable innovation among planning professionals. More institutional recognition and financial support from the public and private sector of LAC countries to professional planning organizations and continuous educational opportunities can be very beneficial for professional planning development in the region. For example, the *Asociación International del Urbanistas* (ISOCARP/AIU), created in 1965, celebrated its 40th anniversary in 2005 by bringing together more than 400 specialists in urban and regional planning, architecture, economics, anthropology, sociology, and politics from over 70 countries to share and discuss recent development and progress in major LAC cities.

Although universities, governments, and associations are doing their best to provide planning students and professionals with fora to increase their knowledge in the field, there is a need to increase the number of programs available for students interested in planning. In Mexico and other LAC countries the demand for urban planning researchers and professionals cannot be met by universities from which only 5 per cent of the population graduate. It is fundamental, therefore, to develop programs to form technicians from high school.

---

[581] US-Mexico Border, http://www.epa.gov/usmexicoborder/ef.htm

[582] Commission for Environmental Cooperation, http://www.cec.org/

Case Study: Planning Education in Brazil

The Associação Nacional de Pos-Graduação em Planejamento Urbano e Regional (ANPUR, National Association of Post-Graduate Urban and Regional Planning) is currently active in Brazil. It is part of the Global Planning Educators Interest Group (GPEAN). This association is one of the nine GPEAN founding organizations around the world that are "intended to facilitate international communication on equal terms amongst the university planning communities in order to improve the quality and visibility of planning pedagogy, research and practice, and to promote ethical, sustainable, multi-cultural, gender-sensitive, participatory planning."

ANPUR was founded in 1983 and included only five graduate-level planning programs. The organization has grown and now includes a total of 39 programs with a focus on urban and regional planning. It currently coordinates graduate programs and research centers involved in teaching and/or researching in the field of urban and regional planning, architecture, geography, economy, public administration, demography, and social sciences. The primary focus of the organization is to enhance the field of urban and regional planning, the exchange of information among planners and researchers, and to link Brazil's graduate programs with global associations. ANPUR regularly publishes its recommendations and recognizes scholars for innovative work in urban planning. In 1999, they launched the *Revista Brasileira de Estudos Urbanos e Regionais* or Brazil's Urban and Regional Studies journal, which is published twice a year.

Another organization, the Coordination for the Betterment of Higher Education Personnel (*Coordenação de Aperfeiçoamento de Pessoal de Nível Superior*, CAPES) promotes graduate studies and consults on the formulation of policy for graduate programs. It was created in 1951 and became a foundation in 1992. CAPES focuses on four major areas: evaluation of graduate and doctorate programs; resource allocation for higher education; access and information hub for graduate studies; and promotion of international cooperation and partnerships. This organization awards scholarships to master's level students and doctorate students and provides opportunities for training and professional development and studies abroad. CAPES has partnered with the US Department of Education to implement their US-Brazil Higher Education Consortia Program which provides grants for up to four years to a consortia of at least two academic institutions each from Brazil and the US. The program fosters the exchange of students and faculty within the context of bilateral curricular development.

Specifically in Rio de Janeiro, there are a number of master level and graduate level programs that focus on urban and regional planning. They include the Programa de Mestrado Professionalizante em Planejamento Regional e Gestão de Cidade, (UCAM); *the Instituto de Pesquisas em Planejamento Urbano e Regional (IPPUR), Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro; and the Programa de Pós-Graduação em Urbanismo, PROURB, Faculdade de Arquitetura e Urbanismo, Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, UFRJ.*

Source: Global Planning Education Association Network, http://www.gpean.org/index.htm

List of References

Abers, R. (1996) 'From ideas to practice: the Partido dos Trabalhadores and participatory governance in Brazil', *Latin American Perspectives 23*, **4**(35):19

Acioly, C. (2007) 'The Challenges of Slum Formation In the Developing World', *Land Lines*, Lincoln Institute of Land Policy.

Acosta, A. and F. Falconí (eds) (2005) *TLC. Más que un tratado de libre comercio*, Facultad LatinoAmericana de Ciensas Sociales Sede Ecuador.

Alcaldía Mayor del Distrito Metropolitano, Caracas, http://www.alcaldiamayor.gob.ve/portal1/index.php

Allmendinger, P. and M. Tewdwr-Jones (2002) 'The Communicative Turn in Urban Planning: Unraveling Paradigmatic, Imperialistic and Moralistic Dimensions', *Space and Polity*, **6**(1):5-24(20)

Almeida, P.D. (2007) 'Defensive Mobilization: Popular Movements against Economic Adjustment Policies in Latin America', *Latin American Perspectives* **34**(3): 123-139.

Almondoz, A. (ed) (2002) *Planning Latin America's Capital Cities 1850-1950*, Routledge. London.

AlSayyad, N. (1993) 'Culture and Squatting: A Comparative Analysis of Informal Developments in Latin American and the Middle East', *Open House International* **18**(2): 37-47.

Alvarez Leguizamón, S. (ed) (2005) *Trabajo y producción de la pobreza en Latinoamérica y el Caribe: estructuras, discursos y actores. Consejo Latinoamericano de Ciencias Sociales - CLACSO. 1a ed.*

Ames, B. and M. Keck (1997) 'The politics of sustainable development: environmental policy making in four Brazilian states,' *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs* **39**(4): 1-40.

Angotti, T. (1987) 'Urbanization in Latin America: toward a theoretical synthesis', *Latin American Perspectives* **14**(53): 134-156.

Angotti, T. (1996) 'Latin American Urbanization and Planning: Inequality and Unsustainability in North and South', *Latin American Perspectives* **91**(23): 12-24.

Angotti, T. (1996) 'The 'Urban Question' in Latin America', *Latin American Perspectives* **23**(4): 12-34.

Angotti, T. (2005) 'Review Essay: Squatter Settlements and Urbanization', *Journal of the American Planning Association* **71**(4): 465-67.

Annez, P. (1998) 'Livable cities for the 21st century', *Society* **35**(4): 45-51

Arias, E.D. (2004) 'Faith in Our Neighbors: Networks and Social Order in Three Brazilian Favelas', *Latin American Politics and Society* **46**(1):1-38.

Arizaga, M.C. (2000) *Murallas y barrios cerrados, La morfología espacial del ajuste en Buenos Aires, Nueva Sociedad*, pp. 166

Arizaga, M.C. (nd) *El Mito de comunidad en la Ciudad Mundializada,* Ediciones, El Cielo por Asalto.

Arreaza, T. (2004) 'ALBA: Bolivarian Alternative for Latin America and the Caribbean' http://www.venezuelanalysis.com

Arreola, D. (ed) (2004). *Hispanic spaces, Latino places: Community and cultural diversity in contemporary America*, Austin,University of Texas Press.

Arreola, D. and J. Curtis (1993) *The Mexican border cities: Landscape anatomy and place personality*, Tucson, University of Arizona Press.

Asociación Latinoamericana de Escuelas de Urbanismo y Planeación (ALEUP), http://www.uaemex.mx/pwww/Aleup/Integrantes.html

Asociación Mexicana de Ciencias para el Desarrollo Regional (AMECIDER), http://www.amecider.org.mx/

Associação Nacional de Pos-Graduação em Planejamento Urbano e Regional (ANPUR) Website http://www.anpur.org.br/home.htm

Associated Press (2007) 'Mexico City bars street sellers from downtown', http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/21271479/

Bachelet, P. (2007) 'Bush signs free-trade agreement' *Miami Herald*

Bachelet, P. and A. Oppenheimier (2008) 'Colombia's Uribe tells Miami Herald he will push on FTA' *Miami Herald*

Baer, W. (1972) 'Import Substitution and Industrialization in Latin America: Experiences and Interpretations', *Latin American Research Review* **7:** 95-122.

Baer, W. and C. Mueller (1995) 'Environmental Aspects of Brazil's Economic Development (I)', *Luso-Brazilian Review* **32**(1): 83-100

Baierle, S. (2002) 'Transformation and empowerment through the Participatory Budget', LogoLink International workshop on Participatory Planning Approaches for Local Governance, Bandung, Indonesia http://www2.ids.ac.uk/logolink/resources/casestudies.htm#lat

Barja, G. and B.S. Gigler (2006) 'The concept of information poverty and how to measure it in the Latin American Context', in H. Galperin and Mariscal (eds), *Digital poverty: Latin American and Caribbean perspectives*, DIRSI, www.dirsi.net, pp.11-28.

Barnes, G. (2003) 'Lessons Learned: An Evaluation of Land Administration Initiatives in Latin America over the Past Two Decades', *Land Use Policy* **20**: 367-374

Barrantes, R., Galperin, H., Agüero, A. and Molinari, A. (2007) *Affordability of mobile phone service in Latin America*, DRISI/IDRC/CRDI.

Barrows, S.A. (2006) *Empowering indigenous community development in Brazil: Myth or possibility*, M.A. dissertation, United States, Kansas, The University of Kansas.

Bartone, C. R., J. Bernstein, J. Leitmann, J. Eigen (1994) 'Towards Environmental Strategies for Cities: Policy considerations for urban environment management in developing countries', *World Bank urban management programme,* **18** *,* World Bank, Washington D.C.

Bate, P. (2002) 'From Raze to Rebuild: Rather than eliminate Rio's slums, city residents are finding ways to improve them', IDBAmerica Online, http://www.iadb.org/idbamerica/index.cfm?&thisid=1429&articlepreview=0&

Bauer, B. (1996) 'Legitimization of the state in Inca myth and ritual', *American Anthropologist* **98**(2): 327-337.

BBC News (July 3, 2007) 'Brazil launches slum reform drive', http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/americas/6263750.stm

BBC News (2008) 'Amazonas state, Brazil',15 May 2008 14:06 UK, http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/americas/7399109.stm

Bedi, A. S. (1999) 'The Role of Information and Communication Technologies in Economic Development – A Partial Survey', *ZEF – Discussion Papers On Development Policy*, No. 7, Center for Development Research, Bonn.

Bell, M., D. Davis, N. Gouveia, V. Borjaaburto and L. Cifuentes (2005) 'The Avoidable Health Effects of Air Pollution in Three Latin American Cities: Santiago, São Paulo, and Mexico City', *Environmental Research* **100**: 431-440

Berney, R. (2008) *The Role Of Planning In Bogotá, Colombia*, Ph.D. Dissertation, University of California at Berkeley.

Berube, M. (2005) 'Colombia: In the Crossfire.' Migration Policy Institute, http://www.migrationinformation.org/Profiles/display.cfm?ID=344

Bianchi, S.M. (1999) 'Feminization and juvenilization of poverty: Trends, relative risks, causes, and consequences', *Annual Review of Sociology* **25**:307-333.

Biderman, C., P.Sandroni, P. SMOLKA, O. Martin (2006) 'Large-scale Urban Interventions: The Case of Faria Lima in São Paulo', *Land Lines*, Lincoln Institute of Land Policy.

Blackman, A. (2000) 'Informal sector pollution control: What policy options do we have?' *World Development*, 28(12): 2067(16).

Blakely, E.J. and M.G. Snyder (1999) *Fortress America: Gated Communities in the United States*, Brookings Institution Press.

Blanton, P. (2004) *The city is the soul: built space, symbolic space, and social values in Sao Paulo, Brazil*, M.A. dissertation, United States,California, California State University.

Blevis, D. (1999) 'Urban Transportation: Challenges Facing Latin America', Inter-American Development Bank, <http://www.iadb.org/sds/ENV/publication/gen_215_2122_e.htm>

Bliss D., S., M.S. Corsonb and W.E. Gran (2001) 'Simulating land-use decisions in the La Amistad Biosphere Reserve buffer zone in Costa Rica and Panama', *Ecological Modelling* **140** (1-2): 9-29.

Bolivian Planning Ministry http://www.planificacion.gov.bo/

Booher, D. E. and J. Innes (2002) 'Network power in collaborative planning', *Journal of Planning Education and Research* **21**: 221-236.

Borah, W. (1972) 'European cultural influence in the formation of the first plan for urban centers that has lasted to our time', *Actas y Memorias* **2**: 35-54.

Border EcoWeb, http://www.borderecoweb.sdsu.edu

BorderBase, http://www.borderbase.org/

Borsdorf, A., R. Hidalgao and R. Sanchez (2007) 'A new model of urban development in Latin America: The gated communities and fenced cities in the metropolitan areas of Santiago de Chile and Valparaiso', *Cities*, **24**(5): 365.

Boyer, H. (2005) 'Urban Land and Housing Challenges in Brazil', *Land Lines*, Lincoln Institute of Land Policy.

Brakarz, J. and W. Engel Aduan (2004) 'Favela-Barrio: Scaled-up Urban Development in Brazil', *World Bank Working Paper*, World Bank, Washington D.C.

Bramwell, M. (2000) *The World in Maps: Central and South America*, Minneapolis, Lerner Publications Co.

Brea, J.A. (2003) 'Population dynamics in Latin America: labor force', *Population Bulletin* **58**(1): 28-31.

Bressi, T.W. (1993) 'Plaza, parque, colonia', *Places: A Quarterly Journal of Environmental Design* **8**(3): 91-3.

Bret, B. (1994) 'Centres-villes, centralité, décentralisation en Amérique latine', *Cahiers Des Amériques Latines* **18**: 61-160.

Bromley, R. (1998) 'Informal commerce: expansion and exclusion in the historic centre of the Latin American city', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, **22**(2):245.

Brooke, J. (1992) 'Curitiba journal: the road to Rio - setting an agenda for the Earth; the secret of a livable city? It's simplicity itself', *New York Times*, http://query.nytimes.com/gst/fullpage.html?res=9E0CE1D81239F93BA15756C0A964958260

Brooke, J. (1993) 'Oil and Tourism Don't Mix, Inciting Amazon Battle', New York Times http://query.nytimes.com

Broudehoux, A.M. (2001) 'Image Making, City Marketing, and the Aesthetization of Social Inequality in Rio de Janeiro', in N. ALSayyad (ed.) *Consuming Tradition, Manufacturing Heritage: Global Norms and Urban Forms in the Age of Tourism*, London, Routledge.

Brown, K. (Mar. 2002) 'Innovations for Conservation and Development', *The Geographical Journal* **168**(1): 6-17.

Buchsbaum, Bernardo D. (2004) *Ecotourism and Sustainable Development in Costa Rica. M.A. dissertation*, United States-Virginia: Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University

Budde Comm. (2008) 'Latin America - Telecoms, Mobile, and Broadband Overview and Analysis 2008', http://www.budde.com.au/buddereports/4521/Latin_America_-_Telecoms_Mobile__Broadband_Overview__Analysis_2008.aspx

Buenaño, G. (1999) 'Regional decentralization and deconcentration: the Orinoco- Apure River Basin Development Plan (Venezuela)', Presentation at Symposium Urban and Regional Links in the Global Age: Development and Integration in Latin America, The Center for Latin American Studies, the Institute of Urban and Regional Development, and the Berkeley Environmental Design Association, Berkeley.

Buenaño, G. (2000) 'El proyecto Apure-Meta: una iniciativa de desarrollo en los llanos Colombo-Venezolanos', Presentation at Symposium Desarrollo Regional y Urbano en la Era Global, August 1996, Bogota.

Burbach, R. (2007) 'Ecuador's Popular Revolt: Forging a New Nation', *NACLA Report on the Americas* **40**(5): 4-9.

Burdescu, R., A.del Villar, K. Mackay, F. Rojas, J. Saavedra (2005) 'Institutionalizing Monitoring and Evaluation Systems: Five Experiences from Latin America', http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTENBREVE/Newsletters/20843583/78SEP05M&EEN.pdf

Burgess, R. (1985) 'Problems in the classification of low-income neighbourhoods in Latin America', *Third World Planning Review* **7**: 287-306.

Bury, J. (1984) 'The Architecture and Art of Colonial Brazil', *The Cambridge History of Latin America*, **1**(2): 747-770.

Caldeira, T. (2000) City of walls: Crime, segregation, and citizenship in São Paulo. Berkeley: University of California Press

Calderon, C. and L. Serven (2003) 'The Output Cost of Latin Americas Infrastructure Gap', *Central Bank of Chile Working Papers*, **186**, Central Bank of Chile.

Calderón, C. and L. Serven (2004a) 'Trends in Infrastructure in Latin America, 1980-2001' *The World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series*, **3401**, World Bank, Washington D.C.

Calderon, C. and L. Serven (2004b) 'The Effects of Infrastructure Development on Growth and Income Distribution', *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper*, **3400**, World Bank, Washington.D.C

Campbell, L.M. (1999) 'Ecotourism in rural developing communities', *Annals of Tourism Research* **26**: 534-53

Campbell, S. (1999) 'Come to Jamaica and Feel All Right: Tourism and the Sex Trade', in K. Kempadoo, *Sun, Sex, and Gold: Tourism and Sex Work in the Caribbean*, Maryland, Rowman and Littlefield.

Campbell, T. (1997) 'Innovations and risk taking: the engine of reform in local government in Latin America and the Caribbean', *World Bank Discussion Papers*, **357**, World Bank, Washington D.C.

Cardenas, R. and C. Moreno (2004) 'A critical reflection on participative planning for regional development', *World Futures*, **60**: 147-160.

Cardoso, F. H. (1969) Dependencia y desarrollo en América Latina: un ensayo de interpretación sociológica, Siglo XXI Editores, Mexico City.

Carlin, R. E. (2006) 'The decline of citizen participation in electoral politics in post- authoritarian Chile', *Democratization* **13** (4): 632-651.

Carolini, G. (ed) (2005) *Home in the City*, London, GBR, Earthscan Publications, Ltd.

Carrión M., D. (2001) 'Democracy and Social Participation in Latin American Cities', *Development in Practice* **11**(2/3): 208-217.

Carrión, F. (1991) 'Municipio y democracia: gobiernos locales en ciudades intermedias de América Latina', Sur pa.

Carroll, R. (April 1, 2008) 'Jamaica slums locked in violence.' The Guardian, http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2008/apr/01/internationalcrime

Carter, T. (1998) 'Cuba on the brink?' *World & I*, **13**: 56-61.

Casas, L.G. (2002) 'Caracas: Territory, Architecture and Urban Space', in A. Almandoz (ed) *Planning Latin America's Capital Cities 1850-1950*, Routledge, New York, pp. 45-74.

Castells, M. (1989) *The Informational City: Information Technology, Economic Restructuring, and the Urban Regional Process*, Malden, MA, Blackwell Publishing.

Castells, M. (1996) *The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture, Volume 1: The Rise of the Network Society*, Malden MA, Blackwell.

Castells, M. (1997) *The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture. Volume 2: The Power of Identity*, Malden MA, Blackwell.

Castells, M. (1998) *The information age: Economy, society and culture, Volume 3: The end of the millennium*, Malden MA, Blackwell.

Castells, M. (2004) 'An Introduction to the Information Age' in F. Webster, R. Blom, E. Karvonen, H. Melin, K. Nordenstreng, and E. Puoskari (eds) *The Information Society Reader*, London and New York, Routledge, pp. 138-149.

Castillo, J.M. (2000) *Urbanisms of the informal: Spatial transformations in the urban fringe of Mexico City*, Massachusetts, Harvard University.

Castillo, L. (2006) 'El microcrédito de vivienda: una herramienta viable y efectiva para la atención del déficit cualitativo de vivienda en sectores de pobreza en Centroamérica', Agencia Sueca de Cooperación Internacional para el Desarrollo (Asdi), Documento de Referencia, San Salvador.

Castro Rodríguez, M. and R. Rodríguez (1984) 'Cuba: planificación y desarrollo agrario', *Economía y Desarrollo*: 40-55.

Cavalho, G., D. Nepstad, D. Mc Grath, M.C. Vera Diaz, M. Santilli, and A. Barros (2002) 'Frontier Expansion in the Amazon', *Environment* **44**(3): 36-45.

Census 2000, http://www.census.gov

Cernea, M. M. (1992) *The Building Blocks of Participation: Testing Bottom-Up Planning, International Bank Reconstruction and Development*, World Bank Publication.

Cerrutti, M. and R. Bertoncello (2003) 'Urbanization and Internal Migration Patterns of Latin America', Prepared for Conference on African Migration in Comparative Perspective, June 2003, Johannesburg.

Cervantes Varela, A. (2001) 'Arturo Uslar Pietri (1906-2001): ideología y conciencia de la Venezuela petrolera', *Cuadernos Americanos* **88** (July-Aug): 228-256

Cervero, R. (1998) *The Transit Metropolis: A Global Inquiry*, Washington, Island Press.

Chant, S. (1997) 'Women-headed households: Poorest of the poor? Perspectives from Mexico, Costa Rica, and the Philippines' Prepared for the Institute for Development Studies Workshop on Gender and Poverty (3-5 March), Brighton, UK.

Charlton, S. (2007) 'Mobilizing Knowledge Resources in the Global South: Learning by Doing and Learning by Thinking', *Planning Theory and Practice* **8**(3): 338-412.

Chase, D.Z., A.F. Chase, and W.A. Haviland (1990) 'The Classic Maya City: Reconsidering the 'Mesoamerican Urban Tradition', *American Anthropologist* **92**(2): 499-506.

Chion, M. and W. Ludeña (2008) 'Lima's Historic Centre: Old Places Shaping New Social Arrangements', in Clara Irazábal (ed) *Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Democracy, Citizenship, and Public Space in Latin America*, New York/ London, Routledge/ Taylor and Francis.

CIA World Factbook (1999, 2005) https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/

Claro, S. (2006) 'Consecuencias para la región de América Latina y el Caribe de la aparición de China en el escenario económico mundial. Documento informativo: el caso de Chile', *Integración & Comercio* **24**: 163-224.

Colantonio, A. and R. B. Potter (2006) 'City profile, Havana', *Cities* **23**: 63-78.

Colon, Y. (2001) 'Jamaica struggling to cut its alarming murder rate,' *Miami Herald*, October 31.

Comisión Económica para América Latina y el Caribe, ECLAC (1997), http://www.eclac.org/

Commission for Environmental Cooperation, http://www.cec.org/

Connolly, P. (2003) 'Understanding Slums: Case Studies for the Global Report 2003, Mexico City, Mexico', University College London, http://www.ucl.ac.uk/dpu-projects/Global_Report/cities/mexico.htm

Coordenação de Aperfeiçoamento de Pessoal de Nível Superior (CAPES), http://www.capes.gov.br/

Corrêa do Lago, L. (2000) Desigualdades e segregação na metrópole: o Rio de Janeiro em tempo de crise.

Costa Vargas, J.H. (2005) 'Apartheid brasileiro: raça e segregação residencial no Rio de Janeiro', *Revista Antropologia* **48**(1): 75-131.

Coy, M. (2006) 'Gated communities and urban fragmentation in Latin America: the Brazilian experience', *GeoJournal* **66**: 121-132.

Crot, L. (2006) ''Scenographic' and 'cosmetic' planning: globalization and territorial restructuring in Buenos Aires', *Journal of Urban Affairs*, **28**(4): 227-252.

Curtis, J.R. (2000) 'Praças, place, and public life in urban Brazil', *The Geographical Review* **90**(4): 475-492.

Cuthbert, A. R. (2003) 'Politics', in Cuthbert, A.R. (ed.) *The Form of Cities: Political Economy and Urban Design*, Blackwell Publishing, Massachusetts.

Davis, D. (2005) 'Reverberations: Mexico City's 1985 earthquake and the transformation of the capital,' in L.J. Vale and T. Campanella (eds) *The Resilient City: How Modern Cities Recover from Disaster*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, pp. 255–280.

Davis, M. (2006) *Planet of Slums*, WW Norton, New York.

de Ita, A. (2008) 'Fourteen Years of NAFTA and the Tortilla Crisis', Americas Policy Program Special Report. Washington, DC, Center for International Policy.

De Soto, H. (1989) *The Other Path: The Economic Answer to Terrorism*, Basic Books.

de Soto, H. (1989) *The Other Path: The Invisible Revolution in the Third World*, Harper and Row, New York.

de Soto, H. (2000) *The mystery of capital: Why capitalism triumphs in the West and fails everywhere else*, Basic Books, New York.

de Wit, H. (ed) (2005) *Higher Education in Latin America: The International Dimension*, Herndon, VA, USA, The World Bank, p. 123.

Dear, M., and A. Burridge (2005) 'Cultural integration and hybridization at the United States-Mexico Borderlands' *Cahiers de Géographie du Québec* **49** (138): 301-18.

del Rio, V. (1992) 'Urban Design and Conflicting City Images of Brazil: Rio de Janeiro and Curitiba.' *Cities*, **9**.4, 270-79.

Del Rio, V. (1992) 'Urban Design and Conflicting City Images of Brazil,' *Special Series on Urban Design, Cities*, Butterworth-Heinemann Ltd.

del Rio, V. (1997) 'Restructuring Inner-City Areas in Rio de Janeiro: Urban Design for a Pluralistic Downtown' *Journal of Architectural and Planning Research*. Volume **14**.1, Spring 1997.

del Rio, V. (2005) 'Favelas', in R. Caves (ed) *Encyclopedia of the City*., Oxford, Routledge.

del Rio, V. and N. Iwata (2004) 'The Image of the Waterfront in Rio de Janeiro: Urbanism and Social Representation of Reality' *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, **24** (2), 171-283.

del Rio, V. And H. Gallo (2000) 'The Legacy of Modern Urbanism in Brazil' *Docomomo Journal*, 23, August 2000.

del Rio, V. (2002) 'Urban Design for a New City Image and Livable Neighborhoods: The Case of Project Rio Cidade in Méier, Rio de Janeiro', Presented at Making Cities Livable Conference. Carmel, 4-8 March 2002.

Deloitte (Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu) (2004) *Brazilian Macroeconomy*, http://www.dtti.com/dtt/cda/doc/content/br_upstreamguide_brazilianmacroeconomy_2004.pdf

Deparle, J. (December 27, 2007) 'A Global Trek to Poor Nations, From Poorer Ones' *The New York Times*.

Díaz Barriga, M. (1996) 'Necesidad: Notes on the Discourses of Urban Politics in the Ajusco Foothills of Mexico City', *American Ethnologist* **23**(2): 291-310.

Dodman, D. (2007) 'Post-independence optimism and the legacy of waterfront redevelopment in Kingston, Jamaica', *Cities* **24**: 273-284.

Dodman, D. (2008 March) 'Developers in the public interest? The role of urban development corporations in the Anglophone Caribbean', *The Geographical Journal* **174**(1): 30(15).

Donner, J. (2005) 'Research Approaches to Mobile Use in the Developing World A Review of the Literature' Submitted to the International Conference on Mobile Communication and Asian Modernities, City University of Hong Kong, June 7-8 2005.

Dowall, D. E. and P. Monkkonen (2007) 'Consequences of the Plano. Piloto: Urban Land Markets in Brasília', *Urban Studies* **44**(12): 1871-1887.

Drakakis-Smith, D.W. (2000) *Third World Cities*, 2nd Ed., Routledge.

Dubeux, C. and E. La Rovere (2007) 'Local Perspectives in the Control of Greenhouse Gas Emissions-The case of Rio de Janeiro', *Cities* **24** (5): 353-364.

Ducci, M. (1996) 'The Politics of Urban Sustainability', in M. Cohen, B. Ruble , J. Tulchin and A. Garland (eds) Preparing *for the Urban Futur*e, Woodrow Wilson Center Special Studies, Washington, D.C., U.S.A., Woodrow Wilson Center Press, p. 267.

Duffy, G. (2007) 'Brazil's homeless and landless unite,' BBC News, http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/americas/6563359.stm

Echeverry, J. (2005) 'The Economics of TransMilenio, a Mass Transit System for Bogotá', *Economía* **5**: 151-196.

Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (1995) *Social panorama of Latin America*, Santiago, Chile: ECLAC

Eggleston, K., R. Jensen and R. Zeckhauser (2002) 'Information and telecommunication technologies, markets, and economic development', in G. Kirkman, P. Cornelius, J. Sachs and K. Schwab (eds) *The global information technology report 2001-2002: Readiness for the networked world*, New York, Oxford University Press, pp. 62-74.

EMBARQ, World Resources Institute, http://embarq.wri.org/en/About.aspx#

Engel, E. (2003) 'Privatizing Highways in Latin America: Fixing What Went Wrong', *Economica*, **4**(1): p129-164.

Escobar-Lemmon, M. (2001) 'Fiscal decentralization and federalism in Latin America', *Publius* **31**(4): 23-41.

Estache, A. (2001) 'Utilities Privatization and the Poor: Lessons and Evidence from Latin America', *World Development* **29**(7): 1179-1198.

Estrada, D. (2007) 'Chile: capital's new transport system hits some roadblocks', http://www.accessmylibrary.com/coms2/summary_0286-30170119_ITM

Fagen, R.R. (1977) 'Studying Latin American Politics: Some Implications of a Dependencia Approach' *Latin American Research Review* **12**(2): 3-26.

Farret, R. (2001) 'Urban and Regional Planning in Brazil: The Role of the Federal Government', DISP **147**: 8-13.

Fearnside, P. (1999) 'Social Impacts of Brazil's Tucurui Dam', *Environmental Management* **24**(4): 483-495.

Fearnside, P. (2002) 'Avança Brasil: Environmental and Social Consequences of Brazil's Planned Infrastructure in Amazonia', *Environmental Management* **30**(6) 735-747.

Fearnside, P. (2006) 'Dams in the Amazon: Belo Monte and Brazil's Hydroelectric Development of the Xingu River Basin', *Environmental Management* **38**(1): 16-27.

Freeman, J. (2002) 'Democracy and Danger on the Beach', *Space and Culture* 5(1): 9-28.

Fehr, M., K.A. Sousa, A.F.N. Pereira and L.C.Pelizer (2004) 'Proposal of indicators to assess urban sustainability in Brazil', *Environment, Development, and Sustainability* **6**: 355-366.

Ferguson, B. and J. Navarrete (2003) 'New approaches to progressive housing in Latin America: A key to habitat programs and policy', *Habitat International,* **27**, 309–323.

Fernandes, E. (2007) 'Implementing the urban reform agenda in Brazil', *Environment and Urbanization* **19**(1): 177-189.

Fernandez, J. A. and B. Hogenboom (2006) 'América Latina frente a China en el neoliberalismo global', *Revista Europea de Estudios Latinoamericanos y del Caribe* **80**: 73-81.

Ferreira da Silva, D. (1998) 'Facts of Blackness: Brazil is not (Quite) the United States … and Racial Politics in Brazil?,' *Social Identities* 4(2): 201-234.

Ferreira da Silva, D. (2001) 'Towards a Critique of the Socio-logos of Justice: The Analytics of Raciality and the Production of Universality,' *Social Identities* 7(3).

Few, R. (2001) 'Containment and Counter-Containment: Planner/Community Relations in Conservation Planning', The Geographical Journal 167(2): 111-124

Financial Times Business Limited (2007, June 7). 'Latin America's middle class holds keys to growth' *Financial Times Business Limited*, p. 1

Flora, J. (2001) 'Management of Traffic and the Urban Environment', in Freire, M.E. (ed) *Challenge of Urban Government: Policies and Practices*, Washington, DC, World Bank Publications.

Ford, P. (2004) 'In Jeanne's Wake, New Efforts to Prevent 'Natural' Disasters', *Christian Science Monitor*, September 29, http://www.csmonitor.com/2004/0929/p04s01-woam.html

Forester, J. (1989) *Planning in the Face of Power*, University of California Press, Berkeley.

Forester, J. (1999) *The deliberative practitioner: Encouraging participatory planning processes*, MIT Press, Boston.

Francis, P. (2008) 'Replanting Our Reefs', *Jamaica Gleaner*, June 2008, vhttp://www.jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/20080714/news/news5.html

Frank, A. G. (1969) 'Capitalism and underdevelopment in Latin America: historical studies of Chile and Brazil', *Hispanic American Historical Review* **48**(3): 453-455.

Fraser, V. (2000) 'Cannibalizing Le Corbusier: the MES Gardens of Roberto Burle Marx', *The Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* **59**(2): 180-193.

Frater, A. (2006) 'Squatting in Montego Bay: horrific past, hopeful future', *Jamaica Gleaner*, April 26, http://www.jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/20060416/lead/lead2.html

Freedman, J. (2008) 'Great, Good and divided: the politics of space in Rio de Janeiro' *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 30 (5): 529-556.

Freeman, J. (2002) 'Democracy and Danger on the Beach: Class Relations in the Public Space of Rio de Janeiro', *Space and Culture* **5**(1): 9-28.

Friedmann, J. (1996) *Regional Development Policy: A Case Study of Venezuela*, The MIT Press: Cambridge

Friend, J. and A. Hickling (2002 [1987]) Planificando bajo presión: Un enfoque se escogencia estratégica. Caracas: Iveplan, Instituto Venezolano de Planificación.

Friend, T. (2000) 'Maya lived as urban farmhands. Middle class thrived in huge planned city in Belize', *USA Today*

Fukuda-Parr, S. (1999) 'What does feminization of poverty mean? It isn't just lack of income.' *Feminist Economics* **5**:99-103.

Fussell, E. (2004) 'Sources of Mexico's migration stream: rural, urban, and border migrants to the United States', *Social Forces* **82**(3): 937(31).

Gafar, J. (1998) 'Growth, Inequality, and Poverty in Selected Caribbean and Latin American Countries, with Emphasis on Guyana', *Journal of Latin American Studies* **30**(3): 591-617.

Galeano, E. (1997 [1970]) 'Open Veins of Latin America: Five Centuries of the Pillage of a Continent' *Monthly Review Press*, 25 Aniv edition.

Garcia-Ramon, M. D. and A. Albet (2000) 'Pre-Olympic and post-Olympic Barcelona, a 'model' for urban regeneration today?', *Environment and Planning A* **32**(8): 1331-4.

Gerster, R. and S. Zimmerman (2003) 'Information and communication technologies (ICTs) for poverty reduction?', *Discussion Paper*, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation, http://www.deza.admin.ch/ressources/resource_en_24102.pdf

Gevert, T. (2006a) 'Metros Struggle to Meet Demand', *International Railway Journal* (August), 37-40

Gevert, T. (2006b) 'Brazilian Suburban Networks Reborn', *International Railway Journal* (August), 35-37.

Gilbert, A. (1994)'Viva the city', *Geographical Magazine* **66**(6): 17-20.

Gilbert, A. (1998) 'The Latin American City' *Monthly Review Press*.

Gilbert, A. (2007) 'The Return of the Slum: Does Language Matter?', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* **31**(4): 697-713.

Gilbert, A. (1995) 'Debt, poverty and the Latin American city', *Geography* **80**(4):323(11).

Gilbert, A. and F. Faust (1984) 'Community participation in upgrading irregular settlements: the community response', *World Development* **12**(9): 913(10).

Global Planning Education Association Network, http://www.gpean.org/index.htm

Gobierno Bolivariano de Venezuela (2005) Artículo 21, http://www.mpd.gob.ve/cordiplan/mpd/d_nuevo.htm#cap4

Gobierno Bolivariano de Venezuela. Ley de la Administración Pública Central. Decreto N° 3.416 Fecha: 20 de enero de 2.005   Gaceta Oficial Nº 38.111

Godfrey, B.J. (1991) 'Modernizing the Brazilian City', *Geographical Review* **81**(1): 18-34.

Goldfrank, B. (2002) *Urban experiments in citizen participation: Deepening democracy in Latin America*, Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, Berkeley, United States, California

González Guerrero, S. (2007) La Universidad Indígena de Venezuela: revolución en la selva. Rebelión, http://www.rebelion.org/

González, R. A. (2008) Unresolved Public Expressions of Anti-Trujilloism in Santo Domingo', in Irazábal, C. (ed.) *Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Citizenship, Democracy, and Public Space in Latin America*, New York, London, Routledge, Taylor and Francis.

Goodale, G. (2006). 'LA's latest export: gangs,' *The Christian Science Monitor*, http://www.csmonitor.com

Goodman, J., M. Laube and J. Schwenk (2005/2006) 'Curitiba's Bus System is Model for Rapid Transit', *Race, Poverty and the Environment* (Winter): 75-76.

Gorostiza Arroyo, F. J. (1997) *Mapping Cosmopolis: Planning and the Sign in Mexico-Tenochtitlan*, Ph.D. dissertation, United States, Pennsylvannia, University of Pennsylvania.

Gosling, M.C. (2001) *The Urbanization of Colonial Brazil: An Incremental Approach*, University of Washington, Seattle.

Goudsmit, A. and J. Blackburn (2001) 'Participatory Municipal Planning in Bolivia: An Ambiguous Experience', *Development in Practice* **11**(5): 587-596.

Graterol-Aranguren, J.A. (1992) *The evolution of industrial development in Costa Rica: Political and institutional constraints to full utilization of factors of production*, Ph.D. dissertation, Cornell University, United States, New York.

Green, A. (2005) 'A hesitant Puerto Rico tries commuting by train', *New York Times*, http://www.nytimes.com/2005/11/19/national/19train.html

Greenfield, G.M. (ed.) (1994) *'Brazil', Latin American Urbanization: Historical Profiles of Major Cities*, Greenwood Press, Westport, CT

Grogg, P. (2008) 'CUBA: 'Green' Farming Techniques to Boost Production', POZO REDONDO, Cuba, May 13 (IPS), <http://www.ipsnews.net/news.asp?idnews=42347>

Gross, R., B. Schell, M.C.B Molina (1989) 'The impact of improvement of water supply and sanitation facilities on diarrhea and intestinal parasites: a Brazilian experience with children in two low-income urban communities', *Revista de Saúde Pública*, **23**(3): 214-220.

Guslain, P., Z-W. Qiang, B. Lanvin, M. Minges, and E. Swanson (2006) 'Overview', in World Bank, *Information and communication for development: Global trends and policies*, Washington DC, World Bank.

Gutiérrez, R. (2002) 'Buenos Aires, A Great European City', in A. Almandoz (ed) *Planning Latin America's Capital Cities 1850-1950*, Routledge, New York, pp. 45-74.

Hainard, F. and C. Verschuur (2001) 'Filling the Urban Policy Breach: Women's Empowerment, Grass-Roots Organizations, and Urban Governance', *International Political Science Review*, **22**(1): 33-53.

Hale, C. (2004) 'Rethinking Indigenous Politics in the Era of the 'Indio Permitido', *NACLA Report on the Americas* 38(2): 16-21.

Harkness, R.C. (2003) 'Comparison of Link light rail versus Bus Rapid Transit trunk (main) line capacity' Coalition for Effective Transportation Alternatives, http://www.effectivetransportation.org/issues/HarknessExecsumfinal_03112003.shtml>

Harris, R. (2002) 'Resistance and Alternatives to Globalization in Latin America and the Caribbean', *Latin American Perspectives, Globalization and Globalism in Latin America and the Caribbean* **29**(6):136-151.

Haughney, D. (2006) *Neoliberal Economics, Democratic Transition, and Mapuche Demands for Rights in Chile*, University Press of Florida.

Healey, S.E. (2007) *Bolivia in the age of reckoning: the peasant-indigenous struggle for sustainable rural communities*, Ph.D. dissertation, Canada: University of Guelph.

Herbst, K. (1992) 'Brazil's Model City', *Planning* **58** (9): 24-28.

Herzog, L.A. (1991) 'Cross-national urban structure in the era of global cities: the US-Mexico transfrontier metropolis' *Urban Studies* **28**(4): 519(15).

Herzog, L.A. (ed) (2000) *Shared Space: Rethinking the U.S.-Mexico Border Environment*, La Jolla: Center for U.S.-Mexican Studies, 41-74.

Huspek, M., R. Martinez and L. Jimenez (1998) 'Violations of human and civil rights on the U.S.-Mexico border, 1995 to 1997: a report', *Social Justice* **25** (2): 110.

Holston, J. (1989) *The Modernist City: An Anthropological Critique of Brasilia*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

Holston, J. and A. Appadurai (1999) *Cities and Citizenship*, Durham, NC, Duke University Press.

Holzner, C. A. (2007) 'The Poverty of Democracy: Neoliberal Reforms and Political Participation of the Poor in Mexico', *Latin American Politics and Society* **49**(2): 87-IV.

Horton, L. (2006) 'Contesting state multiculturalisms: indigenous land struggles in Eastern Panama', *Journal of Latin American Studies* **38**(4):829.

Howard, J. (2002) Estelí's participatory planning initiative, LogoLink International workshop on Participatory Planning Approaches for Local Governance, Bandung, Indonesia, 20-27. http://www2.ids.ac.uk/logolink/resources/casestudies.htm#lat

Hudson, H. (2006) *From rural village to global village: Telecommunications for development in the information age*, Mahwah, NJ, Lawrence Erlbaum.

Huecker, S. (2007) 'The global view: sometimes, small is beautiful', *E: The Environmental Magazine* **18**(1): 30.

Human Rights Watch (2008) 'Universal Periodic Review of Brazil: Human Rights Watch's Submission to the Human Rights Council.' Human Rights Watch, <http://hrw.org/english/docs/2008/04/10/global18497.htm>

Humphrey, J. (1994) 'Are the unemployed part of the urban poverty problem in Latin America?', *Journal of Latin American Studies* **26**(3): 713(24).

ICLEI (2008) Orienting Urban Planning to Sustainability in Curitiba, Brazil, http://www3.iclei.org/localstrategies/summary/curitiba2.html

IDU (2004) http://www.idu.gov.co/noticias/acuerdo_119.pdf

IDU (2007) http://www.idu.gov.co/otros_serv/idu_en_pot.htm

Ingersoll, R. (2004) 'The Barcelona model: with a sensitive scale, sustainable design, and public amenities, a 400-acre urban renewal project creates a new paradigm for city planners', *Architecture* **93**(8): 21-2.

Inglehart, R. (1997) *Modernization and Postmodernization: Cultural, Economic and Political Change in 43 Societies*, Princeton, NJ, Princeton University Press.

Innes, J.E. (1995) 'Planning Theory's Emerging Paradigm: Communicative Action and Interactive Practice', *Journal of Planning Education and Research* **14**(3):183-189.

Instituto de Desarrollo Urbano (IDU), http://www.idu.gov.co/), Bogota, Colombia.

Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Geografía, INEGI (2000) http://www.inegi.gob.mx/inegi/default.aspx

Instituto Nacional de la Administración Pública, INAP, http://www.sgp.gov.ar/inap/documentacion/cediap.htm

Inter-American Development Bank (2004) 'Improving the Quality of Life of Garbage Recyclers in Asunción', Project: PR-S1001, <http://www.iadb.org/projects/Project.cfm?project=PR-S1001&Language=English> Accessed: 4/20/08.

Inter American Development Bank (2005) 'Are cooperatives a better way to solve Latin America's water problems?', http://www.iadb.org/idbamerica/index.cfm?thisid=3497

Inter-American Development Bank (July 15, 2007) 'IDB approves $50 million soft loan to Haiti for urban rehabilitation', http://www.iadb.org/news/articledetail.cfm?language=English&artid=429&artType=PR

International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank (2005) *World Development Report 2006- Equity and Development*, Washington D.C.

Internet World Stats (2008) 'South America', http://www.internetworldstats.com/south.htm

Irazábal, C. (2004) 'A Planned City Coming of Age: Rethinking Ciudad Guayana Today', *Journal of Latin American Geography* **3**(1): 22-51.

Irazábal, C. (2005) *City Making and Urban Governance in the Americas: Curitiba and Portland. Aldershot*, UK, Ashgate, 2005.

Irazábal, C. (2006) 'Localizing Urban Design Traditions: Gated and Edge Cities in Curitiba' *Journal of Urban Design* **11**(1):73-96.

Irazábal, C. (2007) 'Constitutional Reforms in Venezuela Foretell a Planning Revolution', Progressive *Planning* **173**: 33, 37.

Irazábal, C. (2008) *Ordinary places, extraordinary events: Citizenship, democracy, and public space in Latin America,* New York/ London, Routledge/ Taylor and Francis.

Irazábal, C. (forthcoming 2008) 'Urban Design, Planning, and The Politics of Development in Curitiba', in V. del Rio and W. Siembieda (eds) *Beyond Brasilia: Contemporary Urban Design in Brazil*, University Press of Florida.

Irazábal, C. (2009 forthcoming) 'Bridging Regime Theory and Communicative Action in Planning Theory: Realizing Planning's Emancipatory Promise', *Planning Theory*

Irazábal, C. and J. Foley (2007) 'People's Power and Planner Allies: Reflections on the Venezuelan Transition to a Socialist Participatory Democracy' Unpublished manuscript.

Irazábal, C. and J. Foley (2008a) 'Venezuela's communal councils and the role of planners', *Progressive Planning* **174**: 30-33.

Irazábal, C. and J. Foley, (2008b) 'Space, revolution, and resistance: ordinary places and extraordinary events in Caracas', in Irazábal, C. (ed) (2008) *Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Citizenship, Democracy, and Public Space in Latin America*, New York/ London, Routledge/ Taylor and Francis.

Irazábal, C. and M. Gómez-Barris (2007) 'Bounded Tourism: Immigrant Politics, Consumption, and Traditions at Plaza Mexico' *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change*, **5**(3):186-213.

Irazábal, C. and O. Morán (2008) 'Planning Implications of Tourism Development: The Mexican Pacific Riviera', Joint Association of European Schools of Planning (AESOP) and Association of Collegiate Schools of Planning (ACSP) Conference, Chicago, July 6-11, 2008.

Irazábal, C. and A. Punja (2009) 'Cultivating just planning and legal institutions: a critical assessment of the South Central Farm in Los Angeles', *Journal of Urban Affairs,* **31**(1): 1 – 23.

Irazábal, C. and R. Farhat. (2008) 'Latino Communities in the United States: Place-Making in the Pre-World War II, Post-World War II, and Contemporary City', *Journal of Planning Literature* **22**(3): 207-228.

Jackson, S. (2006) 'Guyana, Cuba, Venezuela and the 'Routes' to Cultural Reconciliation between Latin America and the Caribbean', *Small Axe 10*(12): 28-58.

Jamaican Gleaner (2006) 'Poor state of urban planning,' http://www.jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/20060911/cleisure/cleisure1.html

James, I. (2003) 'THE WORLD; A Part of France but Worlds Apart; Cultural contrasts abound in French Guiana, where living standards are higher than in its South American neighbors,' *LA Times*, p. A5.

Jenks, C. (1999) 'Private Urban Transit Systems and Low-Cost Mobility Solutions in Major Latin American Cities', *International Transit Studies Program* **33.**

Jiang Yuxia (2008) 'Bolivian president vows to continue battle for lost sea access', www.chinaview.com

Joe, A., and S. Yemin (2007, December 7) Latin America still lags behind Asia despite 5% GDP growth: SandP, from The Platts Petrochemical Report: http://www.mcgrawhill.com

Johnson, E. (2003) 'The Taming of the Amazon', *Foreign Policy* **136**: 84-85.

Jones, G. A and., & M. Moreno-Carranco (2007) 'Megaprojects: Benneath the Pavement, Excess' *City* **11**(2):144-164.

Kaiser, S. (2008) The Struggle for Urban Territory: Human Rights Activists in Buenos Aires. In Irazábal, C. (ed.) (2008) *Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Citizenship, Democracy, and Public Space in Latin America*, New York, London, Routledge, Taylor and Francis.

Keivani, R. and Mattingly, M. (2007) 'The Interface of Globalization and Peripheral Land in the Cities of the South', *International Journal of urban and Regional Research* **31**(2) 462.

Kinsbruner, J. (2005) *Colonial Spanish-American City: Urban Life in the Age of Atlantic Capitalism*, University of Texas Press, Austin

Klak, T. (1990) 'Spatially and socially progressive state policy and programs: the case of Brazil's National Housing Bank', *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* **80**(4): 571-589.

Klesner, J. L. (2007) 'Social capital and political participation in Latin America: Evidence from Argentina, Chile, Mexico, and Peru', *Latin American Research Review* **42**(2): 1-32, 275, 277.

Knack, R.E. (1994) 'Planificacion spoken here', *Planning* **60**(5): 20-23.

Kraul, C. (2008) 'Auto sales put pedal to the metal in Brazil', *Los Angeles Times*, Apr. 12.

Kretzmann, J. and J. McKnight (1996) 'Building Community from the Inside Out', *National Civic Review* **85**, Winter: 26-27.

Kruckewitt, J. (2005) 'Oil And Cancer In Ecuador: Ecuadoran villagers believe high rates of disease are tied to petroleum pollution, a contention that Chevron disputes', San Francisco Gate. http://www.sfgate.com/

Lama, A. (April 8, 2002) 'Crime-Peru: NYC Police Chief to Take on Lima's Crime Problem' *Inter Press Service*, p. 1.

Lanvin, B. and C. Z-W Qiang (2004) 'Poverty 'e-radication' Using ICT to meet the MDGs; Direct and indirect roles of e-maturity', in S. Dutta, B. Lanvin, and F. Paua (eds) *Global information technology report 2003-04*, Oxford University Press, pp.57-70.

Latin Business Chronicle (2007) 'Ecuador Oil: More trouble ahead.' http://ecuador-rising.blogspot.com/2007/10/ecuador-oil-more-trouble-ahead.html

Laurence, W., M. Cochrane, S. Bergen, P. Fearnside, P. Delamonica, C. Barber, S. D'Angelo, and T. Fernandes (2001) 'The Future of the Brazilian Amazon', *Science* **291**(5503): 438-439.

Leal, M.T. and R.L. Bertini (2003) 'Bus Rapid Transit: An Alternative for Developing Countries', Paper presented at Institute of Transportation Engineers, Annual Meeting.

Lee, D. (1999) 'Models of Government Regulation of Privatized Transit Services in Five Latin American Cities', *Transportation Quarterly* 53: 21-39.

Lejeune, J.F. (2005) *Cruelty and Utopia: cities and landscapes of Latin America*, Princeton Architectural Press, New York

Levy, J. (2003) *Contemporary Urban Planning*, Upper Saddle River, NJ, Prentice Hall Publishers.

Lewis, D. E. (1994) 'Nongovernmental Organizations and Caribbean Development', *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, **533**(Trends in U.S.-Caribbean Relations): 125-138.

Libertun de Duren, N. (2006) 'Planning à la Carte: The location patterns of gated communities around Buenos Aires in a decentralized planning context,' *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* **30**(2): 308-327.

Lima, Z. (2007) *Verso un `architettura semplice*, Roma,Fondazione Bruno Zevi.

Lima, Z. R. and V. M. Pallamin (2008) 'Reinventing the Void: São Paulo's Museum of Art and Public Life along Avenida Paulista', in Irazábal, C. (ed.) (2008*) Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Citizenship, Democracy, and Public Space in Latin America*. New York, London, Routledge, Taylor and Francis

Linzer, A.K. (2002) 'The participation of social actors traditionally excluded in the planning of the municipal development in Eastern Bolivia', LogoLink International workshop on Participatory Planning Approaches for Local Governance, Bandung, Indonesia, http://www2.ids.ac.uk/logolink/resources/casestudies.htm#lat

Low, S, (1999) 'Spatializing Culture: The social production and social construction of public space in Costa Rica' in Setha, L. (ed) *Theorizing the city: The new urban anthropology reader*, Piscataway, NJ, Rutgers University Press, 111-137.

Low, S. (2000) *On the Plaza: The politics of space and culture*, Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Low, S. and N. Smith (2005) *The politics of public space*, New York, Routledge

Low, S.M. (2003) *Behind the Gates: Life, Security and the Pursuit of Happiness in Fortress America*, Routledge, New York and London.

Madon, S. (2000) 'The internet and socio-economic development: Exploring the interaction', *Information Technology and People* **13**(2): 85-101.

Magalhaes, F. and E. Rojas (2007) 'Facing the Challenge of Informal Settlements in Urban Centers', Inter-American Development Bank, June, http://www.iadb.org/publications/search.cfm?countries=&topics=AG

Maldonado Copello, M.M. and M.O. Smolka (2003) 'Using Value Capture to Benefit the Poor: The Usme Project in Colombia', *Land Lines*, Lincoln Institute of Land Policy.

Moreno-S N., P. Roc O Del and J. Maldonado (2006) 'Surviving from garbage: the role of informal waste-pickers in a dynamic model of solid-waste management in developing countries', *Environment and Development Economics* **11**: 371-379.

Mancini, S., A. R. Nogueira, D. A. Kagohara, J. Schwartzman and T. de Mattos (2007) 'Recycling potential of urban solid waste destined for sanitary landfills: The case of Indaiatuba, SP, Brazil', *Waste Management Research*, **25**(6):517-23.

Manning, G. (2008) 'Government to Review Tourism Master Plan: Environmentalists Want Policy with More Teeth' Jamaica Gleaner. April 2008, http://www.jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/20080427/lead/lead5.html

Mansell, R. (2001) 'Digital Opportunities and the Missing Link for Developing Countries', Oxford *Review of Economic Policy*, 17, 282-295.

Marcuse, P, J. Connolly, J. Novy, I. Olivio, J. Potter, J. Steil (eds) (forthcoming) *Searching for the Just City*, New York, Routledge.

Mariscal, J. and E. Rivera (2006) 'Mobile Communications in Mexico in the Latin American Context', Preliminary Draft, Telecommunications Research Program, Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas CIDE

Marques, E. (2003) 'Public Policies, Political Cleavages and Urban Space: State Infrastructure Policies in Sao Paulo, Brazil, 1975-2000', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research:* **27**(4) 811-827.

Martimort, D. (2006) 'Privatization and Changes in Corruption Patterns: The Roots of Public Discontent', Data cited from Harris, C. 'Privatization Participation in Infrastructure in Developing Countries. Trends, Impacts, and Policy Lessons', World Bank Working Paper No. 5

Martinez, E. and A. Garcia (nd) What is Neoliberalism? A Brief Definition for Activists. National Network for Immigrant and Refugee Rights, http://www.corpwatch.org/article.php?id=376

Martínez, O. (2006) *Troublesome border*, Tucson, University of Arizona Press.

Martland, S.J. (2003) *Constructing Valparaiso: Infrastructure and the politics of progress in Chile's port, 1842-1918*, Ph.D. dissertation.

McCormack Asselin, L. (1998) 'Financial management trends in Latin America', *Journal of Public Budgeting, Accounting & Financial Management* **10**(1): 121-140.

McGirk, T. (2000) Gang-bangers: Adeadly U.S. export. http://www.rense.com/general5/gang.htm (accessed November 11, 2006).

McHardy, P. (2002) Urban and Regional Planning in Jamaica, Upfront Publishing, Peterborough, UK.

McNeish, J. A. (2008) 'Beyond the Permitted Indian? Bolivia and Guatemala in an Age of Neoliberal Developmentalism', *Latin American and Caribbean Ethnic Studies* **3**(1): 33-59.

Medeiros, M. and J. Costa (2007) 'Is There a Feminization of Poverty in Latin America?', *World Development* **36**: 115-127.

Medina, M. (2000) 'Scavenger Cooperatives in Asia and Latin America', Resources, *Conservation and Recycling* **31**(1): 51-69.

Medina, M. (2005) 'Serving the unserved: informal refuse collection in Mexico', *Waste Management Research* **23**: 390-397.

Mesquita Neto, P. (2002) 'Crime, Violence and Democracy in Latin America', Latin American and Iberian Resources at the University of New Mexico, http://laii.unm.edu/conference/mesquita.php

MIDEPLAN, Ministerio de Planificación Nacional y Política Económica, Costa Rica http://www.mideplan.go.cr/ http://www.mideplan.go.cr/content/view/63/421/

Ministério das Cidades (2005) Ministério das Cidades lança hoje campanha nacional Planos Diretores Participativos, 17.05.2005, http://www2.cidades.gov.br/index.php?option=content&task=view&id=484

Ministério das Cidades, Brazil http://www.cidades.gov.br/

Ministerio de Economía y Finanzas, Panama https://www.mef.gob.pa/Portal/Ministro.html https://www.mef.gob.pa/comunicados/Visi%F3n%20Estrat%E9gica%20hacia%20el%202009.pdf

Ministerio de Planificación del Desarrollo Bolivia http://www.planificacion.gov.bo/

Ministerio de Planificación y Cooperación, Midelan, Chile http://www.mideplan.cl/final/index.php

Ministerio del Poder Popular para la Planificación y el Desarrollo (MPPPD) República Bolivariana de Venezuela http://www.mpd.gob.ve/

Minplan, Ministerio de Planificación Federal, Inversión Pública y Servicios Argentina http://www.minplan.gov.ar/

Miraftab, F. (2006) *Women and Gender Equity in Development Theory and Practice: Institutions, Resources, and Mobilization*, Durham, NC, Duke University Press.

Moghadam, V.M. (2005) 'The 'Feminization Of Poverty' And Women's Human Rights', *SHS Papers in Women's Studies/ Gender Research* No. 2, Gender Equality and Development Section, Division of Human Rights, Social and Human Sciences Sector, UNESCO, http://portal.unesco.org/shs/en/files/8282/11313736811Feminization_of_Poverty.pdf/Feminization%2Bof%2BPoverty.pdf

Moisés, J.A. and V. Martinez-Alier (1980) 'Urban Transport and Popular Violence: The Case of Brazil,' *Past and Present* **86** (Feb): 174-192.

Mollenkopf and M. Castells (1991) 'Dual City: Restructuring New York' Russell Sage Foundation.

Moraes Valença (2008) (ed) *Cidade (I)legal, Rio de Janeiro*, Mauad X.

Morán, O. (2008) 'The Pacific Riviera: Not Too Pacific Anymore', *Progressive Planning*.

Morello, Matteucci and Rodriguez (2003) 'Sustainable Development and Urban Growth in the Argentine Pampas Region', *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* **590**: 116-130.

Moreno-Carranco, M. (2008). *The socio/spatial production of the global: Mexico City reinvented through the Santa Fe urban megaproject*, Ph.D Dissertation, Berkeley, University of California.

Morley, S.A. (2003) 'Reducing Poverty in Brazil: Lessons Learned and Challenges for the Future', *Pro-Poor Economic Growth Research Studies,* http://www.undp.org/povertycentre/publications/poverty/Reducing_poverty_in_Brazil-MorleyAug2003.pdf

Moura, Rosa and T. Kornin (2001) '(Des)Construindo o Discurso Eleitoral' Unpublished, Curitiba: Universidade Federal do Paraná.

Municipality of Porto Alegre, Brasil http://www.portoalegre.rs.gov.br/

Municipality of Rosario, Argentina http://www.rosario.gov.ar/sitio/arquitectura/plan_urbano.jsp

Munoz, B. E. (2003) *Ciudad, Violencia y globalización en la crónica latinoamericana contemporánea* PhD Dissertation, New Jersey: Rutgers State University of New Jersey, New Brunswick.

Myers, J. (1998) 'Human rights and development: Using advanced technology to promote human rights in sub-Saharan Africa Case', *Western Reserve Journal of International Law* **30**(2/3): 343-371.

Nacif Xavier, H. and F. Magalhães (2003) 'Urban Slums Reports: The Case of Rio de Janeiro, Brazil', Understanding Slums: Case Studies for the Global Report on Human Settlements 2003, UN-Habitat.

Naim, M. (June 17, 2007) 'The crime pandemic; War zones are safer than some cities as assaults, robberies and murders sweep the world,' *LA Times*, p. M4.

Nance, E. and L. Ortolano (2007) 'Community Participation in Urban Sanitation: Experiences in Northeastern Brazil', *Journal of Planning Education and Research* **26**(3): 284-300.

Nickson, A. and P. Lambert (2002) 'State reform and the 'privatized state' in Paraguay', *Public Administration and Development* **22**(2): 163.

Nickson, R. A. (1995) *Local Government in Latin America*, Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Nicoll, F. (2008) 'Seeking an Amazon solution', BBC, May 15.

North American Congress on Latin America (NACLA) (2007) *Report on the Americas: Urban Latin America: space, security, and struggle,* **40**(4):19(1).

NACLA (1995) *Report on the Americas: Urban Latin America: life in the megacity* **28**(4): 11(2).

Organization of American States (OAS) (1990) *Disaster, Planning and Development: Managing Natural Hazards to Reduce Loss*, Department of Regional Development and Environment Executive Secretariat for Economic and Social Affairs, Washington, D.C.

OAS (1991) *Primer on Natural Hazard Management in Integrated Development Planning*, Department of Regional Development and Environment Executive Secretariat for Economic and Social Affairs, Washington, D.C.

Oshikoya, T.W. and N.M. Hussain (1998) 'Information technology and the challenge of economic development in Africa', African Development Bank, *Economic Research Papers*, No. **36.**

Paley, J. (2004) 'Accountable democracy: Citizens' impact on public decision making in postdictatorship Chile'*, American Ethnologist* **31**(4): 497-513.

Panfichi, A. (2002) 'Building barrios: community development in Latin America', *Harvard International Review* **24**(3): 20-6.

Panizza, F., and Philip, G. (2005) 'Second Generation Reform in Latin America: Reforming the public sector in Uruguay and Mexico', *Journal of Latin American Studies* **37**(4): 667-691.

Pearce, D. (1978) 'The feminization of poverty: Women, work, and welfare,' *Urban and Social Change Review* **11**:28-36.

Peattie, L. (1987) *Planning: Rethinking Ciudad Guayana*, University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor.

Pérez Acuña, R.U. (2002) La participacion ciudadana en Estelí. LogoLink International workshop on Participatory Planning Approaches for Local Governance, Bandung, Indonesia, http://www2.ids.ac.uk/logolink/resources/casestudies.htm#lat

Perlman, J. (2006) 'The metamorphosis of marginality: four generations in the favelas of Rio de Janeiro', *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* **606**:154-177.

Perlman, J.E. (1976) *The Myth of Marginality: Urban Poverty and Politics in Rio de Janeiro*, University of California Press, Berkeley.

Perlman, J.E. (2005) 'The Myth of Marginality Revisited: The Case of Favelas in Rio de Janeiro, 1969-2003' in L.M. Hanley, B. A. Ruble and J. S. Tulchin (eds) *Becoming global and the new poverty of cities*, Washington, D.C., Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars.

Perotti, G. (1996) *From Self-help to Participative Planning: The architect's Role Under the Latin American Experienc*e, Kungliga Tekniska Hogskolan, Sweden

Perroux, F. (1955) 'Note sur la notion de pole de croaissance', *Economie Appliquée* **7**: 307-320.

Perry, G., (2007) 'Informality: Exit and Exclusion', The World Bank, http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTLAC/Resources/CH0.pdf

Peters, P. A and E.H. Skop (2007) 'Socio-spatial Segregation in Metropolitan Lima, Peru' *Journal of Latin American Geography* **6**(1): 149-171.

Pezzoli, K. (2000) 'From Pollution Prevention to Industrial Ecology,' in L.A. Herzog (ed) *Shared Space: Rethinking the U.S.-Mexico Border Environment*, Center for U.S.-Mexican Studies, pp. 41-74.

Pezzoli, K. (2002) 'Sustainability, Livelihood, and Community Mobilization in the Ajusco Ecological Reserve,' in P. Evans (ed) *Livable Cities: The Politics of Urban Livelihood and Sustainability*, Berkeley, CA, University of California Press, pp. 195-222.

Pezzoli, K. (2003). Enabling comprehensive regional planning in the San Diego-Tijuana global city-region, GPEIG Newsletter, http://www.regionalworkbench.org/files/GPEIG/GPEIGnewsletterSpring03.pdf

Pezzoli, K. (2008) *Frontiers of Regional Ecology*, http://usp.ucsd.edu/~kpezzoli/sd_tj.html

Phillips, T. (2006), 'Brazil's roofless reclaim the cities,' *The Guardian*, http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2006/jan/23/brazil.uknews1

Pick, J.B., N. Viswanathan and J. Hettrick (2001) 'The U.S.-Mexican borderlands region: a binational spatial analysis', *The Social Science Journal* **38**(4): 567(30).

Pigato, M. (2001) 'Information and communication technology, poverty, and development in sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia', *Africa Region Working Paper Series*, **20,** http://www.worldbank.org/afr/wps/index.htm

Pimenteira, C.A.P., L.G.T. Carpio, L.P. Rosa, and M.T. Tolmansuim (2005) 'Solid Wastes integrated management in Rio de Janeiro: input-output analysis', *Waste Management* **25**: 539-553.

Pinto, M. (2002) 'Estudo de Avaliação da Experiência Brasileira sobre Urbanização de Favelas e Regularização Fundiária'

Pizarro, R. (2005) *Suburbanization of the Mind: The Hollywood Urban Imaginarium and the Rise of American Suburbia in the Colombia Caribbean*, Ph.D. Dissertation, School of Policy, Planning and Development, University of Southern California.

Plummer, D. and B. Ranum (2002) 'Brazil's landless workers movement--movimiento de trabajadores rurales sem terra—MST' *Social Policy* **33**(1): 18.

Pohjola, M. (2001) Information Technology and Economic Growth: A cross-country analysis', in M. Phojola (ed) *Information technology, productivity and economic growth: International evidence and implications for economic development*, Oxford University Press, pp. 242-256.

Pohjola, M. (2002) 'The New Economy in Growth and Developmen', *Oxford Review of Economic Policy* **18**(3): 380-396.

Portes, A. (1989) 'Latin American Urbanization during the Years of the Crisis', *Latin American Research Review* **24**(3): 7-44.

Portes, A. and K. Hoffman (2003) 'Latin American Class Structures: Their Composition and Change during the Neoliberal Era', *The Latin American Research Review*, **38**(1): 41-82.

Portes, A., and B. R. Roberts (2005) 'The free-market city: Latin American urbanization in the years of the neoliberal experiment', *Studies In Comparative International Development* **40**, 1: 43(40).

Portes, A., J. Itzigsohn and C.Dore-Cabral (1994) 'Urbanization in the Caribbean Basin: social change during the years of the crisis', *Latin American Research Review* **29**(2): 3(35).

Portes, A., and B.R. Roberts (2005) Ciudades latinoamericanas: un análisis comparativo en el umbral del nuevo siglo, Prometeo Libros, Buenos Aires.

Pradilla, E. (ed.) (1982) *Ensayos sobre el problema de la vivienda en América Latina*, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana-Xochimilco, Mexico City

Protzen, J. and S. Nair (1997) 'Who taught the Inca stonemasons their skills? A comparison of Tiahuanaco and Inca cut-stone masonry'*, Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* **56**(2): 146-167.

Qadeer, M. (1999) 'Urbanisation of everybody', institutional imperatives, and social transformation in Pakistan', *The Pakistan Development Review* **38**(4): 1193-1210.

Qadeer, M. (2004) 'Guest editorial: urbanization by implosion', *Habitat International*, **28**(1): 1-12.

Quiggins Tiller, A. (1965) 'The igniting spark—Brazil 1930', *The Hispanic American Review* **45**(3): 384-392.

Radcliffe, S. (2007) 'Latin American Indigenous Geographies of Fear: Living in the Shadow of Racism, Lack of Development, and Antiterror Measures', *The Annals of the Association of American Geographers* **97**(2): 385.

Ranis, G. (1996) Will Latin America now put a stop to 'stop-and-go'? *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs* **38**(2/3): 127.

Read, J. (2005) 'Alternative functions: Oscar Niemeyer and the poetics of modernity,' *Modernism/Modernity* **12** (2): 253-273.

Rebelo, J. (1996) 'Essentials for Sustainable Urban Transport in Brazil's Large Metropolitan Area', *Policy Research Working Group Paper*, **1633**, Washington, DC, The World Bank.

Rebelo, J. (1999) 'Reforming the Urban Transport Sector in the Rio de Janeiro Metropolitan Region: A Case Study in Concessions', *Policy Research Working Group Paper*, **2096**, The World Bank ,Washington, DC.

Rebelo, J. (2000) 'The São Mateus-Jabaquara Trolleybusway Concession in Brazil', *Policy Research Working Group Paper*, **2353**, The World Bank ,Washington, DC.

Rebelo, J. (2008) 'Projection Information Document: Rio de Janeiro Mass Transit Additional Financing', World Bank, Washington D.C.

Reese, C. M. (2002) 'The Urban Development of Mexico City, 1850-1930', in A. Almandoz (ed) *Planning Latin America's Capital Cities 1850-1950*, Routledge, New York

Regulatel (2006) 'New Models for Universal Access in Latin Americ', http://regulatel.org/miembros/publicaciones/ESTU%20DIOS/SERV%20UNIV/PPIAF/inform e%20final/draft%20vf/New%20Ch.V%20UA%20Prog%20.v.12.pdf

Rich, J. (Dec 2, 2001) 'Brazilian Slums Prove Location Reigns Supreme in Real Estate (Property Values Increase in Favelas Which Are Nearer to São Paulo Downtown)', *The New York Times*, p. A7

Rios, J. and D. Rios Insua (2008) 'A framework for participatory budget elaboration support', *Journal of the Operational Research Society* **59**(2): 203-212.

Rittel, H., and M. Webber (1973) 'Dilemmas in a General Theory of Planning,' *Policy Sciences*, **4**, Elsevier Scientific Publishing Company, Inc., Amsterdam, pp. 155-169.

Rivera-Cusicanqui, S. (1996) 'Ser Mujer Indígena, Chola o Birlocha en Bolivia postcolonial de los años 90', La Paz: Ministerio de Asuntos Étnicos, Género y Generaciones.

Roberts, B. (2005) 'Globalization and Latin American Cities,*' International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* **29**(1): 110-123.

Roberts, B. and A. Portes (2006) 'Coping with the Free Market City: Collective Action in Six Latin American Cities at the End of the Twentieth Century', *Latin American Research Review* **41**(2): 57-83.

Roberts, B.R. (2005) 'Globalization and Latin American Cities', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, **2**9(1): 110-123.

Rodriguez, C. (2002) 'Situational strategic planning and citizen participation processes in Tlalpan, Mexico', LogoLink International workshop on Participatory Planning Approaches for Local Governance, Bandung, Indonesia, http://www2.ids.ac.uk/logolink/resources/casestudies.htm#lat

Rodriguez, F. and E.J. Wilson III, (2000) 'Are poor countries losing the information revolution?', infoDev Working Paper, The World Bank, Washington, DC, http://www.cidcm.umd.edu/ICT/papers/are_poor_countries_losing.pdf

Rodriguez, L. (1994) 'Barrio Women: Between the Urban and the Feminist Movement,' *Latin American Perspectives* **21**(3): 32-48.

Rojas, R. (1984*) Latin America: Blockages to Development*, London, PhD Dissertation.

Roller, L.H. and L. Waverman (2001) Telecommunications infrastructure and economic development: A Simultaneous Approach, Regulation Initiative Working Paper, **11**, Available at SSRN: http://ssrn.com/abstract=322780

Rollnick, R. (2006) 'The Third World Urban Forum', *UN Chronicle* **43**(3): 24-26.

Rose, D. (2008) 'National Housing Trust Places 48 Houses on the Market', Jamaica Gleaner, January 13, http://www.jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/20080113/business/business4.html

Rostow, W. (1960) *Stages of Economic Growth: A Non-Communist Manifesto*, The MIT Press: Cambridge.

Roy, A. (2005) 'Urban Informality: Toward an Epistemology of Planning,' *Journal of the American Planning Association* **71**(2): 147-158.

Roy, A. (forthcoming) *Poverty Experts: Truth and Capital in the New Global Order of Development*, Routledge, New York

Roy, A. and N. AlSayyad (eds) (2004) *Urban Informality: Transnational Perspectives from the Middle East, South Asia, and Latin America*, Lexington Books.

Salcedo, R. and A.Torres (2004) 'Gated Communities in Santiago: Wall of Frontier?', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* **28:** 27-44.

Saldarriaga Roa, A. (2008) 'The Plaza de Bolívar of Bogotá: Uniqueness of Place, Multiplicity of Events', in Irazábal, C. (ed.) (2008) *Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Citizenship, Democracy, and Public Space in Latin America*, New York, London, Routledge, Taylor and Francis.

Salgado, S. (1997) *Terra: Struggle of the landless*, London, Phaidon Press.

P. Salyer and D. Bloom (2007) 'The March of the Cities' Finance and Development, International Monetary Fund, http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/fandd/2007/09/pdf/picture.pdf

Sánchez, F. (1996) 'O City Marketing de Curitiba: Cultura e Comunicacão na Construcão da Imagem Urbana', in Del Rio, Vicente and Livia de Oliveira (eds) *Percepcão Ambiental: A Experiencia Brasileira*, São Paulo: Studio Nobel/Editora da UFSCar.

Sánchez, F. (1997) *Cidade Espectáculo: Política, Planejamento e City Marketing, Curitiba*, Editora Palavra.

Sanchez, G. (1993) *Becoming Mexican American: Ethnicity, culture, and identity in Chicano Los Angeles, 1900–1945*, New York, Oxford University Press.

Santas Kraatz, E. (2001) 'The Structure of Health and Welleness in a Brazilian Favela' *Journal of Transcultural Nursing* **12**(3): 173-179.

Sassen, S. (1991) *The Global City: New York, London, Tokyo*, Princeton University Press.

Saunders, R.J., J.J. Warford,and B. Wellenieus (1994) *Telecommunications and economic development* (2 Ed.) Baltimore, MD, Johns Hopkins University Press.

Scarpaci, J. (2004) *Plazas and Barrios: Heritage Tourism and Globalization in the New Millennium*, University of Arizona Press.

Scarpaci, J., R. Segre and M. Coyula (1997) *Havana: Two Faces of the Antillean Metropolis*, World Cities Series, John Wiley and Sons.

Scholfield, Piers. (April 3, 2008) 'Street Gangs that Cross Borders', BBC News, http://news.bbc.co.uk

Schrader, S. (2007) 'Planet of Slums', *NACLA Report on the Americas* **40**(1): 46-50.

Schreyer, P. (1999) 'The contribution of information and communication technology to output growth', *OECD Statistical Working Paper*, 99:4.

Schware, R. (Ed.) (2005) *E-development: From excitement to effectiveness*, World Bank, Washington DC.

Scott, A.J. (ed). (2002) *Global City-Regions: Trends, Theory, Policy*, Oxford, Oxford University Press.

Seasons, M. (2003) 'Monitoring and Evaluation in Municipal Planning: Considering the Realities', *Journal of the American Planning Association* **69**: 430-440.

Secretary of Municipal Planning (http://www.portoalegre.rs.gov.br/) Porto Alegre, Brazil.

Segre, R. (2008) 'Iconic Voids and Social Identity in a Polycentric City: Havana from the Nineteenth to the Twentieth Century', in Irazábal, C. (ed.) *Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Citizenship, Democracy, and Public Space in Latin America*, New York, London, Routledge, Taylor and Francis.

Selee, A. (2003) 'Deliberative approaches to governance in Latin America', Woodrow Wilson Center, http://www.deliberative-democracy.net/resources/contrib/selee_20030801.shtml

Sen, A. (1999) *Development as Freedom*. Oxford, UK, Oxford University Press.

Southwest Center for Environmental Research and Policy (SERP), Consorcio de Investigación y Política Ambiental del Suroeste, http://www.scerp.org

Shefner, J. (2001) 'Coalitions and Clientelism in Mexico', *Theory and Society* **30**(5): 593-628.

Sheuya, S. (2008) 'Improving the Health and Lives of People Living in Slums', *Annals of the New York Academy of Science*, 1-9.

Sigmond, K. B. (2008) *Mexican Banking Laws: Evolution into NAFTA and the Global Economy*, Tulane University, New Orleans

Silva, B. (2006) 'Social Cohesion, Criminal Victimization and Perceived Risk of Crime in Brazilian Neighborhoods', *Social Forces* **84** (3): 1725-1753.

Silva, E. (1997) 'The politics of sustainable development: native forest policy in Chile, Venezuela, Costa Rica and Mexico', *Journal of Latin American Studies* **29**: 457-93.

Silva, E. (2003) 'Selling Sustainable Development and Shortchanging Social Ecology in Costa Rican Forest Policy', *Latin American Politics and Society* **45** (3): 93-127.

Simon, J. (1997) 'Prophecy, plague, and plunder', *The Amicus Journal* **19**: 28-33.

Sirianni C. and L. Friedland (nd) 'Deliberative Democracy', Civic Dictionary, The Civic Practices Network, http://www.cpn.org/tools/dictionary/deliberate.html

Srinivas, S. and F. Lund (2000/2005) *Learning from experience: A gendered approach to social protection for workers in the informal economy*, Geneva: International Labour Organization (ILO), WIEGO).

Sites, W. (2007) 'Contesting the neoliberal city? Theories of neo-iberalism and urban strategies of contention' in H. Leitner, J. Peck & E. Sheppard (eds) *Contesting neoliberalism: The urban frontier*, New York: The Guilford Press.

Sklair, L. (2000) 'The Transnational Capitalist Class and the Discourse of Globalisation,' *Cambridge Review of International Affairs*, 14 (1): 67 – 85.

Smith, G. (2008) 'NAFTA: Two Mexicos, Two Outcomes; The trade treaty that has increased Mexico's exports and expanded its middle class has left small farmers without a share of the prosperity' *Business Week Online*.

Smith, M.P. (2001) *Transnational Urbanism: Locating Culture*. Malden MA: Blackwell.

Smith, M.P. (2005) 'Transnational Urbanism Revisited', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, **31** (2): 235-244.

Smith, R. (2006) 'Bicycle is King of the Road as Gas Costs Rise', *International Herald Tribune*, May 5, http://www.iht.com/articles/2006/05/05/business/wbbike.php.

Souza, C. (2007) Local Democratization in Brazil: Strengths and dilemmas of deliberative democracy', *Development* **50**(1), 90-95.

Srinivas, S. and F. Lund (2000/2005) 'Learning from experience: A gendered approach to social protection for workers in the informal economy', Geneva, International Labour Organization (ILO), WIEGO).

Stone, C. (1998) 'Urban Regimes: A Research Perspective', in D. Judd and P. Kantor (eds) *The Politics of Urban America: A Reader*, Needham Heights, Allyn and Bacon

Tamayo, S. and X. Cruz-Guzmán (2008) 'Political Appropriation of Public Space: Extraordinary Events in the Zócalo of Mexico City, in Irazábal, C. (ed.) (2008) *Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Citizenship, Democracy, and Public Space in Latin America*, New York, London, Routledge, Taylor and Francis.

Teitel, S. (2007) 'Latin America's next growth challenge', *The Japan Times*, www.project-syndicate.org

Terra Daily Staff Writers (2008) 'Costa Rica plants more trees to become carbon neutral.' San Jose (AFP) May 12. <http://www.terradaily.com/reports/Costa_Rica_plants_more_trees_to_become_carbon_neutral_999.html>

The Economist (1998) 'Brazilian cities: A future for the past', November 14.

The Economist (2008a) 'Mexico and NAFTA: Tariffs and tortillas, January 24.

The Economist (2008b) 'The slow lane', February 7.

The Economist Ltd. (2007, August 16) 'Up from the bottom of the pile; Latin America's economies', The Economist U.S. Edition, p. 1.5

The UNESCO Courier (1998) 'Curitiba: A miracle of urban planning', **51**(3): 43

The World Bank (2007, April) '2007 World Development Indicators', http://go.worldbank.org/3JU2HA60D0

Thibos, M., D. Lavin-Loucks and M. Martin (2007) The Feminization Of Poverty, Dallas, TX, The J. MacDonald Williams Institute, http://www.dallasindicators.org/Portals/8/Reports/Reports_Internal/Feminization%20of%20Poverty.pdf

Tipling, C (1999) 'From East Central to South: Jamaica Rebuilds Neighborhood Spirit from Within.' Pan American Health Organization, http://www.amro.who.int/English/DPI/Number7_article7.htm

Torres, H. (2005) 'São Paolo Peri-Urban Dynamics: Some Social Causes and Environmental Consequences', The World Bank, http://www.worldbank.org/urban/symposium2005/papers/torres.pdf. Pg. 1

Torres-Lima, P. and L. Rodríguez-Sánchez (2006) 'Farming dynamics and social capital: A case study in the urban fringe of Mexico City', Springer Science andBusiness Media B.V, pp.194.

Transportation Research Board (2006a) 'Applicabilty of Bogotá's TransMilenio BRT System to the United States', http://www.trb.org/news/blurb_detail.asp?id=6340

Transportation Research Board (2006b) 'Innovations in Bus, Rail, and Specialized Transit Operations in Latin America', http://www.trb.org/news/blurb_detail.asp?id=5056

Trias, R. (1977) 'The city planning ordinances of the Laws of the Indies revisited', *Town Planning Review* **48**: 247-268.

Turner, J. (1976) *Housing by People: Towards Autonomy in Building Environments*, Marion Boyars, London.

Ugarte, M. (2007) 'Mexico City Bars Street Sellers from Downtown', *Associated Press*, October 12, http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/21271479/

UN Chronicle (2007) 'Climate change around the world: a view from the UN Regional Commissions', Commission for Sustainable Development, **44**(2): 33-36.

Underwood, D. (1992) 'Civilizing' Rio de Janeiro: Four Centuries of Conquest through Architecture,' *Art Journal* **51**(4): 48-56.

United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN HABITAT) (2003) *The Challenge of Slums: Global Report on Human Settlements*, Nairobi.

UN-HABITAT (2006) *State of the World's Cities 2006/07*, Nairobi, http://www.unhabitat.org/pmss/getPage.asp?page=bookView&book=2101

UN-HABITAT (2008) UN-HABITAT: Shelter for All, March 6, http://www.unhabitat.org

United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP) (2007) 'Global Environmental Outlook: Environment for Development (GEO4)', Progress Press Ltd <http://www.unep.org/geo/geo4/report/GEO-4_Report_Full_en.pdf>

UNEP (2002) *Geo: Global Environmental Outlook 3*, http://www.unep.org/geo/geo3/english/294.htm

United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) (2002) Progress of the World's Women 2002. New York, UNIFEM.

United Nations (1999) 'Local Leaders Drive Global Policy Change', Living Cities: Special Report on Community Regeneration (Series of Short Articles) <http://www.ucl.ac.uk/dpu-projects/Global_Report/>

United Nations (2001) World Urbanization Prospects: The 2001 Revision, United Nations, New York.

United Nations (2004) World Urbanization Prospects: The 2003 Revision, United Nations, New York.

United Nations (2008) World Urbanization Prospects: The 2007 Revision, United Nations, New York

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) (nd) 'Civic Dialogue for Democratic Governance in Jamaica', www.undp.org/fojam/documents.htm

UNDP (2007) 'Human Development Report', New York.

United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (---) 'Feeling the Heat.' <http://unfcc.int/essential_background/feeling_the_heat/items/2918.php>

United Nations Statistics Division (2008a) 'Official List of MGD Indicators', http://unstats.un.org/unsd/mdg/Host.aspx?Content=Indicators/OfficialList.htm

United Nations Statistics Division (2008b) 'Slum Population as Percentage or Urban, Percentage', Millennium Development Goals Indicators Name:http://unstats.un.org/unsd/mdg/SeriesDetail.aspx?srid=710

United States (U.S.) Department of Education, http://www.ed.gov/programs/fipsebrazil/index.html

United States Census Bureau (2000) Census 2000, http://www.census.gov/main/www/cen2000.html

United States Immigration Support, 'History of Cuban Immigration to the United States,' http://www.usimmigrationsupport.org/cubanimmigration.html

University of Vermont Historic Preservation Department (2008) University of Vermont and Preservation Trust of Vermont collaborate on historic preservation research trip to Cuba, July 23, http://www.uvm.edu/histpres/cuba/

Urban Development Timeline (2008) 1960's: Government as Planner, March 6, http://www.urbantimeline.org/intl/1960s

US-Mexico Border, http://www.epa.gov/usmexicoborder/ef.htm

Valladares, L. (2000) 'A gênese da favela carioca. A produção anterior às ciências sociais', *Revista Brasileira de Ciencias Sociais*, **15**(44): 5-34.

Vanderbeek M. and Irazábal C. (2007) 'Urban design as a catalyst for social change: a comparative look at modernism and new urbanism', *Traditional Dwellings and Settlements Review* **21**(1): 41-57.

Vargas, J. (2006) 'When a Favela Dared to Become a Gated Condominium' *Latin American Perspectives*, Issue 149, **33**(4): 49-81.

Varley, A. (2002) 'Private to public: Debating the meaning of tenure legalization', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* **26**: 449-61.

Varley, A. (2007) 'Gender and property formalization: conventional and alternative approaches', *World Development* **35**(10):1739(15).

Vidal Rojas, R. and H. Fox Timmling (2008) 'A Memorable Public Space: The Plaza of the Central Station in Santiago de Chile', in Irazábal, C. (ed.) (2008) *Ordinary Places, Extraordinary Events: Citizenship, Democracy, and Public Space in Latin America*. New York, London: Routledge, Taylor and Francis

Violich, F. (1987) *Urban Planning for Latin America: The Challenge of Metropolitan Growth*, Lincoln Institute for Land Policy, Cambridge, MA.

Wagner, E. L. (1997) *Open Space as a Tool of Conversion: The Syncretism of Sacred Courts and Plazas in Post-conquest Mexico*, The University of Texas, Austin

Wahbe1 T.R., E. M. Jovel1, D. R. Silva García, V. E. Pilco Llagcha and N. Rose Point (2007) 'Building International Indigenous People's Partnerships for Community-Driven Health Initiatives', *EcoHealth* **4** (4): 472-488.

Warah, R. (2003) 'Slums and Housing in Africa', The United Nations Chronicle, http://www.un.org/Pubs/chronicle/2003/issue4/0403p19.asp

Ward, P. M. (2005) 'The lack of 'cursive thinking' within social theory and public policy: four decades of marginality and rationality in the so-called slum', in Wood, C. (ed) *Rethinking Development in Latin America*, Pennsylvania State University Press, Philadelphia.

Waverman, L., M. Meschi, and M. Fuss (2005) 'The impact of telecoms on economic growth in developing countries', in *The Vodafone Policy Paper Series* http://www.vodafone.com/etc/medialib/attachments/cr_downloads.Par.78351.File.dat/GPP_SIM_paper_3.pdf

Weaver, D. B. (1999) 'Magnitude of ecotourism in Costa Rica and Kenya', *Annals of Tourism Research* **26**(4): 792-816.

Weitz-Shapiro, R. (2008) 'The local connection: local government performance and satisfaction with democracy in Argentina', *Comparative Political Studies* **41**(3): 285.

Whitesell, E. (2006) 'Local Struggles over Rain-Forest Conservation in Alaska and Amazonia', *Geographical Review* **86**(3): 414-436.

Wiesenfeld, E. (1997) 'From individual need to community consciousness: the dialectics between land appropriation and eviction threat', *Environment and Behaviour* **29**(2): 198(15).

Wigle, S.J. (2006) *Land, Shelter, and Livelihoods: Exploring the Linkages in Mexico City*, University of Toronto, Dissertation.

Wilson III, E.J. (2004) *The information revolution and developing countries*, Cambridge, MA, MIT Press.

Wilson III. E.J. (1996) 'The information revolution comes to Africa' *CSIS Africa Notes* **185.**

Wolfe, A. (2005). 'Central America's street gangs are drawn into the world of geopolitics' http://www.pinr.com/report.php?ac=view_report&rlanguage_id=1.

World Bank (2002) 'Report No. 22590: Urban Services Delivery and the Poor: The Case of Three Central American Cities,' vol. 1.

World Bank (2007) Urban Poverty, http://www.worldbank.org

Wright, L. (2001) 'Latin American Busways: Moving People Rather Than Cars,' *Journal of the Natural Resources Forum* **25**(4): 121-134.

Wright, R. (1996) 'The Most Innovative City in the World', *Los Angeles Times*, June 3.

Wyels, J.G. (2003) 'Common ground for farmers and forests: alarmed by signs of extensive deforestation over the past decades, groups in Costa Rica are developing programs that combine ecological awareness and sustainable agriculture', *Americas* **55**(2): 22-29.

Xavier, H.N. and F. Magalhães (2003) 'The Case of Rio de Janeiro', Understanding Slums: Case Studies for the Global Report on Human Settlements 2003, UN-Habtitat.

Yamane Shu (2005). Considerations on Urban Formation and Division of Housing Lots

Young, D. (2003) 'The line: Lucio Costa and the modern utopia', *Variety* **392**(12): 34.

Zetter, R. and G. B. Watson (2005) *Designing sustainable cities in the developing world*, Aldershot, UK, Ashgate Publishing.

Zomosc, L. (2007) 'The Indian movement and political democracy in Ecuador', *Latin American Politics and Society* **49** (3):1.

Zoomers, A. (2002) 'Rural Development Policy in Latin America: The Future of the Countryside' *Social Scientist* **30**: 61-84.